

From "Morning Sun" to "Though I Was Dead": The Image of Song Binbin in the "August Fifth Incident"

Wei-li Wu, Taipei College of Maritime Technology, Taiwan

The Asian Conference on Film & Documentary 2016
Official Conference Proceedings

Abstract

This year is the fiftieth anniversary of the outbreak of the Chinese Cultural Revolution.

On August 5, 1966, Bian Zhongyun, the deputy principal at the girls High School Attached to Beijing Normal University, was beaten to death by the students struggling against her. She was the first teacher killed in Beijing during the Cultural Revolution and her death had established the “violence” nature of the Cultural Revolution.

After the Cultural Revolution, the reminiscences, papers, and comments related to the “August Fifth Incident” were gradually introduced, but with all blames pointing to the student leader of that school, Song Binbin – the one who had pinned a red band on Mao Zedong's arm. It was not until 2003 when the American director, Carma Hinton filmed the *Morning Sun* that Song Binbin broke her silence to defend herself.

However, voices of attacks came hot on the heels of her defense.

In 2006, in *Though I Am Gone*, a documentary filmed by the Chinese director Hu Jie, the responsibility was once again laid on Song Binbin through the use of images.

Due to the differences in perception between the two sides, this paper subjects these two documentaries to textual analysis, supplementing it with relevant literature and other information, to objectively outline the two different images of Song Binbin in the “August Fifth Incident” as perceived by people and their justice.

Keywords: Cultural Revolution, Morning Sun, Though I Was Dead, Song Binbin, Bian Zhongyun

iafor

The International Academic Forum

www.iafor.org

I. Introduction – Initial Violence in the Cultural Revolution

This year is the fiftieth anniversary of the outbreak of the Chinese Cultural Revolution.

On August 5, 1966, Bian Zhongyun, vice-principal of the Girls' High School attached to Beijing Normal University in Beijing, was beaten to death by the students struggling against her. She was the first teacher killed in the Cultural Revolution in Beijing. Her death had established the "violence" nature of the Cultural Revolution, and the initial "violence" had started in the school campus.

The unfolding of the "violence" in the Cultural Revolution did not come about in a single step, but was rather step by step beguiled by the rulers, who then ignited it within a few months' time. In the seventeen years before the Cultural Revolution (1949-1966) as a result of the encouragement of various political movements and the guidance of the policies of "proletarian politics" as well as "class struggle," the direction of education had moved toward the "education of revolutionary hate" of the "theory of class origin," which adequately prepared the first generation of children of the People's Republic (those born after 1949) mentally under its imperceptible influence. What then was needed was only a spark.

From the end of 1965 to early 1966, the bombardment on the literary works of the *Hai Rui Dismissed from Office* (Wu Han, 1961), the *Notes from the Three-Family Village* (Yao Wenyan, 1966), and the *Evening Chat at Yanshan* (Deng Tuo, 1961) intensified, which was the fuse of the Cultural Revolution lit by the literary front. On May 7, 1966, in a letter to Lin Biao (this was also the "May 7 Directive," part of which content was published in the People's Daily on August 1) Mao Zedong stated that "education has to be revolutionized, and the phenomenon of the rule of our schools by bourgeois intellectuals must not go on any more."¹ Mao resorted to using school campuses as the opening to launch the Cultural Revolution. Before long, on May 16, the "Circular from the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China" (May 16 Circular) was issued, and this heavy "programmatic" bomb ultimately exploded, formally sounding the horn of the Cultural Revolution.

*All poisonous weeds, all ghosts and monsters, must be subjected to criticism; our struggle against them can only be one of life-and-death struggle; destruction means criticism; it means revolution; hold high the great banner of the proletarian Cultural Revolution, thoroughly expose the reactionary bourgeois stand of those so-called 'academic authorities' who oppose the party and socialism."*²

Although this "circular," for all its combativeness, was initially not made public, informed officials who gathered in the capital had very early grasped the direction of the movement. On May 25, seven teachers and students from the Beijing

¹ "The Whole Country Should Become a Great School in Mao Tse-tung's Thought – In Commemoration of the 39th Anniversary of the Founding of the People's Liberation Army" (1966) *People's Daily*, in Song Yongyi, *The Chinese Cultural Revolution Database* (CD) (2002).

² "Circular from the Central Committee of the Communist Party of China," (1966) issued by the Central (66) no.267, *op. cit.* footnote 1.

University posted a big-character poster criticizing the president and the municipal party committee, which immediately created a commotion in various universities and middle schools, facilitating the creation of the “Red Guards.” On June 1, Mao ordered all radios, newspapers and periodicals of the whole country to publish that big-character poster in order to break open this “reactionary fortress” of the Beijing University. On June 1 and 2, the *People’s Daily* published two editorials respectively, “Sweep Away All Monsters and Demons” and “Hailing the First Big-character Poster of the Beijing University,” claiming that:

Those clowns who vainly attempt to resist the currents of the Cultural Revolution can hardly escape the fate of being wiped out. ³

This series of montage-style rhythms sped up the development of the Cultural Revolution and conferred adequate “legitimacy” on the unfolding of violence.

Campuses were in great chaos. The Central Committee under Liu Shaoqi followed a very standardized way of employing established practices, dispatching to all schools “work groups” to replace the “school party committees” and formulating the Eight Directives in order to keep the Cultural Revolution within manageable limit. However, such moves soon met with strong opposition from radical students. The Red Guards of the High School Attached to Qinghua University put up a big-character poster, saying that “We wield our golden rods, display our supernatural powers and use our magic to turn the old world upside down, smash it to pieces, pulverize it, create chaos and make a tremendous mess, the bigger the better! We must do this to the present revisionist middle school attached to the Qinghua University, make rebellion in a big way, rebel to the end!”⁴ Mao also in his talk pointed out that “the revolution is in a quiet and desultory state” , “All those who suppressed the student movement will come to no good.” As a result, on July 28, the central committee withdrew the work group from the universities and high schools, going all out to mobilize the masses to liberate themselves. In this way, anarchy reigned in the campuses, and a storm was looming on the horizon.

On August 1, Mao in his letter to the Red Guards of the High School Attached to Qinghua University expressed his enthusiastic support. Such a move was no less than a booster to the students. What was originally sporadic violence against those teachers and students designated as “black gangs” during the work group period had now also become the norm. On August 5, Bian Zhongyun, vice-principal of the Girls’ High School attached to Beijing Normal University in which children of senior party cadres gathered, died in the torture in a series of “struggles” and “labor reform;” she became the first teacher to be beaten to death in the Cultural Revolution.⁵ Henceforth, just in the two months of August and September, a total of 1,772 people were killed in

³ “Hailing the First Big-character Poster of the Beijing University” (1966) *People’s Daily*; Editorial Group of the Renmin University of China, *Long Live the Victory of the Proletarian Cultural Revolution* (1966) p.337.

⁴“Long Live the Revolutionary and Rebellious Spirit of the Proletariat,” (1966) , Red Guards of the Middle School Attached to the Quinghua University, *op. cit.* footnote 1

⁵ Wang Youqin,,*Victims of the Cultural Revolution – A True Record of the Search for the Oppressed, Imprisoned and Killed* (2004) p.33.

Beijing.⁶

From what has been described above, it can be seen that the death of Bian Zhongyun, vice-principal of the Girls' High School attached to Beijing Normal University, marked the entering of the Cultural Revolution into the phase of "red terror." However, this "incident" (called "August 5 Incident" as it happened on August 5) is missing in the important official historical materials of the Cultural Revolution. After the Cultural Revolution, the reminiscences, papers, and comments related to the "August Fifth Incident" were gradually introduced, but with all blames pointing to the student leader of that school, Song Binbin – the one who had pinned a red band on Mao Zedong's arm. It was not until 2003 when the American director, Carma Hinton filmed the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) that Song Binbin broke her silence to defend herself. However, voices of attacks came hot on the heels of her defense.

In 2006, in *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011), a documentary filmed by the Chinese director Hu Jie, the responsibility was once again laid on Song Binbin through the use of images.

Due to the differences in perception between the two sides, this paper subjects these two documentaries to textual analysis, supplementing it with relevant literature and other information, to objectively outline the two different images of Song Binbin in the "August Fifth Incident" as perceived by people and their justice.

II. Images of Song Binbin in the *Morning Sun* and the *Though I Am Gone*

As said above, the violence of the Cultural Revolution commenced in campuses, and the first death from violence in Beijing campuses occurred in the Girls' High School attached to Beijing Normal University on August 5, 1966. After the Cultural Revolution, certain works that touched upon the "August 5 Incident" targeted at a twelfth grader of the then Girls' High School attached to the Beijing Normal University – Song Binbin.

Song Binbin was the daughter of Song Renqiong, one of the Eight Elders, founders of the People's Republic of China. In early June, 1966, at a time when the campus was in chaos, she jointly put up a big-character poster with other schoolmates criticizing the school authorities. After the work group stationed in the school, she became the assistant director of the Revolutionary Teachers and Students Committee, leading the Cultural Revolution in the school. On August 18, following the "August 5 Incident", Mao Zedong for the first time reviewed a million strong army of Red Guards in the Tiananmen Square, during which Song pinned a red band on his arm, while Mao made fun of Song's name, saying "Be martial (yaowu)!" Two days later, an onymous essay titled "I Pinned a Red Band on Chairman Mao's Arm" in the name of Song Yaowu (Song Binbin) was published in the *Guang Ming Daily*. Thenceforth, "Song Yaowu" appeared on the stage of history, was turned into a "symbol" that became the idol of Red Guards, and was also "reasonably" connected with the "August 5 Incident" to become the representative of "killers."

⁶ *A Chronicle of the Major Events of the Cultural Revolution in Beijing 1966-1967*, p.26; R. Macfarquhar and M. Schoenhals, *Mao's Last Revolution* (2009) p.139.

After the Cultural Revolution, the image of Song Binbin in related articles or monographs has one-sidedly been portrayed as a bloodthirsty devil. For example, in the *All Sorts of Rebellions* by the Cultural Revolution researcher Xu Youyu, Song is described as killing 7 to 9 people personally after encouraged by Mao to “be martial.”⁷

In 2003, the documentary, *Morning Sun*, produced by Carma Hinton(2003), the American director having close relationship with China, and her crew was released. The name of the film was excerpted from a passage of Mao Zedong,

*“The world is yours, and ours as well, but in the final analysis, it is yours. You young people are full of vigor and energy and on the rise like the morning sun. We place our hope in you.”*⁸

As the name suggests, this film investigated the effects of that movement that touched upon people’s souls of that generation from the perspective of the Red Guards. These interviewees, then Red Guards of that time, were now in their fifties and sixties. They came from families of different class backgrounds, including counter-revolutionaries, rightists and revolutionary cadres. Among them, the one who is most remarkable and has caused most ripples is Song Binbin.

This was the first time Song Binbin offered her explanation in response to the castigation over the years from all circles through the mass media. On the screen, Song hid herself in the shadow, with only her silhouette seen and relating in a low voice:

“I at that time was still very naïve, regarding the saying of the Chairman as casual conversation. Yet the newspapers very quickly published an essay, titled “I Pinned a Red Band on Chairman Mao.” The whole essay employed the first person, and also used a signature I did not know – Song Yaowu (Song Binbin.) I really could not have imagined that for the sake of propaganda, newspapers could even make up such a name for me, and published the essay in my name. By then, I thought I could no longer use my original name.” “[Destroying] the four olds, confiscating people’s property, all these not even once I had taken part in. Yet, rumors about me abounded everywhere, saying that the Song Yaowu who pinned a red band on Chairman Mao’s arm beat up people in such and such way. I felt especially aggrieved because I had always objected to beating people, to armed struggle. At that time, some Red Guards from many other schools came to our school to see me, but they were very disappointed and asked why I was such a person that in no way match with their imagination of me; this seemed to mean that you were not in any sense revolutionary. I then felt that I was completely deprived of this name and image of mine, and I did not have any slight degree of control and was particularly angry. At the same time, I was extremely grieved to find that so many people suffered because of this name. Our original intention was to criticize the capitalist-revisionist line of the cultural and educational circles; the Cultural Revolution now was already miles apart from what we

⁷ Xu Youyu, *All Sorts of Rebellions: Formation and Transformation of the Red Guards’ Spirit* (1999) p.64.

⁸ People's Liberation Army General Political Department, *Quotations from Chairman Mao* (1966) p.249.

thought when we took part in it.” “After the Up to the Mountain and Down to the Countryside Movement commenced, rumors were spreading even before I arrived. These rumors had it that Song Yaowu had committed killings and arson, raped women, and done all kinds of evils; as a result, the old villagers dared not take me without serious thought. However, through my diligent labor and getting along with them, they in the end also accepted me and treated me very kindly. When my father named me as “Binbin,” he had the hope that I would become a gentle girl with elegant manners; in fact, my character was true to my name, and had it not been for such a name, the Chairman would not have said “be martial,” and also would not have given rise to the series of rumors following from it. ‘Song Yaowu’ has gone against my moral principles, and I consider that the whole affair has become a historical misunderstanding and tragedy.”
(Carma Hinton, 2003)

That this film had given rise to much controversy afterwards was to a substantial degree due to the manner in which Song Binbin appeared in the film as well as the above content of her own account. For a long time, in the cognition of many people, Song, as she said in her own account, was an “evildoer,” and at least should be held responsible for the “August 5 Incident.” However, after emerging from a long period of silence through the image media, her concealed appearance in the form of “physically present without showing her face” contrasted so sharply with her radiance on the Tiananmen Rostrum. Director Carma explained that Song did not wish to show her real face as she did not wish to evoke the history of that period in people’s mind when they saw her real face.⁹ With respect to Song’s recounting, it came as no surprise that she voiced out her defense after having been rebuked for so many years. However, the focus dwelt on her denial of being “Song Yaowu” without giving any explanation and clarification of the “August 5 Incident.”

By and large, Song Binbin presented in the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) an obscure image of “self-defense.” Although “self-defense” was not a cause for criticism, and the director also wanted to give Song an opportunity to clarify (or even whitewash herself?), as what was involved was a controversial historical event, and as the controversial person involved presented a controversial image through this controversial manner, the result would only be more controversies.

In 2006, China’s independent documentary film maker, Hu Jie, filmed a long documentary, *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011), in response to the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003). This film focuses on Wang Jingyao, husband of the victim of the incident, vice-principal Bian Zhongyun. After the incident, Wang bought a camera, and took photos of the remains of Bian, the blood-stained clothes, and the big character posters that spread all over his home; the images were recorded on the negatives that were to become the eternal marks. These photographs span the whole film; this silent indictment at that time has now transformed into animated images, telling the stories of the how the victims of the Cultural Revolution met their death.

⁹ Zeng Huiyan, “Why the “sun” did not set – The *Morning Sun* Records the Journey of the Mind of the Cultural Revolution Generation.” Retrieved November 20, 2016, from http://www.edubridge.com/erxiantang/12/morningsun_zenghuiyan.htm

Although the content of the *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011) involved the “August 5 Incident”, there was no interviews of the people involved in it throughout the whole film, (which the director explained that no one was willing to be interviewed.)¹⁰ Rather it makes a low-key and non-sensational accusation from the perspective of the victims. For example, Mr. Wang took out an original document signed by seven people of the then Revolutionary Teachers and Students Committee to show that it was signed by the members attending the Committee on the night of the incident. Here, it is already evident that the responsibility for the incident should be shouldered by these seven people, and the signature on the far left was exactly “Song Binbin.” At about the middle part of the film, as Wang was relating a series of red terror, the newsreel of Mao reviewing the Red Guards on August 18, 1966 cut in. Song Binbin was on the joyous Tiananmen Rostrum, jubilantly pinning a red band on Mao’s arm, with the narrator excitedly saying that “the Red Guard from the Girls’ High School attached to Beijing Normal University pinned a red band on Chairman Mao’s arm. Chairman Mao asked for her name, to which she replied Song Binbin. Chairman asked if it was the “bin (meaning gentle and elegant” in “wenzhi binbin (meaning gentle and elegant in manners),” to which she replied yes. Chairman Mao followed by saying: Be martial.” This 18 second footage completely presents the interaction between Song and Mao, and is the only part of the film in which the image of the student involved appeared. Here the targeted person is crystal clear. With the remains of vice-principal Bian scarcely cold, the main student leader of the school jubilantly stood with Mao and then published an essay in the name of “Song Yaowu.” This is why many people found it hard to forgive in later years. So when this was connected with the list in the first part of the film, the “list” being the “August 5 Incident” while “Song pinned a red band on Mao’s arm” being the “August 18 Review,” the combined effect of the two was that Song Binbin in this film was treated as the main “inflictor” in the “August 5 Incident” and as the “face” linked to the violence in the Girls’ High School attached to Beijing Normal University. Even from the standpoint of the families of the victims, though Song might not have participated in beating up people, she was in their company¹¹ and was on the side of the “evil.” So, the result of the connection between the “August 5 Incident” and the “August 18 Review” was the formation of the “Song Binbin symbol,” which has become the politically correct cognition of this incident after the Cultural Revolution.

¹⁰ “An Exclusive Interview with Documentary Director Hu Jie: Reflections on the Cultural Revolution That we Still Have Not Emerged from Its Shadow.” Retrieved November 20, 2016, from <http://zhangjieping.blogspot.tw/2008/02/blog-post.html>

¹¹ Feng Xiang, “Wang Jingyao on the Death of Bian Zhongyun: I Have Not Forgotten History.” Retrieved November 20, 2016, from <http://www.infzm.com/content/98889>



Figure 2. “August 5 Incident” and the “August 18 Review” was the formation of the “Song Binbin symbol.”

Based on the above discussion, the images of Song Binbin in the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) and the *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011) are enumerated and compared in the table below:

Table 1

Images of Song Binbin in the Morning Sun and the Though I Am Gone

Images of Song Binbin in the <i>Morning Sun</i> and the <i>Though I Am Gone</i>		
	<i>Morning Sun</i>(Carma Hinton, 2003)	<i>Though I Am Gone</i> (Hu Jie, 2011)
Manner of Presentation	Attending interview in person, but concealing her appearance in shadow, and showing only her silhouette; speaking but not showing up	Selecting the newsreel of Mao reviewing the Red Guards in 1966; completely presenting the footage of the interaction between Song Binbin, then 17, and Mao.
Speech	Defending herself in the controversy; denying having published an essay in the name of “Song “Yaowu;” considering all rumors as misunderstanding without however mentioning the “August 5 Incident.”	The narrator relating the dialogue between Song and Mao regarding “Binbin” and “Yaowu.”
Overall image	Concealing the appearance gives people a negative feeling of being not open and candid, and of being obscure and ambiguous. Her whole “self-defense” to absolve herself seemed not to have first faced squarely the history of the controversy, displaying a magnanimous stance. The original intention of clarification, as a result of the above backfired moves, generated more controversies afterwards.	By linking up the “August 5 Incident” with the “August 18 Review” through the images of the Song-Mao interaction, the “Song Binbin symbol” naturally came into being, presenting the “classic” image of Song.

III. The Controversy of Song Binbin

The *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) interviewed several high school students (Red Guards) during the Cultural Revolution in order to investigate the relationship between the Cultural Revolution and the Red Guards. However, after it was released, the issues that it intended to explore seemed to be no longer relevant, as the audience focus their attention on the speech of Song Binbin and the manner of presenting her. The various disputes that came in the wake are listed in the table below:

Table 2

The Controversy over Song Binbin in the Morning Sun

The Controversy over Song Binbin in the <i>Morning Sun</i> (Carma Hinton, 2003)	
Topic of Controversy	Content of Controversy
Presentation in the form of concealing the appearance	Song's "speaking but not showing up" can be regarded as "only coming out after repeated calls, and reluctantly presenting herself on the screen while still hiding her face." ¹² As a result of the notoriety of the old Red Guards in the early phase of the Cultural Revolution, Song, under pressure, did not show up. However, Song had already been a public figure in the Cultural Revolution, and together with the video record, such a reason seemed far-fetched. ¹³ Also, under this protective umbrella, she could freely "defend herself," claiming that she had never beaten people up. Yet people in general would find it hard to accept such defense immediately. ¹⁴
Speech in the film	"Song Yaowu" was the "conferred name" by the "greater leader" and should be something about which one should be happy and extremely flattered. Yet Song said that she knew nothing of this "made-up" name. This kind of "resisting the great leader" did not fit in with the thinking logic during the Cultural Revolution. ¹⁵ Moreover, she later issued a statement and intervened in the Wuhan Incident. Additionally, Song said she "had always objected to beating people up and armed struggle," but when the school authorities were under violent attack, Song as the then student leader had not been seen to step in to stop it, which led to the escalation of the violence. ¹⁶

¹² Hua Xinmin, "To Begin with the Sun that Did Not Show Up – Watching the Film, *Morning Sun*," Retrieved November 20, 2016, from http://www.edubridge.com/erxiantang/12/morningsun_huaxinmin.htm

¹³ *Op. cit.*, footnote 9.

¹⁴ Hu Ping, "A Review of the *Morning Sun*." Retrieved November 20, 2016, from <http://www.huping.net/works/counthead/counthead-2/counthead-2-3.htm>

¹⁵ *Op. cit.*, footnote 9.

¹⁶ *Op. cit.*, footnote 14.

As a result of the interview with Song Binbin, the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) had aroused a great controversy. Then, the *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011) appeared. It accused the tragedy of the “August 5 Incident” from the perspective of the victims, and through the organization of images placed the responsibility on Song Binbin. Similarly, it aroused the people holding a different stand, whose arguments are shown in the table below:

Table 3

The Controversy over Song Binbin in the Morning Sun

The Controversy over Song Binbin in the <i>Though I Am Gone</i>(Hu Jie, 2011)	
Topic of Controversy	Content of Controversy
Was Song Binbin a “Red Guard”?	Prior to August 5, as a result of the withdrawal of the work group from the Girls’ High School attached to Beijing Normal University, the legitimacy of the ”Revolutionary Teachers and Students Committee” that originally supported the work group was weakened and its authority seriously eroded. This also undermined Song’s position as the then “student leader.” So the school at that time was in “a state of power vacuum” and there was no actual “Red Guard organization.” ¹⁷
Did Song Binbin beat people up?	There were no witnesses to Song’s taking part in beating people. ¹⁸
Why Song Binbin did not stop the Red Guards from beating people?	Members of the “Revolutionary Teachers and Students Committee” had no foreknowledge of the struggle of August 5, but even if they knew of it, they could only support it, ¹⁹ for “beating people” was seen at that time as “revolutionary behavior,” which hence should in no way be criticized. ²⁰
The 7-people list of that appeared in the film	Clarifying that this list was a list of guarantee co-signed by the teachers and students of the Revolutionary Teachers and Students Committee when they sent Bian to the hospital for treatment. It was to show that the seven people were to jointly shoulder the responsibility so that the hospital would save Bian. ²¹ They then were not the culprits of the incident.

The images of Song Binbin in the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) and the *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011) are diametrically different, which rendered people of different standpoints to have different opinions and comments on these presentations. However, as long as the historical truth remains buried, it can be believed that such controversy will never disappear.

¹⁷ Ye Weili, “The Death of Bian Zhongyun,” Qi Zhi (ed.) *Stories Are Not History – Documentaries and Writings on the Cultural Revolution* (Taipei: Showwe Information, April 2004,) p.30-35.

¹⁸ *Op. cit.*, footnote 17, p.47.

¹⁹ *Op. cit.*, footnote 17, p.59.

²⁰ *Op. cit.*, footnote 17, p.37.

²¹ *Op. cit.*, footnote 19, p.61.

IV. Conclusion

During the Cultural Revolution, all sorts of movements had caused the unnatural death of a massive number of people. Though the differences over the number of deaths remain unsettled, what can be certain is that the violence and death in the Cultural Revolution commenced in the campuses that should be places where the sound of reading aloud is heard.

On August 5, 1966, the students of the Girls' High School attached to Beijing Normal University beat the vice-principal, Bian Zhongyun, to death. Such an incident had become the indicator. After that, under the passive handling and secretly instigation by the authorities, the green light was given to violent behavior; "killing" became a "revolutionary action," which was not a dinner party, and could not be that gentle, kind, courteous, restrained and moderate.

After the Cultural Revolution, this incident has been included in the subject matter of some writings, all of which however pinned the responsibility on the student leader, Song Binbin. The logic behind is that she pinned a red band on Mao's arm, and accepted the conferred name "Song Yaowu," which was the symbol of "violence." So tracing back from this, the "August 5 Incident" could hardly be separated from Song's violence.

In 2003, Song defended herself through the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) in the manner of "speaking but not showing up." What was originally a superb opportunity for open and honest clarification generated instead more controversies as a result of her being unforthcoming and pretentious, and the image of overly "self-defensive" in her speech. In 2006, the documentary, *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011), on the other hand discoursed from the perspective of the victims of the incident, linking up the "August 5 Incident" with the "August 18 Review" to reinvent the "classic" "Song Binbin symbol."

The documentaries ended, but the controversy has not gone with it. In 2007, Song Binbin was selected as the honorary alumna of the Experimental High School attached to Beijing Normal University (originally the Girls' High School attached to Beijing Normal University), which naturally caused great reverberations; in 2014, Song publicly offered her apology to the victims of that time. Despite it being a positive act, this move still led to opposing views. Mr. Wang Jingyao, husband of vice-principal Bian, also refused to accept this apology.

From what has been said above, for reason of the obscurity of historical truth, the image and stand of Song Binbin in the "August 5 Incident" haven been shaped from different angles in the perspectives of people holding different views; however, historical facts must not be molded. What this paper has done is simply to treat the two documentaries, the *Morning Sun* (Carma Hinton, 2003) and the *Though I Am Gone* (Hu Jie, 2011), as its texts, and analyze the images of and controversy over Song Binbin presented in them. This Incident still has much more development and academic issues, which await follow-up mining and research.

References

Song Yongyi, *The Chinese Cultural Revolution Database* (CD) (2002).

"Hailing the First Big-character Poster of the Beijing University" (1966) *People's Daily*; Editorial Group of the Renmin University of China, *Long Live the Victory of the Proletarian Cultural Revolution* (1966)

Wang Youqin, *Victims of the Cultural Revolution – A True Record of the Search for the Oppressed, Imprisoned and Killed* (2004)

A Chronicle of the Major Events of the Cultural Revolution in Beijing 1966-1967, p.26; R. Macfarquhar and M. Schoenhals, *Mao's Last Revolution* (2009)

Xu Youyu, *All Sorts of Rebellions: Formation and Transformation of the Red Guards' Spirit* (1999)

People's Liberation Army General Political Department, *Quotations from Chairman Mao* (1966)

Zeng Huiyan, "Why the "sun" did not set – The *Morning Sun* Records the Journey of the Mind of the Cultural Revolution Generation." Retrieved November 20, 2016, from http://www.edubridge.com/erxiantang/12/morningsun_zenghuiyan.htm

"An Exclusive Interview with Documentary Director Hu Jie: Reflections on the Cultural Revolution That we Still Have Not Emerged from Its Shadow." Retrieved November 20, 2016, from <http://zhangjieping.blogspot.tw/2008/02/blog-post.html>

Feng Xiang, "Wang Jingyao on the Death of Bian Zhongyun: I Have Not Forgotten History." Retrieved November 20, 2016, from <http://www.infzm.com/content/98889>

Hua Xinmin, "To Begin with the Sun that Did Not Show Up – Watching the Film, *Morning Sun*," Retrieved November 20, 2016, from http://www.edubridge.com/erxiantang/12/morningsun_huaxinmin.htm

Hu Ping, "A Review of the *Morning Sun*." Retrieved November 20, 2016, from <http://www.huping.net/works/counthead/counthead-2/counthead-2-3.htm>

Ye Weili, "The Death of Bian Zhongyun," Qi Zhi (ed.) *Stories Are Not History – Documentaries and Writings on the Cultural Revolution* (Taipei: Showwe Information, April 2004.)

Contact email: tiga39@gmail.com