

*Unconsidered Ancient Treasure, Struggling the Relevance of Fundamental Indonesia Nation Philosophie “Bhinneka Tunggal Ika” in Forming Harmony of Multicultural Society*

Fithriyah Inda Nur Abida, State University of Surabaya, Indonesia  
Dewi Mayangsari, Trunojoyo University, Indonesia  
Syafiuddin Ridwan, Airlangga University, Indonesia

The Asian Conference on Cultural Studies  
Official Conference Proceedings  
0139

**Abstract**

Indonesia is a multicultural country consists of hundreds of distinct native ethnic, racist, and religion. Historically, the Nation was built because of the unitary spirit of its components, which was firmly united and integrated to make up the victory of the Nation. The plurality become advantageous when it reach harmony as reflected in the National motto “Bhinneka Tunggal Ika”. However, plurality also issues social conflict easily.

Ever since its independence, the scent of disintegration has already occurred. However, in the last decade, social conflicts with a variety of backgrounds are intensely happened, especially which is based on religious tensions. The conflict arises from differences in the interests of various actors both individuals and groups. It is emerged as a fractional between the groups in the society or a single group who wants to have a radically changes based on their own spiritual perspective. Pluralism is not a cause of conflict, but the orientation which is owned by each of the components that determine how they're viewing themselves psychologically in front of others.

“Bhinneka Tunggal Ika” is an Old Javanese phrase of the book “Sutasoma” written by Mpu Tantular during the reign of the Majapahit sometime in the 14th century, which literally means “Diverse, yet united” or perhaps more poetically in English: Unity in Diversity. The book describes how the Nation in the past, spawned a great civilization with the diversity as one of its characteristics.

This historical philosophy is a valuable treasure to establish the ideal life of the Nation. However, as time goes by, it is barely abandon and lost its meaning. Throughout Indonesian history, nationalism dialogue and religious pluralism became the important things that protect the diversity of the Nation. With its' fluctuative relations, it is not an easy process to have the harmonious in diversity, but it has to be done, to evoke ancient glory of harmonious diversity in the global era.

Keywords: Multicultural, Social Conflict, Religion, Bhinneka Tunggal Ika.

**iafor**

The International Academic Forum  
[www.iafor.org](http://www.iafor.org)

## **Introduction**

Indonesia is a multicultural country consists of hundreds of distinct native ethnic, racist, and religion. Historically, the Nation was built because of the unitary spirit of its components, which was firmly united and integrated to make up the victory of the Nation. For centuries Indonesia had lived with different societies, cultures, ethnics and various religions (Braddell, 1936). Being a nation of multicultural society, Indonesia has learned to live in differences hence harmony in diversity. The plurality become advantageous when it reach harmony as reflected in the National motto “Bhinneka Tunggal Ika”.

Plurality is a potential treasure for Indonesia. It presents the images of Indonesia’s rich and diverse cultural heritage. Its various perspectives, historical experiences, and local wisdoms are the aspects that can strengthen the nation unity. However, plurality also issues social conflict easily when mistrust, prejudice, and jealousy arise in the society.

Multicultural society shaped from distinguishes social identity such as different religions, ethnics, professions, and social backgrounds which is unique and different from others. Indonesia keeps on processing to weave the character and identity of its culture. However, the most important thing is the awareness of the consequences of social problems such as stability and social harmony and identity competition in a social background.

Ever since its independence, the scent of disintegration has already occurred. However, in the last decade, social conflicts with a variety of backgrounds are intensely happened, especially which is based on religious tensions (Ali, 2003). The conflict arises from differences in the interests of various actors both individuals and groups. It is emerged as a fractional between the groups in the society or a single group who wants to have a radically changes based on their own spiritual perspective. Pluralism is not a cause of conflict, but the orientation which is owned by each of the components that determine how they’re viewing themselves psychologically in front of others. Conflicts that happen in Indonesia are based on various backgrounds or themes, some of them are based on religions (Bertrand, 2004).

In the last couple years, several riots and conflicts has happened in various regions in Indonesia. Some of them happened in a big scale and occur in a long time, such as riots in Ambon (1998), Poso (1998), Maluku Utara (2000), and several riots in a small scale such as a conflict between local villagers with Ahmadiyah(Cikeusik, 2011), Church construction (Bogor, 2011), and conflict between Sunni and Syiah (Sampang, 2012). The conflicts happened not only among different religions but also between the members of the same religion who have different theology and practices. Regardless ofwhethersocialconflictdrive by political interest or economical aspect from a particular group; faith differences derived from a different interpretation and analysis on the religion sources. Often, religion used as a reason for one’s particular group to discredit another group(Wahid, 1998).

## **History and Primordial Wisdom**

Indonesia is an archipelagic country that has interesting geographical position. The archipelago's location has played a profound role in economic, political, cultural, and religious developments. For More than a thousand years ago the archipelago had

served trading network and destined to play an important role as a transition area and a meeting ground for people around the world (Cribb, 2000). Historical records that the geographical position of Indonesia took an important route connecting Asia with the Mediterranean world, including North Africa and Europe. D.H. Burger says (1960:15) that the traffic starts from the Northern coast of Sumatra along the East coast, continues to the South sea of Java. The voyages to West head to Benggala and North toward China. This chain of route is part of the famous series of trade known as the Silk Road. This trading routes leads to the entrance of various cultures and credence's to the Indonesian society. These wide ranges of cultures and beliefs are easily blended and adapted with the local culture. Furthermore, the original indigenous cultures have been enriched by the complex cultural mixture from different countries. The easily process of adaptation and syncretism of the new influences are the proof of the Indonesian's liveliness and openness. The original indigenous cultures of Indonesia is very adaptable, as Soekmono (1961:10) says that the origin of Indonesian culture give a space for every new influences and values that comes long as it is not contradict the original culture. This connection shaped Indonesia into the multi-ethnic and religiously diverse nation that we see today.

The geographical position of Indonesia not only gives a huge impact of the bridges of cultural and commercial exchanges but also brings a significant factor to the development of the greatest empires in Indonesia. Two biggest kingdoms that hold hegemony in south Asia are Srivijaya and Majapahit Empires. In the 7th century, the powerful Buddhist kingdom of Srivijaya arose on Sumatra. It controlled much of Indonesia until 1290, when it was finally conquered by the Hindu Majapahit Empire from Java (Groneveldt, 1960). Majapahit influence is considered to be one of the greatest and the most powerful in the history of Indonesia and Southeast Asia. This empire reached the height of its power and influence under the guiding hand of the Prime Minister Gajah Mada which also served as one of the most influential empires in the Indonesian history. Both Srivijaya and Majapahit kingdoms are the center of civilization of that time which served as bridges for cultural and religious diversity (Hinduism, Buddhism, and Islam). (Collins, 2005; Fatimi, 1963; Ricklefs, 2005).

The plurality of religious traditions and cultures is the characteristic of Srivijaya and Majapahit kingdoms. The spirit of tolerance and acceptance is an essential element in the foundation of the two kingdoms. The cultural narration "Bhinneka Tunggal Ika" written by Mpu Tantular in the Majapahit reign shows the plurality in unity. The word means "We are of many kinds, but we are one" or as literally translated "Unity in Diversity". It expresses the profound reality of a pluralistic society in which a strong desire to achieve unity among heterogenous religions, ethnic groups, and cultures is prominent. Rahmat Subagya (2002: 15) maintains that the symbol "Bhinneka Tunggal Ika" contains a philosophy based on a synthesis of two reciprocal poles namely plurality and unity. This cultural narration describes not only how the nation lays the great civilizations in the past, but also portraits how the nation had lived in a pluralism and multicultural society, where different religions and cultures live in harmony; where diversity is celebrated in everyday life. This evidence shows that the values of tolerance and acceptance are highly respected and become the archetype of the Indonesian since ancient time.

The native of Indonesian believe in the powerful but unseen spiritual entity that can be both benevolent and malevolent. They believe that inanimate objects had spirits

which could affect the well-being of those around them. There were also considered to be spirits in trees, rocks, mountains as well as people. Before various religions came to the archipelago, the ancestors adhere animism and dynamism (Alisyahbana, 1988). These beliefs have persisted since ancient times and have become part of the syncretism system of Indonesian cultures and religious today. Animism and dynamism have existed since Indonesia's earliest history. Furthermore, the indigenous original culture of Indonesian was built from traditional culture that has made a strong spiritual behavior that is animism and dynamism activity. When Hinduism, Buddhism Islam, Christianity came several years later, animism and dynamism still exist and confluence with the new beliefs. The social and religious beliefs of the spirit and mysticism closely influence with the way of thinking, the customs, and the cultural of Indonesian people. Animism and Dynamism teach to respect the nature, water, forest, sky and the other things who have give the power and enjoyable life for people. The beliefs tied Indonesian people to the biggest power in the universe which make them hold rituals, offerings, and ceremonies to respect the spirits and supernatural power. The faith to the greatest power and the perception to the harmony of human being and universe is the core principal why ancient beliefs can easily adapt the new values and religions. Genuinely speaking, animism and dynamism have congruency with today's religion, the power of spirituality and mysticism also appeared in the modern religions. Buddhism and Hinduism both have ritual and ceremony to the gods, or devata. Islam and Christian also believe in the spiritual power and metaphysical. Therefore, every religions and cultures in Indonesia are tightly connected with the ancient beliefs. The new cultures and beliefs are suited with the original culture and ancient beliefs. Often the old rituals are adopted in the new religions to make it more acceptable (Taufik, 2013). Religion often considered as guidance; which contain the message of peace related with one's inner peace or social situation. It occurs in the form of revelation (from God) and philosophical (derived from human's wisdom). Then why religion becomes the background of violence and conflict? In a modern era where multiculturalism and freedom become the characteristics of the society, religion can neither serve as pillars of harmony nor justification of violence.

### **Conflict and the Nature of Religions**

To understand religion reality dualism – peace medium and justification of violence-it should be understood first the nature of religion dan how religious precept shape the followers attitude and behavior.

Religion related conflict (differentiated with religion based conflict), as any other social conflicts, is a horizontal group clash that developed formatively (affiliated to certain society or community) otherwise definitely (possessed certain characteristic). As a relatively religious society, Indonesian people are rally sensitive with creed issues (Hosen, 2005). Comprehension of religion related conflict dynamic require understanment of the nature of religion itself.

A religion compiled by many aspects. For the believers, religion understood as doctrine, feeling, organization, life style or pattern, and set of ritual (Titus, et al., 1994). As a doctrine, religion precept considered sacred dan undisputable. Distinguished from science wich obtained by exact testable research, religious guideline believed as fundamental and absolute truth. Even though, some religious traditions provide space (even encourage) for people to critically empowering their rational thought, so that the believe achieved would not be just naive obidience.

Interpretation of religious textual precepts still over important place for human logic and common sense.

Religious appreciation also tend to involve profound feeling of attachment to God. Veneration to the God raising a strong happiness affection in the believers. Even though, some people consider that merely affection is insufficient. It can easily lead as tray if it's not accompanied side by side with rational common sense.

As a society, followers of a religion habitually compose their belief as institutional foundation to express their fate. The Presence of leader and followers make social relationship clearly acknowledged. Religious formal organization also formed to achieve ideal goals, and strengthen social attachment among the followers. Nonetheless, some people understood that they don't need any structure nor organization for worshipping God and accomplish good deeds.

When religion reflected deep dedication, it can't separated from daily life. It would be frame of reference for someone to think and act. Further, it would also shapes life style and pattern. Spiritual obidience in formal religion performed in form of rituals simbolized certain meaning. Although, in the implementation of those rituals, one might not truly comprehend the core meaning, and merely facused on rutinity.

Religions oftenly not just considered as a guidlene to achieve genuine happpiness, yet also regard as perspective frame adopted by believers to percieve the world and how the life should lived. Religion offer explenations about human existence in the mysteriously indefinite universe, and those explenations provide assurance and safety feeling.

It is not enough to understand religion simply as worshipping relationship and set of rules humanity base on sacred manuscripts. Yet, the difference of belief and religious attributes could emerge segementation social groups. Religion, at the side of modium of social cohesivity and solidarity, could also precipitator of social disintegration. Fanatic followers could easily consider those who have difference of belief as infidel and lose dheep. Religious differenciation could emerge in form of sectarianism segmentation that possess range of disparity from superficial to the essential of religious construct.

Religious community could easier accept reality that another religion followers have different ideas in interpretating life and universe, yet the difference among the same religion frequently harder. Believers of a religion tend to expect the same religion followers have the same way of view.

Some believers are more tolerable in accepting difference, and understand that mistake in interpretation could be forgiven as long as it done carefully, by competence persons, with high responsibility, and possess together goodness orientation. In other dichotomy, some believers tend to easily claim that those who doesn't has same interpretation are infidel and unforgiven. They consider that wrong interpretation, however, could impair the purity of the religion cunstruct.

Religious diversity turns out has it's own dilemma. In one side, it gives positif contribution to the nation development. But in other side, the diversity could also

become condition where conflict seed could bloom easily. In certain cases in Indonesia, conflict emerge from house of worship building (which considered by community as violation of regulation or local norms), economical discrepancy, religious precept deviation, and political issues. Those issues then occasionally draw on by some people, triggered to areligious conflict. In some research held by Indonesian Government, religious related conflict rooted from those issues mentioned, then expanded to a religious based conflict for certain agendas (Ali, 2003).

Religious nuanced conflicts in Indonesia are not purely base on belief diversity. This condition related with daily cultural characteristic of Indonesian people, who realize their identity as a diverse nation, and formally (through educational system in school) they are taught to live peaceful in diversity. Generally, it is consentable for them, as long as among follower of religios or among sect in one religion can appreciate and respect each other. Even though, discrepancy (social, economic, or politic) as well as stigmatic stereotype among group can cause discomfort and jealousy. Violence is never be intrinsic aspect of religion, yet by those discrepancy it simply can be utilized and justificate offensive act be done.

Conflict causality can be sometimes base on claim of truth. But dominantly it triggered initially by elements that remotely related with religion itself. Religious identity oftenly used as an effectife tool to get social endorsement, legitimation dan empowering the position of each group that has certain agendas. Meanwhile, the main cause considered came from external aspect of religion. This conditions are compounded by inadequate law enforcement, complicated by globalization and reformation impact, which goes out control (Ali, 2003).

Conflicts held by religion followers can be rooted by religious and non religious factors (Wahid, 1984). Regardless of its cause, the presence of religion in society can have two possibilities, namely as a factor of integration or vice versa, disintegration (Wach, 1971). Religion can serve as a unifying medium - especially in conditions of a fragmented society in high tribal sentiments - by raising awareness of shared spiritual and implement its teachings for the good of the whole universe. Religions teach brotherhood on the basis of faith, nationality and humanity. Religion teaches peace and harmony between humans and fellow creatures. Religion taught noble character, orderly life and adherence to the rules of society.

However, religion may be a factor underlying the disintegration when out in the field in the form of exclusivity, understood narrowly and rigidly. Religion comes with a set of rituals and belief systems to which gradually gave birth to a separate community distinct from the community of other faiths. The sense of difference was intensified when the adherents of a religion have come to the attitude and the belief that the only true religion is the religion that they embraced, while others wrong. Exclusivity that grow more severe can lead to negative prejudice or attitude despise to other religion followers. Internally, religious texts in the religion are also open to various interpretations that can cause diversive sects and religious groups, even conflicting with each other, triggering a conflict (Wahid, 1984).

In addition to the factors associated with the doctrine as noted above, there are other religious factors that may indirectly condition the vulnerability of conflict among religious communities. Among the factors: religious broadcasting without maturity

and tolerance, marriage or adoption between adherents of different religions, religious festivities without considering the condition of other religious communities, the interpretation of religious texts and rituals that are different from the mainstream group, perceived blasphemy, establishment house of worship which is considered disturbing the surrounding community (Wahid, 1985).

As for the non-religious factors were identified as the cause religious disharmony include several things, among others: economic inequality, political interests, differences in socio-cultural values, advances in information technology and transportation (Hasan and Ahmad, 1986).

### **Ancient Treasure Dan Beyond**

Indonesia basically is a country of pluralism and diversity. The existence of pluralism and attitudes toward respect for diversity in Indonesian archipelago has long been in a place. Pluralism is neither foreign nor unknown to this nation's past. Since ancient times, the ancestors had lived in a multicultural society. Animism and dynamism enable the new influences to come and adapt with the origin (Koentjaraningrat, 1958). The primordial values to live in harmony both with nature and human being have shaped the perception of Indonesian that differences are not harmful.

Nowadays, the unity in diversity still becomes the founding principle of the modern Indonesian nation. The concept of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* that philosophically contains the essential unity of various differences and multiculturalism in Indonesia is not a unifying system which can instantly applied for the nation. However, the idea of unity in diversity implies that despite enormous ethnic, linguistic, cultural, geographic and religious differences, the people of Indonesia are all citizens of a single, unified nation. The nation declares the essential unity of its members despite ethnic, regional, social or religious differences. Indonesia values unity and cooperation above all else and yet it is a country of more diversity than perhaps any other. Furthermore, *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* is the symbol and projection of the Indonesian archetype that has been deeply rooted since ancient times. It is an ancient treasure of Nusantara that portrait how the ancestors keep the harmony and unity in multiculturalism condition. Unity in diversity expressed the collective wisdom of Nusantara, which had developed over the centuries and was already deeply rooted within the culture of a wide geographic region that lay at the crossroads of many ancient civilizations. However, the atmosphere of pluralism has not always been breezy but on the contrary is often under attack. The values of unity in diversity are weakened from time to time. Egoism and exclusivity from particular groups that want homogeneous can really harm the Nation. Therefore, the unity of this nation depends on the willing to keep primordial values and continuously voice local wisdom in order to remind everyone about the identity of the nation.

Religion conflicts in Indonesia is a multidimensional problem. As a main aspect of the Indonesian society, religion must be regarded and practiced as a whole. Every religion has two dimensions: the ascetics and the social, and every adherent should perform those two dimensions in balance (Mibtadin, 2010). Besides intrinsic aspects in religion, conflict reconciliation need to be focused on the extrinsic aspects. Different from the past, the harmony in nowadays situation can only be achieved by several conditions; there is equality and social justice in the society, real action of government

roles to overcome the problems, and appropriate law to strengthen and secure the humanity and diversity in Indonesia.

Bhinneka Tunggal Ika is the local wisdom which remind the nation that nearly two thousand years ago, Nusantara 's civilization has constituted a unique experiment, and direct experience of, human being s' ability to live peacefully amid diversity. Of prioritizing harmony with others, above one's own self-interest. Of spiritual self-confidence, this allows one to experience and embrace new ideas and teachings. Of knowing that differences of opinion (and religion) are not harmful. By holding the principles and philosophy of life based on Bhinneka Tunggal Ika, diversity is in fact like colors emerging from a prism, derived from a single source of Light. The emergence of cultural and religion diversity in Indonesia which is derived from primordial philosophy of the ancient archipelago is the values that still relevant today and need to be preserved as the greatest local wisdom of the Nation.

As a multiculturalism society, Indonesia needs well-planned system to reduce the conflicts. The education system can positioned as a mediator factor of the process of reducing conflict. This consideration are particularly focused on formal education, due to the massive scope and standardized. Nevertheless, informal education can also be a means of support in micro coverage. The education system is not only instill pedagogic instruction, but also the attitudes, values and behavior (Eide, 1999). In a cultural paradigm, education should include aspects of multiculturalism.

Multicultural education in Indonesia must be accompanied by efforts to promote local wisdom. The themes can be implemented in it could be: (a) identification, the recognition of the differences that exist, (b) tolerance, respect the interests of other groups, (c) assimilation, for example, by the majority of minority acceptance into a new identity which unites, or (d) social integration, which means melting where there are equal rights with respect for differences in language, customs, and religion or belief.

### **Conclusion**

The ancestors of Indonesia has experienced repeated changes and diversity with the interpretation and understanding of the diverse local communities, indigenous and migrants. There is legacy that is the core of epistemological knowledge about the perspective of the world, which is passed down from generation to generation. Local wisdom of Indonesian nation were formed from a value system that emphasizes harmoni, diversity, humanism and morality can guide the ancestors live peacefully side by side. Local wisdom can be extracted through a careful study over cultural symbols, for example; rituals, literacy, local myths and legends, rituals, architecture (Meliono, 2011).

The multicultural education system especially focused on formal education can positioned as a mediator factor of the process of reducing conflict. Multiculturalism education can be given starting from the early childhood to the higher education. By teaching the differences and diversities, learners will conceive that understanding and tolerance are needed to appreciate the differences. Individual who comprehends the diversities could encourage the healthy competence in the way of thinking, expressing ideas and socializing with others. Understanding the differences also prevent the domination of one over the other (Ujan, 2009).



## References

- Ali, Mursyid. (2003). *Konflik Sosial Bernuansa Agama di Indonesia Seri II*. Jakarta: Badan Litbang Agama dan Diklat Keagamaan Puslitbang Kehidupan Beragama, Departemen Agama Republik Indonesia, 2003, 82.
- Alisyahbana, S. Takdir. (1988). *Revolusi Masyarakat dan Kebudayaan di Indonesia*. Dian Rakyat: Jakarta.
- Bertrand, J. (2004). *Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia*. Cambridge : Cambridge University Press.
- Budiwanti, Erni. (2002). *Islam Sasak*. LKIS, Yogyakarta.
- Burger, D.H. (1958). *Sedjarah Ekonomi-Sosiologis Indonesia I*. Pradjanparamita: Djakarta
- Collins, James T. (2005). *Bahasa Melayu, Bahasa Dunia - Sejarah Singkat* (dalam bahasa Indonesia). Jakarta: KITLV bekerjasama dengan Pusat Bahasa dan Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Eide, A. (1999). *Multicultural dan Intercultural Education: Conditions of Constructive Group Accommodation*. Universitas Oslo: Norwegian Institute for Human Rights.
- Fatimi, S.Q. (1963). "Two Letters from the Maharaja to the Khalifah". *Islamic Studies* (Islamabad), 2:1, hlm. 121-40.
- Gronoveldt, (1960). *Historical Notes on Indonesian and Malaya Compiled from Chinese Sources*. Bhratara: Djakarta
- Hasan, A. R., & Achmad, A. (1986). "Usaha Pengembangan Enasipasi Sosial: Beberapa Catatan," A Rifa'i Hasan dan Amrullah Achmad (ed.), *Perspektif Islam dalam Pembangunan Bangsa*, Yogyakarta: PLP2M, 1986, hlm. 323-335.
- Hosen, Nadirsyah. (2005). "Religion and the Indonesian Constitution: A Recent Debate". *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*. Cambridge University Press. doi:10.1017/S0022463405000238.
- Koentjaraningrat, (1958). *Metode Antropologi dalam Penyelidikan Masyarakat dan kebudayaan Indonesia*. Universitas Indonesia: Jakarta
- Meliono, I. (2011). Understanding the Nusantara Thought and Local Wisdom as an Aspect of the Indonesian Education. *Tawarikh: International Journal for Historical Studies*, 2(2) 2011.
- Mibtadin, S. (2010). *Humanisme dalam Pemikiran Abdurrahman Wahid*. Tesis. Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga.
- Pickering, W.S.F. (1984). *Durkheim's Sociology of Religion*. London: Routledge.
- R Soekmono, (1961). *Pengantar Sejarah Kebudayaan Indonesia I*. Trikarya: Djakarta
- R. Braddell. (1936) "An introduction to the study of ancient times in the Malay Peninsula and the Straits of Malacca". *JMBRAS* 14 (1936) pp. 1-71.
- Ricklefs, M.C. (2005) *A History of Modern Indonesia, ca. 1300 to the present*. London & Basingstoke: Macmillan; Bloomington : Indiana University Press, 1981. 2nd edition (Palgrave and Stanford University Press) 1993. 3rd edition (Palgrave and Stanford University Press) 2001. Revised Indonesian edition 1991 (Gadjah Mada University Press); 2nd revised Indonesian edition 2005 (Serambi)
- Robert Cribb, (2000). *Historical atlas of Indonesia*. University of Hawaii Press: Honolulu
- Santoso, Soewito. (1975). *Sutasoma, a Study in Old Javanese Wajrayana*. New Delhi: International Academy of Culture.

- Taufik, M. (2013). Harmoni Islam dan Budaya Lokal. Ilmu Ushuluddin, Juli 2013, hlm. 255-270 Vol. 12, No. 2
- Titus, H., Smith, M., & Nolan, R. (Eds.). (1994). *Living Issues in Philosophy*, 9<sup>th</sup> ed. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Ujan, Andre Ata et al. (2009). Multikulturalisme Belajar Hidup Bersama Dalam Perbedaan. Indonesia: PT Malta Printindo, hlm. 124.
- Wach, J. (1971). *Sociology of Religion*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 1971, hlm. 35
- Wahid, A. (1984). "Massa Islam dalam Kehidupan Bernegara dan Berbangsa," *Prisma*, edisi extra, 1984, hlm. 3-9.
- Wahid, A. (1985). "Merumuskan Hubungan Ideologi Nasional dan Agama," *Aula*, Mei 1985, hlm. 31
- Wahid, A. (1989). "Pribumisasi Islam," Muntaha Azhari dan Abdul Mun'im Saleh(ed.), *Islam Indonesia Menatap Masa Depan*, Jakarta: P3M, 1989, hlm. 81-96.
- Wahid, A. (1998). "Dialog Agama dan Masalah Pendangkalan Agama," dalam Komarudin Hidayat & Ahmad Gaus (ed), *Passing Over: Melintasi Batas Agama*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.