

*Subaltern Bugis Women in Short Story “Ketika Saatnya”:
Spivakian Postcolonial Studies*

Ramis Rauf, Universitas Khairun, Indonesia
M. Ridha Ajam, Universitas Khairun, Indonesia
Arlinah Majid, Universitas Khairun, Indonesia
Afriani Ulya, Halu Oleo University, Indonesia

The Asian Conference on Arts & Humanities 2023
Official Conference Proceedings

Abstract

This study aims to reveal the phenomenon of social-cultural facts of Bugis women as subalterns in the short story “Ketika Saatnya,” written by Darmawati Majid. The problem in this research is the narration of the third-world women in Darmawati’s *Ketika Saatnya*. This study uses the subaltern theory by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. The term subaltern refers to a social, political, and geographical population subdued by a group that controls them. A subaltern is a group whose voice is always represented and becomes a tool of a hegemonic practice that symbolizes political, military, social, and even cultural domination by one group over another. The study reveals that the position of women as subalterns are narrated as a subaltern group trying to convey their voice to be heard even though they occupy a position as “third-world women” who are trapped between tradition and modernization.

Keywords: Subaltern, Bugis Women, Spivakian, Third-World Women, Postcolonial Studies

iafor

The International Academic Forum
www.iafor.org

Introduction

Since immemorial, women have been objects and positioned as women from the Third World in literary works and subaltern groups. Terminologically, the term subaltern refers to junior officers in the British military context, meaning subordinates. The word is often used to describe officers who are low-ranking or below the rank of captain. In the study of critical theory and postcolonialism, the term subaltern refers to a population that is socially, politically, and geographically outside the hegemonic power structure of the colonial nation. Antonio Gramsci first introduced the term subaltern through his work on cultural hegemony, categorizing excluded and ostracized groups in the social order (Morton, 2008).

Spivak developed from these negative connotations that subaltern is not just a classy word indicated for the oppressed class or the "Other" group. For Spivak, in postcolonial terms, the subaltern is not only about categorization as the oppressed or the oppressed working class but also about anyone whose voice is limited by the access that represents them. The term subaltern was originally—by Spivak—used to identify widows (in the Sati incident) who were oppressed by the dominating solid power relations in Indian society. Widowing is a subject among other subjects. It is stated in the essay *Can the Subaltern Speak?* For example, subaltern material from Mahasweta Devi Stanayadini's story is used in "A Literary Representation of the Subaltern (1988)" to examine various "elite" Western theoretical discourses to reveal their limitations and absence (the West). Spivak concentrates on minor characters, subplots, or motifs that seem marginal to reveal the unconscious racial nature of the conceptual framework operating in various nineteenth-century female canonical texts. A common characteristic is the "re-constellation" or "catachresis" technique (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

Catachresis is a more localized tactical maneuver that involves removing specific images, ideas, or rhetorical strategies from their place in particular narratives and using them to open up new areas of meaning (often in direct opposition to conventionally conceived meanings and functions). It redefined Gramsci's concept of the "subaltern" reasonably radically. While in "Can the Subaltern Speak?," he takes a precise definition of "Otherness" in Derrida's writings, describes it in the context of the eschatological sense of "Other," and reconceptualizes it to criticize other (post) colonial notions of metropolitan. (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

Third-world women as subaltern subjects presented in fiction, especially literary works, display massive socio-cultural conditions related to gender and discourse in today's era. The issue of third-world women displayed by the author in a literary work aims to convey a message about socio-cultural conditions to be understood by the reader as a phenomenon of ongoing socio-cultural construction. From these descriptions, the researcher traces the track record of third-world women narrated in an anthology of short stories, "Ketika Saatnya," written by Darmawati Majid. In this anthology of short stories, the author presents women's defeat in expressing their voices, either because they are silenced by tradition or modernization. Thus, the researcher formulates the problem of this research into the question, "How are third-world women narrated in the short story *Ketika Saatnya?*"

The significance of the problem is expected to be a forum for educating the millennial generation about the use of regional literature as a form of diverse identity to build the culture of the Indonesian nation. Through the short story "Ketika Saatnya," students are expected to

be able to see the phenomenon of socio-cultural facts in terms of balancing the position between women and men to achieve gender equality in the social order.

Many researchers have researched the study of women in the third world. One of them is Asep Deni Saputra. In 2011, the alumnus of the Faculty of Languages and Arts, State University of Jakarta, wrote a scientific journal entitled "Subaltern Women in Poskolonial Indonesian Literature." He concludes that the position of women Nyai Ontosoroh, Surati, Prinses van Kasiruta, Pulette (Buru Tetralogy), Nyai Dasima (Njai Dasima), and Srintil (Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk) have been marginalized, or rather become subaltern groups, to occupy the lowest space. Women are not able to get up and show their existence. Even the women did not dare to appear to put up a fight even though they knew they would find defeat. In this case, Spivak's statement has been justified and is considered a problem that does not require resolution because Spivak's statement regarding doubts about subaltern groups has found the answer. Subaltern groups will not be able to speak and determine their life choices. They will remain silenced forever. It has been narrated by Pramoedya Ananta Toer, G. Francis, and Ahmad Tohari as authors who subject women in their novels.

A decade later, in 2021, M. Hafidzullah S.M. et al., a postgraduate literature student at the Faculty of Cultural Sciences, Gadjah Mada University, wrote about "Representation of Third World Women as Postcolonial Constructions in Chris Cleave's Little Bee Novel." This research implies that it paradoxically finds two opposing poles when the author represents women who are considered to be from two different worlds. West is considered to have a unique character, and East could be better. The construction of women presented in the material object is a return to the image of Eastern women. The image of the results from the author's subjectivity as a narrator gives rise to a view of constructing and representing women. In the novel, the depiction and presence of Little Bee and his refugee friends, as well as Sarah's character, implies an opposing dimension between race, ethnicity, and collective memory.

The Subaltern Concept

Consistently, Spivak pays attention to the practice and politics of pedagogy, an area that should be discussed more in detail in Said and Bhabha. In particular, Spivak sought new ways to incorporate non-Western cultural productions into Western academies without setting aside his challenges to the metropolitan canon and modes of study and consequently perpetuating the "subalternation" of the so-called "third world" literature. Spivak outlines several ways what he calls "transnational cultural studies" can be facilitated, particularly at the graduate level, suggesting steps as diverse as discontinuing single-author studies, expanding the range of language requirements to include non-Western languages, and more significant concerns. Nonliterary media and forms of popular culture integrate critical theory more effectively into postcolonial studies. Spivak rejects the idea that there is uncontaminated space outside modes and objects of analysis and that postcolonial criticism has access based on "life experience" or cultural origin (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

There are three criticisms of Spivak. First, Spivak asserts that Deleuze's reference to the "labor struggle" as an organizing principle in his political theory and practice is flawed by unfounded Eurocentrism so that Deleuze "ignores the international division of labor, a gesture that often characterizes poststructuralist political theory." Second, Spivak argues that Foucault and Deleuze typically favor micro-resistance structures defined by local conflict and operating through voluntary association at the expense of macro logical and "objective"

determinations such as class interests, global capitalism, and nation-state alliances. However, he should have paid more attention to the effectiveness of the micrologic resistance pattern. Spivak argues that they should not be allowed to remove larger power configurations and other potential sites and resistance modes. Third, Spivak reintroduced the concept of ideology to challenge Foucault and Deleuze's construction of the subject according to what he saw as the simple economy of "want" (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

In this view, making subjectivity, agency, and identity coherent and legible in a way that, ironically, is comparable to what liberal humanism proposes: "In the name of will, they reintroduce undivided subjects into discourses of power." In contrast, Spivak's theory of the subject draws equally on the classical Marxist model of the "split and dislocated subject" at the level of individual and class identity and on Althusser (subjects that are worthy of being held together only, and given the illusion of free subjectivity by ideological interpellation). Spivak states it is better to leave the subaltern as an inaccessible subject of emptiness. It reveals the horizons and boundaries of Western knowledge (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

Spivak sees deconstruction as having a more direct "affirmative" mode. Spivak considers deconstruction to produce a greater awareness of excluded or marginalized social constituencies. There is a parallel between what is suppressed or ignored to enable a particular theory or text to function as a coherent or authoritative narrative and how the dominant social faction operates in a hegemonic manner. Spivak also uses deconstruction to subvert the binary system, which is the dominant discourse's basis for legitimizing their (Western) power. For Spivak—like Derrida—direct counter-hegemonic discourses are more likely to be canceled or even appropriated by the dominant than the "tangential" or "wild" guerrilla engagement modes, so Spivak advocates "negotiation" and "criticism" modes that unsettle the dominant party (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

For Spivak, two specific areas of reinterpretation of the dominant ideology occur in counter-hegemonic discourse; the definition of the identity and the role of the subject's investigation. For Spivak, Derrida's conception of the worthy subject is instrumental in preventing the postcolonial struggle from falling into fundamentalist politics through his critique of traditional ways of understanding "identity, belonging, and origin." In Spivak's view, the self or subject must be understood not as innate or given but as discursively formed and, therefore, as inevitable "worthy." The effects of the subject can be briefly plotted as follows: what appears to operate as a subject may be part of an extensive discontinuous network (text in the general sense) of strands that may be called politics, ideology, economics, history, sexuality, and language. The different knots and configurations of the strands are determined by heterogeneous determinations, which depend on various circumstances producing the effect of the subject of operation (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

Spivak also refers to Lacanian theory to describe the feasibility of the subject as a consequence of its emergence through the symbolic order written in the language. Spivak also cites Foucault to point out the many inevitable subject positions, with which he carves out the textuality of both writers and readers and, by extension, the subject in general. Textuality is where the self loses its boundaries and traces of the other, preventing identity and consciousness from being fully present. Spivak rejects all definitions of identity in the essentialist conception of origin or possession. A necessary consequence of Spivak's theory of identity according to the "spread" and "textual" model is that he rejects the argument that only postcolonial subjects can deal with the subject of postcoloniality – a perspective which

he considers "nativism" or "reverse ethnocentrism." Meanwhile, Spivak accepts that, too often, postcolonial subjects remain broadly discussed by metropolis (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

As noted, affirmative deconstruction also manifests in Spivak's attention to the role and politics of the "subject of investigation." In *Subaltern Studies: Deconstructing Historiography*, Spivak argues that the group mistakenly assumes they can override the implications of creating a space where the oppressed can speak—in this regard, repeating the problem identified by "Three Women's Texts and a Critique of Imperialism" essay (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

Spivak makes this point by juxtaposing the work of Foucault and Deleuze with an explanation of how the British assumed the prerogative to speak on behalf of oppressed indigenous women in the discourse surrounding the prohibition of Sati in early nineteenth-century India. An essential maneuver, as in the case of Rani of Sirmur, was to build an image of Indian women who "justified" the adoption of the empire's "modernizing, liberating and progressive" regime, a process that also consolidated the British imperial self-image as superior to civilization as compared to indigenous women who degraded and their local oppressors. As Spivak points out in the essay "Three Women's Texts and a Critique of Imperialism," St John Rivers missionary at *Jane Eyre* justifies her missionary project as one that involves improving her race and the "liberation" of India. Such attitudes have continued into this century, even among opponents of colonial rule (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

At the heart of the appropriation process in the discourse around Sati is the notion of "voice"—denoting the will and free agency—to subaltern women. In the case of Britain, the voice is said to be calling the imperialists for liberation; according to the native male, the voice agrees with his practice. No version—according to "Can the Subaltern Speak?" which may reliably represent the "real" voice of the female subaltern. On the one hand, Spivak points out that the British cannot even spell the names of the people they have "saved" and often translate the proper names into common nouns. On the other hand, Spivak notes that the violence Sati inflicts on Indian society is directly proportional to the amount of property the widow owns—and thus, poor women are often spared the trials of their wealthier sisters. In both discourses of sati, the subaltern voice uses ventriloquism, "spoken" as it is. Spivak suggests that one "never finds a female voice-conscious testimony." So, between colonialism and indigenous patriarchy, "the figure of women disappears, not into pure nothingness but into alternating violence which is a displaced figure from third world women trapped between tradition and modernization" (Moore-Gilbert, 1997).

The method used in this analysis is a qualitative research method. This study tries to describe the data with words or sentences distinguished according to certain elements and parts related to the research objectives and to obtain research results. The data source used in this research is the short story "Ketika Saatnya" by Darmawati Majid. The research data consisted of primary data and secondary data. The primary data are the texts in the short story anthology "Ketika Saatnya" relevant to the research analysis. Meanwhile, secondary data are in the form of books, journals, written works, and articles, which sharpen the analysis of third-world women, Bugis women.

The technique of data collection is the method of listening. The listening method is used in language research by listening to the use of language in the object under study (Sudaryanto, 1988). Adapting to the material object that the author will analyze in the form of text, the understanding of the listening method will be equated with repeated reading. The steps taken

in collecting data for this research include 1) reading the text of the short story anthology "Ketika Saatnya" intensively and repeatedly; 2) performing data selection in the form of language identification (literary text); 3) recording data that is considered relevant to the research analysis; 4) performing data analysis according to the theory/paradigm of the Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak subaltern; 5) compiling research reports. In the data analysis stage, the method used is descriptive and explanatory, namely by describing and explaining the position of third-world women narrated in the short story "Ketika Saatnya."

The Bugis Women as Subaltern

The definition of third-world women or Eastern women shows a form of colonization that is discoursed through socio-cultural, economic-political, and others (Mohanty et al., 1991). In a book entitled "Belenggu Pascakolonial: Hegemoni dan Resistance Dalam Sastra Indonesia," Faruk (2007) asserts that postcolonial theories focused on the implications and impacts of the remnants of colonialism on colonized nations and countries continuously and transformed into a form of neocolonialism.

The existence of third-world women—(Mohanty, 2007)— is considered too excessive in terms of domestic issues. Hence, the image of third-world women becomes a homogenization agenda for first-world women (Western women) to create an ideal image for female subjects. Homogenization is an act of hegemony that forms a particular identity created on the collective memory of Eastern subjects (the colonized people). The form of homogenization of women can be found in the short story anthology "Ketika Saatnya" by Darmawati Majid. The short story anthology "Ketika Saatnya" is a collection of short stories about the image of third-world women in various districts and cities in South Sulawesi. The problems presented by the author in the short story anthology are said to be various, ranging from women who are cheated on by their husbands and the position of women in marriage to women who are locked in their mate. The third-world female figures revealed in this study are Alaida, Ammak, and Indah. By following the short story "Ketika Saatnya" shows the dialogue between Alaida and Ammak.

Kenapa perempuan disamakan dengan tempat bertelur, Ammak? Alaida gusar. Sebegitu rendahkah posisi perempuan di dalam adatnya? (Majid, 2019)

Why are women likened to laying eggs, Ammak? Alaida was furious. How low is the position of women in their customs? (Majid, 2019)

The quote above illustrates a female character—Alaida, who confirms the position of women to the Ammak—her mother, in a patriarchal Bugis-Bone society. The author shows that women in the customs of the Bugis-Bone tribe are represented as "ampoti." Ampoti, in the Bugis-Bone tribe, is known as chicken cages. She is positioned as a place to save money, manage family finances, and accompany her husband. This representation—by Ammak figures, is considered a unique position held by Bugis-Bone women. Women being represented as the frontier of such allegorical substitution is a reminder to us academic feminists (both Third World and First World feminists) that despite careful research into the term "woman," one thing that has not been studied as academic feminists is to "stop feeling special as a woman." Spivak demands that we stop using culturalism as a way out of ethnocentrism and trace the regulatory psychobiographies that shape the effects of female subjects differently (Ray, 2009).

Regulatory psychobiography is a narrative model that gives meaning to readings about self and others. One cannot abolish the so-called uterine social organization because it is the suppression of ideological material from the clitoris as a marker of gendered subjects who exercise particular oppression against women, as the lowest level of "chicken cage" used by the Bugis-Bone community with solid control, in the extraction of surplus value in the Bugis-Bone cultural order (Ray, 2009).

The use of the chicken cage symbol is the author's affirmation of the representation of the identity of Bugis-Bone women in South Sulawesi. Symbols or signs presented as characteristics of the subject's identity can also be found in various literary works, from regional and Indonesian literature to English/American literature. An example can be found in the parody "Gone with the Wind" novel entitled "The Wind Do Not Go"—from now on abbreviated as TWDG, the author displays the symbols of cinnamon (cinnamon) and coffee to portray the physical attributes of black people who are dense and black; Chocolate. Cinnamon is one type of spice that has not only a dense texture but also a pungent taste. It is the same as the symbol for bitter coffee, but it gives an intense sensation to the person who consumes it. Such presuppositions are interpreted as a physical representation of black people; although black is not visually beautiful but has high vitality. Vitality refers to strength and health, which is essential to have in the human body.

From the European perspective in early modern times, spices (spices) were costly goods and symbolized the prestige of someone who owned them. Europeans were willing to expedite to the Eastern hemisphere to have spices, such as Maluku. In the fifth century AD, documents on spices were found for various medical purposes. For example, black pepper (black pepper) is prescribed various kinds of serious diseases, namely paralysis, sewerage, inflammation of the mouth and throat, and bubonic plague (Andaya, 2015).

The use of spices is also found in religious rituals—especially in Ancient Greece- the process of preserving corpses in polytheistic worship and ritual offerings of gods (Turner, 2011). Thus, spices, as a representation of black people's identity, mark the values given by black people in America. These values not only complement the composition of the population but also contribute to the cultural variety that adds to the diversity and strength of the American nation. This diversity makes America more unique and stands out from the rest.

Sudah jadi takdir seorang istri untuk menghormati suami, Nak. Suami bekerja keras memenuhi tanggung jawab, mencukupkan kebutuhan anak istrinya. Karena itu, saat kau menikah nanti, titah suamimu yang seharusnya kau utamakan, kau laksanakan sepenuh hati, tak setengah-setengah. Dengan cara itu, kita, perempuan, memperoleh berkah Tuhan. (Majid, 2019)

A wife's destiny is to respect her husband, a girl. The husband works hard to fulfill his responsibilities to provide for the needs of his wife's children. Therefore, when you get married later, your husband's orders that you should prioritize you carry out wholeheartedly, not half-heartedly. In that way, women get God's blessing. (Majid, 2019)

The quote above affirms the patriarchal discourse that remains strong in the Bugis-Bone community in South Sulawesi. Implicitly, the patriarchal tradition has silenced Alaida's character. He was forced to accept it because the subject who practiced the discourse was his biological mother. He saw and proved for himself that his mother is a historical subject who

still preserves the foundation of patriarchy through loyalty to her husband (Alaida's father). From here, the author shows the subject of women's misogyny against other women.

As an object of history, oppression (misogyny) against women is carried out by men and other women, which cannot be resisted. Women are victims, and God ordained them to be the object of male domination. Therefore, the inner voice of a suffering woman will never be heard, even by her fellow women.

The silencing of Alaida's character by Ammak is a form of subaltern constructed by the culture of indigenous peoples placing women as "back friends" of men whose lives only revolve around problems; wells, mattresses, and kitchens (Gandhi, 2006). It means that the placement of women is considered low in family life. Women in a patriarchal society no longer have a role in interacting in the public sphere. The position of women is only a complement, and their activities or relations with men are only used to the extent that they support men's activities and projects. Women will be valuable if they themselves have value and benefit men's lives. Thus, the position of women becomes marginal.

An example of the story of marginalized women is also found in the novel *Tjerita Nyai Dasima* (1896) by G. Francis—a European author. The story of Nyai Dasima narrates a Javanese woman named Nyai Dasima who becomes the nyai of a British man named Tuan W. Nyai Dasima is portrayed as a beautiful and kind woman. The image made Mr. W fall in love. As a nyai, Nyai Dasima can have happiness and luxury. However, all of that was ruined by a native man named Samioen. Samioen had instigated Nyai Dasima that the position of the nyai had an unfavorable view and that Tuan W, as a colonial, could only seize the wealth of the natives. Samioen, with all his strategies, has tricked Nyai Dasima into leaving Mr. W and marrying him.

The position of women as objects is stereotyped as weak and powerless. Women can be treated as complements and have no room to defend, fight, or even choose their way of life. G. Francis described the figure of a nyai who could not keep up with colonial power as described by Pramoedya Ananta Toer with his character Nyai Ontosoroh. Nyai Dasima is too soft and weak as a woman to be quickly marginalized by patriarchal power.

Pramoedya narrates Nyai Ontosoroh as a continuation of Nyai Dasima to defend her rights as a woman and elevate the dignity of women as nyai. Nyai Dasima, narrated by G. Francis, has gone through a critical period to maintain her dignity as a nyai. She came out of the colonial territory to clear her good name as the mistress of a colonial man even though she was treated like a wife who lived a luxurious life in a palace. Nyai Dasima has been instigated by discussions that her position as a nyai is viewed negatively and will hurt her future because Tuan W, a colonial man, will return to his country and leave Nyai Dasima. That made Nyai Dasima able to articulate her voice, leaving Mr. W, and she married Samioen even though she had to become his second wife. Nyai Dasima's resistance was limited to a cultural conflict between the colonial and the natives. He chose to marry Samioen because he considered his marriage legal and acceptable to society. While he was the Nyai Tuan W, there was no clarity, and it was considered illegal under Islamic law or the norms of indigenous peoples.

From the story, the conclusion is that the position of women as subordinate and second class can be justified. The women's voices had been silenced before they spoke and thought. The patriarchal system has received legal space from society to build a discourse of men as rulers

and women under it. Spivak's statement regarding the subaltern group that they cannot speak has been seen in reality in every event raised by women in literary works.

Spivak stated that literary works could be a milestone in observing postcolonial society and matters related to colonialism, including the struggles of subaltern groups. During the colonial period, many events left history to be used as objects and showed things considered representations of colonialism's ugliness. As a subaltern group, women were emancipated to escape the colonial or even the patriarchal system, which became the colonial strategy of putting women second. Women were discriminated against during and after the colonial period as a form of unity from the patriarchal culture that continued to establish its power. Women's emancipation never developed because the patriarchal or colonial system tried to silence it and did not provide opportunities or space for women. The existence of women is still considered low and passive, so men use patriarchal and colonial power to oppress them.

Kau tahu, kan, kalau kita beli teh botol, penjualnya selalu minta botolnya kembali. Laki-laki juga begitu. Biar saja isinya berceceran di mana-mana, yang penting botolnya pulang. Tidak apa-apa suami selingkuh, yang penting mereka tetap kembali kerumah, menjalankan kewajibannya, menafkahi kita lahir dan batin. Bu Rania gamblang menerangkan. (Majid, 2019)

The seller always asks for the bottle back when we buy bottled tea. So do men. Let the contents splattered everywhere; the important thing is that the bottle goes home. It is okay for husbands to cheat; the important thing is that they stay home, carry out their obligations, and provide for us physically and mentally. Mrs. Rania clearly explained. (Majid, 2019)

In contrast to the character Alaida—a third-world woman from the Bugis-Bone tribe, the author presents the character of Indah as the subject of an educated urban woman. However, the image of Indah's character presented—by the author—as a subaltern woman who cannot voice her feelings against the patriarchal discourse perpetuated by her neighbors—is also a female subject. The discourse that men cheat is natural as long as the man can meet all kinds of needs of his wife and children, both internally and externally. This discourse is called—by Spivak—essentialism. Spivak sees that essentialism has an inherent perceptual danger to the subaltern. Essentialism functions to revive (revival) subaltern voices by offering heterogeneity and creating a stereotyped representation of the various identities of people who make up certain social groups. Essentialism can be seen as a subaltern's dream and hope. Essentialism is a manipulation that a representative group of subalterns will exploit.

Essentialism refers to group identity in inter-community discourse that facilitates subaltern communication to be noticed, heard and understood. Essentialism offers the importance of difference (subaltern, not as "the Other") in social groups. However, in its practical function, strategic essentialism is politically just a tool that uses subalterns. Women are always the only objects that can be exploited socially or sexually. Women are the concrete other. In this case, the idea of the concrete other can be interpreted as accepting the 'other' as an individual with a concrete history, identity, and effective emotional constitution. Women not only have the right to express opinions but also to think. In women's minds, a symbol of kindness has been engraved throughout centuries (Supelli, 2006).

Spivak (Ray, 2009) argues that transactional reading sees the collective as a strategic way of following the essentialist notion of consciousness to write subalterns as historical subjects.

The essentialist idea is the second main problem after the subaltern as a basic hegemonic form. Strategic essentialism becomes a mode of delivery, a buzz phrase that indicates one's subject position to engage in feminism that rejects essentialism. Women's individualism is often achieved at the expense of "other women" (the other). Strategic essentialism (after reduction) involves a philosophical acceptance of the anti-essentialist argument that, in principle, there is no essential identity. Strategic essentialism acts "as if" identity is stable for specific political reasons. For example, one might temporarily accept the category of "women" as a stable entity to mobilize women for political action (Barker, 2004).

They add that strategic essentialism is tied not only to the historical narrative that is produced but also produced when articulating one's subject position. In the previous short story excerpt, men are portrayed as driving the economy's engine, ignoring women's struggles, discrediting women, and being equal to parents and children. Women are just tools for the continuity of life, objects that reproduce and regenerate. The main characters in the struggle are the men.

Kau memutuskan menanti dengan sabar botolmu pulang. Ini belum oerkara hidup-mati. Orang berpendidikan mana pun juga tahu, yang bersemangat pasti sedang sehat (Majid, 2019).

You decide to wait patiently for your bottle to come home. It is not a life-and-death affair yet. Any educated person knows that the spirit must be healthy. (Majid, 2019)

The author presents Indah—an educated urban woman, as the subject of subaltern women whose voices are alienated. Subaltern is not just a classy word indicated for the oppressed class or the Other group. In postcolonial terms, the term refers to everything related to access restrictions. It becomes a kind of space of distinction. For example, during a demonstration, a demonstrator leader took action to voice labor rights against the ratification of the Job Creation Act. When workers' voices are always represented and do not have freedom of speech, they are subalterns. From this, Spivak emphasizes the significance of an effort to see the unconscious hegemonic mechanism regarding the use of subaltern word attributes. They (workers) are in a hegemonic discourse, meaning there is a kind of unconscious manipulation of what they are doing (Morton, 2008).

Implicitly, Spivak questioned the involvement of academics with Liyan. For Spivak to prove an authentic engagement with the subaltern, academics should remove themselves as experts amid the binary social relations between Us and Them, Center and Periphery, and other binary oppositions. Academics—especially Western academics—have a great curiosity about the subaltern experience of colonialism. However, they did not want to position themselves in the middle of the colonial domination experience. That is, there is a gulf between academia and subaltern. It exposes the subaltern truth, which is the truth that comes from experts or academics. Subaltern subjects only submit knowledge about colonialism to be used by academics, especially Western academics.

Hooks (1990) said, "... I do not need to hear your voice. It is better to talk about yourself than you can speak about yourself. I do not need to hear your voice. I need your pain. I need your story to tell it back to you in a new way. I tell it back to you so that it has become my own. Re-writing you, I write myself anew. I am still the author and authority. I am still the colonizer who is the subject. You are the object at the center of my talk." It is an application of Foucauldian epistemic violence that describes the destruction of the perspective of non-

Western societies in viewing the world. The subaltern is oppressed and manipulated to have a perspective like the Western nation in viewing the world. If the whole society has only one point of view, the Western point of view, then that is where we need to be made aware of colonialism in its most discursive form.

For Spivak, that epistemic violence relates specifically to Third World women who are never really allowed to express themselves. They are only used as a trigger for sympathy to function as a comparison with the essential women, such as Western women who are elegant, free, independent, and so on. That is how the colonial powers hegemony non-Western cultures simultaneously to see the world as Western society understands and knows the world (Sharp, 2008).

Furthermore, Spivak insists on not seeing subaltern people as cultural Others. He believes that the Western world can progress and develop rapidly through self-criticism and introspection of fundamental ideas and methods of investigation (reasoning), which leads them to study the culture of inferior non-Western people. That is, Western nations become culturally superior because they set cultural standards.

Subaltern women in French feminist theory (especially in the case of Kristeva) become a single storehouse in their differences. Therefore, for French feminists, they are added as a temporary depiction of absolute value always on the other side. For Spivak, the reconfiguration of the subaltern woman as another temporal bracket in the "micrology of political economy" reduces the subaltern woman to a mirror that only reflects the views directed at her. French feminism is concerned with establishing a discourse about women that confuses the relationship between women's meanings for women. In other words, what concerns French feminism is the relationship between the feminine and women in discourse, literature, and philosophy with women themselves.

Subaltern women lie between the gaps of globality and development on the one hand and immigration and multiculturalism on the other. The subject of gender globalization generates gender alliances. It legitimizes its ethical agenda in the name of an all-too-easy global justice that fails to address capital/cultural aporia on the other side of the capital. By understanding the circulation of women in colonial discourse and the repetition of indifference in decolonization, one can open the gaps between the two discourses that women pervade. When that gap opens, one will discover that woman has multiple meanings in different locations: one side being in the streets of the capital and the other being in a country house where she might return. One cannot involve one without involving the "Other." One cannot hold on to a single issue of feminism because gender becomes a meeting point for discourse, not only about development but also about the war in the name of women's equality in another world."

Conclusion

This research leads to two mutually sustainable conclusions. First, third world women narrated by the author in the short story anthology "Ketika Saatnya" describes the construction of "third world women" as subjects who are homogeneously powerless and 'powerless' and occupy the position of victims of the discourse of social, cultural, and economic systems, patriarchal discourse. Discourses that are always confirmed by the Colonized subject. Second, the colonialization steps taken by the author is the representation

of third-world women as subaltern subjects. Finally, third-world women will always be positioned as objects for the author.

Acknowledgements

The author wishes to express his heartfelt gratitude to the **Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (LPDP/Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education)** of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Indonesia for sponsoring his doctoral studies and providing financial support for this publication.

References

- Andaya, L. (2015). *Dunia Maluku: Indonesia Timur pada Zaman Modern Awal* (terj.). Ombak.
- Barker, C. (2004). *The Sage Dictionary of Cultural Studies*. Sage Inc.
- de Kock, L. (1992). Interview with Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak: New Nation Writers Conference in South Africa. *ARIEL: A Review of International English Literature*, 3(23), 29-47.
- Faruk. (2007). *Belenggu Pascakolonial: Hegemoni dan Resistensi dalam Sastra Indonesia*. Pustaka Pelajar.
- Gandhi, L. (2006). *Teori Poskolonial: Upaya Meruntuhkan Hegemoni Barat*. Alam.
- Hooks, B. (1990). "Marginality as a Site of Resistance", dalam R. Ferguson dkk. (eds), *Out There: Marginalization and Contemporary Cultures*. MIT Press.
- Majid, D. (2019). *Ketika Saatnya* (U. Kayang, Ed.). KPG (Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia).
- Mohanty, C. T. (2007). *Under Western Eyes*. Duke University Press.
- Mohanty, C. T., Russo, A., & Torres, L. (1991). *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism* (Vol. 32). Indiana University Press.
- Moore-Gilbert, B. (1997). Postcolonial theory: contexts, practices, politics. In *Choice Reviews Online* (Vol. 35, Issue 04). Verso. <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.35-1944>
- Morton, S. (2008). *Gayatri Spivak: Etika, Subaltern, dan Kritik Penalaran Poskolonial*, Terjemahan. Pararaton.
- Ray, S. (2009). *Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak: in Other Words*. Wiley-Blackwell.
- Sharp, J. (2008). *Geographies of Postcolonialism*. SAGE Publications.
- Sudaryanto. (1988). *Metode Linguistik, Kedudukan dan Aneka Jenis*. Karyono.
- Supelli, K. (2006). Wacana Perempuan: Menulis tentang Yang Lain. *Jurnal Filsafat Driyarkara*, XXVIII (3), 6.
- Turner, J. (2011). *Sejarah Rempah: Dari Erotisme sampai Imperialisme* (terj.). Komunitas Bambu.

Contact email: ramis.rauf@unkhair.ac.id