“To Open Minds, To Educate Intelligence, To Inform Decisions”

The International Academic Forum provides new perspectives to the thought-leaders and decision-makers of today and tomorrow by offering constructive environments for dialogue and interchange at the intersections of nation, culture, and discipline. Headquartered in Nagoya, Japan, and registered as a Non-Profit Organization (一般社団法人), IAFOR is an independent think tank committed to the deeper understanding of contemporary geo-political transformation, particularly in the Asia Pacific Region.
The Executive Council of the International Advisory Board

Mr Mitsumasa Aoyama
Director; The Yufuku Gallery, Tokyo, Japan

Lord Charles Bruce
Lord Lieutenant of Fife
Chairman of the Patrons of the National Galleries of Scotland
Trustee of the Historic Scotland Foundation, UK

Professor Donald E. Hall
Herbert J. and Ann L. Siegel Dean
Lehigh University, USA
Former Jackson Distinguished Professor of English
and Chair of the Department of English

Professor Arthur Stockwin
Founding Director of the Nissan Institute for Japanese Studies & Emeritus Professor
The University of Oxford UK

Professor Chung-Ying Cheng
Professor of Philosophy, University of Hawai‘i at Manoa, USA
Editor-in-Chief, The Journal of Chinese Philosophy

Professor Steve Cornwall
Professor of English and Interdisciplinary Studies, Osaka Jogakuin University, Osaka, Japan
Osaka Local Conference Chair

Professor A. Robert Lee
Former Professor of English at Nihon University, Tokyo from 1997 to 2011, previously long taught at the University of Kent at Canterbury, UK

Professor Dexter Da Silva
Professor of Educational Psychology, Keisei University, Tokyo, Japan

Professor Georges Depeyrot
Professor and Director of Research & Member of the Board of Trustees
French National Center for Scientific Research (CNRS) & L’Ecole Normale Superieure, Paris, France

Professor Johannes Maenius
William R. and S. Sue Johnson Endowed Chair of Spatial Economic Analysis and Regional Planning
The University of Redlands School of Business, USA

Professor June Henten
Dean, College of Human Sciences, Auburn University, USA

Professor Michael Hudson
President of The Institute for the Study of Long-Term Economic Trends (ISLET)
Distinguished Research Professor of Economics, The University of Missouri, Kansas City

Professor Koichi Iwabuchi
Professor of Media and Cultural Studies & Director of the Monash Asia Institute, Monash University, Australia

Professor Sue Jackson
Professor of Lifelong Learning and Gender & Pro-Vice Master of Teaching and Learning, Birkbeck, University of London, UK

Professor Sir Geoffrey Lloyd
Senior Scholar in Residence, The Needham Research Institute, Cambridge, UK
Fellow and Former Master, Darwin College, University of Cambridge
Fellow of the British Academy

Professor Keith Miller
Orthwein Endowed Professor for Lifelong Learning in the Science, University of Missouri-St. Louis, USA

Professor Kuniko Miyangage
Director, Human Potential Institute, Japan
Fellow, Reischauer Institute, Harvard University, USA

Professor Dennis McInerney
Chair Professor of Educational Psychology and Co-Director of the Assessment Research Centre
The Hong Kong Institute of Education, Hong Kong SAR

Professor Brian Daizan Victoria
Professor of English
Fellow of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies

Professor Michiko Nakano
Professor of English & Director of the Distance Learning Center, Waseda University, Tokyo, Japan

Professor Thomas Brian Mooney
Professor of Philosophy
Head of School of Creative Arts and Humanities
Professor of Philosophy and Head of School of Creative Arts and Humanities, Charles Darwin University, Australia

Professor Baden Offord
Professor of Cultural Studies and Human Rights & Co-Director of the Centre for Peace and Social Justice
Southern Cross University, Australia

Professor Frank S. Ravitch
Professor of Law & Walter H. Stowers Chair in Law and Religion, Michigan State University College of Law

Professor Richard Roth
Senior Associate Dean, Medill School of Journalism, Northwestern University, Qatar

Professor Monty P. Satiadarma
Clinical Psychologist and Lecturer in Psychology & Former Dean of the Department of Psychology and Rector of the University, Tarumanagara University, Indonesia

Mr Mohamed Saleheen
Director, The United Nations World Food Programme, Japan & Korea

Mr Lowell Sheppard
Asia Pacific Director, HOPE International Development Agency, Canada/Japan

His Excellency Dr Drago Stambuk
Croatian Ambassador to Brazil, Brazil

Professor Mary Stuart
Vice-Chancellor, The University of Lincoln, UK

Professor Gary Swanson
Distinguished Journalist-in-Residence & Mildred S. Hansen Endowed Chair, The University of Northern Colorado, USA

Professor Jiro Takai
Secretary General of the Asian Association for Social Psychology & Professor of Social Psychology
Graduate School of Education and Human Development, Nagoya University, Japan

Professor Svetlana Ter Minasova
President of the Faculty of Foreign Languages and Area Studies, Lomonosov Moscow State University

Professor Yozo Yokota
Director of the Center for Human Rights Affairs, Japan
Former UN Special Rapporteur on Myanmar

Professor Kensaku Yoshida
Professor of English & Director of the Center for the Teaching of Foreign Languages in General Education, Sophia University, Tokyo, Japan
The European Conference on Arts & Humanities 2017

Official Conference Proceedings

ISSN: 2188-1111
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In Search of Justice Narratives in Music Performances: Intersecting</td>
<td>Santosa Soewarlan</td>
<td>pp. 1 - 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning among Musicians in Gamelan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing of the History: Ernesto Rogers between Estrangement and</td>
<td>Lejla Vujicic</td>
<td>pp. 11 - 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Familiarity of Architectural History</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Reflection on Buddhist Dhamma Teachings through Acrylic</td>
<td>Chollada Thongtawee</td>
<td>pp. 23 - 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paintings and Video Art: Experiential Approach of Understanding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Research of Self-Disclosure on Fanpage Creators of Illustration/Text</td>
<td>Li-Chiou Chen</td>
<td>pp. 31 - 45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Taiwan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life and Death in Verse Case Study: The Writings of Lili Kasticher,</td>
<td>Lily Zamir</td>
<td>pp. 47 - 56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Only Woman Who Wrote in Auschwitz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context, Genre, Hybridity, Transculture, and Double Bind: Cultural</td>
<td>Jeffrey L Spear</td>
<td>pp. 69 - 79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriation and Sita Sings the Blues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Mise Hors Scène Screen Memory</td>
<td>Lin Hsin-I</td>
<td>pp. 81 - 88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arthur Hugh Clough's “Amours De Voyage”: A Poetic Account of the</td>
<td>Cora Lindsay</td>
<td>pp. 89 - 94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1849 Siege of Rome</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centering Literature: Literature and The History of</td>
<td>Zainor Izat Zainal</td>
<td>pp. 95 - 106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmentalism in Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967-1970</td>
<td>Paul Obinwanne Obi-ANI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can Design Underpin a Strong Wellbeing?</td>
<td>Antonia Concha Philip Palmer</td>
<td>pp. 121 - 126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treasure and Travesty: Refractions of Victorian Imperial Racism In</td>
<td>Lauren Ashleigh Cruz</td>
<td>pp. 127 - 139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selected Contemporary Literature</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teaching History or Retelling Ancient Stories with Pictures: William Blake and the School Version of Virgil
Mei-Ying Sung pp. 141 - 149

The Medical Intelligentsia Life in the Post-revolutionary Russia (Doctors Letters Material to Nikolay Semashko)
Kira Bogatyreva pp. 151 - 155

Tapoi Katha: A Reconstruction of History through an Odia Folk Travel Narrative
Supriya Subhadarsini Sahoo pp. 157 - 169

Structuring Narrative Space, Memory, and Everyday Present in Tarashankar Bandopadhyay’s The Tale of Hansuli Turn
Madhumita Chakrabarty pp. 171 - 180

Art from Tibetan Buddhist Perspective
The First Anthropological Study of Jonang Sect
Mei Xue pp. 181 - 188

Postmodern Simultaneity versus European History in Contemporary Travel-Writing: A Study of Jean Baudrillard, Pico Iyer, Umberto Eco
Ana Calvete pp. 189 - 199

Business Name Signboards in the Area of Bang Lamphu: Analysis of a Linguistic Landscape
Krittaphon Wangpusit pp. 201 - 211

Television Comes to Town - The role of Television in National Identity Formation in One Post-Colonial Nation
Lynette Sampson pp. 213 - 227

Contesting History: Revisiting Native American Identity Through the Narratives of Momaday and Erdrich
Lalrinchhani Hmar pp. 229 - 239

The Possession of Narratives: Telling and Transmitting Caste in Indian Folktales
Siddharth N Kanoujia pp. 241 - 252

Looking for the Heart: From the History of Heart Transplant in the USSR
Yana Grigoryan pp. 253 - 261

Untouched Voices: Dalit Women’s Autobiographies in Dalit History
Payal Madhia Sahay pp. 263 - 272
In Search of Justice Narratives in Music Performances: Intersecting Meaning among Musicians in Gamelan

Santosa Soewarlan, Indonesia Institute of the Arts (ISI) Surakarta, Indonesia

Abstract
This paper explores how musicians and singers in gamelan performances represent ideals to criticize groups of people. The researcher believes that by implementing Thandeka K Chapman’s approach (2011), in which personal, community, and global levels of social interactions forge meanings, musicians and audiences emphasize the significant issues in community. Using the idea the writer intends to show that articulating appropriate themes from social contexts, musicians and singers strengthen issues in social, political and cultural domains that result in the negotiation of the concepts of: balance of status, recognition of right, refinement of social conducts, better relationship between human and natures, and the like. Through metaphors in performances they mediate the dream and the reality they want to manifest in their contexts.

Keywords: performance, Indonesia, gamelan, narrative, justice
Introduction

In the last five years or so, I have been observing the use of gamelan, an Indonesian musical orchestra, in various events in community. My focus has been the relationship between musicians and audiences in performances. Along the process of investigation, I get better understanding of how significant the role of musicians is, making them central figures in performances. This makes me pay close attention of relation among music, musicians, audiences and environments.

A question arises: what musicians want to express when performing gamelan? Performing gamelan is more than making sound of instruments available for audiences. It is unlike presenting a box in an empty space without meaning rather it is a condition that is responsive to social settings and conditions. Musicians express ideals: belief, desire, intention, and hope to deliver meaning to the well-informed audiences. Performances mediate ideas from performing artists to audiences in a fluid condition. This can be done after “mapping” (Jogerson, 1998:78) the aesthetic domain of audiences.

Performing gamelan requires understanding of what audiences think of environments, how they reflect community, and in what way they preserve nature. This is so because musicians do not perform ideas that derive from nothing rather they adjust with social setting and ritual or ceremonial background. Musicians need knowledge of environments that may become guide to formulate ideas for performance. They are required to be sensitive to issues that affect the way musicians create performances.

When perform, musicians do not rely on imagination of their personal point of view rather they try to correlate between what they think and what audiences think in the contexts of social life. So, they can develop ideas only when they are familiar with people and community and understand the issues that are available in the society.

Methodology

This investigation is based on field works done among 10 (ten) musicians and 10 (ten) male and female singers living in Surakarta (Solo), Indonesia. Interviews were done to collect data concerning performances in ceremonial and ritual contexts. In performances, musicians and singers consider to react to audiences who own ideals that exist in community. Using long experiences in playing gamelan and singing in performances, they react to audiences and fluid atmosphere to articulate current and significant issues to reach community goal. The researcher believes that implementing Chapman’s approach (2011), in which personal, community, and global levels of social interactions forge new meanings, musicians and audiences create meanings in the community.

Based on Chapman’s concept the researcher develops the concept of “intersecting meaning” in which three levels of social interaction intersect to establish new meanings in communities. The three levels of social contexts, each has different meaningful elements and fragments, create social dynamic that results in new atmosphere that provides space to the process of creating meanings. In this process musicians, who have previous experiences, are delved into larger context that results in new aspiration. Thus, belief, concept, and aspirations do not stay as they are rather
they are renewed to reach proper environments. It is in this process that musicians
guide audiences to develop new ideas for the better community life.

**Justice in Interactive Context**

No matter how scholars disagree with the scope of the principle of justice, people
believe that justice is not just personal matter rather it is a public domain in which all
of the community members are responsible to maintain the concept. Justice covers
wide context not only as personal morality but also as communal ethics in which all
of people are actively involved in a public event; it should be implemented among
members of the community. In line with this, Clive Barnett believes that the concept
of justice should avoid prejudice and challenge imaginary geographical constrains by
saying: “Freeing concepts of justice from imaginary geographical constraints and
from restrictive rationalistic conventions presents a challenge to spatial disciplines to
suspend their chauvinism about the use of spatial vocabularies in other fields”
(2010:246).

Even if it is based on personal view the implementation of justice requires wide
context in which variety of thoughts exchange position and roles in the constellation
of people’s world-views. Everyone in the group is involved in “public policy” sharing
equal chances to be part of the community. So, justice narrative cannot be executed by
individuals who dominate others because it is a collective domain in which people
make cooperative efforts. Personal views are parts of the elements contributing
meaning to the whole system. Due to the necessity to reach equal position and civil
right, every member needs to make efforts and it is in this context that all groups of
people: government officials, merchants, lawyers, musicians, singers, and artists make
sense of context in social interaction.

Individuals, who have freedom to behave and think in community, consider justice as
the fundamental and substantial value in society. To achieve justice every member
needs to conduct personal contact and interaction with other members rather than
generating genetic engineering for their interaction. Ronald A. Lindsay believes that
genetic engineering on social interaction cannot make better environments; it can only
impair the condition of the society. Lindsay continues that the engineering “will
exacerbate existing social divisions and inequalities, especially if only the wealthy can
afford genetic enhancements (2005:3).

The researcher positions the role of individual as an important figure in reaching
justice because they are central to the process of interaction in community. They are
the paramount in the negotiation of ideals to generate morality, following Joshua
Kassner’s idea (2011:219). As moral agents they feel obliged to accommodate other’s
view to keep community intact. When justice concept is implemented everyone in the
group will feel secure because they already know the concept and are able to
constitute practical reasoning. Barnett further explains how individuals use reasoning
when they conduct interaction with other people. Citing J. Tully he says: “Using
concepts like justice, equality, and freedom is a matter of practical reasoning,
meaning that it involves the activity of ‘being able to use a general term in various
circumstances and being able to give reasons for and against that use’” (Barnett,
2010:247). It is this reason that the researcher intends to contextualize justice concept
in gamelan performances especially to implement the concept in wider contexts of variety of group resulting in general meaning of justice for audiences.

The Narrative of Self

Performing music is held in a particular situation and it orients on specific purposes. It reacts to specific issue by using perception taken from environments. Musicians, who are also active in social events, make use of values in social domain to represent current issues. What happened to Outlanders in diaspora worlds among Danish group in Denmark, for example, shows how musicians use social settings as a means of constructing narrative of self. Reem M. Hilal explored this issue in the negotiation and construction of the narrative as follows:

Through their music, Outlandish expresses the ways in which what differentiates between people binds them through a process of recognition, to borrow from Judith Butler. Focusing on Outlandish’s music, I examine the role of music in the negotiation and construction of narratives of self by contemporary Muslims that counter those that have been constructed for and against them (2015:20).

The construction of self occurs in complicated process in which musicians reinforce rules of conduct to maintain social order. The process mediates musicians to express current and meaningful issues to the members of audiences and at the same time they forge social norms to comply with the development of thoughts. This occurs in a dynamic process in which every member develops thoughts. It eventually affects not only the way people react one another but also more importantly how individuals struggle in the group. I believe that musicians use basic ideas that function as “the bedrock of group solidarity and survival” to use Donatus I Njoku term (2015:25).

In the process of interaction musician preserves connectivity using individual point of view not only in personal but also in communal and global contexts using Dianna Harris’ concept that music is “a means of grounding, provoking, and connecting’ with himself and his community (2011: 394). This connectivity alters people’s orientations that eventually “change from looking at the universe as fixed, and translate our attitudes in a way that allows us to connect with one another (2011: 395). It is in this context that people improve their world-views and perspective in wider context of environments.

The above process leads musicians to evaluate and consider moral values by contrasting evil and good, equality and inequality, justice and injustice, the concerns for keeping the community alive. In other words, they conserve principles as references that guide people to protect unity. They interpret the ideals in new environments expecting to bring new interpretations, expectations, dreams, preferences, and aspirations and contextualize them in performance. These result in the formation of new issues among members of audiences.

Being in this context, individuals make sense of self and others in a community group and a global environments aiming to negotiate proper ideals. The process occurs following Thandeka Chapman’s model in which “something personal and immediate, such as living in dangerous neighborhood, can be related to global issue of violence
and war” (2011:50). In this process personal meaning achieve global meaning by using interactions in different levels. Contents of performance are then constantly adjusted to environments negotiating perspective to reach final concept.

Chapman’s model of Justice Narrative in Gamelan Performances

The researcher thinks that Thandeka Chapman et. al.’s article on “A Social Justice Approach as a Base Teaching Writing” is a seminal model for an analysis of justice narrative. They apply social justice approach to writing in a literature class in which students use ideas from contexts and environments to format the writing. This approach can be applied to other kinds of arts in different context such as in dance, theatre, and music performance. In this article the researcher is going to show the use of the concept in gamelan performances.

As a model of analysis the process of writing in literature owns a specific characteristic: it triggers an individual interaction with environments in community. Chapman et. al. model defines writing as a nurturing process of interconnections among members of community in different levels. They classify the interaction into three levels: personal, community, and global contexts (2011:539). Each level has its own characteristic that will become guide to the process of interaction.

Other important feature of the model is that the writing, as well as performing, presenting, and articulating ideas, stimulates psychological process that results in the awareness of individuals in wider social contexts. Individuals own internal living power that is readily changing to adjust with other powers. This process results in the refreshment of its format and content. It is through this process that internal elements of awareness react to social challenges that occur in their environments. Even if individuals are involved in inherent process it is the interactive process that defines the final format and content of the thought because they intentionally mean to gain new thoughts.

For Chapman individuals do not have static characters attached to their personality rather they maintain a group of characters that develop in their environments. Through an intensive communication with other individuals they construct configuration of meanings. Mutual collaboration among individual, that occurs in the above contexts, negotiate to find what is proper for the community. The contrast among ideals results in an “amalgam” in which new aspiration is constructed. This fusion leads into new meaning that can be called “intersecting meaning”. This meaning reflects the current ideals that are relevant to the present-day condition.

Using similar approach to writing literature, performing music mediates the three levels of interaction (personal, local, and global) leading into a particular and new perception. Personal level provides basis for local and global processes resulting in new orientation for the individuals. The interactive process of individuals in local and global environments stimulates complicated process of intersection resulted in the “intersecting meaning” mentioned before. The three levels of awareness occur when the integration of value system strengthen the whole system in community. This affects people’s orientation that stimulates interpretation of all potential meanings.
Like what happens in Nigeria, this process stimulates re-orientation of value system that “would promote national image, respect for human life and corporate values” (Njoku, 2015:25). This eventually binds the participants to feel in the same atmosphere and formulate the sense of being in the same community (Salavuo, 2006:254). This process can be seen as individual orientation that emphasizes the importance of listening music as a means to forge a sense of self. Listening to music “often form allegiance that transcend time and place plays crucial role in forging sense of self in ways that are important to understand but difficult to explain” (2004:703). Thus, performances recall personal aspects of life – of the position, relation, belief, ethic, prestige, etc – to construct new values in relation to the current settings and situation.

The value construction forges the formation of pride, self, and dignity that heightens musicians’ and audiences’ statuses and roles in the community. Furthermore, these processes help in the formation of identity, a basic ideal in which characters and personalities are modelled into a social unit, as Salavuo puts it, “Discussions about music are a core part of any music culture, and they help to form identities and create a sense of togetherness and belonging” (2006:254). This is the most fundamental value that inspires behaviours and thoughts. In Javanese community this practice is significant to mediate musicians to articulate ideals that represent strong voice that may not be heard in daily community settings. For audiences this representation provides media to absorb the current buzzing issue.

**Presenting Justice in Performance**

The following passages explore how Chapman concept inspires the frame of reference for musicians and audiences in gamelan performances. Especially, how musicians orient themselves on the three contexts formulated by his model of interaction. For musicians, the contexts have significant role in the articulation of issues because they intend to adjust with the dynamic of the environments. Since musicians are involved in the environments, they know what issues are relevant to the community. For that reason, the musicians can articulate appropriate issues such as: to criticize the misconduct of rulers, to disagree with the management of natural resources, to condemn the behaviour of bureaucrats, and to promote government’s programs. A heated issue of corruption, for example, can be presented as follow:

Kuwi apa kuwi e kembang melathi  
Sing tak puja puji aja dha korupsi  
Marga yen korupsi negarane rugi  
Piye mas kuwi iya ngona ngono-ngono kuwi  

[take a look what is that? That is a jasmine flower]  
[I wish you do not corrupt]  
[because if you corrupt, the country will collapse]  
[what do you think sir, what you said is correct]

In the above example, musicians’ idea corresponds to the stanza especially the second and third lines representing the main idea of the song. The idea emphasizes the current social issue that is widely uttered on television program, newspapers, and
social media. The choice of the issue does not occur by accident as every member of the community is exposed to the issue.

Pak Waluyo, a senior male singer in Surakarta, believes that participation in community will help musicians and singers internalize “the intersecting meaning” (personal communication, August 1, 2017). For him, presentation of a song opens wide space to create imagination for musicians and singers. It stimulates interaction between musicians and audiences especially because it targets the greedy people who want to gain personal matters. Musicians and singers intend to convey messages of disapproval on current situation especially the imbalance position between those who gain power and the under-pressured groups who suffer from the lack of power. Presenting the song musicians hope that audiences perceive strong image of “broad, diffuse, and vague sets of beliefs, emotions, values, preferences, and ideals” (Jackson, 2005:29) that are current and may occur in reality. Pak Rusdiyantoro, another senior male singer in Surakarta, also believes that the meaning of the song can guide them to understand and reinforce human rights, social welfares, freedoms, and liberties (interview, November 3, 2016). Similarly, a song called ”Biko” by Peter Gabriel is not simply a political rally song with an ability to facilitate ‘collective identity formation’ but a protest song able to intersect with the political consciences of audience members” (Drewett, 2007:39).

Ideals offered by a song do not only make sense in personal level but more importantly in community and global levels as it is mentioned in Chapman model. This process is widely known in gamelan community because in performances people orient themselves on social welfare as it happens in other aspects of life in community. Musicians and singers do not only think of gamelan performances as a means of amusing audiences (they call it tontonan, an entertainment) but also of presenting social rules (tatanan, a social order), and expressing a guide of ethical conduct (tuntunan, a moral force). According to Pak Waluyo, a performance should take ideals from community and orient its meaning to justice, the fundamental issue in community (interview, August 1, 2017). The process of getting meaning in community can be illustrated in the following diagram:

![Diagram 1. Musicians are involved in the personal, communal, and global social interactions.](image-url)
The complex social interaction in performances, as shown in the diagram, reflects the process in which personal values are conflicted with community and global values. This conflict occurs in a changing configuration that put musicians and audiences in a constant dialogue to find ideals. Through this process musicians and audiences are involved in a liminal stage that requires consideration to make good decision. It is in this context that all of the thoughts are contested to find the best assessment to ethical values in community. Thus, Chapman model provides reference for musicians and audiences to find the best ideal that is conceivable in the three levels of contexts, personal, communal, and global environments. This social environment provides local values such as tontonan, tatanan, and tuntunan mentioned above to get position in a real environment. These ideals find new format in which conflicting thoughts find agreement. This process can mediate ideals such as glory, virtue, and wisdom find meaningful to contest with negative values such as corruption, exploitation of resources, and dishonest behaviours.

Conclusion

To conclude this article, I would like to emphasize that musicians and singers do not only use performances to affect people’s orientation in aesthetic domain rather they also use it as a means of conducting dialogue with audiences. Musicians and singers intend to articulate real issues: disagreement with natural resources management, condemnation to bureaucrats’ behavior, promotion of government’s programs, and criticism to rulers’ misconduct. They believe that music can be used as a method of expressing voices in which people are struggling for social welfare and balance of life. Moreover, performances can provide alternative point of view in which, by their own deliberate choice, audiences can change world-views through the use of images that exist in gamelan (music) performances. This image reverberates in the minds of audiences that in turn will influence the way they think and behave in community. In a way, music can be used as a means of expressing voices in which people are struggling for harmony and justice, as they are reflected in their world-views. As a whole, people in gamelan community use performances for portraying social issues: social welfare, freedom, justice, human rights, etc. The contents of the performances strengthen the values and vice versa resulting in the reinforcement of new social and cultural values for the contemporary life and the future.
References


Contact email: santosa.isisolo@gmail.com
Writing of the History: Ernesto Rogers between Estrangement and Familiarity of Architectural History

Lejla Vujicic, Union Nikola Tesla University, Serbia

The European Conference on Arts & Humanities 2017
Official Conference Proceedings

Abstract
Ernesto Rogers was the key figure of the post-war Italian architecture. Architect, educator, writer, editor, he was a man of a great erudition and talent. As with many intellectuals of the post-Second World War Italy, he theorized history and used somewhat eclectically sources to promote his idea of continuity as a temporal model in architecture. His theory came on one hand out of particular Italian pre-war intellectual tradition but was also based on a wide spectrum of resources such as Enzo Paci, Henry Bergson, John Dewey and Henri Focillon, among others. It found its way into writing a story of architecture in some of the work of his office, namely project for Torre Velasca in Milano that we will use as case study in this paper. Following his idea of “sensing the history” he created buildings and pieces that are in constant state of flux between what one might feel is familiar, a “true” representation of the history and, on the other hand, estrangement that comes with desire to physically embody history in the field of pre-existing environments (i.e. cities or natural environments) that was never really present. The result was the uneasiness that comes with the question of representation of history in the physical form that oscillates between history as we imagine it and history as a source of future imagination.

Keywords: Ernesto Rogers, Continuity, History, Tradition, Torre Velasca
Introduction

In the period immediately after WWII, Italy was a country of political confusion, economic desperation, blurred borders of national identity and a site of artificially induced “self-absolving collective memory.” Building activities reflected land speculation, backed up by traditional building techniques and the need to reduce an enormous unemployment rate. Italy lacked a comprehensive urban planning policy which had multiple consequences for the development of its cities in the 1960s. A plan for Milan sketched out in 1945 as a comprehensive regional plan by Franco Albini, Pietro Bottoni, Ignazio Gardella, Ernesto Rogers, Ludovico Belgiojoso and Ezio Cerutti, did not go through. After the Christian Democratic Party (DC), strongly supported by the United States, won the election in 1948, it offered a national housing plan that gave only partial solutions to the current urban problems. In 1949 INA casa (Istituto Nazionale Abitazioni) came into being initiated by DC minister Amintore Fanfani which gave again, partial solutions to the problems of the cities.

An encounter with history and the question of how to write it, build it, or build within it, was for Italian architects a question of re-engaging modernism, rather than a project of unproblematic progression from previous times. Instead of linear time form that modernism generated and a perpetual production of the new, phenomenon connected to ahistorical approach to architectural production, Italian architects cultivated more complex understanding of historical time in the context of architectural heritage. The political and social context of the time was also complex. The ‘temporal’ posed the theoretical issue of the relationship between tradition and the present moment and also occurred as an issue of building practice. These issues conflated explosively when the architect was building within and around the historic city. In this reexamining of architectural and urban policies there was not always interest in novelty per se, and while many other art disciplines developed an avant-garde approach, Italian architectural production of the 60s was considered to belong to ‘incomplete’ avant-garde or rearguard.

Ernesto Rogers was an internationally renowned Italian architect. He taught in Great Britain, United States and South America and was one of the best known Italian CIAM (Congrès Internatinaux d’Architecture Moderne) members. As with many intellectuals of the post-Second World War Italy, Rogers theorized history and used sources somewhat eclectically to promote his idea of continuity as a temporal model in architecture. Following his ideas of continuity, “sensing the history,” pre-existing environments and mediation, he created buildings and pieces that are in state of flux between what one might feel is familiar, a “true” representation of the history and, on the other hand, estrangement that comes with desire to physically embody history in the field of pre-existing environments (i.e. cities or natural environments) that was never really present. The result was the uneasiness that comes with the question of representation of history in the physical form that oscillates between history as we imagine it and history as source of future imagination.
Ernesto Rogers and the Notion of Continuity

Continuità as cultural charge was propagated through Rogers’s editorial politics in journal Casabella, one of the most influential and widely read media that both supported modern architecture in the struggle against formalism and the continuation of Italian rationalism in the post-war period. As a model of time, continuità encompassed several of Rogers’s concerns, from the notions of tradition and memory, invention and experience, to individualism and cultural unity. It marked the continuation of the pre-war experience and Casabella of Giuseppe Pagano and Eduardo Persico. Through their editorial politics these two authors attacked academism imbued with right wing philosophy pervading architectural education of the period. At the same time, continuità was a methodology, tool and a “complex ideology progressively theorized by Rogers.”1 It signified, in Rogers’s words, “historical consciousness.” As a methodology it supported his theory of the pre-existing environments. As an ideology the concept of continuità fostered fusion of modernist tendencies, history and tradition.2

The concept of continuità emerged from Rogers’s understanding of tradition as a broad cultural activity to which the subject had direct access through art. Rogers and Enzo Paci attacked modernist ideology reflected in functionalism as well as Crocean idealism by offering phenomenological reading of history. They intended to bring artistic expression down from the world of ideal into the world of culture, presented as a unity of the social, technical and historical.3 This unified world, liberated from intellectual mediation, cognitive a-priori, and freed for immediate experience of the subject, is what Rogers called tradition.

At the beginning of his article “L’architettura e il mondo della vita” published in Casabella 217 Paci (1957), summarized key issues of two opposite tendencies that, in his view, needed to be superseded: Crocean detachment from the realities of the world, and the tendency to prioritize function and deny the artistic qualities of architecture. Paci goes on to problematize Marxist philosophy for its claims that artistic form is conditioned by economic structure:

“It is true that every human activity is conditioned. But what conditions it is not solely economic structure but complex set of factors, between which, in the case of architecture, reenter the nature of materials, utilitarian functions, geographic and environmental situation, ways and means of communication, psychological character of a given population, historical traditions and so on.”

---

1 In several occasions Luca Molinari emphasized the significance of the concept in the period as well as diverse meanings it took over time. See “Giancarlo De Carlo and the postwar modernist Italian architectural culture: role, originality and networking” at http://www.team10online.org/research/studies_and_papers.html.
2 Work of the Modern masters was presented on the pages of Casabella in the second half of the 1950’s as steps in the evolution of architectural modernity. Continuità as a temporal model is based on the evolutionary process, the cumulative power of more or less gradual change. Rogers often used term evolution to describe development of urban forms.
3 Rogers’s writings often show his desire to see once again the world in terms of what Lukacs called an ‘integrated civilization’. Integrated civilization is pre-modern: it reflects society in which there is unity between the subject and the world. For instance, Rogers ascribes short life of Style Nouveau to the non-unified society where the relationship between the content and representation is broken. See Ernesto N. Rogers, Cesare de Seta, Gli elementi del fenómeno architettonico, p.70.
Paci was born in 1911, studied under Antonio Banfi, the most prominent scholar of Husserel in the 30’s in Italy and continued his phenomenological thought. Paci’s thought is a specific merge of phenomenological and Marxist thinking. As George Psathas
Both Rogers and Paci believed that architecture is a way of exposing ‘life-world’ as a pre-meditative, mutually shared ever-changing cultural ‘horizon.’ The changes in the life-world are temporal phenomena, which is why Rogers considered the past significant for understanding human existence and the existence of architecture as one of necessary human practices. “It is while questioning the past (but not by becoming the past) that I understand the present and the interest of the present for its own transformation.” (Paci, 1972). Paci furthermore deployed Husserl’s ‘suspension of judgment’ and ‘seeing things the way they are,’ as immediately accessible for perception. New ‘style,’ according to Paci, could only be born of new encounters with the life-world, through lived experience unburdened by prejudices. The architect, who is able to uncover certain aspects of the life-world through his/her work, can find in it a society that is not “theorized or ideologized or structured beforehand according to the perspectives of a given sociology... but make[s] alive and real social relationship of his country, with its needs and miseries, with its illusions and hard sense of reality, of the limits and conditions of life.” 5 This heightened awareness of the world is what the architect can bring forth if only (s)he herself can “see the things the way they are.” It is the collapse of an ordered relationship between human subjects and the world—authentic living that goes beyond purely rational and involves bodily engagement—that Paci and Rogers wanted to see in new architecture.6

**Ernesto Rogers, T.S. Eliot and Bergson**

In a February 1954 editorial, “Tradition and the Individual Talent,” Rogers borrows the title of T. S. Eliot’s well-known essay advancing the theory of artistic depersonalization. Rogers (Rogers, 1997) described how Eliot “invites artists and critics to broaden the terms of historic sense while warning them against inborn deformations, which alter the quality of the judgment.” It is the capacity to critically approach one’s own and other cultures that is the prerequisite for a true artist. In this context tradition is the field in which artist continually erases himself and his progress is a “continual self-sacrifice, a continual extinction of personality” which enables mediating or channeling experiences outside his/her own sphere. In this vein, tradition, as Eliot (1982) claims, cannot be inherited:

“…if you want it you must obtain it by great labor. It involves, in the first place, the historical sense which we may call nearly indispensable to anyone who would continue to be a poet beyond his twenty-fifth year; and the historical sense

---

The central problem for Paci is the role of the subject in the world and the transformation it went through world’s ‘scientificitation.’ “The center of the whole problem is, and remains, the return to subjectivity. We have alienation when social relations do not allow this return.” …”Phenomenology wants to return his (man’s) ‘subjectivity’ to man. It wants to return man to himself; freeing him from every fetishism, from the mask behind which humanity has been hidden or veiled.” p. 6.

“I, if I know myself, know myself in the world and in relationship to the others and that is to plurality and in plurality.”

5 Paci, “L’architettura e il mondo della vita”

6 It is precisely this request for authenticity and abstraction of historical contextualization of the subject that will be attacked by Theodor Adorno. According to Adorno, thinking that it is possible to grasp something substantial behind the thought generates ideology of a “universal humanity” that blurs distinctions between the subject and historical conditions to which it belongs. In Adorno’s opinion, “jargon” of authentic existence does not liberate subject from alienation but masks circumstances under which it operates. See Theodor W. Adorno, The Jargon of Authenticity.
involves a perception, not only of the pastness of the past, but of its presence; the historical sense compels a man to write not merely with his own generation in his bones, but with a feeling that the whole of the literature of Europe from Homer and within it the whole of the literature of his own country has a simultaneous existence and composes a simultaneous order… This historical sense, which is a sense of the timeless as well as of the temporal and of the timeless and of the temporal together, is what makes a writer traditional. And it is at the same time what makes a writer more acutely conscious of his place in time, of his own contemporaneity.”

This understanding of historical sense is what marks Rogers’s understanding of historical time: at once continuous time and the atemporal content of history shape themselves in the form of tradition. Instead of the causal chain of events, Rogers thought of history as the layering of events, layers that for him were equally visible in anonymous architecture as well as in Palladio.

How are temporal phenomena manifested in physical form in Rogers? Through invention, of which memory is an agent. It is memory that (Rogers, 1960) “confers on space the measure of time, of all the time which comes before us.” Following Bergson’s (Bergson, 1911) discussion of two kinds of memory, Rogers claims that memory has two functions in design, related to contemplation and activity respectively: “one that moves from us towards things” and one that moves “from things to us and beyond us.” In Bergson the former uses “centrifugal movements” and constitutes bodily memory registered in the body itself, while the second suggests “centripetal movements,” marked in representations within the external world. The first implies action formed by a habit, while the second requires recollection. In both cases the human body is the medium that communicates between the external world and its perception. While Bergson’s understanding of memory remained a discussion of individual memory, Rogers never clearly marked how this individual memory becomes collective; it is clear, however, in his writings that the artist/author is the one “who knows” the collective.

The work of art also employs Bergson’s contemplative memory, which moves “from things to us” and generates representations of the world as it is within. In order for the work of art/architecture to fulfill this role—as Rogers believes alongside Paci—it must balance the relationship between utility and beauty. The definition of form, moreover, was to Rogers (Rogers, 1960) one of the central problems of misuse of history in architecture:

7 However, Rogers claims, memory is just one of the elements necessary for the art to address the issues of larger cultural framework.
8 Rogers does not cite directly Bergson in this editorial but he confirms reading of his work in “Economia e armonia” where he discusses the role of tactile vision.
9 Bergson’s dual memory conflicts with Paci’s notion of continuity as life-world. First implies notion of directionality, from subject towards world and from the world towards subject that does not seem to be present in Paci.
10 By removing element of stability/firmness from Vitruvian triad structural concerns are avoided. This went hand in hand with Paci’s disinterest in technological aspect of the work of architecture. Rogers on the other hand was familiar with new technologies and interested in the possibilities of prefabrication and its role in the reconstruction. The issue was discussed on the pages of Casabella. However, Rogers in discussion with Roberto Pane claimed that in the symmetry beauty – utility firmistas is included as practical concern in utility. Rogers rarely showed enthusiasm for the technology which some of the modernists advocated.
“it is clear that the measure of these terms [utility and beauty] is different from case to case and that, therefore, their internal relations are in each case different. But it is just this identity of method, which consists in drawing form out of the reality intrinsic to each case that, in penetrating each case, reveals it for what it is and finds a different expression from one to another.”

The “case by case” method was a doctrine that enabled Rogers to criticize the perceived universalization of architectural language on one hand and the use of typology of Saverio Muratori’s kind on the other.\(^{11}\) Method itself was Rogers’s tool to enact ideology; to address the classical ideal of *concordia discors*, a strategy of mutual dependency of architectural works, urban environment and man made landscape/nature, and finally, repetitiveness of typological approach. It was in his mind also the most powerful tool against formalism (Rogers, 1960).\(^{12}\)

“Thus, the most profound discovery of the Modern Movement, i.e. the inclusion of methodological research in the process of form, transformed the very essence of traditional theory and practice which, however variable and rich, was based on a belief in few principles subject to the play of variations.”\(^{13}\)

Paradoxically, in Rogers’s discourse, method generates specific autonomy of architectural work (Ockman, 1993): “[p]recisely because the method of approaching is the same, it follows that the solution to every problem is different.” Thus the solution to what Rogers sees as formalism and lack of historical awareness lies in keeping and balancing the distinction between particular generated by the method and universal created by typology. In Rogers’s view method requires careful recognition of the “concreteness” of a pre-existing environment, while typology abstracts its complexity. The duality between method and typological approach maintained in Rogers recurs as a problem in Torre Velasca, one of the most disputed and difficult projects BBPR built following the theory of pre-existing environments.

Rogers introduced the theory of pre-existing conditions in the editorial “Le preesistenza ambientali e i temi pratici contemporanei” in Casabella Continuità (February 1955). The text summarizes much of his thinking on the relationship between a building, urban environment and man made and natural landscape. *L’ambiente*, or context as it came to be translated in English, is the place of pre-existences, of the “prime plasmatic matter” as

---

\(^{11}\) Michelangelo Sabatino explains that Rogers’ “case by case” method was an interpretation of “method without a method” advocated by his professor at the Politecnico di Milano Ambrogio Annoni. See , p.76.

\(^{12}\) Saverio Muratori (1910-1973) was an Italian architect, historian and educator known for the development of operative history based on typological research. Muratori ‘s methodology was rigid and conservative and soon became known as a generator of anachronistic and mute architecture mostly foreign to architects who considered themselves followers of modern tradition. After students’ protest in 1968 Muratori was removed from the architectural scene and his activities shifted from teaching and designing to writing.

\(^{13}\) “The style, as a unification of figurative expressions, is each time specified through facts and there can be no mechanical repetition nor analogical (imitative) transference, where its formal constitution is already defined somewhere else. To empty forms from their defining content would be completely external operation which would precipitate into formalism.” p.99.

For Rogers, in order for formalism to be avoided, new building needs to be a result of a specific process/method that addresses dialectically relationship between the past and the present.

\(^{13}\) Rogers in several occasions acknowledged influence of Walter Gropious on his thinking as well as his disagreement on the treatment of history.
Rogers defined history.14 “It is clear then,” he further explains in The Image: the Architects Inalienable Vision, “that building cannot be isolated from the environment which surrounds it; and this does not merely include the landscape [paeasaggio] that which visually embraces the place where the building is erected; but also that unity of images born of the most diverse associations, all of which are legitimate by reason of the serrated logic of sensation.”15 In a relational universe, where objects constantly create and recreate mutual connections, new buildings must enter “organically into the given spatial-temporal situation” where each form is specific to its own set of circumstances. This means that architecture is “profoundly connected to environmental conditions,” which are determined both by socio-economic and cultural factors. For Rogers, language, nature and architecture are products of the long history of transformations. Evolution of forms is the result of a long period of adaptation and selection.16 Evolution is culturally constituted but also has its natural determinants. However, when building is set in relationship with the context, “the copying of the traditional forms will obviously be impossible, but so will the design of an architecture only abstractly satisfying our taste and the conditions of contemporary technology[.]” Furthermore, forms must “convincingly document the subtlest ethical claims of collective and individual man, continuing the ancient discourse.”17

In his discussions of architectural continuity and evolution, Rogers had in mind both spatial and temporal consistency, notwithstanding radical shifts that mechanisms of change might bring in certain epochs or certain places. One must understand history and time as underlying the overall structure of human existence to understand why for Rogers it is not possible to eschew living in history (Rogers, 1999):

> “Whether history evolves according to a continuation of customs, content, form or whether history is characterized by a fracture that causes an emergency, in any case, as I was suggesting, there is a relationship in time between the present time and the period that preceded it.”

Continuity, then, is not marked by the rate or nature of change, gradualness, or finding similarities between epochs but is a ubiquitous principle. It simply implies dynamic historic process, where every stage of development relates to the previous one.18 Continuity thus needs to be distinguished from chronological, or linear time, segmented in measurable units that succeed one another. Continuity, channeled through the theory of

---

14 In Gli elementi del fenomeno architettonico Rogers defines history as a “patrimonio disponibile: ridiventa materia prima plasmabile, secondo la volontà e l’interpretazione di cui siamo capaci.”, p. 32. Interestingly enough, Marc Bloch, founder of the Annales School of history claimed that “history’s time is the plasma in which phenomena are immersed and the locus of their intelligibility.”
16 Rogers was familiar with Henri Focillon’s work and his theory of pre-existing conditions echoes Focillon’s theory of the evolution of form.
18 This understanding of continuity resembles the notion of continuism in science. Continuism assumes that “any event of today was directly preceded by some event which must have taken place yesterday. However, the event of today is not necessarily an ‘advance’ over the event of yesterday, but it is only a ‘reaction’ to it, and the reaction may be a positive or negative one. That is, the event of today may concur with yesterday’s event and carry it forward, or it may disagree with it, and oppose it with something different.” See “Continuity and discontinuity in nature and knowledge”, Dictionary of the history of ideas, http://etext.virginia.edu/cgi-local/DHI/dhi.cgi?id=dv1-62
pre-existing conditions, molds two concepts of time in one: while it implies diachronic processes of adjustment in the evolutionary development, working with pre-existing conditions understood as a historical pre-requisite that requires a horizontal cut through the grain of time.\textsuperscript{19} \textsuperscript{20}

**Torre Velasca and Time Collapse**

At 1959 CIAM conference in Otterlo, Ludovico Belgiojoso, Enrico Peressutti and Ernesto Rogers (BBPR) exhibited the project of Torre Velasca, several years long exploration into methodologies of skyscraper design within historic urban environments.\textsuperscript{21} For an architectural practice that came out of the Italian rationalist tradition, Torre Velasca was not only different among other BBPR works but proved problematic for many CIAM participants.\textsuperscript{22} Rogers’ (and BBPR’s) interpretation of history as an overarching principle and tradition understood as ‘life-world’, once implemented in the urban context, was seen as static and anachronistic. In a heated conference debate, Peter Smithson commented that the building belongs to an anachronistic “closed aesthetic” and wielded a “plastic vocabulary” of an “immoral” and dangerous sort (Newman, 1961): “[n]ow I suggest that you, in a way, created a model here which has included certain consequences which, if you had been aware of your position in the society and your position in the development of things, you would have seen are dangerous.” Jacob B. Bakema thought that building’s silhouette looked as it could have been there for fifty years, and its form failed to communicate contemporary life.\textsuperscript{23} In his answer to Smithson’s charge of immorality, Rogers insisted on structural integrity of the building: “[t]o me the intimate morality of an architecture is the clarity and sincerity of the structure and the awareness of the use of the many things required in the putting up a building – that is the morality of the object.”\textsuperscript{24}

\textsuperscript{19} In *Course in General Linguistics* Ferdinand de Saussure distinguishes between two branches of linguistics: “synchronic linguistics will be concerned with logical and psychological connections between coexisting items constituting a system, as perceived by the same collective consciousness. Diachronic linguistics on the other hand will be concerned with connections between sequences of items not perceived by the same collective consciousness, which replace one another without themselves constituting a system.” See p. 98.

Diachronic time is related to the notion of diachronic history which is represented by a vertical axis. Diachronic history follows the process, it is evolutionary by nature, it registers changes and how certain event comes into being. Synchronic history implies structural approach and focuses on a system in place at a fixed point in time.

\textsuperscript{20} In few instances Rogers mentioned cyclical time in the context of modern architecture. He was familiar with Vichian *corsi e riconcorsi* from student’s days and described in one of his texts historic change in terms of culture exhausting itself and creating a new one. This concept of historic time is not elaborated in his writings but it does, however, contribute to the overall understanding of historical time which is not based on the notion of progress.

\textsuperscript{21} In 1959 CIAM [Congrès International d’Architecture Moderne] members gathered for the eleventh time. Forty architects participated in the congress held in Otterlo in the Musée Kröller – Muller, building originally designed by Henry van der Velde. Rogers was in the coordination team together with Bakema, Roth, Voelcker and Wogenscky. Presentations reflected irrecconcilable approaches towards direction of architectural thinking and the conference marked the end of the CIAM. Peter Smithson, Alison Smithson and Jacob Bacema harshly responded to BBPR’s project.

Giancarlo de Carlo, Ignazio Gardella and Vico Magistretti also exhibited their work at the conference. The projects raised a polemic between the members, Jacob B. Bacema for example, claimed that Rogers is resisting contemporary life. Projects by Vittorio Gregotti, Aldo Rossi, Guido Canella, Aimaro Isola and Roberti Gabetti were presented on the pages of Casabela which came to be known as Neo-Liberty.

\textsuperscript{22} There are other projects in this period that exhibit BBPR’s interest in building with the theory of pre-existing conditions in mind. One of those is mixed use building in corso Francia in Torino. Most of them, however, do not exhibit historical elements in the manner Torre Velasca does.

\textsuperscript{23} Bakema’s statement points towards lack of understanding of specificity of Italian situation and the building constraints in Milan in this period.

\textsuperscript{24} “There is one main difficulty that I see,” Rogers replied to Smithson’s argument that BBPR’s project is both aesthetically and ethically wrong, “and that is that you think in English. Now that is not my way of thinking.”
At the conference Rogers claimed that (Newman, 1961) “the general shape of the building is the result of a very rational design approach,” where “in design of any building there are three things to be considered: how the building meets the ground, how it meets the sky and the variation of the body (how it goes around the corner).” Rogers thought that the three part division of façade in Torre Velasca was satisfactory, without reference to non-differentiated vertical (metaphorically infinite) compositional structure which is the usual typological determinant for a skyscraper. At the same time, Rogers claimed, the horizontal division of the high-rise enabled contact with human dimension. He emphasized the way in which the building was an “articulation of the structure,” which comports with Paci’s idea that architecture has particular power of articulating relationship between function and construction as a part of larger agenda of art to demonstrate social life. Apart from the “structural coherence” that allows for the construction to have an aesthetic role, Rogers claimed that the significance of the project also consists in the collection of images it evokes without direct reference to any particular Milan building. “The value of this design,” Rogers explained, (Rogers & Molinari, 1997) “lies in its intent to epitomize, culturally speaking – while avoiding repetition of the expressive language used in any of its buildings – the atmosphere of the city of Milan, its ineffable yet perceptible character.”

**Conclusion**

Rogers’s theory of *preesistenze ambientali* and desire for cultural unity generated methodology which combined diachronic and synchronic notions of time. In other words, it created conflict between event and structure, or process and system. In Torre Velasca historical continuity is dismantled by making a horizontal cut through the grain of time which meant simultaneous occurrence of architectural elements that belonged to separate time periods of the historical development of Milan. While these elements (color of concrete, shape of the windows, shape of the tower etc.) did refer to the cumulative
process of the evolution of the city, the fact that they were combined at one place in one/present moment could not but freeze the historical process. This created an aesthetics, (something Rogers and his office claimed little interest in), that provoked experience of estrangement and familiarity simultaneously. Tacit dualism in the architecture of Torre Velasca drew from the notion of continuity, yet also the “collapse of time” seen in the contextual approach. The contextual framework that Rogers and BBPR posed as a starting point was a complex historic environment, and a resource for the work of art that imaginatively addressed whole of the history of Milan. The synchronization of the past embedded in the image of the building, however, clearly seemed to many a consequence of eclectical approach to history. This ‘approach’ which many named also stylistic, had to do with what George Kubler called the “spatialization of time” characteristic of stylistic representations of history (Kubler, 1967).

Torre Velasca can be seen both as a skyscraper and a scaled up fragment of a historic city; it is prefabricated system with expressive structural components and heaviness that resembles Perret’s work. One can say, however, that history in this building operates as the mechanism of memory: it is fragmented and somewhat remote. This brings us to the question of whether cultural unity was ever broken or its nature was transformed. If there is any reason why this work cannot be named historicist, proto-post-modern or any other lexical interpretation of the reaction to modern it is because it still belongs to the period of crisis of history. The attempt at timelessness of the building, manifested through the set of historical references belonging to different time periods and consequently different cultural expressions, brings us back to the question of the familiar and estranged. In this “time confusion,” Rogers found a source of cultural richness and the capacity for dismantling the dualism between the Nietzschean interior and exterior. Architecture’s task of mediating the aesthetic and ethic, or what Smithson called “morality,” proved difficult (Tafuri, 1989): “this was an architecture that reflected on everything – the past, the city, and the possible dialogue between intellectuals and the masses – less then on itself.”

---

25 In Kubler’s terms: “The idea of style is best adapted to static situations, in cross-cut or synchronous section… Thus style and the flow of happening are antinomies. Style pertains to a timeless sphere…”
References


**Contact email:** lejlavujicic@hotmail.com
Self-Reflection on Buddhist Dhamma Teachings through Acrylic Paintings and Video Art: Experiential Approach of Understanding

Chollada Thongtawee, Silpakorn University, Thailand

Abstract
This research aims to study the experiential method of learning and understanding of buddhist teachings on Truth or Dhamma through self-reflection of the artist creating acrylic paintings and video art. The qualitative research methodology was used in data collecting and analysis. The result of the research has shown that the experiential approach of artistic works could accelerate personal growth of the artist on buddhist teachings through self-reflection and self-healing at the deep level. Artistic practice could increase inner peace/meditative state of mind, leading to intuitive understanding of philosophical scriptural teachings. This suggests that one of the best ways to learn buddhist philosophical teachings, which generally explains the nature of mind and life, is through the experiential exploration within of one's own mind, that is, through artistic practice.

Keywords: experiential learning, buddhist dhamma teaching, acrylic painting, video art, self-reflection
Introduction

Amid our complex and chaotic society nowadays, one finds himself/herself looking for the way out, including religious path. Buddhist Dhamma/Truth is one of the path chosen by many to lead the way out of sufferings. However, traditional meditation practice could be discouraging to contemporary practitioners. The application of artistic creation could be an interesting innovative method to enhance concentration, mindfulness, and self-reflection similar to Buddhist traditional meditation practice. The experiential learning of Buddhist Dhamma/Truth through the use of acrylic painting and video art making is thus interesting to be explored.

Objective

1. To study the path of meditation through experiential learning using acrylic painting and video art making to understand Buddhist Dhamma/Truth.

Methodology

Qualitative methodology is used in data collecting and data analysis: journal writing and content analysis.

Self-exploration of the researcher as the creator of artistic medium of acrylic painting and video art is focused in this research, based on the concept of experiential learning and self-reflection.

Conceptual Basis
From this diagram, Buddhist Dhamma/Truth could traditionally be understood through the practice of Samatha, that is, concentration meditation for inner peace and mind centering, and Vipassana or insight meditation, that is, reflective observation of intrinsic Truth of nature, basically based on the power of the concentrated, peaceful state of mind gained from Samatha practice.

However, by using experiential learning method through artistic creativity like acrylic painting and video art, one could possibly understand the deep meaning of Buddhist Dhamma/Truth as well, through the potential of concentration practice and reflective observation of the process of artistic creation.

**Literature Review**

1. Experiential learning: tacit learning

1.1. The explicit and tacit knowledge process: Ikujiri Nonaka & Hirotaka Takeuchi

The internalization process is the process of understanding and absorbing explicit knowledge to tacit knowledge of individuals. The internalization process is basically the experiential process, through one's own practice/action, in real situation or simulating situation. This would provide the opportunity for one to directly experience and understand the actual concept and methods. This process is the process of transferring explicit knowledge to other individuals or groups (Nonaka & Takeuchi, 1995).

1.2. The process of learning by doing: Michael Polanyi

Polanyi states that most of our knowledge is tacit knowledge. He explains, 'We can know more than we can tell'. While explicit knowledge could be transfer through systematic language, tacit knowledge could only be learnt through one method, that is, giving one the opportunity to teach oneself. Thus, Polanyi explains human learning process that we learn through bringing ourselves into relation with the object learnt, in the manner of 'indwelling'. (Polanyi, 1969).

2. Buddhist meditation practice: samatha and vipassana

2.1. Samatha  concentration meditation for inner peace and centering of the mind.

2.2. Vipassana: insight meditation, the reflective observation of intrinsic Truth of nature, basically based on the power of the concentrated, peaceful state of mind gained from Samatha practice.

**Research Results**

The results could be divided into 2 parts:

1. Acrylic painting
2. Video art
1. Acrylic Painting

1.1. Concentration, mind centering practice while painting: acrylic colour is water-based, requiring much concentration and mindfulness to control the smoothness of colours blending.

1.2. The philosophical content of the paintings required inner contemplation.

The examples of acrylic paintings explored in this research are as following:

➤ Sea of interconnectedness: the inseparable nature of the wave (ego) and the ocean (wholeness)
The chain of karma(action): the tie of attachment

Sea of interconnectedness: we are the inseparable part of the whole, the elements in nature.
➤ The cycle of Anicca: the impermanent nature of Nature.

➤ Seed/chain of karma: the fruits of action
2. Video Art

2.1. Concentration, mind centering practice while creating. Video art is the mixture of art forms by nature: film, music, photography, and performing arts. This blending of different artistic forms required detailed concentration.

2.2. The philosophical content of the video art required inner contemplation.

Themes explored in video art creation in this research are as following:

➤ The chain of Karma: the effect of karma or our action, especially with attachment.

➤ Sea of interconnectedness

➤ The cycle of Anicca: the impermanence nature of nature

➤ The seed/chain of Karma

Discussion and Conclusion

➤ Acrylic painting and video art making are the art forms conducive to building mind concentration and mindfulness. They could be used as the medium for Samatha meditation: Buddhist meditation practice for centering the mind.

➤ The philosophical content of this artistic practice is based on Buddhist Dhamma/Truth, that is, the law of karma(action), the interconnectedness of all things, and Anicca (the impermanent nature of Nature). The creation of the art thus required contemplation and self-reflection on the subjects explored. This could be comparable to Vipassana meditation: Buddhist insight meditation practice of reflective observation of the intrinsic Truth of nature, basically based on the power of the concentrated, peaceful state of mind gained from Samatha practice.

➤ This experiential learning approach of Buddhist Dhamma/Truth through artistic creation of acrylic painting and video art, could thus be an innovative path towards the understanding of Buddhist Dhamma/Truth besides the traditional meditation practice.
References


A Research of Self-Disclosure on Fanpage Creators of Illustration/Text in Taiwan

Li-Chiou Chen, Yuan Ze University, Taiwan

Abstract
As technology evolves, gradually more virtual network platforms with innovative functions are being developed. Nowadays, the phenomenon of nearly every person having a personal mobile device, usually a smartphone, can be observed everywhere. Because the amount of information people receive has been increasing every day, reading habits are also changing. Compared with simple textual descriptions, pictorial expressions more easily arouse contemporary readers’ interest. Thus, graphic creation is an emerging industry on social networking platforms. Among such platforms, Facebook has achieved outstanding levels of development and has a considerable number of users, thereby contributing to the online migration of many illustrators to Facebook for use as a sharing platform to rapidly gain popularity and accumulate followers. The illustrators who use Facebook fanpages to present their works, in this study will be called as “fanpage creator of text/illustration”. The study will apply qualitative method to explore the relevant applications of the self-disclosure theory on 10 graphic illustrators who manage Facebook fanpages that have considerable numbers of followers, to gain an insight of the phenomenon of self-disclosure among Facebook fanpage creators of text/illustration.

Keywords: Facebook, fanpage creator of text/illustration, self-disclosure
1. Introduction

Swiping on one’s mobile phone has become an activity in itself in modern life. As lengthy texts are difficult for viewers to understand in short periods of time, the presentation of simple images enables them to recognize the meaning immediately, even responding with a knowing smile. Thus, there has been a trend in the use of humor or satirical statements by creators of text/illustration; these creators must have not only a certain degree of artistic ability but also a keen eye for the world around them, as only by melding their works with current affairs are they able to elicit favorable responses from the viewers. As viewers “like” and “share” the works of text/illustration creators on social media, their works can become known to more people. As a result, the popularity of the creators increases as their fanpages or works collect more likes. According to the social media monitoring platform database of Taiwan’s Institute for Information Industry (III), among the categories of online celebrities, there is an extraordinary number of fans of online illustrators; in the ranking of Taiwan’s top ten internet celebrities, the Facebook fanpages of creators of text/illustration occupied the seventh and ninth places (Carat Media, 2014).

In recent years, there has been a rise in the use of Facebook fanpages by illustrators to publish their works; in this study, we call these artists “Fanpage creators of text/illustration.” The creative content of this type of creator is centered on drawings, supplemented with text; these drawings are often presented casually using line drafts, with a straightforward creative method. The content of these works is generally humorous, with their satirical nature eliciting an emotional venting effect. Furthermore, they use today’s most popular free social media site, “Facebook,” as their development platform. This study uses the DailyView internet popularity tool to survey the “Top Ten Illustrators Most Loved by Netizens” (2010), as calculated by online big data, and the “Popular Taiwanese Online Illustrators” proposed by the UBeauty website (Venus, 2014). By combining the data with the number of fans of fanpages as collected by the researchers, and creating a ranking based on the number of fans, we have selected subjects suitable for interviews. Through qualitative interviews and an in-depth discussion of the phenomenon of self-disclosure. The objective of this study is as follow:

To explore the phenomenon of self-disclosure among Facebook fanpage creators of text/illustration:

To explore the ability of creators of text/illustration to apply self-disclosure, expression, self-clarification, social validation, social control and relationship development, and analyze the phenomenon of self-disclosure in their creations.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Emergence of Fanpage Creators of Text/Illustration

In the Web2.0 world, online blogs are platforms that emphasize the sharing of ideas. In addition to having basic functions for the exchange of information, they also provide web users with a convenient platform for debate. Compared with the previous traditional forms of mass media, blogs are more effective with regard to both viewer interaction and feedback. Previously, because of the high popularity of illustrators on
blogs, such as Wan Wan, many illustrators were attracted to the platform in hoping that they could share their works through the social media platform, and follow Wan Wan’s footsteps. However, following the rapidly increasing number of Facebook users, by 2009, 62% of the Taiwanese public used Facebook (Chen 2009). Furthermore, according to Liang Youmei, Facebook’s manager for the Greater China region, “up to 2014, in Taiwan, an average of 11 million people were logging into Facebook each day, and an average of 15 million people logging in each month (Yang, 2014). This trend has also encouraged illustrators who previously shared their works on blogs to shift gradually to the use of Facebook as a sharing platform to gain popularity more quickly.

In addition, there is an increasing number of such creators who are beginning to operate text/illustration based fanpages because of various reasons: looking to the future development of text/illustration, in view of the cost-free nature of the Facebook platform, and driven by personal interest or the encouragement of friends. Generally, fanpage creators of text/illustration initially only rely on “likes” and “shares” from their Facebook friends, expanding gradually their group of viewers and accumulating fans. However, only when a certain degree of fame is attained is it possible to make physical versions of their creations available to the public for purchase. As regards the age distribution of Facebook users, those aged between 25 and 34 and 18 and 24 make up the bulk of users, comprising 42.2% and 36.2% of total users, respectively (Business Next, 2009). We can see that based on this distribution, Facebook fanpage creators of text/illustration are generally relatively young; for example, Cherng and Baibai Jiujiu were born between 1981 and 1990. Furthermore, there is an increasing number of fanpage creators of text/illustration whose works are expanded and shared by other Facebook users as they accumulate more likes, for example, Duncan, Mr. H.H, and the Funny Tattoo Shop.

However, the characteristics of fanpage creators of text/illustration differ from traditional illustrators in certain ways; in addition to being shared on different platforms, there are also a number of differences in modes of creation and style: (1) The process of creation has been condensed. Creators of text/illustration have shortened the creative process to adapt to the high rate of elimination within the Facebook platform; if they are able to share multiple works in a short period of time, it is easier to attract a stable following of fans. (2) Textual content is more realistic and satirical. Typically, works with particularly satirical content, or content particularly pertinent to current events, more closely match the thoughts of viewers; as a result, it is easier to resonate with viewers and attract fans. (3) Image presentation methods are transformed. The presentation of images can be divided into two types: single image presentation, which causes viewers to recognize immediately the meaning of the text/illustration creator, as in Figure 1; or dialogue presentation, for example, though a narrative presented in continuous images, as in Figure 2. (4) The use of simple colors and black-and-white line drawings are introduced. To reduce the duration of the creative process, many fanpage creators of text/illustration have a habit of using extremely simple black-and-white line drawings paired with simple colors as their main method of creation, and use basic color blocks to represent their desired color pattern.
2.2 Phenomenon of Self-disclosure

Psychologists have always hoped to understand the relationship between the internal psyche of individuals and the formation of their personalities; an important study in this regard involves the search for an internal phenomenon of human behavior: self-disclosure. The psychotherapist Sidney Jourard was the first to study the phenomenon of self-disclosure in individuals’ behavior, and defined self-disclosure as “the process of making the self known to other persons” (Jourard & Lasakow, 1958, p. 91). However, in many situations, any individual may reveal unintentionally such information to others; hence, Jourard and Lasakow (1958) believed that self-disclosure is better defined as a process occurring in an environment with at least two people, wherein one person reveals intentionally a secret personal information. This process of self-disclosure leads to the transmission between an individual and another individual; an individual and a group; or an individual and an organization (Joinson & Paine, 2007; Petronio, 2002).

People can attain many rewards through self-disclosure behaviors, although there are also potential risks in such behaviors (DeVito, 2009). The reason that people engage intentionally in self-disclosure is that they can attain rewards, and that the good use of self-disclosure can generate positive effects. Self-disclosure has several different functions; Derlega & Grzelak (1979) stated that self-disclosure has five primary types of function (Sears, Freedman, & Peplau, 1985; Taylor, Peplau, & Sears, 1997).

1. Expression:
Expression involves primarily an individual telling others positive or negative things. It is an appropriate venting behavior, and can bring about emotional relief, in addition to achieving the goal of emotional expression.
2. Self-clarification:
Appropriate self-disclosure can promote the clarification of an individual’s way of thinking, help others to understand them, and help to generate consensus with others. It also avoids the generation of unnecessary conflict or misunderstanding.

3. Social validation:
When individuals express their way of thinking, attitude, and values, they can increase their acceptance within the community through the help, guidance, recognition, and affirmation of others. Then again, it is also possible to change one’s views to be in line with societal norms.

4. Social control:
Often, people will use this function to create a fixed image, and search for recognition among others or within society to achieve a certain goal. For example, several people will emphasize intentionally their strengths or use private information to control indirectly the views of others, allowing them to strengthen their image.

5. Relationship development:
Self-disclosure is used to transfer information related to beliefs, views, or ways of thinking between individuals, and can increase mutual understanding, thereby achieving a heightened level of closeness in the relationship.

In summary, we can see that an appropriate self-disclosure allows for venting one’s emotions, promoting understanding of oneself, and achieving further recognition from others, in addition to influencing others’ impressions of our own personal images. With regard to the development of mutual relationships, self-disclosure is an important means of promoting interpersonal relationships and increasing the degree of intimacy in relationships.

3. Research Method

As the highly popular fanpage creators of text/illustration explored in this study form a niche profession, this study has chosen to conduct qualitative interviews as a research method to understand the phenomenon of self-disclosure among the fanpage creators. Below, this study expands upon the positive functions of self-disclosure, and establishes the semi-structured interview questions, as shown in Table 1:
Table 1: Interview questions corresponding to positive functions of self-disclosure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Function of Self-disclosure</th>
<th>Interview Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Expression</strong></td>
<td>What are you thinking when you create works for your Facebook fanpage? Which works do you think express your emotions? Can you give an example?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-clarification</strong></td>
<td>What thoughts did you have when you began establishing your fanpage? Have you ever encountered fans whose opinions contradict your own? How do you clarify or explain your thoughts? Can you give an example?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Validation</strong></td>
<td>What are your feelings when you see that the number of people on your page, posts, or likes have increased? What type of content is most likely to attract “likes” from fans?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Control</strong></td>
<td>When managing your Facebook fanpage, will you create a certain image to represent your thinking? For what reasons do you want to form this image?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relationship Development</strong></td>
<td>Do you enjoy interacting with fans of your fanpage? How much time do you spend each day? Do you have any special interaction experience? Can you give an example?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Source: This study

After ranking fanpage creators according to the DailyView Current Big Data Analysis (2014) and the highly popular fanpage creators of text/illustration proposed by the UBeauty website in 2014 (Venus, 2014), this list serves as the original list of interview subjects for this study. However, because a number of creators of text/illustration could not participate owing to personal factors or refusal, we have supplemented this original list of interviewees with creators of text/illustration whose fanpages had at least 140,000 fans as of October 30, 2016. Below, we assign a code beginning with “F” (Facebook, Fanpage) to interviewees, ranking them by number of fans, and explaining briefly the content of their works, as shown in Table 2:

Table 2: Top 10 Fanpage Creators of Text/Illustration, Number of Fans, Description, and Works

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Name of Fanpage</th>
<th>No. of Fans</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F01</td>
<td>Allcaneat</td>
<td>562,434</td>
<td>The creator of “Allcaneat” use a round-faced, chubby, short-haired boy as his protagonist. His creations involve events encountered in life, and use humorous techniques and detailed descriptions of everyday life phenomena.</td>
<td>![Allcaneat Image]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
F02 QiaohuTIGER 466,175 The creator of “QiaohuTIGER” use an anthropomorphic “chicken-sister” as his protagonist. He describes a phenomenon encountered by service industry staff, and has a humorous drawing style and narrative technique, winning acclaim from many department store service staff members.

F03 Funny Tattoo Shop 348,416 The creator of “Funny Tattoo Shop” use a particularly Taiwanese black-and-white “Ah-Bei,” wearing a pair of underwear as his protagonist. The creator’s family has opened a Chinese medicine clinic, and uses a pen to draw black-and-white line drawings easily in his spare time at work, creating a precise Taiwanese “Ah-Bei,” wearing only his underwear, to convey sarcastic and humorous content.

F04 Yellow Book 327,365 The creator of “Yellow Book” created the pen-name “Yellow Book” as a result of his love for black-and-white humor. Initially, his works were primarily humorous, but he shifted gradually toward the expression of real-to-life logic through their comics.

F05 2bau 488,570 The creator of “2bau” is a mother of twins, a vegetable and a meat bun. She uses fine lines and a variety of colors to draw the interesting events that occur with her sons.

F06 Jokeman 411,463 The creator of “Jokeman” uses a brown-skinned “Tuitui Bear” as his protagonist; the fanpage primarily tells jokes, which are expressed through interpersonal dialogue.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Views</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F07</td>
<td>Lousy Girlfriend</td>
<td>372,984</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F08</td>
<td>Mr. Doumiao</td>
<td>213,022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F09</td>
<td>I Wanna Hate You for Five Mins</td>
<td>192,621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F10</td>
<td>Wei, Wei</td>
<td>140,414</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The works of the creator of “Lousy Girlfriend” became popular as stickers for the Line messaging app. The works use warm, soft colors, and fine lines, and show subtle everyday interactions between boyfriend and girlfriend.

The creator of “Mr. Doumiao” is still a university student, and his protagonist is a figure with two leaves growing from its head. The creator likes to use green colors in his works, illustrating interesting events in everyday life.

The creator of “I Wanna Hate You for Five Mins” use a black-and-white character, with an oval hairstyle as her protagonist. Most of her works are in black and white, at times, including few color blocks. The content of these works often breaks taboos in discussing current or political topics.

The creator of “Wei, Wei” uses a blue, smiling wizard as his protagonist. The creator prefers to use watercolors to paint his works, which often have childlike and soothing content, and differ from typical works of creators of text/illustration.

Data Source: This study

4. Data Discussion

Use of expression-integrating creative content

Self-expression, attaining others’ attention: According to the interview results of this study, we found that most creators of text/illustration believe that they could express their personal feelings through the creation of expressive works (F04, F05, F06, F08, F09, F10). When completing a related text/illustration, in addition to being able to express their feelings, creators can also receive a variety of feedback from their fans; on this point, interviewee F08 said, “I hope that everyone gives me a heartfelt reply.” Furthermore, certain respondents stated that when a text/illustration resonates with fans, they would often feel comforted (F03, F04, F05, F07), and “wonder what people felt” (F08). In addition to obtaining different feedback, one interviewee stated that he was also able to attain new inspiration or ways of thinking from fan feedback, and applied this to his future creative content (F04).
Observation of others instead of self-expression: Compared with incorporating personal feelings into works as a means of expression, only a small portion of creators of text/illustration stated that they do not incorporate their own feelings into their works (F01, F02, F07). Rather, they think that it would be more appropriate to keep personal feelings separate from their works: “Not at all, I separate my personal feelings when drawing” (F02). Furthermore, one interviewee believed that it is more appropriate to collect or observe the lives of others and then aggregate common phenomena into their works, as interviewee F07 stated: “My fanpage is more like homework I give to myself; I record my own or other people’s interesting behavior, so this isn’t really expression, it’s more like my feelings about some things that I have collected.”

Use of self-clarification, dealing with opposing voices

Creating works that generate opposition easily: Because online social media platforms are used by individuals holding many different ideas, fans will at times hold opposing views or ideas; most interviewees stated that they had encountered this kind of situation (F03, F04, F05, F06, F09). Especially when concerning political or violent topics, it is easy to attract the ire of fans (F07, F09). “As long as there is a little bit of violence, I don’t think that you shouldn’t draw this sort of thing, but when you draw these kinds of works, it is easier to generate opposition” (F07). However, this study found that when healing language is used, or the work does not contain subjective emotions, it is less likely to incite opposition among fans (F01, F10). This is similar to the statement of interviewee F01: “The things that I draw generally aren’t subjective, and so it’s not common for fans to complain or oppose them.”

Handling opposition: The way by which creators of text/illustration manage opposition voices varies according to their personality. One interviewee stated that they would clarify earnestly their meaning to fans: “I always explain things to them earnestly. I can’t say who wins and loses, but at least I said what I wanted to say, and they also spoke up; it’s only a question of whether you acknowledge one another” (F09). Still, other interviewees stated that they would not clarify their ideas (F03, F04, F05); “I think that it is better to ignore than argue with them” (F04). It is interesting that oftentimes, clarification is not something only conducted by creators; a number of the interviewees stated that oftentimes, fans would help them clarify their thinking (F02, F05). As interviewee F02 said, “I think that clarification isn’t just done by myself, my fans will also help me.”

Application of social validation, a reflection of the number of “likes”

Number of likes influences the mood of the creator: The results of this study indicated that almost all interviewees found that when the number of likes, shares, or comments received by their works was higher, their mood would improve (F01, F02, F04, F05, F06, F07, F08, F09, F10). Certain interviewees thought that, initially, they would feel a certain pressure as a result of the size of these numbers (F02, F08), and that this pressure only varied according to changes in their attitude: “I don’t know why I think so much; I don’t draw these pictures for likes, I draw them because I want to share some funny things with other people” (F02). Another interviewee stated, “I don’t really care if I get many likes; if I don’t, it doesn’t matter” (F10).
High degree of discussion related to holidays and current events: We can see from the interview materials that often, creators of text/illustration know which kind of content is more likely to attract the attention of fans, such as content related to holidays or current events. Interviewee F04 stated: “I know that the most resonating pictures should be pictures related to current events.” Although a number of the interviewees chose to use “holiday stems” for their work (F01, F10), others only selected a few special holidays, to distinguish themselves from most creators of text/illustration (F08, F09). “I may draw something for more special holidays, like Father’s Day or Mother’s Day, but for holidays like Women’s Day, I don’t want to be the same as the others and follow the trend, so I don’t really want to draw anything” (F08). Furthermore, the level of discussion on topics related to politics or religion is relatively high. Generally, these kinds of works readily attract the attention of fans, but many interviewees avoided touching on such topics to avoid being labeled by the public (F04, F06, F08). However, a small portion of the interviewees chose to create works related to political topics, although they tended not to care about the views of others: “For me, politics is a part of life, and when politics becomes a part of life, if I don’t draw these things, my mood will be pretty bad, so I can’t avoid it” (F09).

Viewers are mainly female: It is widely known that fanpage creators of text/illustration are primarily male, such as the creators of Funny Tattoo Shop and QiaohuTIGER. Nevertheless, according to the information collected from interviews in this study, for most text/illustration fanpages, females make up the majority of fans, at times by a significant margin (F02, F04, F06, F07, F09). Interviewee F02 stated, “There are several women who work at department stores, an extremely high proportion.” One interviewee believed that the reason for this is related to the qualities of the fanpage: “because of the topics that I address, the proportion of my fans who are female is certainly higher, as high as around 80%” (F07). However, one interviewee believed that this may be related to females’ being more likely to “like” things: “Because guys don’t really look at this kind of fanpage. Because I remember that I looked at some data before, and there were fewer guys looking at fanpages and liking posts than girls. I myself don’t really “like” stuff, and tend not to look at other things” (F04).

Application of social control, designing the appearance of fanpages

Inadvertently producing a fixed image: Creators’ text/illustration fanpages often have not formed a fixed image at the beginning. As time passes, many interviewees had established gradually a set image to represent their fanpages, to provide fans with a clear reference point for their page (F01, F02, F05, F07, F09, F10). Furthermore, the image that creators of text/illustration form may be related to their personal preferences, the memories of viewers, or different professions. For example, one interviewee established the image of their page based on their personal preferences: “I use small bits of text in my illustrations; the reason for my use of short, witty language is that I’ve always liked these kinds of works” (F10). Another interviewee created their page’s image to provide viewers with a reference point: “I found that it’s actually not easy to make everyone remember you, so I slowly began to form an image; the resulting feeling is that there’s really such a person living next to you” (F01). Furthermore, when a creator of text/illustration is in a certain work environment, it is easy for them to produce works in line with the “stem” of this environment: “At that time I thought that I’d like to draw things in my own work
environment, after doing some drawings, I found that all of them were things related to the department store industry; after that, it was just a matter of course that it would become the way that it is now” (F02).

Integration of personal ways of thinking into character image: We can see from the information collected from interviews that many interviewees project their own thoughts onto the characters that they create (F01, F05, F08, F09, F10); As interviewee F09 stated, “I will create a specific image on my fanpage to represent my own way of thinking.” However, a few interviewees also stated that they would establish a virtual form to express the figure they want to create: “I’m relatively different in that the character isn’t me; it’s a virtual character that I’ve created; I try to project the person that I’d like to become onto it in creating the structure of this person” (F06). At times, creators do not realize that the content that they create contains their own ways of thinking, and must be alerted to this fact by others: “In fact, this could be my subconscious” (F03).

Application of relationship-development, an interaction with fans

Most creators enjoy interacting with fans: A majority of the interviewees stated that they enjoy interacting with fans (F01, F02, F05, F06, F07, F08, F09, F10). “I really like to interact with fans. I really encourage people to leave comments for me” (F05). However, a minority of the interviewees also expressed that they do not really like to spend time interacting with fans (F03, F04), and believed that it is better to spend their time on the improvement of their works: “I think…that it is better to spend the time to get back on working” (F04). This is because interviewees believed that it is most important that they create good works. In an interaction with fans, the groups who like each page vary according to the different characteristics of the page itself. For example, because most of the works on the page of interviewee F05 relate to interaction between mother and child, it has accrued many fans who are also mothers; at times, she would even receive children’s products sent by fans.

Controlling time spent on replying and interacting with fans: As the number of fans increases, the numbers of likes and comments also rise. However, this study found that fanpage creators of text/illustration do not spend a large amount of their time interacting with fans; most creators complete their replies in a short period of time (F02, F06, F09, F10). “In fact, it doesn’t take long, maybe about half an hour!” (F10). Other interviewees expressed that they would interact with fans through comments frequently (F05, F07, F08); “Almost all the time, unless I’m busy or go out to do something fun; otherwise, I’ll look at comments often” (F08). For creators who receive a large volume of comments, it is only possible to reply selectively; comments that more likely obtain replies include questions posed by fans: “Basically, I will only reply if I can” (F05). One creator stated that, with regard to interesting comments, “If it’s funny, I’ll interact, or if I can do something with it, I’ll also intercept this funny thing” (F03). Another creator believed that, with regard to comments that create topical works, “If I post a topic on which everyone debates, of course, I’ll spend more time; for example, if I post something more lifestyle-oriented, it’s only to give everyone a laugh. I tend not to reply to these sorts of things, I’ll only look at them” (F09).
Keeping an air of mystery: Although most interviewees enjoy interacting with fans, they hope to maintain a distant relationship with fans and keep up a certain degree of mystery to avoid damaging the imagination of fans (F02, F03, F08, F10). As interviewee F08 stated, “Everyone hopes to retain an air of mystery, we hope that you like our artwork, and not us as people. At times, people have fantasies toward these images, I don’t like to disappoint people.” Thus, if it is necessary to appear in front of people, such as by appearing in a television program or attending an exhibition, creators wear sunglasses or homemade masks to hide their faces to preserve their mystery (F02, F03, F06).

5. Research Conclusions

With regard to self-disclosure, when fanpage creators of text/illustration produce “expressive” text/illustration, they generally incorporate their personal feelings into the work. To achieve the goal of expression, at times, as a result of sticking close to creative content related to popular feelings, it is easy for such works to resonate with fans. When compared with standard illustrators, fanpage creators of text/illustration are able to use the functions of their fanpages to attain immediate feedback or comfort. However, only a small portion of text/illustration creators will separate their personal feelings from their creative content, rarely placing their personal feelings into their works, but rather observing the daily lives of others as a primary source of content. As a result, the “expressive” works of creators of text/illustration are at times created for the public, as opposed to solely as an expression of the creators’ personal emotions. In addition, although most of today’s highly popular public creators of text/illustration are male, according to the interviews conducted in this study regarding the management of fanpages, it is mostly female fans who “like” works on text/illustration fanpages; at times, this gender gap is especially pronounced. Because females more readily engage in self-disclosure when compared with males, it is easy to see that the proportion of females “liking” posts on fanpages is high.

As fanpages are instantaneously interactive platforms, they are suitable platforms for all parties to engage in “self-clarification.” When fanpages accrue consistently increasing numbers of fans, it is easy to imagine the joy of the fanpage creator; however, as creators feel the pressure of declining or stagnant fan numbers, creators can only find relief from improving their mood themselves. Furthermore, when a fanpage has a large number of fans, various voices are generated easily. The ways in which creators manage opposing voices vary depending on their personality or the characteristics of their fanpage; certain creators of text/illustration would clarify actively their views to fans to avoid misunderstandings, and at times, other fans with similar opinions would help in this clarification, providing comfort to the fanpage creator. With regard to self-disclosure, most people enjoy receiving “social validation,” and fanpage creators of text/illustration are no exception. When compared with previous illustrators, fanpage creators of text/illustration are able to observe the responses of fans on their pages to understand their preferences. Often, creators of text/illustration understand what sort of content more readily attracts the attention of fans, although a number of text/illustration creators would choose not to follow such trends to differentiate themselves from the bulk of fanpage creators. Additionally, when facing highly sensitive content, such as religious or political topics, most creators of text/illustration would choose to steer clear of such works to avoid being labeled by the public, although others would be driven by personal ideas to continue
to create such works.

With regard to “social control,” fanpage creators of text/illustration can use easily the fixed form of their fanpages to influence indirectly the thinking of their fans. However, this study found that in fact, many creators of text/illustration had established the image of their page gradually and unintentionally, and generally because of personal preferences, to provide an easily remembered reference point for fans, or because of the unique profession of the creator and the ease of generating creative “stems” from different professions. For example, the creator of QiaohuTIGER was previously employed working behind the counter of a department store, and thus, most of their creative inspiration came from their experiences during their work. Often, creators of text/illustration unknowingly incorporate their own ways of thinking into their works; it is interesting to note that at times they need to be alerted to this phenomenon by others. A number of creators even incorporated their own image and characteristics into their protagonist, creating a personal image of themselves. Furthermore, when compared with previous illustrators, modern creators of text/illustration use “like” and “comment” functions to engage in a “relationship development” with fans, increasing the closeness of their relationships with their fans. However, at times, the number of comments received is extremely large, and so it would be excessively time consuming to reply to comments one by one; as a result, many creators would choose to respond to comments that ask questions, which have interesting content, or which they believe contain a topical work. To increase their fame, present fanpage creators of text/illustration would at times participate in television programs under the guidance of agencies, although they would usually cover a part of their face, instead of revealing their appearances to the public. This may be illustrative of the idea that many creators of text/illustration hope to retain a sense of mystery, and maintain a distant relationship with their fans to avoid damaging their fans’ sense of fantasy.

This research is partially sponsored by the Ministry of Science and Technology, Taiwan, R.O.C. under Grant no. MOST 105-2410-H-155-040.
References


Carat Media (2015, August 1). Qiantan Xinxing Wanglu Chahuajia de Guanjian Xiyinli (1) [The Key Attractiveness of New Internet Illustrators (1)]. Retrieved from http://yahoo-marketing.tumblr.com/post/120007272136/%E6%B7%BA%E8%AB%87%E6%96%B0%E8%88%88%E7%B6%B2%E8%B7%AF%E6%8F%92%E7%95%AB%E5%AE%B6%E7%9A%84%E9%97%9C%E9%8D%B5%E5%90%B8%E5%BC%95%E5%8A%9B%E4%B8%8A.


Contact email: lichiou2001@yahoo.com.tw
cambre@saturn.yzu.edu.tw
Life and Death in Verse Case Study: 
*The Writings of Lili Kasticher, the Only Woman Who Wrote in Auschwitz*

Lily Zamir, The David Yellin Academic College of Education, Israel

Abstract
This paper focuses on the unique works of a young woman named Lili Kasticher, written at the Auschwitz-Birkenau death camp from April to November 1944. Lili, the only woman known to have written at Birkenau (Shik, 2012), risked her life by stealing pieces of paper and pencil stubs to write poetry and encouraged her friends to do so, offering them a prize—a portion of her bread. The notes bearing her writings were concealed on her person until her liberation in spring 1945. The possession of a piece of paper or writing implement was absolutely forbidden in Birkenau. Anyone caught with such contraband was immediately sentenced to death. Consequently, inmates at Auschwitz produced no written material, with rare exceptions, such as the records kept by the *Sonderkommando* or the postcards that Germans ordered their victims to write, as discussed below (Levi, 1995).

Keywords: Sonderkommando, Auschwitz–Birkenau, death camp, writing
Introduction

This study introduces the unique, authentic works of Lili Kasticher, written at Auschwitz-Birkenau. Lili may well be the only individual inmate who was willing to risk her life by writing. Possession of a piece of paper or pencil stub was absolutely forbidden in Birkenau. Anyone caught with such contraband was immediately sentenced to death. Consequently, inmates produced no written materials, with rare exceptions, such as the Sonderkommando, who documented everyday life at the camp, concealing their records in jars that they buried near the crematoria in the hope that someone would find them after the war, as indeed occurred (O. D. Kulka, 2013, 15). Jewish inmates were ordered by the Germans to write postcards to their relatives, describing the “decent” living conditions in their “new place of residence” (O. D. Kulka, 2013, 10). In Moments of Reprieve, Primo Levi describes a love letter that a gypsy inmate asked him to write, indicating that he endangered both their lives doing so, just to gain half a portion of bread.

Historical notes

Auschwitz, the largest and best known of Nazi concentration camps, was built in 1940 when the Nazis realized that they had more prisoners than prison space. It was liberated by the Red Army on January 27, 1945. Nine days earlier, as Soviet troops drew closer, all inmates capable of walking—48,342 men and about 16,000 women, along with 96 prisoners of war—were dispatched on foot via Austria to other locations in Nazi-occupied Europe. These evacuation campaigns would later be known as Death Marches. About 6,000 inmates remained in Auschwitz–Birkenau, including some 4,000 women. The last of the Nazis left the camp on January 24, three days before its liberation.

In the inferno that was Auschwitz–Birkenau, various regulations were imposed with the sole purpose of maintaining a repressive system that sought to break the inmates’ spirit and utterly destroy all traces of humanity among them. One such edict was an explicit ban on possession of paper and writing implements. Those who violated this prohibition were sentenced to death. We are aware, however, that the Sonderkommando systematically documented the destruction of their brethren—not only in writing but also photographically—realizing that they were the last and

---

1 Some of the Sonderkommando used those same jars to conceal poetry or diaries, such as the diary of Zalman Gradowski, that was discovered among the Auschwitz crematorium ruins. These Sonderkommando, who faced certain death as a consequence of their documentation, were also members of the underground that planned the revolt.

2 These postcards included cryptic references warning their addresseees not to believe the ostensibly optimistic messages. For example, they might say: “Every day, we welcome Uncle Hlad (Czech: Starvation)” or Uncle Mavet (Hebrew: Death).” The cards were sent by inmates of a Birkenau camp populated by families dispatched there from Theresienstadt. They were dated March 25, but the people who wrote them were annihilated on March 7, over two weeks earlier. The entire family camp was wiped out in July 1944.
perhaps the only inmates who could attest to the annihilation of European Jewry. Had they been caught in the act, they would have been executed at once. In any case, they were living on borrowed time because the Germans, at Adolf Eichmann’s orders, exterminated the Sonderkommando every few months and replaced them with new ones, so that their secret would go with them to their deaths and not find its way outside. The only exceptions to this decree were people with special jobs, such as expert mechanics, furnace tenders, “Room Service”\(^3\) personnel, etc., as Rudolf Hess testified at his trial in a Warsaw court shortly after the war (for a more detailed explanation, see Gutman and Berenbaum, 1998).

Shlomo Dragon, one of the few Sonderkommando survivors, attested that he and his comrades wrote out of a sense of mission. Besides keeping records, they collected the diaries they found among the items left behind when people were ordered to undress before entering the gas chambers. The Sonderkommando concealed these items by burying them in jars and boxes in the courtyard of Crematorium II, hoping that someone would find them at the end of the war (Greif, 2005, 54). In his testimony, Dragon, who had worked in the “Room Service” unit of the Sonderkommando, said he made sure that Zalman Gorodovsky, who kept a diary and documented the events of each day in meticulous detail, would be given a bunk near a window, so that he would have light by which to write. After liberation, Dragon recalled where Gorodovsky had hidden his documentation and began digging among the crematoria ruins until he found it. He also provided Gorodovsky with thermos-like jars in which to bury his works. Leib Langfuss, known as the Magid (preacher—for more detailed information, see Cohen, 1990, p. 312) joined Gorodovsky in his writing efforts. His comrades assigned him easy tasks, so that he would have time for the writing craft. At the end of the war, Shlomo Dragon submitted all the material to the Soviet Extraordinary State Commission that came to investigate Auschwitz. His brother, Abraham, who was also a Sonderkommando survivor, stated that they knew no one would remain alive and that they had to leave testimony for the world thereafter. Inmates serving as Kanada Kommandos\(^4\) risked their lives to smuggle in pieces of wax to the Sonderkommando, so that the writers could seal the jars and containers in which they hid their notes. Sonderkommando Ya’akov Gabai, of Greek origin, wrote about 500 pages of documentation about the annihilation of his brothers. Gabai was unable to carry all he wrote on the Death March to Matthausen, but submitted them as testimony from his memory after liberation (Greif, 2005, 223). Another Sonderkommando of Greek origin succeeded in writing a note reading: “If anyone finds this note, please give it to my wife and tell her that I’m dead.” He hid it in the courtyard of Crematorium II. Fortunately, it turned out that he survived. Writing the note, a heroic act in itself, was possible only because the Sonderkommando had special living conditions, including quarters isolated from the rest of the camp and an exemplary organizational structure that ultimately led them to mount a rebellion in October 1944.

\(^3\) A Sonderkommando unit responsible for quarters, ongoing maintenance and food management.

\(^4\) A work detail whose job was to sort goods that the victims left behind on the ramp before their dispatch to Germany. At times, these inmates had the opportunity to smuggle in some of these goods, risking their lives by doing so, of course. Usually, they looked for food, medicines and the like.
Another well-known writing enterprise at Auschwitz–Birkenau involved the postcards distributed among inmates before they were sent to the gas chambers. They were ordered to write to their relatives in German (those who did not know German were not permitted to write), telling them that they had arrived at a labor camp where the work is reasonable and the food is satisfactory; they are well treated and in good health and hope to see their families soon. These postcards usually were dated several days after they were actually written, after their writers had already been turned to ashes for some time (Levi, 1995, 39-46).

In his story, The Gypsy (Levi, 1995), Primo Levi documents postcard writing and the distress felt by inmates who did not know German and did not participate in the Germans’ deceptive postcard campaign. One of them, “the Gypsy,” asked Levi to write something in German for him in exchange for a half portion of bread. To Levi’s surprise, he pulled out a sheet of paper rather than a standard postcard, asking him to write a letter to his sweetheart. This was a strange and unique situation, not only because the Gypsy had a sheet of paper but also because he showed Levi a picture of his girlfriend that he managed to smuggle with him into the inferno (ibid.). It is clear that the punishment for possession of either or both of these two “treasures” would be a beating or death, depending on the whims of the officer in charge. Similarly, we know of Polish inmates, most of them political prisoners or people in contact with them, who kept records in Auschwitz and managed to save their work.5

The writings of Ruth Klüger describe experiences in Auschwitz but were recorded in Gross–Rosen, as Klüger confirmed in 1994 (Nader, 2007, 52-53). Eva Golgevit’s poems were also presumed to have been composed in Auschwitz, but as she noted in her book Ne pleurez pas, mes fils..., published in France in 2000, all her poems and songs were transcribed from memory after the liberation and not during her internment.

From a historical perspective, Lili Kasticher’s Auschwitz writings are worthy of special attention—not so much for their literary value but because of the unique and marvelous human story they tell of a young woman whose heroism challenges and bests death by means of the written word.

Lili Kasticher’s works may be divided into three principal groups. The first, to be discussed below, was written in Auschwitz–Birkenau and comprises a collection of poems, some of them decorated with miniature drawings, mostly her own.

Among the notes she saved from Auschwitz were two additional interesting items:

---

5 Dr. Wojciech Polosa, Archive Director at the State Auschwitz–Birkenau Museum in Oświęcim, submitted the following items on June 22, 2016: Jerzy Pozimski’s notes, in Polish, from June 24 to December 23, 1940; notes in Polish that Wincenty Gawron took with him when he escaped from Auschwitz in May 1942; Tango Tesknoty, a poem written by Tadeusz Borowski after his arrival in Auschwitz in autumn 1943 and saved by Polish political prisoner Mieczyslaw Szymkowiak; a handwritten Polish note of unknown date and authorship, discovered in Auschwitz in 1958; a handwritten Russian poem of unknown date and authorship.
1. A Yiddish letter of unknown authorship. According to Lili’s son Alexander Hirt and daughter Daniela. Lili did not know Yiddish at all.

2. A poem dedicated to Berta, describing hunger. It bears neither name, date nor signature, but its content and the handwriting on the original copy indicate that it was most likely written by Lili. It begins with the verses: “I feel ashamed/but I am hungry / I should have been given more food” and concludes with “There are no boys here, only girls / I must not think about food.”

Only two poems were written by her friends and partners in suffering whom she urged to write. Piri, Inmate No. 86855, dared to write a satiric poem about “recreation” in Auschwitz, comparing the death camp to a special resort where the inmates swim in their own filth instead of a pool. Juci Abraham submitted a poem as well, entitled A Sweet Dream. Both poems are dateless. In her Auschwitz diary, Lili mentions that she had to persuade her friends to write these poems in exchange for her bread portion.

The Code of Behavior that she would later develop at the Gross–Rosen Labor Camp in Oberhohenelbe, attempting to institute social order and mutual assistance among female inmates, was written on the reverse side of Auschwitz requisition forms. The Code is of immeasurable importance, as it represents an unequivocal promise that within the chaotic realities of the camp, in which every movement and every breath is dictated by the Germans, several Jewish women joined forces to draft their own rules, thereby declaring their moral superiority and freedom of opinion against an oppressor that seeks to render them subhuman.

The second category comprises a much larger set of poems and drawings from the Gross–Rosen Labor Camp in Oberhohenelbe, to which Lili was dispatched from Auschwitz in late December 1944, while the third consists of the Auschwitz diary that she reconstructed from memory after liberation.7

Lili Kasticher was born in 1923 in Petrovaselo, Yugoslavia and subsequently lived in Novi Sad (annexed by Hungary in 1941). She was deported to Auschwitz–Birkenau in April 1944 and had the K. C. number 8965 tattooed on her arm. From there, she was assigned to Gross–Rosen, where she worked at the Lorenz factory until liberation in May 1945. In December 1948, she immigrated to Israel where she remained until her death in November 1973.

It is common knowledge that female inmates at Auschwitz–Birkenau did not write because of the severe prohibition against possession of even the most rudimentary writing utensils and paper scraps (Shik, 2012). Lili insisted on writing nonetheless and even encouraged her fellow inmates to do so as a means of maintaining a last shred of human dignity. These “written signs” from the inferno also engendered an intuitive therapeutic empowerment, now referred to as bibliotherapy, that helped them face...
their horrible fate and gave them the aim and purpose that are so critical in the human struggle for life and survival (Frankl, 1970).

In an interview published in the Hungarian-language Israeli newspaper Uj Kelet (New East) on February 23, 1951, Lili explained how she stayed alive, revealing the ways she obtained pencils and crayons in Birkenau. She had once read a book on handwriting analysis and palmistry and would read palms for the inmates, always promising them an encouraging future. One day, she was approached by the Kapo, who asked to have her palm read. Excited by Lili’s reading, the Kapo asked her to analyze letters from her boyfriend at the front, wanting to know if he really missed her. Lili’s interpretations always confirmed what the Kapo wanted to hear. Subsequently, the Kapo asked Lili to write and illustrate her letters to her boyfriend. That’s how Lili obtained writing implements. She picked up paper from the office floor, hid them in her pocket and took her booty back to her blockmates. This story was repeated in a letter she wrote to a Mr. Halmi on December 15, 1963.

Lili wrote mostly at Birkenau, while her friends did so primarily at Gross–Rosen, where the living conditions were slightly more bearable, Lili organized writing contests, for which the prizes consisted mostly of food that she had set aside from her own minimal portions.

### Lili’s Writings in Auschwitz

In Auschwitz, Lili wrote five poems with date-bearing headings and two—The Song of The Camp and Where Is Our Homeland—whose headings mentioned only the location: Auschwitz. The Song of the Camp describes the women’s yearning for the landscape of the Danube and their “homeland”: Green, flower-laden fields, small cottages and the sweet sound of bells ringing in the valley. Where Is Our Homeland opens with the eponymous question and concludes with a prayer for success in finding that homeland, where they will be free and where “mother is waiting to be hugged and kissed.” The two poems appear to have been written about the same time, as their themes are similar and no mention is made of the camp and its hardships.

As its title suggests, One Night in Birkenau was written in Auschwitz–Birkenau on May 31, 1944, not long after Lili’s arrival, on a piece of paper filched from the office with German writing on the other side. It opens with the verses:

Thousands of nighttime fears are chased by the wind, in the night… (Kastich er, 1951)

The poem’s content expresses the tortures of life in the Lager (camp), with all its terror, loneliness and hopelessness. The inmates lived with their nightmares, in which they see their children asking for a cup of chocolate milk. Then, the alarm signaling the start of the work day cut the dream short:

8 The poems were translated into English by Suli Bruck in July 1973, with subsequent minor emendations by Zvi Ofer.
Rise, the sound of the alarm,
The camp bell high in the sky.

They are returned to the real world, in which they had been separated from their children, who were slaughtered in the gas chambers. To the left of the poem is a miniature illustration of the muddy camp and its wooden barracks.

To the Doctor at Auschwitz was written at Birkenau on June 15, 1944 in the same manner—in pencil on a piece of used paper, with a miniature sketch in the upper left-hand corner depicting tiny women raising their hands towards heaven. In a diary she wrote in Israel, Lili recounts that the poem was dedicated to a Jewish woman doctor who risked her life by tearing a piece of cloth from her smock to bandage a wounded inmate. The poem describes the inmates’ physical and mental torture and their yearning for words of encouragement:

Stand strong! We shall overcome…
Cursed hands will not drain our blood!

The Jewish physician indeed offered inspiration and substantive assistance through her kindness and soft words.9

The Germans routinely ordered inmates, men and women alike, to sing on the way to and from work. Lili’s poem The Parade is on the Way (July 30, 1944) was thus included in the women’s marching repertoire, sung to the tune of a well-known march, Mariska and describing the inmates’ lives with much humor and irony:

The parade is on its way, out of the gate
Whoever stays in place gets a kiss on “the place”…
Oh, how wonderful is our fortune of plenty

This poem includes a miniature illustration of marching women at its upper left corner.

The Women of the Camp (November 11, 1944) deals with the joy that another week has passed and all are still alive. It describes the terrible starvation that the inmates suffer, yearning for bread as they listen to the sounds coming from their empty stomachs.

Spring 1940 (December 3, 1944) was probably Lili’s last poem written at Auschwitz. Unlike all the others, it describes the horrible historical events of Spring 1940 that she had witnessed, in which people killed one another as the Danube flowed peacefully through the beautiful green forests of European spring. Lili’s postwar notes call the poem Dreaming of Novi Sad 1940. Its most remarkable feature is the absence of any reference to the misery of Auschwitz, instead focusing on Lili’s account of the Third

---

9 Concerning the altruism of Jewish physicians and nurses, Wilner (1998, pp. 28-30) reports that they carried dysentery and typhus victims, at risk to their own lives, so that the Germans would not notice them and send them to the gas chambers.
Hungarian Army’s butchering of Serbs and Jews as it passed through the region. This event preceded the mass shootings of Serbs and Jews along the Danube in winter 1942, known in Serbian history as “the Cold Days.”

Most of the writing at Auschwitz–Birkenau was accomplished by Lili herself, who tried to minimize the risk when encouraging her friends to do the same. At the Gross–Rosen Labor Camp in Oberhohenelbe, Lili organized literary competitions, but hardly wrote herself. At both camps, the prizes were always taken from her bread portion, reflecting her heroic, altruistic personality and leadership.

Lili’s Auschwitz–Birkenau writings, all in Hungarian, included Rules of Behavior,10 a guidebook influenced by her socialist views. She declared that the only way to survive the hell of Birkenau is to act as a mutually supportive group that adheres to the moral values on which its members were raised: “Here, there is no longer ‘I,’ there is only ‘we.’ And as ‘we,’ we will be saved if we behave sincerely, sacrificing ourselves for others, displaying good will, never bearing grudges or reporting others. Only thus can we maintain human dignity,” concludes Lili (Kasticher, 1951). This manifesto illuminates Lili’s personality as a socialist leader and reveals that the real purpose of her writing initiative was to preserve a modicum of humanity for herself and her friends.

Lili’s diary, written in 1951, describes the birth of a baby in Birkenau. The women realized that it would mean disaster for the mother and everyone else. After considerable hesitation, they decided to give him up. They wrapped him in a blanket and placed him at the entrance to the block, without revealing who the mother is. Lili describes this warm and sweetly breathing creature, painfully addressing the difficult moral dilemma and subsequent decision to give him up, thus saving the life of his mother and those of the others in her block (see discussion of One Night in Birkenau, above).

Lili’s Auschwitz works reflect starvation, humiliation, beatings, hard labor, poor hygiene, crowding, fear of death and uncertainty, all of which rendered life unbearable, but also expressed hope for a much better life in Israel, after liberation, as exemplified by the final lines of Homeland:

Those who suffered
Will rejoice again one day.

Within this inferno, one may discern signs of moral behavior, at great sacrifice, in which people risk their own lives for the sake of others, such as the Jewish doctor who saves a wounded inmate, or Lili herself, who steals pencils and paper and gives away what little bread she has despite her own overpowering hunger. As she wrote in her diary: “Soft words are life itself.” As long as we write, sing and create, we will remain human (Kasticher, 1951, pp. 12, 15).

10 A handwritten manuscript found in Lili’s diary. Lili’s granddaughter recalled her mother’s informing her that Rules of Behavior was written in Birkenau (Sela Ben-Ami, 2007).
Conclusions

Lili’s writings in Auschwitz–Birkenau raise several interesting points concerning her struggle to defeat death both physically and morally. Had she been caught, her punishment would have been death. Yet her writing was her struggle to defeat death, so the price was taken into account. 11 Second, the moral dilemmas she described in her poems and to a certain extent in her diary (Kasticher, 1951), especially the one concerning the woman doctor, always had altruistic solutions that accord top priority to others and their needs. Such behavior is also described as overtly feminine in educational contexts (Noddings, 1994).

Her own works and her attempts to encourage her friends to write 12 are heroic and unique measures of resistance, expressing her fight against the Nazis as well as her struggle to remain human and help her friends do so. She realized that as long as the breath of life was within them and their spirit continued to resist the Nazi oppressor, they still had some chance of survival. She derived great mental and spiritual satisfaction from her ability to create, proving her humanity even in the hell of the labor camp. Above all, she exacted her triumph over the Nazi oppressor who wanted to turn her into an Untermensch.

The therapeutic empowerment of Lili’s creativity saved her and many of her friends by raising their self-esteem and pride in the horribly sadistic and humiliating atmosphere created by the Nazis. These women and their works may well be remembered long after the Nazi era fades into oblivion.

In a recent newspaper article, Prof. Dov Kulka (2013) inquired: "What was the essence of Nazi Antisemitism?... The Jews, by race, were the biological source of the Jewish spirit… [that] was the enemy because of its ideas about the unity of the world and equality of humanity… The opposite idea was a conception of inequality among races… and a constant war for survival. They wanted to return the world to its ‘natural order,’ that is contrary to the humanistic ideas originating in Judaism.” This study uniquely identifies the transformation of accepting one’s fate into a source of creativity that accords dignity and strength to life in a world of brutality and violence, as exemplified by Lili Kasticher, whose creative verses of life and death turned the chaotic world of Auschwitz into an island of possible survival.

11 It is important to note that unlike the Sonderkommando, she had no organization to support her writing but rather relied on her own initiative and efforts.

12 Female inmates’ participation in the prize competitions that Lili organized intensified in the Oberhohenelbe Labor Camp, where physical conditions were slightly improved, with a positive effect on the overall atmosphere as well. The inmates were working for the Lorenz plant, that manufactured radio receivers and other electronic devices. They slept on mattresses and two-person platforms in an attic and above all, once every two weeks, on Sundays, when the factory was closed, they had time for personal hygiene. Lili used her free time for social activity because she knew that a reinforced spirit would rescue her comrades from death.
References


Silesia and Oikology: What Knowledge of Home Does Silesia Offer?

Aleksandra Kunce, University of Silesia in Katowice, Poland

Abstract
The author addresses the problem of the philosophy of the Silesian home. Silesia is a borderland in Central Europe now located mostly in Poland, with small parts in the Czech Republic and Germany, whose cultural and political history was influenced by various traditions. The Silesian narrative of home, the unique Silesian oikology, brings us closer to renewing our discipline of life. Oikology is an idea that binds oikos (home) and logos (knowledge, reason, word, idea), but it also involves something else, that which is in-between: a correspondence between the two which all at once is also distance, care and desire. The author tries to interpret the Silesian oikology as a unique Silesian-made product.

Keywords: Silesia, Home, Place, Oikology, Dwelling
Silesian oikology

Silesia is the idea of at-homeness, practised every day. Silesia is a borderland in Central Europe now located mostly in Poland, with small parts in the Czech Republic and Germany, whose cultural and political history was influenced by various traditions. Things have never been easy here: never just one language, one fitting national label, one history, or one identity. Home has been spelled out into so many individual households: aristocratic, middle-class, working-class, peasant houses (cf. Greiner, 2000; Kuzio-Podrucki, 2007); those in the city and in the country; those in the centre and on the periphery; homes less and the least national; those whose sympathies leaned towards Bohemia, Germany or Poland and those of an altogether separate experience (in the sense of Silesian separatedness); those marked by multiplicity, within one family able to place, side by side, two or even three languages, intertwining religions in a similar way as well. But all these homes emerged by the virtue of the one shared place (cf. Bieniasz & Szczech, 1998; Fuchs, 1968; Kramarz, 1981). They were Silesian, not nondescript.

Owing to their experience of the border, such homes were becoming more or less frontier-like, as Silesia has been about the complex experience of the boundary brought about by a well-demarcated place. That is the reason for the affirmation of being on the borderline or next to it, as a boundary protects the domestic territory and comes close to the experience of human frailty. Whatever is frail must be strengthened by the fortitude of home, the attachment to the landscape, but also by reaching out towards all those located beyond the border. Place becomes characteristic as such, and care for one’s home turns into an imperative. In Silesia people find themselves as subjects of their homes, irrespective of their social differences, being situated in a given historical moment, or relocations (displacements, migration, exile). Home that is so much more than just a building is related to the ideological and geographical territory. Silesia has created a singular religion of the domestic: you live in a place, together with it, next to it, and sometimes beside it, or despite it, but you never lose it from sight. Without home, “one is lost”; without emplacement one can fall into the hubris of unrootedness and independence instead of practising humility and performing service in one place. The teaching provided by the Silesian home and implemented throughout the ages, whether in Görlitz (Zgorzelec), Tarnowskie Góry (Tarnowitz), Pszczyna (Pless), Gliwice (Gleiwitz), Racibórz (Ratibor) or Wrocław (Breslau), has been straightforward: “we are where we are supposed to be”. We travel, wander, get tossed around and displaced, but everywhere we go, we are accompanied by our idea of place. People shaped by the idea of Silesia live in Frankfurt, Katowice, Essen or Opava. Frontier people are simultaneously people of the place, and therefore they find it difficult to become familiar with the binary thinking that opposes a wanderer and a settled person, for what they experience is a sense of interconnectedness: we move out and in, wander around but also perfect the myth of settledness. The border goes across minds, separates people, places families in diverse corners of history, sometimes establishing a friendly connection between the domestic territory and whatever is outside, but it also moves people out of their houses, oftentimes greedily intervening in their interpersonal relationships. More than that, it establishes in the most peculiar of ways bonds among those who are displaced, who have moved or re-settled, while installing an emptiness in their midst. We might point to anthropology of experience.
here, and say that the Silesian home displays “emptiness”, and does not disclose too much.

**What would Silesian oikology be as a unique Silesian-made product?**

Oikology is an idea that binds *oikos* (home) and *logos* (knowledge, reason, word, idea), but it also involves something else, that which is in-between: a correspondence between the two which all at once is also distance, care and desire (cf. Sławek, Kunce & Kadłubek 2013). Because of that, oikology situates the point of sharpness “a little further”. Emptiness and fissures provide the background for oikology as the knowledge of home, or perhaps knowledge by home that home prepares for us. We are those who have left home, and worked through the benefits and failures of rootedness and uprooting. We are those who look from afar so that things might become clearer, but also more acutely felt, as a lack, a gap, a fall. The home – our own home, understood as our neighbourhood, region, community, perhaps Europe, and finally as the world – will always have cracks and maybe even darkness within.

The Silesian home has always been a home in translation. What helps in understanding the phenomenon is the dispersed museums, whose very names allude to Silesia: Muzeum Górnośląskie (The Museum of Upper Silesia) in Bytom, Muzeum Śląskie (The Silesian Museum) in Katowice, Schlesisches Museum (The Silesian Museum) in Görlitz, Oberschlesisches Landesmuseum (The Upper Silesian Museum) in Ratingen, Haus Schlesien (The Silesian House) in Königswinter, Slezské Zemské Muzeum (The Museum of the Silesian Land) in Opava, Železniční Muzeum Moravskoslezské (Moravian-Silesian Railway Museum) in Ostrava, Muzeum Śląska Opolskiego (The Museum of Opole Silesia), Muzeum Śląska Cieszyńskiego (The Museum of Cieszyn Silesia), as well as Schlesisches Museum der Bildenden Künste (The Silesian Museum for Visual Arts) and the Wrocław Schlesisches Museum für Kunstgewerbe und Altertümer (The Silesian Museum of Craft and Antiques), which were both shut down in 1945. They have become a way of working through the Silesian home, once whatever had been lost became lost forever, and once the transparent home had become an opaque territory. Estrangement and distance connect thinking with experiencing. In Silesia one can communicate with others through one’s own sense of at-homeness, and the language as such does not matter, be it Polish, German, Czech or Silesian. One engages with one’s sense of at-homeness, but what creeps into that conversation is deferment. After all, the at-homeness that has been practised in Silesia for ages comes from the outside to supplant human beings. Settled and absorbed in that quiet conversation, one relinquishes the noisy course of culture, placing oneself out of the way, as one wants to take the effort to understand “home” from a distance, with no gusto, most of the time imperceptibly and within limits.

Unhurried and undemanding, the relationship of the idea of home with the concept of place leads us to the margins. In Silesia home is recognised as what is in the margins, be it the margins of the world, periphery of discourse, or whatever is off the official course of culture, out of the way of the promoted mobility of people and objects, but also away from the propaganda of stability and familiarity. Silesian oikology encourages us to take a few steps back, to loosen the bounds of functional thinking and slow down the rash exercise of practising “home”. It is not about practical thinking, and neither is it a set of instructions for using home.
**Humanities and Silesian at-homeness**

If the humanities are rediscovering themselves nowadays in the idea of at-homeness, they should pay attention to the Silesian experience of home. After the whimsical fascination with unrootedness and homelessness of thought and the apotheosis of lightness and dislocation, the domesticated humanities are becoming a challenge again, imbuing with gravity our words, actions and fortunes that are all emplaced, because we all belong to discrete points in the space-time continuum, even if we do sing the praises of movement. Emplacement reaches us when we are settled and when we wander, owing to the fact that we are born somewhere and we also die somewhere. What does come easy in Silesia is the experience of the relatedness of movement and stasis. The idea of place is broad: we wander around and then return to the notion of place that we have never really abandoned. Or perhaps it is more honest to say that we return to the place that has never allowed us to abandon it. The Silesian idea that place is necessary makes us work through the notion of home, continually taking the side of the domestic and the domestic bonds, even when we speak of their loosening and loss.

The knowledge dispensed by the Silesian home would be simple: it is an imperative of a return to the idea of home. This means that one cannot be out of place, a place that one would not be able to return to, even if that return were purely imaginary. We need this realisation as a signpost also pointing to the fact that what hovers over the idea of home – any home, yours, and mine – is a premonition of an end. Silesia has been through this so many times, experiencing both an end and a new beginning, undertaking the effort of coming back, even when accompanied by the knowledge that the places of days past are gone and that you cannot simply return to previous times. Those who find their place in Silesia have had their experience of the Silesian being-on-the-borderline and keeping watch over home in History; precisely because of the inescapability of time they go to the pains of living the place that has already been sentenced to perish away. Everything dies. Therefore, we return.

Silesian at-homeness on the spot eludes states and nations. Once one or the other storm of history has ended, home will be unalteringly upheld in the movement that means return. This smacks of the Nietzschean eternal return of things, whereby the momentary and the eternal are tied together, as the linear order is destroyed (Nietzsche 2006, p. 128). When all things return, the idea of home as the home of being returns as well. The force of thinking (of ) home is inescapable, but in Silesia it returns as an imperative: we are the ones that build and ruin houses, and we are also the ones that move them. Our lot is to repeat that experience. Destruction and decay exist in the service of the metaphysics of reconstruction, renewal, patching up and sustaining the household. Nietzschean “sameness” that returns, Gilles Deleuze would add, as what is “always different”, would be the knowledge of the impossibility of return of the things that are literally the same (Deleuze 1994, p. 41). This bind of eternity and the “now” is of significance for home.

When we speak of the “product” that is the Silesian home or the understanding of the Silesian at-homeness, we have to remember that we refer to the space that in the seventeenth century was called “the eye of the world” and “Europe’s emerald” (Silesia was praised thus by the poet Heinrich Mühlpfort in the verse that reads “Ocellus Orbis, & Smaragdus Europae”, in a funeral elegy for George William, who
died in 1675) (Mühlpfört, 1991). At the same time the very same Silesia was turning into a dangerous heritage that required systematic annihilation after 1945. What had been the experience of architectural luxury and civilising power taking the shape of urban and industrial development (the magnate families of Donnersmarck, Ballestrem, Schaffgotsch, Hochberg and Hohenlohe, industrialists such as Friedrich von Reden, Karol Godula and Franz von Winckler), the strength of theosophical, philosophical, literary and scientific thought (for the sake of example let us mention just the names of Jacob Böhme, Joseph von Eichendorff, Gerhart and Carl Hauptmann, Horst Bienek, Otto Stern and Kurt Adler) was also the experience of land degraded both industrially and manually.

Such a conjunction renders living in the service of the return of things a simple and ordinary task. The imperative of a return to the place that eludes our cognitive understanding is something that repeats itself over and over again. We perpetuate in our experience the return to the things closest to us. What comes back before and after our times is the idea of home; and it repeats itself in a form that is identical, but different. It will return as the road that we take to go back “to” our home, as well as to get “away” or “out of” it. We will repeat thinking in terms of home even when we escape from it. We will relive the experience of filling home with our presence only to remove ourselves from it. We will go on destroying and building houses, perform the wandering and the pilgrimage.

Care for the home is the care for the self that is continuously evolving in the face of the return of things. It reappears together with the necessity of citing François Villon’s lamentation (Villon, 1982, verses 329-356; verses 367-384) and the quotes from Ecclesiastes. The narrative of passing away in the service of the return of things does not fall silent at home. The movement of creation, destruction and return seems to be an ever-renewing experience of emplacement, as well as of a subjection to the flow of life that is intertwined with the feeling of being transported by life and the eternal return of things.

Remembering – Silesian admonition

In the face of equalisation and uniformisation, but also of the excessive, often xenophobic attachment to the familiar, it is worth recalling the Silesian understanding of home. Silesian oikology brings forth oikos in experience and in thought, without glorifying the limitations of bunkers or the endlessness of open space. By allowing thought to take a new root in the notion of place, oikology draws attention to home as a task that lies ahead of men. It renews thinking about the discipline of the household, but not of dictatorship. Without the fissures that somewhat unhinge the house, there would be no dwelling. When, in his 1951 lecture “Building Dwelling Thinking”, Martin Heidegger calls for a new investigation of the relationship between dwelling and building, this call corresponds with the Silesian assertion of home that is repeated on a daily basis. Owing to the fact that he realised the connectedness of care (colere, cultura) and building (aedificare), Heidegger discovered or re-discovered the essence of dwelling (Heidegger, 2000, p. 149).

We mention Heidegger’s admonition because the repeatedly renewed call of the Silesian home connects being, place and dwelling, somewhat contrarily to the whimsical narrative of nomads. However, nomads are not as unconstrained, nor are
homes as static as one thinks. If we are coming back home, again and anew – especially after glorifying the nomadic and unrooted being “everywhere and nowhere”, working through the fascination with the idea of global, pan-human and unfixed communities – it means that we are renewing the gravitas of home. Home then becomes the most intimate space of gravity delineating future travel trajectories and preserving the density of experiences of at-homeness. Still, it also means that our discovery of home preserves the fissures and the loosening of ties; that it conceals a warning against the excessive covering (up) of what is human as well as an admonition against the irresponsible annihilation of things intimate. To insist upon renewing home entails a return to the uncomplicatedness of domestic thinking. This renewed task is a challenge for our transient time. What stands on the side of such hope is not a global home, but locality in itself, neighbourliness, and the concrete character of space and time. The idea of the local encompasses our attachment to place, landscape, things, community and separatedness of fate, as well as singularity of culture and our metaphysical at-homeness in this particular take on time, space, necessity, contingency, order of things, etc. Home is not sunk in shapeless magma.

Silesia notes the strength of the spiritual place that lingers on and endures, even when strained; the cultural sense of attachment to oneself that is impossible to erase in enforced or self-willed movement of peoples and individuals; the rootedness that is stronger than any socio-political order. The Silesian narrative of the strength of place returns to us as a challenge that becomes the more relevant, the more we grapple with the insufficiency of the biological and political storylines. It throws at the merry(less) figure of the nomad a question that lands at his feet like logs: are you really so certain that home has so easily let you out into the world? That it has simply left you, or let go of you so lightly? The simplicity of the domestic is recovered among the Silesian experiences of the domestic, and may become a call for preserving home. It is an oikological creed: “And yet we are on the side of home”. Against all odds.

“Somewhere” – we are on the side of home

If one stands on the side of home, that means that home is revealed as a value. A place is spreadahead, and a return to it is within the realm of possibility. This realm may be understood as the Nietzschean watery expanse that lies wide open to us (Nietzsche 2006, p. 36). The Silesian realm of possibility becomes just like the tempestuous sea: an invitation to return. But the moment it becomes what it is “worth”, it turns into an imperative. One has to return. As an uncanny “where?”, home leads us beyond what is certain and does not promise an eternal vigil. Still, it does not cease to be an emplaced “somewhere”. “Exactly here”, “somewhere here”, and not “there”: place appears as “somewhere” that is important to us, for it is where it is “worth” it.

“Where?” can also arouse fear (Joyce, 2012, p. 558), as Tadeusz Sławek has demonstrated. “Where?” introduces anxiety for oneself and the place, expropriating it from the position of privileged duration (Sławek, 2013, p. 28). “Where?” basks in the shadow of “nothing”. We should ask about the way in which “where?” is unearthed in Silesia.

If we followed this path, we would find in this question only (or as much as) the breath of God’s repeatedly grave address to Adam in Genesis: “Where are you?”. We would find Hasidic thinkers and philosophers of dialogue that dwelled on it. Shneur
Zalman of Liadi, Martin Buber and Franz Rosenzweig all resonate in the discovery of that disturbing inquest which forms an invitation to take upon oneself human life understood as a journey (cf. Shneur Zalman of Liadi, 2005, p. 173; Buber, 2004, p. 13; Rosenzweig, 1976, pp. 195-196). The shock caused by such an unusual question about “YOU” will be enough for the “I” to discover itself (cf. Tischner 1990, p. 79). It is an indication of great significance for us. Silesian oikology laments the “where?” of the place that people have already questioned, just as it grieves for the future “where?” of other places, in which one has to see home. Where is this “somewhere” for people, what will wandering be in the name of “whereness?”; will it find its fulfillment “somewhere”? Alexander Nawarecki dramatically words his concern for emplacement in Silesian: “Kaj we are som?” (Where are we?), and provides the simplest answer: “My som tukej” (We are here) (Nawarecki, 2004, pp. 9-21). The question needs place, because people need emplacement.

Anxiety is supposed to lead us onto the right course, helping us to take upon ourselves the life and place that has been given to us. But even the most whimsical “wherever” carries within it the weight of emplacement. Silesian oikology then warns us against succumbing to the excessive desire for imbuing the question of whereness with terror, as our task is to find the road back home. Once “somewhere” or “wherever” become renewed by our “here, here I am”, they start being emplaced. Without leading us too far away, they allow us to come back home. What stands behind the question of “where?” that dislocates home and attachment is the care for the tangible “somewhere”.

Emplacement in the “exactly here” becomes the experience of tangibility of things, but it is also a touch of the eternal. At home the world stops. It freezes, even though everything around changes all the time. What opens up at home, where time stands still, in one place, is the space of neighbourliness. Place opens itself up as a way in to “somewhere”. Oikological reflection in Silesia would then provide an invitation to opening place, once it has become a space again.

In the margins

To think home, to think in terms of home, to experience home: these tasks permeate the attempts to domesticate the world and to bring the world within home. Derived from Silesian experiences, oikology would then form an invitation to take a few steps backwards in reflecting and experiencing home, as well as to broaden one’s thinking by making a few steps to the side or by coming to a halt. At the same time, however, it would comprise an invitation to engage in a movement forward or, finally, into a radial movement that emanates in all directions, binding whatever retreats and comes closer, goes out and returns, is accelerated or slowed down, past and future, central and peripheral. There is no room for oppositions or binaries of sense here: only for the obverse and the reverse, a presence side by side, with one another, together. Built up and intertwined, interruption and withdrawal are necessary for recovering oikological thinking, in which the house reappears as a value. A departure from acts of expansion and spectacular events, as well as a retreat from excessive attachment to familiarity, are needed so that we can unhinge our experience of home. Home can be found only in the margins of both our self-attachment as well as on the sidelines of our carefree diagnosis of the liberating lack of rootedness. Marginal thinking, liberated and undemanding, binds itself with the care of emplacement.
By touching the Silesian narrative of home, people become people in the margins, seeing the world, including themselves, from close-up and yet from afar. They are people of both distance and proximity. The vast perspective from which you can behold things, individuals, values and the sky is fused with the precision of the microscopic diagnosis of things that escape the attention of others. An act of seeing things is not vague, but becomes singular and clear. It is as if the work of a watchmaker were fused with the perspective of a theologian or an astronomer, but also with the skill and courage of a sailor. People in the margins have already relinquished a demanding attitude towards the world and are satisfied with questions that have no immediate answers. What is enough is a silence that comes instead of the noisy dispute that we so hastily call a dialogue. A withdrawal means the recovery of domestic gravity, but also the joy of loosening the ties with the world and oneself. Already liberated from ourselves, free from societal aspirations, we gaze at the place that has befallen us.

In a sense, the story of the Silesian home could be about a return to the lightness of the child-like way of looking at the world, including home itself. Such a way of looking explodes the existing order of things, destroys established schemas and liberates life. It is Nietzschean chaos incarnated. And here we touch the mystery of the conjunction, to which Silesian oikology can lead us. Home is: it begins and crumbles before our eyes; it becomes tangible and intangible; it eludes us and imposes its presence onto us. It is intimate and distant at the same time. It is the embodiment of opacity, but also of simplicity. The child immediately understands the call “Let’s go home!”; the Silesian “Do dom!” (Back to home) has a metaphysical tenor and terror to it.

Out of the combination of countless details – gestures, words, the symphony of colours and fragrances, glances, silences, ordering of things, network of paths and the height of neighbouring buildings; the shape of doorways, windows and thresholds; the aesthetic sense and the symbolic emplacement of detail; the surrounding greenery, humans, animals and the landscape; fragmentary thoughts and traces of writing – one can extract home. It cannot be measured. It is the longing for the future. It is always already a premonition of the inevitable end. Even in the most cheerful moments of experiencing home, the Silesian everyday carries gravity within, evoking the End.

Surrounded by the idea of home, we are experiencing the abjection characteristic of existential experience. It is both frightening and ordinary, which makes us indifferent to a continuous reflection on it. In Silesia people become indifferent to their own abjection by losing attachment to the narcissistic habit of looking at oneself and one’s possessions, and by abandoning interest in the past (from which no one sensible wants to learn anymore); they stand by the idea of home instead. This experience does not overpower them, but on the contrary, makes them affirm and renew their home.

Silesia – endless trajectories and the discipline of life

The Silesian home is rugged. As the reality of experience, home is rough and does not fall into a sweet-sounding tune: it involves suffering and love, attachment and exile, rootedness and loss, glamor and poverty, ownership and the lack thereof, membership and homelessness, safety and fear, order and ruin. The experience of at-homeness is
not smoothed out or strictly demarcated. It is full of nooks and corners, ambiguities, vague connotations and multiple names. The poverty of language is all the more noticeable when we compare it with the abundance of the sensual experience, the intensity of images, bodily memory, the domestic weight of time passing, the rhythm of daily life, the strength of the experience of space. This particular curvature of the Silesian home makes the domestic elude us, as if it were moving away from a straight line in order to send us forth into infinite trajectories. Home is a never-ending interaction of what is human and what goes beyond humanity – beyond our imagination, our surroundings, our human way of experiencing things, beyond our interpretation, and beyond our space and time.

Silesia teaches us that we have to get used to the unpredictable movement that is our lot and that is involuntarily, outside or above us; it forces us into subjection so that we no longer hold the rudder firmly in our hands. Home lives in us. We are, after all, drafted to create home in the movement of attraction, connection, disconnection, merging and destruction. We become subordinate to the disproportionate forces that permeate home. We work through the forces of attraction and weightlessness. Home defies coherent stories of physical or social body, revealing areas of spiritual density and thinning that are inconceivable to us. The Silesian home means both euphoria and decline. The self-limitation of knowledge to which home brings us allows us to harness our ability to understand and predict things, while constantly presenting us with infinite trajectories, infinite stories and infinite experiences of space.

The Silesian home conceals intriguing thinking. On the one hand, there is the immensity of the sky, curiosity, as well as universal values, and on the other that interruption, coming to a stop in one place, the security of home, and the limited, finite act of holding onto what is known. Infinite trajectories that burgeon out of home and then intersect with other homes, tying them with other spaces, require adjustments – and these are provided by the humility taught by home, for it is home that patiently subdues the arrogance of cognition and restrains the naive rush to expand power and to strengthen oneself in the world. In the experience of home we find a lesson in governance of that which can open and close things at the same time. In this sense, the Silesian home renews the discipline of life. We move away in order to get closer to what is essential. The Silesian narrative of home, the unique Silesian oikology, brings us closer to renewing our discipline of life.

**The question instead of the conclusion**

Finally, let us return once again to the disciplining question that the Silesian oikology throws, like logs, at the feet of the (un)happy nomad: are you really so certain that home has so easily let you out into the world? That it has simply left you, or let go of you so lightly?

Translated from the Polish by Anna Kowalcze-Pawlik
References


**Contact email:** aleksandra.kunce@us.edu.pl
Context, Genre, Hybridity, Transculture, and Double Bind: Cultural Appropriation and Sita Sings the Blues

Jeffrey L Spear, New York University (Retired), United States

The European Conference of Arts & Humanities 2017
Official Conference Proceedings
The issue of cultural appropriation has moved out of academia and into the arena of popular culture where disagreements between individuals and groups increasingly emulate the naming and shaming, trolling or extolling rampant on the internet with little regard to context. This paper proposes a countermove, a discursive framework that would substitute for an unproductive binary, a space of potentially productive exchange in which all identities and points of view have a place. My focal point is Nina Paley’s 2008 animated feature film Sita Sings the Blues. Sita has been protested as an appropriation and boycotted by the Hindutva right under its older name blasphemy. The post-colonial left has been more respectful of Paley’s artistic achievement, but raises the question of appropriative white privilege. To take a current example, Shefali Chandra (2015) groups Sita with Elizabeth Gilbert’s memoir and follow-up film Eat, Pray, Love, and Katherine Russell Rich’s Dreaming in Hindi as works in which “India is produced through the desires of the white woman, who is then regenerated by India and made well once more. Hindu India releases her from an acknowledgement of her whiteness, or her imperialism” (p. 509).

Whatever our initial reaction to a work the first step even in a disagreement is to make sure we are talking about the same thing. Using Sita as an example I will discuss in turn a set of defining frames that can situate questions of appropriation: 1st, genre and narrative structure; 2nd, the situation of production and reception, what Pierre Bourdieu (1993) calls field, the “space of possibles” (p. 64) and habitus, the actions of individual agents within “the space of possible positions and trajectories” (p. 65); 3rd, the question of hybridity and the distinction between critical transculturalism and appropriation. I will conclude by suggesting that many of the controversies about appropriation in the arts and humanities can be better understood and productively discussed if we abandon the appropriative or not appropriative binary and think in terms of what Gayatri Spivak (2012) calls the double bind that occurs when two of our values, principles, convictions are in conflict. The double bind requires, in Spivak’s words, “learning to live with contradictory instructions” (3). The double bind “is not a logical or philosophical problem like a contradiction, a dilemma, a paradox, an antimony. It can only be described as an experience. … In the aporia or the double bind, to decide is the burden of responsibility. The typecase of the ethical sentiment is regret, not self-congratulations” (pp. 104-5). In the case of cultural appropriation, the contradiction is most often between, on the one hand, the human right to be seen, recognized and respected as an individual or a group in one’s own terms, and on the other the freedom of speech and expression essential to the independence of artists and writers in every mode from fiction and film to philosophy.

Genre: Sita Sings the Blues is a comedy in an ironic or mock heroic mode, a multi-plot animated, musical film. It interweaves four narrative strands, each with a distinct graphic style. The autobiographical strand, what I call the Ninayana, or Nina’s Journey combines photo-realistic backgrounds with repeated overdrawing giving the scenes a jumpy, nervous energy entirely distinct from the Indian strands.
The strand that has Sita channeling Annette Hanshaw’s blues, I call the Ram and Sita Show. It borrows from old-fashioned musical films and their Bollywood analogues with action backed by song and dance numbers. There is even an intermission in which the characters including ten-headed Ravana, raid the concession stand like actors on a break. Paley extrapolated the muscular Rama from Indian graphic or comic book representations turning him into a mock superhero who pointedly lacks the marks of his divinity.

The hybrid singing Sita will be discussed later, only noting here that she is dressed in mixed mode as an Indian performer wearing an abbreviated bodice over a more classical skirt.
In what I call the intertext, three of Paley’s NRI (that is Non Resident Indian) friends with roots in different regions of the subcontinent, become the voices behind Indonesian Wayang Kulit shadow puppets who narrate and comment upon the story of Rama and Sita as if it were a modern relationship. As the interlocutors reconstruct the central story from memory it becomes clear that they are not simply recalling Valmiki’s classic text, but regional variations, dramas and other popular versions. This is the Ramayana as cultural artifact not religious text. Paley illustrates their conversation in the style of contemporary Indian poster and calendar art derived from the academic style taught by the British, but now thoroughly Indian, combined with whatever modern objects the commentators mention. In this mode Rama’s forehead bears his royal tilak.

![Shadow Puppet Commentary](image)

Fig. 3 Shadow Puppet Commentary by Aseem Chhabra, Bhavana Nagulapally and Manish Achaarya

(4) Finally there is the Ramayana strand reserved from scenes taken directly from Valmiki’s and drawn after the style of Rajasthani manuscript miniatures.

![Manuscript Style and Miniature](image)

Fig 4 Paley’s Manuscript Style and Rajasthani Miniature of Rama, Basohli style, Pahari, c. 1730
Context:

In 2002 Paley’s then husband Dave took a job in Trivandrum, Kerala. Paley followed, but after three months left for what was to be a brief job in New York only to discover that her husband, who had become withdrawn in their marriage, had withdrawn from it, dumping her as she puts it by e-mail: Alone and depressed in a barely furnished Brooklyn sublet, she found solace listening to a 1920s collection of blues and standards sung by Annette Hanshaw that the owners had left behind and at the same time felt possessed by the Ramayana. The feminist Nina had not found Sita’s unquestioning devotion to Rama to be an edifying story, but the abandoned wife suffering both the pain of rejection and the humiliating compulsion to beg to be taken back saw Rama and Sita in a new light. Here was a central cultural myth that did not feature typical western issues of infidelity, misalliance or incompatibility, but male withholding. Rama, warrior prince, incarnation of Vishnu, the ideal man nevertheless questions and eventually exiles Sita even though his chaste wife never yielded to her kidnapper, Ravana the demon King of Lanka, and had patiently awaited rescue by Rama as befitting a wife. The challenge of creating a work of art linking Hanshaw’s singing and Sita’s story gave Paley’s life a new and positive focus.

It took five years for Paley to craft Sita Sings the Blues on her home computer. Over that time, she posted complete scenes on the internet attracting comment, collaborators and piecemeal funding. Her South Asian collaborators were international NRIs, part of what Jonathan Friedman calls “a global, cultural hybrid elite sphere… connected to international politics, academia, the media and the arts. Their careers, especially if they were born in the Third World and live in the First are thoroughly cosmopolitan…(1997, 84). And they have real political and economic power, which mitigates the difference in power or cultural authority assumed by the appropriation accusation. Paley collaborated with them as equals. Nevertheless, I said mitigates rather than eliminates the power differential because even this cultural elite is subject to social discrimination and hate crimes. The key point here is that the Sita “contact zone” is not India and the place of the Ramayana there, but the Indian diaspora community and the internet, where the story of Rama and Sita, as Paley sees it, is part of world culture or, what some call the cultural commons of cyberspace. By way of contrast, I would argue that a film like Wes Anderson’s The Darjeeling Limited (2007) is appropriative because India and Hindus serve as an exotic backdrop against which three American brothers work out western family tensions as they travel. The brothers could be taking a train across Indiana rather than India for all that it would matter to the plot. That Anderson dedicated his film to Sátyajit Ray and quoted his film scores is a fine gesture, but makes no critical difference.

The vexed question of Hybridity

The figure of the performing Sita with her pin-hinged limbs and pipe-stem waist mark her as an avatar of Laxmi as she appears in the opening sequence of the film. Paley reverses and so negates the category error of the racialist who confuses the accidents of culture with the determinations of biology by having Sita’s appearance represent cultural hybridity. Her costume and jewelry echo those of Indian female performers, but her wide
face and round eyes are not those of Laxmi, but resemble Annette Hanshaw’s cartoon contemporary Betty Boop.

Fig. 5 Sita, Laxmi and Betty Boop (For more on Betty Boop in Asia see Annette (2013)

This head on that body is a translation different in kind than either English language texts and performances of the Ramayana, or the Ramayana strand in the film. Like the “translated” Nick Bottom in A Midsummer Night’s Dream she is an embodied hybrid and one that pointedly upsets racial stereotypes.

One thing that can distinguish a work of critical transculturalism from cultural appropriation is respect for the border, the distinction between things that can legitimately cross over, in this case Rama and Sita as a love story, and what cannot, in this case the Hindu essence of Ramachandra as the seventh avatar of Vishnu and Sita the avatar of Laxmi and daughter of Mother Earth, and not merely their representation. The first version of Sita’s test by fire, the agni pariksha, which is part of the Ram and Sita Show, contains traditional elements. The hybrid Sita sings unharmed through the flames and the major Hindu deities are witnesses as tradition requires, but the episode is simply part of the background to Sita/Hanshaw’s rendering of Alhert and Turk’s standard “Mean to Me.” This is the version of Sita’s test by fire that Paley posted on the internet without context, and so could be read as equating Sita and Nina, as some Indians did, which would be an allegorical appropriation. But the finished work keeps the autobiographical strand separate from the others and has NRIs tell the Rama Sita story in their own words with Paley serving not as the interpreter of the epic but as editor and illustrator, allowing us to see parallels between Paley’s story and Sita’s without subsuming one to the other. By surrendering the position of narrator and recording NRIs telling the tale she preempts any implicit claim to “own” the story or to be an authority on the Ramayana.

Paley placed the second agni pariksha at the center of the film immediately after Nina receives the heart breaking e-mail: “Dear Nina, Don’t come back, love Dave.” It takes the form of an original dance performed by a rotoscoped Reena Shah, a Bharatanatyam trained NRI dancer and vocalist. Shah sings the accompanying song written in Hindi by her mother, and set to music by her husband Todd Michaelsen in which Sita tells Rama that her love is as sacred and pure as Agni’s fire and Ganges water. On the surface, literally, the surface this looks like an act of appropriation as Paley pours her western heartbreak over the dance in a myriad of colors and transformations amid what sometimes looks like hell fire. As in the first test, we see the fire god but Sita is now outside western visual representation and present only in Hindi song and the gestural
language, the mudras of the dance. Pulsating images of the heart projected onto the dancer convey Paley’s pain; but the dance itself is under the aegis of rapidly cycling images of the Indian pantheon, and the song never wavers from the serenity Sita always displays in traditional renderings of this scene.

Fig. 6 The Sign Language of Indian Dance: The Katakamukhra Mudra (opening in a bracelet

Fig. 7 Dancer and Heart; Dancer and Rotating Deities
Shadrach, Meshach and Abednego in the Book of Daniel were preserved in the fiery furnace by an Angel of God, but Sita survives the flames of her anti-sati because she is herself divine. This is the limit point -- Sita’s divine aspect, a song in a language neither Paley herself and the vast majority of westerners can understand, the gestural language of dance, mudras that can only by appreciated aesthetically and seen as implicitly not literally narrative by a western public -- these mark the line between what can be shared transculturally and what can only be appreciated respectfully from outside and will be culturally appropriated if decontextualized.

Critical Transculturalism as formulated by Marwin Kraidy (2005) is a mode of cultural analysis that has three foundational pillars: a conception of culture as synthetic, an emphasis on the translocal and intercontextual links between hybridity and agency, and a commitment to an epistemology with multiple methodologies – discursive, textual, and empirical. “Critical transculturalism advocates doing away with the view that cultures are stable and autonomous unities, because the holistic view of culture is an obstacle to a critical approach to international communication…. [It] differs from both cultural imperialism and cultural pluralism in that it rejects what the anthropologist George Marcus called the “fiction of the whole” but at the same time emphasizes that intercultural relations are unequal” (pp. 152-3). Like Spivak’s “double bind,” it stresses experience and social engagement over winning an abstract argument, and opens a space for protest, contest, and exchange.

Consequently, although I have maintained that Sita Sings the Blues succeeds as a transcultural work, I acknowledge that I do so from a position like Paley’s own, a secularized, Jewish- American. Someone watching the film in Chennai or Mumbai might see Sita Sings the Blues against debates about cultural purity, or the place of the epics in Indian education, or a particular view of Non-Resident Indians. I might disagree with that view as a critic and argue for my position, but I cannot contest a different experience of the work. An African-American, or someone with the history of the blues in mind might accept the Indian part of the film without question, but point out that Annette Hanshaw benefited from White appropriation of Black musical innovations. After all, Sam Coslow’s “Daddy Won’t You Please Come Home,” which Sita/Hanshaw sings when she is the prisoner of Ravena longing for rescue, was first sung without credit by Theresa Harris, an African-American, in Joseph von Sternberg’s Thunderbolt (1929), but it was the white woman who got the recording contract.

Finally, I suggest that Spivak’s double bind and Kraidy’s rejection of holism while acknowledging inequality can be fruitfully applied to a more immediate controversy, the stand-off over a possibly failed attempt at transcultural expression, Dana Schutz’s painting Open Casket in the Whitney Museum’s prestigious Biennial for 2017 and the protest letter sent by the British artist Hannah Black with over 30 cosigners.
Fig. 8 This combined image from Trey Speegal (2017) exemplifies both the strong feelings stirred by *Open Casket* and the spread of the internet troll’s language into public discourse. Because Schutz makes radical use of *impasto*, building paint almost into relief and slashing into it, the painter deliberately implicates herself in an act of symbolic violence. No photographic reproduction can capture that aspect of the work.

Putting aside the question of who gets to speak for a disparate group, Black’s manifesto contains a trenchant critique of the treatment of Black subjects by non-Black media:

*Ongoing debates on the appropriation of Black culture by non-Black artists have highlighted the relation of these appropriations to the systematic oppression of Black communities in the US and worldwide, and, in a wider historical view, to the capitalist appropriation of the lives and bodies of Black people with which our present era began. Meanwhile, a similarly high-stakes conversation has been going on about the willingness of a largely non-Black media to share images and footage of Black people in torment and distress or even at the moment of death, evoking deeply shameful white American traditions such as the public lynching. Although derided by many white and white-affiliated critics as trivial and naive, discussions of appropriation and representation go to the heart of the question of how we might seek to live in a reparative mode, with humility, clarity, humour and hope, given the barbaric realities of racial and gendered violence on which our lives are founded. I see no more important foundational consideration for art than this question, which otherwise dissolves into empty formalism or irony, into a pastime or a therapy* (quoted in Greenberger (2017).

The general case, however, does not cover every instance after the manner of postulates and theorems. There may be no more powerful artistic rendering of the horror of public lynching than Billie Holiday’s rendition of “Strange Fruit,” a song composed by Abel Meeropol. But neither does the exception disprove the general case. Black’s critique of media coverage of Black people rings true, but the debate over the right of someone in the majority culture to make use of an iconic African-American image regardless of her
intention is less clear cut, the question of whether motive can be inferred from that image even more so.

As Spivak insists, it is disquieting, disturbing, uncomfortable to be caught in the double bind, to hold in mind the value of free expression and the belief that art of all sorts has the potential to put one in the place of another though sympathetic imagination, and be aware at the same time that a work like Open Casket that attempts such an act may be deeply offensive regardless of its quality as a painting. “I don’t agree with what you say, but I will defend to the death your right to say it” is part of the American creed. But the other side of the coin, “I cannot be who you are, but will defend to the death your right to be who you say you are” is missing.

At the outset of her petition Black calls for the removal and destruction of Schutz’s painting. That demand takes us out of the painful but potentially dialogic place of the double bind and into the realm of free speech. The call for censorship, even if it is only a symbolic gesture, carries the danger of playing into the hands of those who hold institutional and political power and are all too willing to invoke the rhetoric of the oppressed to justify actual acts of oppression. Finally, as a reminder that commitment to a common identity does not mean uniform responses, Kara Walker, whose depictions of Black history have been criticized within her own community, points out that: “The history of painting is full of graphic violence and narratives that don’t necessarily belong to the artist’s own life….A lot of art often lasts longer than the controversies that greet it. I say this as a shout to every artist and artwork that gives rise to vocal outrage. Perhaps it too gives rise to deeper inquiries and better art. It can only do this when it is seen (quoted in Boucher, 2017).
References


La Mise Hors Scène Screen Memory

Lin Hsin-I, Tainan National University of the Arts, Taiwan

Abstract
Regarding mise-en-scène, in Antonin Artaud’s letter to theater critic, Benjamin Crémieux, Artaud candidly expressed that “mise-en-scène itself” could act as a safeguard to "another language". Reading this today, it reflects well upon Jacques Rancière’s Les sorties du Verb. In Jean-Francois Lyotard’s essay, L’Acinéma (1973), Lyotard expands mise-en-scène to become motions inside and outside the borders of frame, creating a re-discussion about reality and truth using the concept of “la mise hors scène”. It invites the readers to use their own various perceptions to compensate for the scenes outside of the text, prompting them to reconstruct a performance in their own minds. From the aesthetic perspective of “la mise hors scène”, this paper discusses how in some works of Taiwanese theater reportage and people’s theater, the history and writing re-translate within the body, dispatching the body back into the body as an expression of historical writing. Then, “screen memory” is served to “recover” covered-up history as a "self-presentation" approach to imaging. Finally, this paper examines the re-translation of words, the redistribution of cultural location, and how images files can be “watched and read”.

Keywords: La Mise Hors Scène, Screen Memory, theater reportage
Introduction

The time has arrived to go to Liuzhangli.
We must now hear and study, record and discuss.
(Wandering Xianshan. Scattering Paper Money)
- Chen Yingzhen, Spring Worship, 1995

In 1964, Song Feiwo produced the script for “The Wall” based on Jian Guoxian’s original Japanese and Chinese text, which was called “Taiwanese Single-Act Opera”. Song Feiwo also broadcasted the “The Wall” in the Taiwanese language on Taiwan Radio Station. The grand occasion of the performance of “The Wall”, in addition to the enthusiastic response of the crowds brought about the curse of censorship. Wu Zhuoliu believes that the primary application of the “Taiwanese language” is to get in touch with the social classes of that time period. The ‘body language’ and ‘dialogue’ on stage both constitute the “stage arrangement”. An uproar occurs when the viewer is directly touched by the different aspects of the stage. Through the inquisitive search of a Taiwanese script, dialogue, body language and public involvement, which all simultaneously and collectively reflect the desires of the open public play, it also serves as the counterpart to the creative potential of participants. How can history and the written word be reinterpreted as body language? How does one arrange the body into an expression of a historical event? To me, it becomes the specific question of the relation between verbal expression and body language. If the on-stage arrangement is considered to be a type of orderly combination for the “pre-theater”, then the off-stage arrangement uses the reality from beyond the stage, integrating the off-stage reality into the scene, so that the invisible lens is made up for by the ongoing written word and body language.

Therefore, I began to search for the verbal expressions themselves found in written plays, the aim of the writing system, besides the public stage, the dramatic literature, and the dramatization of an event, and also including the outside-stage arrangement assembled by text, dialogue and body which the system also constitutes the experimental region of thought, a spiritual stage, in order to express the written word as body movements, aiming towards the corporal experience. In reality, this form of writing is no different from looking into the context, it is also no different from the position of each script. It exists in front, within, without and behind the corporal expression, unlike journalistic reporting, the script implies an artistic political disposition of the necessity of reconstruction(distinct from a fabrication). The so-called reconstruction referred to here signifies the permission for a person who is able to describe, witness and act to reconstruct, represent, identify and act an event following a different method(perhaps anew). The event here represents the existence of the reconstruction, however, the method of reconstruction embodies the intangibility of the event, it cannot directly become the event itself, but through the reconstruction, we are able to acutely engrave our perception of the moment from this historical event to accumulate the depth and weight that resonates with a different historical time period. If your aesthetic experience can impact the political realm then this kind of reconstruction will be the tangible reality that touches the event.
Scene I: Liuzhangli public cemetery

Regarding this context, I want to dissect it from two different perspectives. The first perspective: The first version of the script published in 1995 by Chen Yingzhen as “Spring Worship”, using the literary forms of reporting theater, from the scene inside the memorial tombs of Liuzhangli public cemetery, summoning the spirits of White Terror victims, Xu Qinglan, Huang Fengkai, Zhang Tianding, using the written word to re-express the brutality of the 1950’s era White Terror. The play, “Spring Worship”, directed by Zhong Qiao, premiered on March 14, 1994, at The Taipei Hainan Road Art Museum. According to Chen Yingzhen, the production of the script for “Spring Worship” is related to the article, “Roar! Hanaoka!” which was published in the July 1986 edition of “RenJian” magazine. Due to the introduction by Wang Molin, RenJian cooperated with the “Immortal Bird” theater troupe, which was lead by the Japanese theater activist Shi Feiren, to perform the Mandarin version of the play, “Roar! Hanaoka!” in Taiwan in the form of journalistic drama. This is Chen Yingzhen’s first experience with journalistic drama.

“Journalistic drama is a type of literary form. Likewise, journalistic drama, in essence, is a type of drama. However, it is fundamentally different from other types of literature and drama due to the fact that its reporting is based on reality thus possessing elements of journalism, immediacy and timeliness. Fictional elements are not allowed, neither is the fabrication of any imaginary things that concern human, time, business and karma issues. In terms of the methods of expression, as long as reality is strictly adhered to, then one can employ all types of novels, poems, prose and other forms of literary techniques as well as all types of theatrical techniques.” - Chen Yingzhen (1995: 66-67). Journalistic drama uses slide projectors to display news reports and historical photos on the stage to create a historical impact. However, journalistic drama should refuse any “illusions” or “man-made scenes” caused by the theatrical performance and ensure viewers can approximate the historical reality. In the script of “Spring Worship”, Chen Yingzhen arranges a historical maiden “chorus” to serve as the primary narrator while simultaneously including off-stage sound effects and monologues to compose the main contents. The reconstruction of “Journalistic drama”, on one hand, must strictly adhere to realism to describe humans, things and events, while, on the other hand, must be open to the imitation of and emotional triggers of real events. The former allows the viewer to experience tangible history while the latter drives the transformation of understanding into perception. The writer, viewer and actor all interact on this two-sided field.

The other scene is found in the main topic of “Roar! Hanaoka!” published in Renjian Magazine including large quantities of wood engravings by Xinju Guangzhi, Longpin Erlang and Mu Dajie regarding the Hanaoka Mine Incident(木刻連環画集 花岡もの がたり, 秋田：無明舎 October, 1981 First Edition.), and also an article by Wang Molin called “The Weeping found in Historical Fault Lines”. In the article, Wang Molin mentioned his request to Shi Feiren to designate an actor for the journalistic dramatization of the Hanaoka Mine Incident, “For ‘Journalistic drama’, there is no need to memorize the script just read directly from the lines as the main purpose is to use your voice to touch the audience, it is not necessary to rely on so-called ‘body language’ to express the drama’s depth. Isn’t the good thing about this form the fact
that everyone can immediately become a participant of this play.” (Wang Molin 1986:29). Besides the historical witnesses, Liu Zhiqiu and Li Zhenping, this journalistic drama also invited a Japanese veteran, Masao Ōtsuka, who was a participant in the Three Alls Policy during the Second Sino-Japanese War to serve as a historical witness. We can view the Hanaoka Mine Incident through historical witnesses and the presentation of historical photographs, moreover, the actors (Japanese and Taiwanese) who narrate the historical events, the images (wood engravings) and the eyewitness account of the other historical incident. This diverse group of people, who are able to describe, witness and produce, each can utilize their individual experiences to simply integrate into the historical event in order to let the audience have a vivid impression. The journalistic drama work of Taiwan Public Theater director, Zhong Qiao, “Testimony” (2015) and “Horse Carriage Etude” both use this form to reconstruct and retell the history. Everytime “we hear and study, record and discuss” is all for the embodiment of the written word, to allow the hidden meaning to be expressed so that the historical event can be seamlessly arranged on stage along with the impact of language beyond the scene in order to strengthen the historical experience.

Scene II: The Unseen film

In 2016, I went to Hong Kong to interview the theater worker Mo Luoru and discuss the ongoing oppression of theater; the other interviewees were the Hong Kong Woofer Ten artist-activists Li Hofeng and Chen Sanmu, we discussed the impending June 4 Tiananmen Square incident memorial parade, and in 2015, “Emerald Street Incident”, a complete story of street activism. In the archives of “Emerald Street Incident” street theater, besides information regarding the 1989 Hong Kong parade in reaction to the Tiananmen Square incident, the related five year activities organized by the Woofer Ten and an archival collection of many years of emerald street demonstrations, there was also a picture sitting on the disorganized archive shelf, Wei Chengguang. In 1989, Chen Guang was assigned to be an army photographer, during that time, he took quite a few photographs of the Tiananmen Square incident, while reporting back to authorities, he hid three rolls of film. The rolls of film remained hidden from the public eye for twenty-three years. In 2012, one of these rolls of film was released to public for the first time. This reminded me of Zhang Weixian’s younger brother, Zhang Cai, the founder of the “Xing Guang Theater Research Group”, who, in 1960, destroyed many incriminating rolls of film from the 2/28 massacre. As Zhong Qiao described in an article “First Generation Photographer -- Zhang Cai “ in the December, 1988 edition of “Ren Jian Magazine”

“On the day of the February 28 incident, I received a phone call from a friend who said there was a demonstration going on at the traffic circle. With my camera packed, I immediately rushed to the scene, as I saw more and more people assembled, I grabbed my camera and took a photograph of a frustrated and outraged face, also going along with the protestors’ slogan — follow the road to the government bureau. He said that while he was at the demonstration, several people in the crowd angrily pointed at the man behind the camera. “After I explained several times, they finally eased up” - if my memory doesn’t fail me, Zhang Laoxian, with the usual nonchalant tone, said “A few years ago, I burned all of these photographs.”
“Burned!”
“That’s right.”, he said.
I asked him if he had any regrets, he laconically said no. (p. 36)

From a historical lens, a form of orientation towards disaster victims, recording the suffering that occurred just before one’s eyes, providing clear evidence; like standing from the perspective of the victim, the lens facing the oppressor, in pursuit of a sharp analysis of the public’s view of the two intertwining sides forming history, a criticism of the incident. In reality, the two types of drama, camera lens and reporting, in fact, literature and reporting have much in common. In the middle of April this year, Zhong Qiao produced “The Etude of the Carriage”, directed by Lin Jingjie. While discussing journalistic drama, the substandard theater member, Li Zheyu, brought about plans on his own regarding the unmarked graves of the Liuzhangli White Terror, “Red Words Group 2014-1949” as an experienced reference, suggesting the use of eye covers by journalistic drama actors just like the “Cover” of the White Terror time period. This group of innocent souls, who no longer have mouths or tongues to defend their actions, buried in unmarked graves at Liuzhangli after being killed by their own nation (historical scene), however, in 2014, the Ministry of Finance State Property Department issued a report of suspected ‘embezzlement’. The meaning of this gradually changing political absurdity is that the society at the time collectively turned a blind eye. Confronting the cover-up (reenactment) is not only about entering that period of history but it is also about creating a new identity, re-understanding our space and re-distributing relationships. The lens of ‘Reenactment’, on one side serves as a hind mirror facing the past, scanning the records of incriminating evidence, whereas, on the other side it is the perception of the cover-up by the society at that time, an anatomical remodeling, so to speak.

Scene III: Screen Memory

While Bishop was analyzing Nikolai Evreinov’s historical reenactment, The Storming of Winter Palace, he described how the masses use drama to create their own identity, when the past and present overlap, historical events are transformed into ‘immanent’ memory. The historical reenactment itself must undergo strict rehearsals in order to create a screen memory, even better than the original event, so that the secondary events of the revolution become focal points in the collective imagination, even it will confuse those who actually experienced the original events. (Bishop, 2012:59) In psychoanalysis, "mask/screen/hidden memories" represent the stated events in reality whereas the present context pollutes the mind, causing it to imagine an altered story rather than the original. Through focusing on smaller events peripheral to the primary event, one unconsciously avoids or suppresses one's suffering involving the main event. In such a situation, the key point is how the primary subject can be acted out? Namely, inquire how the main subject can be acted out(permeated with interpretation and imagination) as a scene from memory, that way the main subject can be meaningfully analyzed instead of stubbornly focusing on the minute realistic details of the original. In the book, Media Worlds: Anthropology on New Terrain, 2002, the anthropologist, Faye D. Ginsburg describes how "shielded memory" becomes a method for aboriginals to 'revive' covered-up history in order to implement a self-description approach. This is not an easy task, when the 'outsider/researcher' studies
an 'exotic culture/subject' through the media, how can he find the truth about the culture? Or will the "current" identity be self-stated? The method of photography, the process of discussion, the translation of words, the distribution of cultural positions, finally, even the archives can be "inspected and read", are all part of the path that must be handled with utmost sensitivity. In this regard, Ginsburg is partial to using the method of "shielded memory" to reveal how the image of the present cultural identity can be obscured, how it can be constructed and how it can be perceived. Based on the three arguments above, we will turn our "shielded memory" lens towards the 2014 Luleqian where Li Junfeng and others planned the "Emerald Street Incident -- June 4 Rolling Street Theater". This street performance does not attempt to reenact the original scene or repeat the June 4 Tiananmen Square Incident but, rather, it focuses on a demonstration that occurred on the morning of Juny 7, 1989, in Yau Ma Tei and how Hong Kongers were inspired by the June 4 Tiananmen Square Incident to action through protests, strikes and boycotts.

When The Gate of Heavenly Peace, the three hour documentary directed by Richard Gordon and produced by Carma Hinton, showed Chai Ling receiving the controversial video clips of American journalist Philip Cunningham, I rewinded the scene several times before pausing the video and began searching for the full context of the interview. There is a short description of these controversial video clips on the "Tiananmen Square" documentary website, one of which includes Chai Ling and an open letter from Feng Congde, a documentary film producer (dated May 28, 2009 and June 15, 2009) as well as a description of the film's response to the open letter. In response to the fact that the film has not been revised for many years, several articles of the letter continue to be published by Feng Congde regarding the montage clippings in the "Tiananmen Square" documentary that result in "narrative", "translation through words", "reporting and personal testimonies", "image shaping" and other issues stemming from historical realities and timing. These articles and others can be found on the "June 4 Archives" website.

Conclusion

Due to the nature of montages, some of the context is obscured, the event itself is constantly being met with skepticism and threats to the copies, because of the questions regarding the copies, besides the files found in these documentaries, the movement continues to spread. Recorded images bear some sort of original crime, but to some extent because the media is different, it no longer bears this original crime even though the lens is at the scene and the witnesses are at the scene, but once the "narrative structure" is taken into account then the focus is on the unrestricted confrontations of the different scenes. Whether or not we can say, the attempts at off-stage arrangement exist, that is, the 'distance' between the events and the copies, but through the 'distance' we can continue to hide, then walk, then view, then happen, at the same time, the people who can describe and view this event can help use eliminate our position of "passive perspective" so that we will be expelled from the fixed consciousness. At least from a certain image from the official history can we remove the third person narrative. Jacques Rancière argues in The Emancipated Spectator that "drama is a form of aesthetic construction for a collective -- the perceived context of the collective: in a way, the collective occupies time and space as a series of life positions and attitudes, early on, they transformed the perception of the human
experience through any political forms and organizations (...).” Rancière, 2009:6)
Beginning with the search for the written word, the old souls of historical events collectively express the harsh sound, on-stage sound arrangement, drama and the superposition of reality of the daily fragmentation of occupied space, the repetition of the personal testimony all verbalize to "We are going to be alive...because of you". Words as expressed through the body, the off-stage arrangement of this stage may just allow my physical action to be a translation in a simple request for a personal story: He wrote from a script.
References


Arthur Hugh Clough's “Amours De Voyage”: A Poetic Account of the 1849 Siege of Rome

Cora Lindsay, University of Nottingham, United Kingdom.

The European Conference on Arts & Humanities 2017
Official Conference Proceedings

Abstract
In this paper I talk about Arthur Hugh Clough’s epistolary poem Amours de Voyage, which describes Clough’s first-hand experience of the events of 1840s Europe, a time of uncertainty and rising nationalist agendas. Amours de Voyage was largely written during Clough’s stay in Rome from April to July, 1849, the brief period in which the Roman Republic existed, and the city was under siege from the French. The poem is an unusual, unromantic and bemused depiction of nationalistic conflict. By the time it was finally published in Britain in 1862, the Italian struggle for independence had become one of the most celebrated and romantic causes of the century. Clough, with his questioning turn of mind, was inherently wary of such emotional responses. This poem epitomises the detached and constructive scepticism with which Clough approached political and national manifestos, questioning blind certainties and often undermining the pomposity of fanaticism through humour.

Keywords: Arthur Hugh Clough, Risorgimento, 1849 Siege of Rome, Amours de Voyage
Arthur Hugh Clough’s *Amours de Voyage*: A poetic representation of the 1849 Siege of Rome

The poetry of Arthur Hugh Clough (1816 – 1861) is generally little known in Britain, and when I talk about his work, I usually have to add that he was a contemporary and friend of Matthew Arnold and writing at the same time as Tennyson and Browning. These days he is possibly best known for the much-anthologised “Say Not the Struggle Nought Availeth” – a poem of optimism for times of darkness, which was quoted by Winston Churchill in 1941 to celebrate the US entry into World War II.

*Amours de Voyage* is, I would argue, Clough’s greatest poetic achievement. The poem, or epistolary verse novel, was largely written during Clough’s stay in Rome from 16th April to the end of July, 1849. It is made up of five cantos or chapters, and consists primarily of a series of letters in verse written from the Rome of this time by Claude, an English Oxford undergraduate, and Georgina and Mary Trevellyn, two sisters in a travelling English family.

The narrators or letter writers are each in some sense typical of the travelling English of the later nineteenth-century Grand Tour. Claude is the archetypal student who is visiting Rome for its classical past; the Trevellyn family are representative of the emerging new type of family and Thomas Cook tourist whom we also see in Dickens’s Dorrit family.

As its title indicates, *Amours de Voyage* is fundamentally a love story. Alongside the love story, however, the letter writers record their responses to the political events of the spring of 1849. 1848 was, of course, a year of European revolutions, as is sometimes known as the Spring of Nations. Clough had been in Paris that year during the establishment of the French Second Republic and he travelled to Rome in 1849 partly because of his interest in the Italian independence cause, although he was certainly never a revolutionary in the Romantic Byronic manner. The poem is, among other things, a creative interpretation of Clough’s own first hand experiences in the siege and a powerful account of an individual experience of developing conflict.

By the time *Amours de Voyage* was finally published in Britain in 1862, the Italian struggle for independence and unification had become one of the most celebrated and romantic causes of the century. It has been termed “the most mythologized political and cultural movement in 19c Europe” and a “revolution marked … by heroic sacrifice, cooperation and high-minded ideals that endorsed the validity of the principles of nationalism”. (Davies, 2000, p.2).

*Amours de Voyage* is set within the events of the spring and summer of 1849, in the aftermath of the flight of the ruling Pope from Rome, the establishment of the Roman Republic and its subsequent defeat by the French after a siege of some weeks. The brief existence of the Roman Republic was a key episode in the Italian fight for unification and independence. The new president of France, Louis Napoleon, who wanted to prevent Austrian domination of Italy, saw the restoration of the Pope as a way of doing this and of extending his own power in Italy. The French attack and subsequent siege of Rome in which *Amours de Voyage* is set became central to the romantic narrative of Italian independence. The fight of the small republican army holding out against the imperial French forces was for some not only “the most
significant and moving scene of the Risorgimento” but also “a poet’s dream” (Trevelyan, 1907, p.3).

Giuseppe Garibaldi was the most dramatic of the personalities both in the siege of Rome and in the subsequent events of the Risorgimento. He is generally depicted as the honest, brave, but simple patriot taking up arms against the evils of Austrian, Bourbon and Papal rule and occupation. The *Illustrated London News* in 1849 described him as “a most picturesque ruffian, the ideal of a brigand – eminently handsome, with a red blouse, braid belt full of pistols, dark wide-brimmed hat and green feather” (*Illustrated London News* 14 June 1849 p. 379), while the Anglo-American writer and historian Elizabeth Wormely Latimer describes him as “beautiful as a statue… mounted on a white horse which he sat on like a centaur” (Wormely Latimer, 1897, p.379).

Matthew Reynolds, in his account of the relationship between poetry and nation building in the mid-nineteenth century, notes that the standard romantic response to Claude’s situation in Rome would be to “fight for liberty [and] make a daring escape with Garibaldi” (Reynolds, 2001, p.146). Claude, however, excuses himself from patriotic martyrdom, and makes a number of half-ironical lame excuses for his refusal to succumb to death and glory in the Roman cause:

> Why not fight? - In the first place, I haven't so much as a musket;  
> In the next, if I had, I shouldn't know how I should use it;  
> In the third, just at present I'm studying ancient marbles;  
> In the fourth, I consider I owe my life to my country;  
> In the fifth - I forget, but four good reasons are ample.

(*Amours de Voyage* III.iii.68 – 72)

With its Roman setting, its account of a siege and its use of classical metres, *Amours de Voyage* contains implicit reference to Virgilian and Homeric epic in both its content and form. But while the somewhat effete Claude is most evidently not a heroic figure comparable to Aeneas or Ulysses, any consequently implied criticism is double-edged, and Claude’s scepticism towards the militarism of the Roman Republic serves also as comment on the naïvely unquestioning heroism of other epic warriors.

Both in his correspondence from Rome and his poetic interpretation, Clough notes the mundane, the sense of confusion, and the slightly surreal aspects of a city imminently or already under siege. In a letter to a friend written from Rome on June 21 1849, he noted the ordinariness of a city under siege:

> It is curious how like any other city a city under bombardment looks. – One goes to … the Palatine to look at the firing; one hears places named where shells have fallen; one sees perhaps a man carrying a bit of one.

(Mulhauser, 1957, Vol. 1 p.260)

It is this element of ordinariness, and the apparently banal details, which Clough captures so successfully in his poetic interpretation of the siege. In one of his letters, Claude describes the beginning of the French attack:
Yes, we are fighting at last, it appears. This morning, as usual, Murray, as usual, in hand, I enter the Café Nuovo; Seating myself with a sense as it were of a change in the weather, Not understanding, however, but thinking mostly of Murray, And, for to-day is their day, of the Campidoglio Marbles; Café-latte! I call to the waiter, - and Non c'è latte, This is the answer he makes me, and this is the sign of a battle. (Amours de Voyage II.v.95-101)

After his “milkless nero” Claude watches the first French bombardment of the city from the Pincian Hill, a venue usually recommended to visitors as a viewing point from which to admire the monuments of Rome. He gathers with a group of foreign travellers to watch the French attack almost as if it were another of Rome’s tourist attractions:

Twelve o’clock, on the Pincian Hill, with lots of English, Germans, Americans, French, - the Frenchmen too are protected, - So we stand in the sun, but afraid of a possible shower; So we stand and stare, and see, to the left of St. Peter’s, Smoke, from the cannon, white… (Amours de Voyage II.v.113-117)

In contrast to this relaxed response to the initial events of the siege, Claude’s letter vii of Canto II captures the uncertain and unsettling feel prior to an escalation of conflict and alludes to the episode of the mob killing in Rome of a man suspected of being a Jesuit priest. Claude’s letter begins by aiming at a tone of casual cynicism but soon shifts to a sense of bemusement and disquiet. He has seen something, but does not quite know what it is he has seen:

So I have seen a man killed! An experience that, among others! Yes, I suppose I have; although I can hardly be certain, And in a court of justice could never declare I had seen it. But a man was killed, I am told, in a place where I saw Something; a man was killed, I am told and I saw something. (Amours de Voyage II.vii.162-166)

The account continues and takes on a staccato and disjointed note that reflects the growing sense of chaos, confusion and frenzy in the city and in what the writer sees:

… and now the Crowd is coming, has turned, has crossed that last barricade, is Here at my side. In the middle they drag at something. What is it? Ha! bare swords in the air, held up? There seem to be voices Pleading and hands putting back; official, perhaps; but the swords are Many, and bare in the air. In the air? they descend; they are smiting, Hewing, chopping--At what? In the air once more upstretched? And--Is it blood that's on them? Yes, certainly blood! Of whom, then? (Amours de Voyage II.vii.178-185)
Claude deflates the casually glorifying aphorisms of war, transforming them into statements to be ironically questioned and deflated:

Dulce it is and decorum no doubt for the country to fall, - to
Offer one’s blood an oblation to Freedom, and die for the Cause; yet
Still, individual culture is also something, and no man
Finds quite distinct the assurance that he of all others is called on…
(Amours de Voyage II.ii.30-33)

Sweet it may be and decorous perhaps for the country to die; but,
On the whole, we conclude the Romans won’t do it, and I shan’t.
(Amours de Voyage II.ii.46-47)

In another letter the heroic version of war is set in antithesis to the reality:

The smoke of the sacrifice rises to heaven,
of a sweet savour, no doubt, to Somebody; but on the altar,
Lo, there is nothing remaining but ashes and dirt and ill odour.
(Amours de Voyage II.vi.153-155)

The political polemicist and classical scholar, F. L. Lucas, writing in 1930, felt Clough’s underlying sentiment in this section of the poem to be a relevant one in the context of his own time:

Some of us may, perhaps, find that odour not unfamiliar, remembering 1919:
and, seeing Mussolini stand where stood Mazzini, may wonder if Clough was, after all, so wrong as our fathers must have thought.
(Lucas, 1930, p.64)

Ultimately Claude and the Trevellyn sisters escape from Rome – the Trevellyns return to England and Claude travels on to the East. Claude ends with disillusionment towards nationalist conflict and any cause which asks individuals to sacrifice their lives. “Whither depart the brave?” he asks, and responds, “God knows; I certainly do not”. (Amours de Voyage V.vi 6, 16)

Clough died in Florence in 1861, and so did not see the final unification of Italy. Amours de Voyage is a powerful representation of a historic event, a depiction of an individual experience of conflict from a unique perspective and in a unique form. Clough conveys very successfully the individual’s sense of the build-up to a conflict – the small uncertainties in single episodes, the increasing mania of nationalist populism and the sense of an individual perspective on events outside his control and comprehension which must inflict many caught up in war and conflict. Elsewhere for nineteenth-century writers and indeed for other writers since, the Siege of Rome became another part of the national and romantic narrative of the Risorgimento. Clough was unique in his rejection and deflation of that emotional picture of conflict.
References


*Illustrated London News* (1849)


Trevelyan, George Macaulay (1907) *Garibaldi’s Defence of the Roman Republic* (London: Longmans, Green and Co.)
Centering Literature: Literature and The History of Environmentalism in Malaysia

Zainor Izat Zainal, Universiti Putra Malaysia, Malaysia

Abstract
Environmentalism in Malaysia, which has its roots in the British colonial administration, has evolved as a social and political force. Ranging from grassroots activists to ENGOs, the environmental movement is founded on the same aspirations: to increase environmental awareness, to preserve the environment and to ensure sustainable development. State-imposed constraints may be the Achilles’ heel in the fight to ensure sustainability but this has not deterred the movement from developing. In the realm of Malaysian literature in English, writers have written extensively about environmental activism – although little attention has been given to this area in the local literary-critical practice. In this paper, I attempt to redress this dearth by examining and critiquing four contemporary Malaysian novels in English: Keris Mas’ Jungle of Hope (2009), Yang-May Ooi’s The Flame Tree (1998), KS Maniam’s Between Lives (2003), and Chuah Guat Eng’s Days of Change (2010). These novels are selected due to their alignment to the key moments in the history of environmentalism and the plurality of relations and struggles depicted. This paper analyzes the environmental politics, past and present, found in the selected texts, and the solutions that their works present to ensure sustainability. It yields a keen understanding of irresponsible environmental degradation as well as illuminate agency and transformation. More importantly, it places literature at the core, thus demonstrate the indispensability of these works in the history of environmentalism in Malaysia.

Keywords: Environmentalism, Malaysian literature, history of environmentalism
Introduction

Environmentalism in Malaysia can be traced back to the British colonial administration. Protests in the form of armed resistance by the locals whose livelihood in the forest was threatened to British unjust laws that pertained to land rights and access were relatively common then, though not many records are available. Tok Bahaman’s 1891-1895 rebellion in Pahang exemplified these protests (Kathirithamby-Wells, 2005). Haji Abdul Rahman from Terengganu, who represented 43 peasants who refused to bow down to the British system of getting permits to plant hill paddy, contested the British notion of land use at the Land Office (Mohideen, 2000). Discontentment over land rights grew, which eventually culminated in a Malay peasant uprising in Terengganu in 1928, led by To’ Janggut. However, this resistance was quashed “swiftly and ruthlessly by British guns” (Idris, 2000, p. 7).

Environmentalism during colonial times was also crudely informed by scientific discovery and botanical studies that were carried out throughout the Empire. Scientific discovery and botanical studies were rooted in European Enlightenment values, which valorized the superiority of the rational human mind over non-rational matter, including nature. People and nature in the colonies, therefore, were seen as ‘uncivilized’ by the British Empire and in need of being brought to order and rationality, named and labelled so as to enlighten the rest of the world (Adams and Mulligan, 2003). Forest sustainability became a major concern throughout the British Empire due to hunting, commercial plantations, and scientific research. To this end, conservation was seen as extremely crucial. The inauguration of King George V National Park in 1939 (renamed as National Park in 1957), a forested area that stretches over three states, Terengganu, Kelantan, and Pahang, reached the pinnacle of conservation efforts carried out by Theodore Hubback, a British officer, who was deeply concerned about wildlife preservation and the survival of the Orang Asli (aborigines) in the forests of Malaya (Kathirithamby-Wells, 2005). Hubback’s efforts were commendable but not uncommon during colonial times. Coinciding with forest conservation measures carried out throughout the British Empire, especially in Africa, India, and Burma, Hubback’s efforts were premised on the philosophy of Empire at that time, which was “the concept that protection and preservation of the biological realm were congruent with good governance and the enhancement of political power” (Kathirithamby-Wells, 2005, p. 189). Indeed, conservation efforts, such as Hubback’s, were an important part of colonial ideology by the 19th century, and had spread to become a global concern in the 20th century (Adams and Mulligan, 2003). This is evident from the creation of Kruger National Park in South Africa (1926), Hailey National Park in India (1936), Kivu National Park in Congo (1937), as well as other conservation parks and sanctuaries throughout the world (Kathirithamby-Wells, 2005).

The oldest and largest environmental non-governmental organisation (NGO) in Malaysia, The Malaysian Nature Society (MNS), was established in 1940 by a group of British expatriates committed to preserving the country’s natural heritage. With the publication of Malayan Nature Journal Volume 1 in 1940, the MNS set out to be Malaysia’s premier environmental NGO, promoting conservation and environmental education, tasks they have continued to pursue until today. Decades of environmental work has made MNS the largest environmental NGO in Malaysia, surviving from colonial times until now. Amongst its greatest achievements are saving the Endau-
Rompin Forest in the ‘70s, preserving and managing Kuala Selangor Nature Park in the ‘80s, introducing School Nature Clubs in schools in the ‘90s, and gazetting the Royal Belum State Park in Perak in 2007 (Malaysian Nature Society, 2011). NGOs working on environmental issues mushroomed from the ‘70s onwards. The Consumer Association of Penang (CAP) was established in 1970, WWF-Malaysia was set up in 1972, and Sahabat Alam Malaysia (SAM) was founded in 1977. These NGOs have been acknowledged as the pioneers of the environmental movement in Malaysia, which continued to grow in the ‘80s and ‘90s (Ramakrishna, 2004). To date, other than MNS, CAP, WWF-Malaysia, and SAM, Malaysia has 14 registered environmental NGOs (MENGOs) dealing specifically with the environment, such as the Environmental Protection Society Malaysia (EPSM), EcoKnights, Borneo Resources Institute Malaysia (BRIMAS), Sustainable Development Network Malaysia (SUSDEN), and Water Watch Penang (WWP). MENGOs in Peninsular Malaysia are mostly concerned with resource conservation and quality of life issues, whereas MENGOs in East Malaysia are focused on the needs of the forest and the indigenous people that inhabit it (Ramakrishna, 2004). These MENGOs differ not only in their concerns but also in their approaches in influencing political and governmental decisions related to the environment. Conducting and presenting research results, presenting viewpoints, contacting government officials, and lobbying through the media are popular tactics used by the MENGOs (Mohd and Sonn, 1999). Broadly speaking, however, they share the same aspirations of increasing environmental awareness, promoting activities that aid the preservation of the environment, and encouraging and developing policies geared to sustainable development (Ramakrishna, 2004).

MENGOs have been successful in some of their campaigns. CAP, SAM, and MNS have managed to halt a few development projects that were deemed environmentally destructive, such as the redevelopment of Penang Hill, the building of Tembeling Dam at Taman Negara, and extensive logging at the Endau-Rompin forest, but failed miserably to lobby for the termination of the Bakun and Selangor dam projects, the gazetting of Pulau Redang as a state marine park, and many more unsustainable development projects that involved logging, deforestation, and the building of road, bridge, and hill projects (Weiss, 2005). Many of these MENGOs have the scientific knowledge, skills and expertise which they have sometimes utilised to cooperate with the government to draft environmental policies. Regional and international support has also worked to these MENGOs’ advantage in addressing environmental issues. However, Vincent and Mohamed Ali (2005) in their book Managing Natural Wealth: Environment and Development in Malaysia doubt the degree of the ability of these MENGOs to influence the pace and direction of sustainable development and political outcomes in Malaysia. Ramakrishna also has the same opinion, arguing that MENGOs generally have “inadequate power” and “a weak voice,” preferring non-confrontational methods over aggressive ones (2004, p. 135). This is partially attributable to state-imposed constraints (Ramakrishna, 2004). A major constraint related to this argument is the Society Act (1966) and the Internal Security Act (1960) (replaced with Security Offences (Special Measures) Act (2012) in April, 2013), legislations that work in favour of the government in implementing its development policies. The Society Act for instance, requires every club, organisation, society, or political party to secure a licence, thereby granting the government the exclusive right to block or impede the formation of any organisation which it considers detrimental to the country. Whereas, the Internal Security Act gave the government and the police...
absolute power to arrest and detain whoever they think is a threat to national security, without trial.

Malaysia’s dynamic private business sector, which is the key economic growth driver and carries out much of the economic activities in the country, including agriculture, mining, and commerce, has also played a role in addressing environmental issues. Nowadays, more and more companies and multi-national corporations in this sector have included “green initiatives” in their corporate social responsibility, in line with governmental efforts in leading green initiatives nationwide (Jeong, 2010). To illustrate, Digi, one of the leading telecommunications providers, embarked on the “Mangrove-saving Project” in 2008 to help stop the devastation of mangrove forests in Selangor (Digi, 2008). Sime Darby, the Malaysian-based diversified multinational involved in key growth sectors such as plantations, property, motors, and industrial equipment, embarked on a three-year “Plant a Tree Program” in 2008 with the aim of planting 300,000 trees (Yayasan Sime Darby, 2017).

Grassroots campaigns, usually organised by ordinary people fighting for a common environmental cause, have also emerged in the past few decades. Their campaigns, though they were successful and worked to their favour, proved to be a long, difficult battle. The Bukit Merah Action Committee, founded in 1984, is an example. The committee, which represented about 10,000 residents of Bukit Merah, Perak, sued Asian Rare Earth Sdn. Bhd. (ARE), a Japanese-Malaysian joint-venture plant, in 1985 for its irresponsible dumping of radioactive waste. Prior to this, numerous complaints were received from the community about their failing health and increasing incidents of leukaemia, infant deaths, congenital diseases, and lead poisoning since the setup of the plant in 1982 (Consumers’ Association of Penang, 2011). In 1992, the people of Bukit Merah won their suit against ARE. The factory was ordered by the Ipoh High Court to shut down within 14 days. This long battle was a feat considering residents in the community had to deal with health risks, countless false assurances by the government, and the police force, which were quick to arrest them when they set out to protest (Consumers’ Association of Penang, 2011). The Bukit Merah Action Committee set the first precedent in Malaysian legal history for being the first community to tirelessly fight over an environmental issue in order to protect their health and environment from radioactive pollution.

Grassroots environmental movements in the past, especially in the ‘80s, were seen predominantly as racially motivated, which was simply because an environmental issue usually started off as an issue that affected a certain racial community, was fought for by that community, and was later championed by racial-based political parties (Tan, 2013). This, according to Hezri, a prominent researcher in sustainable development and environmental policy in Malaysia, is the outcome of racial-based politics, which has played a large role in Malaysian politics for decades (Tan, 2013). This, however, has changed. For the past few years, Malaysia has witnessed countless protests, demonstrations, and arrests involving the establishment of a rare earth processing plant project by Australia’s Lynas Corporation in Gebeng, Kuantan, Pahang. What started off as a talk drawing less than 200 people in Kuantan in March 2011 quickly garnered thousands of supporters “from a much wider spectrum of society” as they learned of the impending radiation exposure and its effects on health, safety, and the environment (Gooch, 2012). This grassroots movement reflects the public’s growing awareness of environmental issues and their rights for a safe and
clean environment, the power of expressing their views publicly and in urging business corporations and the government to be more transparent and accountable to the people, as well as a shift from racial-based politics to environmental-based politics.

Although state power and its enforcement have been feared, in recent times, many have come forward to question and challenge the state’s environmental decisions and implementations. Indeed, state governments have been accused of abusing and exploiting their power to launch land grabs for their state-backed corporations’ profiteering agendas. A case in point is the over-acquisition of land in Pengerang, Johor, which raised concerns over the displacement of the community to make way for the state’s cronies’ development projects (Chua, 2012). Recently, too, the Negeri Sembilan state government has also been accused of excising huge pieces of forest reserve land for logging, plantations, and numerous development projects that benefits its cronies, resulting in the loss of 53 areas of forest reserves (Teoh, 2012). The government responded to environmental degradation in many ways, one of which was through legislation. There are currently 43 environmental-related laws in Malaysia. Following the Environmental Quality Act (EQA) in 1974, the government also set up the Department of Environment (DOE) in 1975. In 1988, the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) procedure was introduced. However, in his overview of the developments of environmental law in Malaysia, law expert Azmi Sharom (2002) asserted that “the problem with environmental law in Malaysia is not the lack of laws. Instead it is the lack of true political will to put those laws to their full use” (p. 889). Citing the controversial Bakun Dam Case in Sarawak, which triggered a great hue and cry regarding the lack of transparency in its EIA as an example, Sharom contends that a more cohesive approach to environmental protection and management is needed in Malaysia (p. 889).

Environmentalism in Malaysia has evolved as a social and political force. In this paper, I use a definition of “environmentalism” referring to concern about and action aimed at protecting the environment. It is a social movement that involves actors (agencies) such as the state, multilateral institutions, businesses, ENGOS and grassroots activists. I will be using the term “environment” in the sense given by Mukherjee in his book Postcolonial Environments: Nature, Culture and the Contemporary Indian Novel in English. Borrowing from Mukherjee (2010), the concept of environment is not only restricted to living and non-living things, but it is also “inclusive of culture”, which inevitably entails economical, political and historical matters (p. 4). “Environment”, writes Mukherjee, “is the surroundings we find ourselves in, from ecosystem to biosphere, where humans and non-humans exist or co-exist naturally; and these are inclusive of culture” (2010, p.4). The term environment used in this study is essentially different from “nature,” which I take to mean non-humans, and distinguished from the work of humanity.

State-imposed constraints may be the Achilles’ heel in the fight to ensure sustainability but this has not deterred the movement from developing. In the realm of Malaysian literature in English, writers have written extensively about environmental activism – although little attention has been given to this area in the local literary-critical practice. In this paper, I attempt to redress this dearth by examining and critiquing four contemporary Malaysian novels in English: Keris Mas’ Jungle of Hope (2009), Yang-May Ooi’s The Flame Tree (1998), KS Maniam’s
Between Lives (2003), and Chuah Guat Eng’s Days of Change (2010). These novels are selected due to their alignment to the key phases in the history of environmentalism in Malaysia. The first phase is during British rule (1824-1957). This phase is what I would refer to as “hard times” as the locals struggled against unjust laws that threatened their livelihood and dependence on the forests. The second phase is the period between 1970-1990. I would refer to this phase as the “growing awareness” phase as many environmental laws were introduced and numerous ENGOs were established during this period and worked to promote environmental awareness, justice and sustainability. Grassroots activism also emerged during this period. The third phase is the period between 1990-2000. This is when the “environmental movement was born”. This decade saw massive degradation of the environment as well as the rise of civil society that became more assertive and critical. The fourth phase is the period from 2000 onwards. I would refer to this phase as the “marching forward” phase as globalization and the Internet further accelerate environmental awareness, cooperation and lobbying. This paper analyzes the environmental politics, past and present, found in the selected texts, and the solutions that their works present to ensure sustainability. It yields a keen understanding of irresponsible environmental degradation as well as illuminate agency and transformation.

“Hard Times”: Keris Mas’ Jungle of Hope

Jungle of Hope (henceforth, JOH) represents environmentalism during the colonial times. In JOH, Keris delineates the human-environment interactions in the Malayan environment in the ‘20s-’30s. These relations are largely linked to political, economic, and cultural domination. To accentuate the power of colonial capitalist enterprises, Keris broadens this domination to include the success of the colonial rulers and capitalists in manufacturing consent among the Malays to embrace the capitalist tin-mining and plantation economy. Zaidi and a score of other villagers in Ketari exemplify this consent. Even though Zaidi adopts this ideology, he does not do so ‘blindly.’ A self-made man, he makes sincere efforts to salvage the Malays’ land in Ketari, built upon a vision of social justice for the Ketari villagers and change in the villagers’ practices and attitudes. Zaidi’s hard work, however, is undermined since it is hardly able to stop the menace of mining from eating up the land in Ketari and the surrounding areas. Nor is he able to stop the breakup of the Ketari people into two factions – one that takes up rubber planting and the other that is displaced and has no choice but to flee to the jungle. Environmentalism in JOH, as represented by Zaidi, involves embracing and giving consent to the capitalist ideology, but this is done with a clear conscience of alleviating displacement and landlessness among the Malays as well spurring the Malays’ political and economic autonomy to faster growth. Zaidi’s empowerment however, becomes a problem since the transformation that he aspires for is crushed by the counter-hegemonic struggle of his brother, Pak Kia, and some folks from the village. He is not really successful in convincing Pak Kia to take up rubber planting and not leave Ketari. Pak Kia’s sullen resistance also represents the fragility of environmentalism during colonial times. Environmentalism, to Pak Kia, includes significant resistance to overt attempts to alter his livelihood, lifestyle and tradition. In the end, however, his resistance proves to be futile, leaving him with no choice but to flee from Ketari and settle in the jungle.
“Environmental Movement Was Born”: Yang-May Ooi’s The Flame Tree

Yang-May Ooi’s The Flame Tree (henceforth, TFT) is set in Britain and Malaysia in the ‘90s. TFT revolves around the construction of Titiwangsa University, a complete town and campus in the rainforest-covered hills of Malaysia, set to be the grandest, most visionary project in Asia. Jordan Cardale bids for the construction of the new university town in Malaysia and is awarded the contract. Luke, an environmental consultant hired by Dr Chan, on the other hand, is adamant to prove Jordan’s design of the new university town would be damaging to the environment and the people of Kampung Tanah.

Resistance, as exemplified by Luke’s and Dr. Chan’s efforts to stop the destructive project, is pitted against Jordan’s “power over” in TFT. These antagonistic relations imply that the capacity of grassroots movements depends in part on their capacity to counter the power of capitalists. In TFT, Luke and his friends fail miserably to stop the environmentally-damaging project. A year after construction begins, the university tower that is being built collapses, causing a massive landslide that causes a massive environmental damage, adversely affecting tracts of forest and the Kampung Tanah people (p. 304). In Kampung Tanah’s case, Luke’s awareness campaign fails to persuade the people to contest Jordan’s proposed project. Dr. Chan’s attempts to let the public and the authorities know about the flaws of Jordan’s design is also easily countered, backed by the ideology that Luke’s attempts are ‘interference’ by those representing the First World country or First World environmental movement, encroaching on the rights of Malaysians to enjoy the benefits of progress. This ideology, coupled with the ideology of progress-and-development, which have been propagated by the state and internalized by the rest of society for many decades, come in handy for Jordan to advance his interests. In TFT, Ooi seems to necessitate the need to focus more on ideological rather than coercive domination. To sum up, TFT represents the environmental politics during the ‘90s, at a time when civil society was only developing, constricting progress-and-development ideology was rife, and globalization was treated with distrust and suspicion by Asian leaders and authorities.

“Marching Forward”: KS Maniam’s Between Lives and Chuah Guat Eng’s Days of Change

K.S. Maniam’s Between Lives (henceforth, BL) is located imaginatively in colonial and contemporary Malaysia, probably in the late ‘90s or early 2000s. Sellamma, an old, poor, rural woman battles to keep her land from being acquired and developed as a theme park. Sumitra, a young woman and social worker, is entrusted with the task of persuading Sellamma to give up her land. Maniam delineates the human-environment interactions in the postcolonial Malaysian environment, foregrounding his indictment of state control and domination whilst highlighting the problems of resistance and empowerment. Both Sellamma and Sumitra exemplify resistance and empowerment, the former using her knowledge and memory to resist the displacement from her land, whereas the latter uses her skills and connections to help save the land from being grabbed by the developer. In Sellamma’s case, resistance poses a problem as she is denied the right to live on her land. Sumitra’s indifference towards Sellamma’s predicament in the beginning of the story demonstrates the extent of the power of the state’s progress-and-development ideology. Maniam probes into this ideological domination, pointing out the need to pay more attention to ideological
rather than coercive domination. Sellamma’s resistance, which is limited to the private sphere, needs to be advanced, which is why Sumitra is given the role by Maniam to extend it into the public sphere. Maniam underscores what happens when strongly-held personal and cultural views come into conflict with those of the state. Through these power relations in BL, Maniam also affirms the contradictory roles of the state, as the protector and destroyer of the environment. The state’s complicity in making decisions and taking subsequent actions to evict Sellamma from her land attest to these opposing roles.

Maniam also delineates the nuanced and dynamic image of the Internet as an arena for resistance — an arena to protest and garner public support, away from the constricting “power over” of the state. In semi-democratic Malaysia, the media and the state have a symbiotic relationship. Mainstream media are often controlled and owned by the state. Laws related to the operation of media often give the state the power to censor or stop the transmission of information that is deemed as going against state policies. This symbiosis naturally manifests in pro-state press and broadcasting coverage, often sidelining alternative voices struggling to gain a hearing. However, in the past few decades, the proliferation of new media in Malaysia has provided a venue in which more basic political conflicts are waged. Alternative media and the Internet have become the arena for those who want to be heard and need a less constrictive democratic space. Maniam accentuates this political liberalization through Sumitra’s efforts to raise the society’s awareness of the injustice suffered by Sellamma. The Internet, Maniam elucidates, provides greater freedom of expression and political participation and challenges the existing power structures in ways that have been limited before. This measure may serve as “an example of the countervailing implications of the globalization process, where intensified market penetration and appropriation of hitherto peripheral environments are accompanied by expanding communications networks and new political possibilities for resistance” (Hirsch and Warren, 2002, p. 4).

Chuah Guat Eng’s Days of Change (henceforth, DOC), is set in Malaysia, spanning several decades from colonial times to the early 2000s. It revolves around the life of Hafiz, a 55-year-old self-made Malay man. When the story begins, Hafiz is suffering from amnesia. To trigger his memory, Hafiz uses the I Ching, the Chinese ‘book of changes,’ to recall his past. He then remembers his battle with his friends against a major corporation bent on appropriating his land at Ulu Banir, and his efforts to bring development to Kampong Basoh, a poverty-stricken village in Banir Valley. Chuah conveys her optimism towards solving environmental threats through resistance and empowerment. The protesters lined up by Hafiz’s friend, Yew Chuan, are all educated, urban citizens intent on raising public awareness and making the Banir Valley issue heard, despite the daunting obstacles that await them. There are Dr. Mohini, a physician; Hector Wong, a journalist attached to a regional newsmagazine based in Hong Kong; Faridah, a psychologist; and Sundram, an engineer who works with the Waterworks Department and also is a chairman of the Malaysian Nature Society’s local branch. These characters embody empowerment, each with his or her expertise and knowledge, which are then played out collectively in the public sphere to stop the proposed project.

When news regarding Hartindah’s plans for the Banir Valley receive coverage in the local and regional media due to Hector’s role in drumming up media interest, the
protest group organised by Yew Chuan relentlessly lobbies for its case. Hector’s position as a journalist attached to an external press service proves advantageous and liberating considering the media in Malaysia has either been co-opted or is controlled and constantly reinforces the state’s ideology regarding development. Hector writes about how the development project is merely a pretext to log the forest in Banir Valley whilst

Sundram gave interviews, wrote letters to editors and even articles explaining the importance of forest reserves and the ecological impact of the proposed theme park. Faridah, the psychologist, did the same on the issue of the sociological and psychological impact of displacing people from their ancestral homes. (p. 60).

The media exposure led to some conspiracy theories, which were “picked up by journalists writing for regional newsmagazines, and they began to probe into Hartindah, its finances, and its political connections” (p. 61). Months of intense lobbying pays off when, a few months later, Hartindah announces that the project is shelved until a thorough environmental impact assessment has been made.

Yew Chuan’s group’s fight against Hartindah’s proposed project is a manifestation of empowerment. After decades of progress in economy and education, Yew Chuan’s group is convinced of their right to freedom of expression and the right to participate in issues that concern the land threatened with social and environmental degradation. The community-based group proves to be a formidable player in the controversial Banir Valley project, challenging the moral character of the state and business corporations. Chuah suggests that if the public sphere realises its unique potential in resistance and empowerment, and work together irrespective of ethnicity, race, or religion to shape the course of action and decisions related to the land, it would be able to create more equitable relations and structures of power. More equitable relations and structures of power here means the public would be able to challenge the role of the state in managing the various aspects of environmental well-being, and thus able to pressure the state and its backed business corporations to modify or stop practices that contribute to land and community degradation. Yew Chuan’s group’s struggle to fight the ecological injustice brought by a development project implies that when an environmental issue is fought for, per se, like in DOC, without exploiting communal or racial politics that are central in contemporary Malaysian politics, it would help an environmental issue to be resolved. The group’s civil society-based protest and lobbying reflects what Weiss has noted as a “reasonably diverse and vibrant” civil society in Malaysia, which has “expanded dramatically since the 1980s” (Weiss, 2009, p. 742).

Yew Chuan’s group’s resistance also serves as a significant political intervention that proves “civil-society activism has succeeded in influencing state policies and political norms” in Malaysia (Weiss, 2005, p. 78). This, I believe, also reflects what capitalist modernisation in Malaysia has brought over the years, such as more equal access to education, occupations, and wider access to information through the media, all of which play major roles in advancing knowledge of environmental issues, as well as sensitivity to local environmental conflicts and resistance. It also signifies what Bryant and Bailey have identified as “a new politics of the environment in the Third World” (1997, p. 131). This “new politics of the environment” is evoked by Chuah on
two levels. On one level, the Malay-agenda politics played out by Abu Bakar and the lobbying by Yew Chuan’s group represents Malaysians’ revulsion to the manner in which the state and its cronies exercise their power to realise environmentally-destructive projects, denying freedom of expression, right to information, participation in decision-making, and right to justice — traits associated with liberal democracy. At another level, these politics also signify the erosion of the state’s hegemony and authoritarian rule over the society based on rapid economic development and the rise of civil society in Malaysia, which has matured over the years.

Conclusion

In conclusion, these novels represent the different phases of the history of environmentalism in Malaysia. JOH represents environmentalism during the colonial times. TFT represents the politics involved when the environmental movement was born whereas BL and DOC represent environmental politics from 2000 onwards. What these works suggest is that environmentalism is at its best when it becomes a collective effort and fought for in the public sphere. These works express a deep-seated responsibility to environmentalism which can be mediated through a strong and resilient civil society. As a firm believer in such a tenet where literature and history illuminate each other, I argue that these works intersect with the history of environmentalism, thus making them indispensable in the discourse of environmentalism in Malaysia.

Acknowledgements

This research received funding from the Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia, grant no. FRGS/1/2016/SS102/UPM/03/1.
References


**Contact email:** zainor@upm.edu.my

Ngozika Anthonia Obi-Ani, University of Nigeria, Nigeria
Paul Obinwanne Obi-Ani, University of Nigeria, Nigeria

Abstract
The objective of this study is to examine the experiences of the Nkanu Igbo during the civil war. The Nigerian-Biafran Civil War was savagely contested by both sides of the divide. The seceding Biafra had borne the brunt of the pogrom, the counter coup d’état that decimated its officer corps in Nigeria and the sporadic outbursts of sectarian and ethnic cleansing that preceded the declaration of the Republic of Biafra on May 30,1967. In less than three months of the commencement of hostilities, Biafra lost its capital, Enugu, with all its stores. Enugu and its environs are peopled by the Nkanu Igbo and with the retreat of the Biafran forces, civil populace predominantly of the Nkanu Igbo came under the Nigerian army occupation from September 1967 to January 1970. The occupation of Nkanu Igbo was horrendous, with the civilian population subjected to inhuman treatment such as summary execution of suspected Biafran partisans, enforcement of pass system and arbitrary commandeering of young women as sex slaves by the Nigerian army. Unfortunately, this heinous crime against humanity has not received any scholarly attention. This paper is anchored on Mixed Method. Generally, emphasis is on qualitative method for interpretation of results. Tools for data collection are secondary data, newspaper reports, in-depth interviews and expert judgments. The sample is taken from a small group of people from 55 years and above. This group is over the age bracket of 10 years within the scope of study.

Keywords: justice, civil war, occupation, war crimes, Nkanu Igbo, butcher, Nigerian army.
Introduction

Nigeria is an amalgam of over 250 ethnic groups. Under the strong arm of the British colonizers, this behemoth appeared to hold the hope of a great nation in the making. Six years after independence the cookies started to crumble. The January 15, 1966 coup d’état set the ball rolling. The killings of some of the emergent independent leaders were misconstrued, ethnic motives, rather than poor governance ascribed to their elimination. The Igbo people were stigmatized became targets of sectarian violence in most Northern Nigeria cities between May to October 1966. The Igbo returned enmasse to their region, abandoning their jobs, businesses and properties. After half-hearted attempts at peace building particularly the reneging of January 1967 Aburi Accord, the Republic of Biafra was declared on May 30, 1967.

On July 6 1967, the Nigerian military leader, Lt.Col. Gowon, declared war on the seceding Biafran Republic. The overrunning of Nsukka Division the border town of Biafra to the North and the capture of the strategic Opi junction exposed the vulnerability of Enugu, the Biafran capital. Enugu was within the shooting range of the federal forces and the subsequent bombardment was terrifying. Despite the propaganda of the Biafran government of its ability to defend Enugu, the people were thrown into panic. The Biafran leader, Lt. Col. Ojukwu did not embark on systematic retreat of Enugu until it was too late. Rather Ojukwu sent to the war front, Biafran recruits armed with machetes to confront armoured personnel carriers and well-armed, better fed and motivated federal troops. Many inexperienced Biafran combatants perished at the war front. Retreat is strategic to lure unwary opponent into an ambush. Yet, Biafran regime refused to retreat and evacuate important stocks that could have sustained the war for over a year. Enugu was abandoned with all its markets and resources for the federal troops to loot.

On the 27th September, 1967 the federal forces were within the periphery of Enugu, the Biafra capital. Yet, Enugu was not evacuated. The next day, on the 28th September, the federal troops were within five miles of Enugu and were massively shelling the town. Like the University town of Nsukka, the people began to evacuate in a hurry leaving behind valuables and government movable properties. Col. Ojukwu had left Enugu on the 26th barely 48 hours before the federal forces entered Enugu (Madiebo,1980). On 28th September, 1967 Enugu fell to the federal forces. The Biafran troops left behind to defend the capital had neither food nor ammunition to halt the onslaught. It is still a miracle how the Republic held on for more than two years even as the capital became a government on the wheel.

The Occupation of Enugu and its Environs

The horrors experienced by the Igbo domiciled in the North were the issues that precipitated the Civil War. As the railway linking Enugu to North brought home Igbo refugees with tales of woes, the people were irked. The People wanted peaceful parting of ways through break up of Nigeria or outright war to achieve Biafran independence. Unfortunately, nobody envisaged the magnitude of modern warfare. The fall of Enugu on the 28th September 1967 invariably led to its
occupation. Enugu and Nkanu are intertwined as Nkanuland constituted more than 85% of Enugu metropolis. Thus the entire outskirts of Enugu belong to Nkanu Igbo. The collapse of Enugu invariably put Nkanuland at risk. The Nigerian army quickly distributed itself to all parts of Enugu and its environ for effective policing and occupation. An observer noted that the people hated the Nigerian army occupation but could not express it openly. The reason adduced was that the people witnessed the offloading of the bodies of those who were killed during the pogrom in the North and as such regarded the Nigerian army as an enemy force, which had come to complete the pogrom (Nnamani, 2007). By January 1968 the last resistance by Biafran BOFF (Biafran Organisation for Freedom Fighters) and Rangers in Akegbe-Ugwu was consequently crushed.

Biafran partisans who were sympathetic to Biafran cause contributed in no small measure to keep the war raging in the face of excruciating difficulties and pains. These die-hard Biafrans were found among BOFF and Rangers. The BOFF were young boys who could not be enlisted in the army but were trained to penetrate the enemy line and carry out guerilla attacks while the functions of the Rangers was also to carry out sabotage operations against the federal forces. They engaged in the conscription of civilians into Biafran army and would eliminate anybody fraternizing with the enemy forces. In Nkanu, Nwankwo Ani of Ogui Nike, Titus Nweke and Nwanu Okoroafor of Amuru((Nnamani, 2007) were a few of those killed by BOFF for alleged fraternization with the Nigerian army.

Some wealthy chiefs who were Biafran sympathizers supported the cause not only with their wealth but also recruited young boys to be trained as Biafran soldiers. The driving forces in Biafrans wanting to fight back were: first in defence of their fatherland to maintain Biafran sovereignty, to prevent the impending genocide and finally to maintain the territorial integrity of Igboland. The Biafran propaganda kept on recounting the woes of Igbo massacred in the North claiming that the war was for total annihilation of the Igbo. The people had to employ the old instinct of self-preservation by fighting in the face of grave difficulties. Therefore, the people hated the federal forces even in cases where they had shown kind overtures. There were occasional attempt to poison their palm wine in Ozalla and Agbani. Barriers were created along the paths of the Federal army through cutting down trees, digging trenches to impede movement by the federal forces. In extreme cases, some federal soldiers who lost their ways were ambushed and killed. According to Igwe Edwin Ogbonna:

our people’s immediate reaction was to join the Biafran army. Our people reacted further by cutting down trees, thus creating a barrier to the military penetration of the villages. These include major roads such as Ugbawka-Amodu roads. They went further in their resistance, by digging trenches to hinder their vehicular movements on the major roads. Our people ambushed and killed them in their attempt to covering the pits and removal of the obstacles along the roads. This helped in delaying them in
their attempt to penetrate major communities. Many villages laid ambushes on numerous track roads, waiting for stray federal soldiers. Our people also joined Rangers. These Rangers helped the Biafran troops in their campaign to prevent the federal troops from occupying an area or help in recapturing of lost areas (Nnamani, 2007).

Nkanuland proved difficult to be controlled by the invading forces. The civilians posed a stiff wall of resistance. They were mainly employers of the railway station. They witnessed the horrors of September-October massacre that saw the influx of dead and traumatized Igbo from the North. As a warlike group in pre-colonial Igboland, they awaited with eagerness the invasion of the Nigerian army but unfortunately, the Nigerian side fought with armoured cars and ferret while they relied on machetes and borrowed dane guns from their wealthy folks. Those who sympathized with the Biafran cause or fought on their side were tortured, punished or killed while the older ones were detained.

The occupation of Nkanu Igbo was marked with brutalities. Women were forced into marriages or raped, valuables were looted whereas any good house got burnt. One of the hallmarks of the occupation was the imposition of pass laws. In a war situation, pass was generally issued to monitor the infiltration of the liberated areas. This was because cross-border infiltration to the federal camps by young Biafrans was common. Part of Ojukwu’s strategies in setting up of the Biafran Organisation for Freedom Fighters (BOFF) was to train young boys as spies to operate behind enemy lines and for sabotage operations. The Nigerian soldiers were attacked. They lost some of their members through guerrilla attacks by BOFF or Rangers. It was alleged that their food, water and palmwine were in most cases poisoned by BOFF or Rangers operatives. This happened in Udi, Ozalla and Agbani. Young boys were trained to infiltrate enemy camps. The Nigerian soldiers unwittingly recruited those boys not knowing they were spies. These Biafran secret agents may stay for few weeks and disappeared into thin air in which they ferry information back to the Biafran army. It took time before the Nigerian soldiers discovered that those stray, hungry looking kids were “Ojukwu boys” and started shooting them on sight. The Federal soldiers would interrogate those “boys” soldiers captured and had their mouths slit open and returned to the Biafran side as a deterrent for other recruits (Gould, 2013).

The surprised attacks and loss of men and ammunition by BOFF and Rangers provoked the Nigerian army to slaughter Biafran partisans like goats. To safeguard the so-called liberated areas, movement passes were issued to civilians. Because of the casualties suffered, the Nigerian army had to screen and fish out these die-hard Biafrans. Pass was imposed for their security. The pass law stipulated that every male child within the age of seven years must possess a pass with attached passport photograph. This pass must have the details of the bearer. It was first issued to males but later adult females possessed it. According to Chief Anthony Nwobodo Agbo, who was appointed the Sariki or war chief of Amichi Awkunanaw during the war by Lt. Col. T.Y Danjuma, he used to issue this movement pass to enable the people
move freely to Enugu town and also to enable the people access the relief materials (Agbo, personal communication, June11, 2016).

The Nkanu Igbo were issued with such pass to aid their movement and secure jobs with the Red Cross. Chief Anthony Agbo is praised today for saving a lot of lives through issuance of passes. Those issued with pass were safe from Federal forces harassment and could move anywhere within the ‘liberated areas’. Nevertheless, the imposition of passes gravely restricted people’s movement. This became a scourge on its own. It contributed to the scourge of starvation because without a pass, those farther inland could not easily scavenge for food nor had access to relief materials. A pass therefore was a paper issued to an individual as an attestation of his/her loyalty to the federal authority. The pass system endured even after cessation of hostility under the strict scrutiny of the victorious federal forces. To obtain the pass, people had to be subjected to rigours. The individual in need of a pass had to subject him/herself to clearance by the Sariki. Again, being conversant with the heinous activities of some of these war chiefs saddled with the power to issue those passes could only mean that it was definitely meant for their cronies. As Chief Edward Onu posited that movements were restricted and only supporters of the federal cause who had passes were allowed to have food and medical aids (Nnamani, 2007). Majority of the people who moved farther into the hinterland because of fear of possible genocide could not possess those passes thereby adding to the grave difficulties on ground within the period.

Collaborators, Saboteurs and Attempted Annihilation of Freeborn in Nkanu

The instinct to survive especially during a war could lead to betrayals. Wives betrayed their husbands while kinsmen betray their kith and kin. During this period of intense difficulties, there were no shortage of saboteurs, cowards and turn-coats. This group of people acted as collaborators and saboteurs against their people. They were regarded as traitors when faced with difficulties sabotaged their people. In Nkanu, they capitalized on their interaction with the occupation forces to settle old scores. The collaborators it was alleged helped troops as guides and led them through the various communities. Some of these collaborators were later appointed war chiefs and most of them spoke Hausa language fluently. Because they were villains, they undermined their people, abused their powers and committed heinous crimes. In order to please their pay masters, they blackmailed previously well to do Nkanu people before the Nigerian soldiers as Biafran sympathizers.

These quislings gained the confidence of the occupation forces and were made war chiefs/Sariki thereby displacing the real chiefs. Some notable collaborators were Peter Mba-Egbo, Daha-Egbo, Ogbuebo from Amankazi, Boniface Nwobodo and Simon Ugwu from Amurri. They gave lists of their enemies to the Nigerian military men accusing them falsely of being Biafran soldiers (Nnamani, 2007). Pa Joseph Eze the pre-war chief of Amurri was accused of aiding the Biafran troops. The Nigerian military executed him. Prominent men suffered most during this epoch. It was difficult for them to escape both sides. A rich man could be accused by his enemies
as a Biafran sympathizer and got killed by the Nigerian side or viewed as collaborator and killed by the Biafran BOFF. Titus Nweke and Ambrose Nnaji fell in the bad books of the 130 Battallion of Biafran troops stationed in Agban. Titus Nweke tried to curtail the excesses of the Biafran soldiers. His enemies concocted stories of his aiding the Nigerian army and was beheaded at Eke Ogbaku by the Biafran troop (Nnamani, 2007).

These collaborators served as war chiefs thereby displacing the pre-war political structure of the people. As some of the men were mischievous, there were others who were praised today for working assiduously for the good of the people. Elder Jack Nnamani and Chief Anthony Agbo wrote their names in the sands of time as they protected their people’s property during the occupation. They were said to have effected the release of people incarcerated by the occupation army. They always questioned the rationale behind their detention. It was alleged that Elder Jack Nnamani usually blackmailed the occupation forces that they promised the people that no harm would befall them if they returned home. It should be recalled that the dislodgement of Biafran forces and the ferocity of Nigerian Air Force bombardment made the people scampered for safety in dense forests. These places were called agu (uninhabited farmlands which were not motorable). People hid in such places to escape executions, rape and forced marriages. As each community was liberated by the federal forces, they appointed war chiefs with the express order to cajole people out of their hidings to embrace the ‘liberators’. In Nkanu, the people viewed such gestures with utmost suspicion. It was an irony that those who later mustered the courage to return from hiding were always harassed at every turn. Young men were executed and labeled "Ojukwu boys” while women were raped or forced into marriages, houses were burnt, stalls were looted, tobacco was a prized booty, storey buildings were destroyed with dynamites to name a few. All wealthy men who sought refuge in Biafran controlled zone were Biafran sympathizers and therefore, their buildings were destroyed.

The collaborator in Oruku Nkanu East L.G.A was alleged to have presided over the elimination of over thirty young men from that community (Nnamani, 2007). Oruku community witnessed a massive execution on the day the Nigerian army entered the town. Those young men were labeled Biafran collaborators by the federal informants. This was similar to what happened at Aba where the Nigerian Soldiers massacred more than two thousand civilians (Achebe, 2012). In the words of Kanayo Nnamani "our people were the major cause of the death of most of the people” (Nnamani, 2007, p.104). In Amurri, Dawa Nwegbo, Ogbebo and Peter Nwegbo excelled in directing the federal troops into the community and saw to the elimination of Chigbo-Ogbu a Biafran Ranger from Amankazi Eziokwe Amurri (Nnamani, 2007). They worked with the Nigerian soldiers, collected bribes and gave them information on young girls and newly married women in hiding. An informant narrated a story of a young girl of about 18 years from Umuigbo Amurri whom the Nigerian soldiers forcefully took away from her parents. Her mother wept bitterly that they should leave her daughter who was her only child. The Nigerian soldiers insisted on forcefully taking the girl. Peter Nwegbo an accomplice threatened the poor woman that he was going to kill her if she refused her daughter being taken...
away; after all, they were not interested on the mother but the daughter. The embittered mother was lucky because in the midst of the fracas, a more senior federal officer appeared on the scene and inquired over the reason for the commotion. The woman tearfully narrated the problem to him. The soldier was enraged and asked Peter Nwegbo and his Nigerian soldier accomplice if that was what they usually do. He lambasted them that instead of searching for young men, they were busy conscripting young girls who were the only hope of their aged mother. Consequently, he ordered that the erring soldier should be punished (Nnamani, 2007). The poor mother in the story had the blessings of mother luck on that fateful day. Again, the story depicts that not all the Nigerian soldiers were rapists. Most of the officers conducted themselves well but the rank and file was despicable.

These people who acted as guides helped the Nigerian army to effectively occupy Nkanuland and its environs. All recognized chiefs in Nkanu area ran away and were afraid of being killed. They were Igwe Chukwuani of Ozalla, Igwe Ofor Nnaji of Obe, Igwe Nnamani of Agbani among others. Hence, they left their duty posts and in its stead, collaborators and saboteurs were appointed war chiefs or Sariki. However, some of the Sarikis acted in good faith by protecting their various community, encouraged them to come out of their hidings, arbitrated between their people and federal forces in case of misunderstandings among many other good deeds. The good ones were actually in the minority. Sariki Ogbuebo and Dawa brought Nigerian soldiers into Amurri where they burnt houses. Amechi Awkwunanaw was invaded around November 1967. The invaders set up a camp and launched attacks from there as people fled Amechi Awkwunanaw. It was alleged that their invasion of Amechi Awkwunanaw led to the burning of buildings of prominent men such as Nnaji Nwobodo, Nwankwo Ugwu Aniede, Chief Mba among others. Chief Mba was accused of being a Biafran supporter while his compound was a secret meeting point of Biafrans. It was alleged that he fled to Nomeh and later died in 1971, shortly after the war. He could not survive the loss of his wealth. Any household the head of the family was not present when the Nigeria soldiers visited became a Biafran sympathizer. At times the Nigerian soldiers would leave a message that the owner of the compound should report to the Nigerian army camp at Eke-Otu. If after few days and the owner had not surrendered to the army of occupation, the army would eventually plant dynamites around the building and demolish it.

The day they invaded Amechi, it was only Chief Jonah Agbo’s one storey building that was spared. Chief Jonah Agbo was neither a Nigerian collaborator nor saboteur. But he was smeared and blackmailed by a descendant of slaves, Nwanyani; that he (Chief Jonah Agbo) was a Biafran sympathizer. Nwanyani and his fellow collaborators were on a vengeful mission to eliminate all prominent Amadis (freeborn) in Amechi Awkwunanaw through branding them as Biafran partisans. Nwanyani alleged that Biafran troops stock-piled weapons and met regularly at Chief Jonah Agbo’s house. This descendant of slaves, Nwanyani, wanted Chief Jonah Agbo’s house demolished on false allegation of aiding the Biafran war efforts. However, after the Nigerian troops had planted dynamites around the building, a curious officer wanted to search the building for the alleged
weapons but stumbled on a wall picture in the living room in which Chief Jonah Agbo had taken with the Emir of Zaria. The officer brought the picture down and took a closer look and discovered that it was the Emir of Zaria and further inquired whether the owner of the building about to be demolished was in the picture and they pointed at a young man squatting in front of the Emir. He ordered his men to remove the dynamites from around Chief Jonah Agbo’s house. That picture spared the building and most likely those associated with the owner of the building. But because they had forcefully broken into the building, the door was left ajar and people looted every conceivable item in the house (Oguejiofor Agbo, personal communication, May 30, 2016).

Chief Jonah Agbo was lucky but other prominent men of Nkanu who deserted their houses were not lucky. His stint with Emir of Zaria during his stay in the North saved his property. On the other hand, people lost years of painstaking acquisitions. On the whole, they burnt fourteen houses on that fateful day. They equally engaged in killing spree and subjected the remnants to various kinds of punishments. As Achebe opined that Nigeria had not succeeded in crushing the spirit of the Igbo people, but it had left us indigent, stripped and stranded in the wilderness (Achebe, 2012).

Every society has its own cleavages and issues. But these issues should be submerged during a national catastrophe like Biafran/Nigerian Civil War. Unfortunately some people felt that they should capitalize on the differences existing in Nkanuland and punish their former overlords. They thought joining forces with the Northern soldiers would liberate them. Indeed they were mistaken. The Hausa/Fulani society was the most stratified society where the nobles lord it over the serfs mercilessly. According to Chief Christian Achi Nnaji of Agbani, the Nigerian army entered Nkanuland through the ex-slaves of Nkanu origin who had lived in the North and spoke Hausa language fluently. They manipulated the Nigerian army of occupation into fighting the Amadi (freeborn). One of the ex-slaves, Nwonovo Obunne of Umuowo Agbani took the invading troops to Agbani Beach where the soldiers looted palm oil and palm kernel. He alleged that all Amadi were Biafran partisans and accordingly blackmailed them before the Nigerian army. All prominent Amadis were alleged to be against the Nigerian army and most of them were eliminated based on false accusations by the ex-slaves and their descendants (Achi Nnaji, personal communication, May 31, 2015).

The planned annihilation of prominent Amadi men taking refuge at Akpufu was aborted by BOFF. Those earmarked for execution include: Ezekiel Nnamokoh, First Nkanu LGA Secretary, Chief Fidelis Nwatu (FECO) Igwe of Ihuokpara, Chief Emmanuel Nnaji (Ancoto), Igwe of Amagunze and Chief John Igwesi, Igwe of Obuofia Awkwanaw. Others to be killed include: Chief Nnamani Nwatu, Customary Court Judge, Nnamani Nwonoekwe, Igwe of Akpufu, Nnam Nwannamani and Nwatu Nwa Judge. Indeed, when the ex-slaves’ plot to eliminate the Amadis failed, the Nigerian army’s anger turned against them. The federal troops killed Ogbonnia Ogbo of Akpufu and Mike Nwede Onovo Obunne of Umuowo Agbani. These ex-slaves were butchered by the Nigerian army for attempting to
betray them to the Biafran army. The total number of Nkanu people butchered by the Nigerian army occupation at Agbani was not less than eighty (80) persons (Achi Nnaji, personal communication, May 31, 2015). These people were not killed but “slaughtered” like goats by bloodthirsty federal troops for allegedly aiding a national Igbo cause. This heinous crime and massacre of Nkanu Igbo remain a big dent on world conscience. The Nkanu Igbo are powerless to confront and demand for justice from the Nigerian government. But this was a crime against humanity and all those who abused their position should be made to account for it or posthumously by the International Criminal Court, ICC. Besides the brutalities against Nkanu men, the women were turned into sex slaves, many of them raped. Some were forcefully taken to the North by the Nigerian army occupation after the war.

However, it should be noted that the struggle between freeborn and slaves in Nkanu predated the Nigerian Civil War. In traditional Nkanu settings, there were two distinct groups of people-freeborn (Amadi) and domestic slaves (Ohu). As an agrarian enclave, the wealthy farmers owned a large number of slaves who constituted the labour force. The relationship between the domestic slaves and their freeborn overlords was generally symbiotic. The domestic slaves performed some feudal services to their masters as a token of appreciation for the land granted to them. They therefore, devoted two of the four-day Igbo week to work for their masters among other obligations (Obi-Ani, 1999).

The two groups never intermarried, as their marriage was a taboo in Nkanu. It was not a surprise that during the civil war, these former slaves presented themselves as friends of the ‘liberators’ guiding them into the villages, blackmailing their former masters as Biafran sympathizers and tacitly using the Nigerian soldiers to fight their war against the freeborn (Amadi). Thus in Nkanu the ex-slaves and their descendants constituted a stumbling block to Biafran war effort. They saw an opportunity to overthrow the old order and avenge their second-class status by collaborating with the enemy—the Nigerian army. Wealthy and influential Amadi in Nkanu were special targets. As they hid from invading Nigerian army, they also scamper for cover from vengeful ex-slaves who saw an opportunity to exert a pound of flesh from their former masters—the Amadi. The war was nightmarish for the Amadi of Nkanu.

The ‘Butcher’ at Agbani

Wars bring the worst in man. All the bestialities come to the fore in men. The aggressive instincts in man are resurrected. Wars turn men into cannibals, brutes and psychopaths. Suddenly an easy going man becomes a monster overnight. All the repressed prejudices, hatred and violence are awakened among combatants at war fronts. The Jews were hounded, gassed and over six million of them eliminated in the great holocaust orchestrated by Adolph Hitler during the Second World War. In 1994 the Tutsi in Rwanda and Burundi faced genocidal attacks from their neighbours, the Hutu. The Nigerian-Biafran Civil War enthroned such monstrous human beings like Sergeant Clement Yilda. His atrocities had been mystified among the Nkanu Igbo where he reigned as a tyrant that tormented the people during the civil war. Most
informants characterized Sergeant Yilda as a bloodthirsty monster, lacking human compassion and most likely devoid of good education or any at all.

Yilda was a victim of his own beastly nature. In a polarized society such as Nkanu, some ex-slaves capitalized on their closeness to the army of occupation to falsely accuse their former masters of being Biafran sympathizers. Without any credible evidence Sergeant Yilda condemned these men to death. It was the nature of execution that petrified Nkanu people. Sergeant Yilda subjected his victims to horrifying death. He slaughtered his victims through the slashing of throat or by cutting the private part at a public square (Achi Nnaji, personal communication, May 31, 2015). In short, he terrorized Nkanu people through his callous, crude and dastardly method of using sharp knife to kill his victims. Nobody brought to Yilda’s torture chambers survived or escaped his brutal death method. Hundreds perished at Yilda’s hands. It is the general consensus of Nkanu Igbo that Sergeant Yilda and his accomplices and their superiors that allowed such a reign of terror should face the International Criminal Court, ICC.

Why Justice Delayed?

Wars create monstrous situations. The worst in man unfolds. Soldiers at the heat of battle may have become mentally deranged without their superiors taking note of their health deterioration. As long as their aggressive tendencies are directed at the opposing forces, little or no action is taken until it is too late. Those scenarios resonated during the Nigerian-Biafran civil war. Many soldiers particularly from the Nigerian occupation forces behaved outrageously towards the Biafran partisans and civil population without any official reprimand. The Nkanu Igbo were brutalized, tortured, most alleged Biafran partisans slaughtered in the most barbaric form by Sergeant Yilda. These victims of occupation army have not received justice almost fifty years after cessation of hostilities.

The victorious Nigerian army received accolades at the end of the war in January 1970 while some of their Biafran counterparts were detained in solitary confinement for more than a decade for alleged sadistic behavior. Despite General Yakubu Gowon’s diplomatic posturing of “no victor no vanquished” proclamation and the supposedly effusion of reconciliation, rehabilitation and reconstruction, the Nkanu Igbo had a raw deal after the war. The “butcher” at Agbani, sergeant Yilda continued to serve in the Nigerian army as if nothing happened. There was no military board of inquiry on the atrocious behavior of Nigerian soldiers. The Nkanu Igbo had no platform to ventilate their grievances and seek for justice. The Gowon regime did not apologize for the horrendous havoc perpetrated by his soldiers. Nearly fifty years after, the Nkanu Igbo are still awaiting justice.

The so-called 3Rs( reconciliation, rehabilitation and reconstruction) of public utilities like schools, hospitals, postal offices and private properties never received federal or state government attention in Nkanu. It was through the people’s self-help efforts and doggedness that schools were rehabilitated and hospitals restored in the area. The Agbani railway beach the Nigerian army looted the palm oil and palm kernel holding, did not receive any compensation after the war. How the owners picked up the pieces
of their lives did not worry the Gowon military government? After all, the Nkanu Igbo had been vanquished. The looting of Enugu, that halted the military campaign against Biafra for over a month, deserves official query. Who were the beneficiaries of the loot? Did the Gowon military government uncover those behind the looting of Enugu, and what punishment did it met out to them? In the spirit of reconciliation, the military regime ought to have paid compensation. Unfortunately, the vanquished Nkanu Igbo did not receive any compensation to restart their vandalized businesses, their destroyed homes and psychological traumas they passed through at the hands of occupation forces. It is not late to atone for such criminal negligence by a government that boasted of not knowing what to do with petro dollars. Compensation could be in form of monuments, industries to assuage the people that suffered from the deliberate government policies to stagnate and retard them at the end of the war.

What about war crimes committed against Nkanu Igbo? The Nigerian government should set up a panel of inquiry to investigate the alleged barbaric slashing of throat and private parts of Biafran partisans by Seagant Yilda at Agbani during the war. The nature of the killing of over eighty (80) able-bodied Nkanu Igbo on alleged sympathy for Biafra was horrendous, wicked and inhuman. Those involved in this crime should be unraveled, and punished if they are still alive or condemned posthumously. An inquiry should be able to account one by one name of the victims of this heinous crime and a cenotaph built with their names inscribed on it. The Nigerian army and government should tender an apology to the families of the victims of naked brute power exercised by its officials. Reconciliation would remain a smokescreen unless effort is made for genuine atonement.

The current wave of agitation for actualization of Biafra is an indictment on the hollow nature of post-war reconciliation in Nigeria. The Igbo have been discriminated against in employment into the civil service, armed forces and public corporations since the end of the Biafran war. The policy of quota system has been used to deny them admission into colleges and universities. As many Igbo people drifted into the private sector of the Nigerian economy, their businesses are target of incessant vandalisation and riots outside their region of origin. Politically, the rest of Nigerians are afraid of entrusting them with the highest political office in Nigeria, not because they lack the competence but fear of Igbo retribution. This fear is germane due to years of discrimination against the Igbo. But this fear can only be allayed by entrusting and abolishing discriminatory practices in public institutions. Nigeria cannot progress unless merit is the watchword and justice seen to be done at all points. The injustice of occupation forces in Nkanu Igbo should be the starting point. Let us start with apology and monuments recognizing the various atrocities across the length and breadth of Igboland as a token of reconciliation.

**Conclusion**

War is a harbinger of the bad and the ugly. The Nigerian army occupation of Enugu environs was reminiscent of the evils of war. The soldiers rampaged the area thoroughly, raping women with impunity and looting life time treasures of the people. The civil population became willing tools in the hands of the occupation army. The
Nkanu Igbo blackmailed perceived enemies before the federal troops who wasted no time in executing many people on trumped up charges of supporting Biafran war effort. To some of these Igbo turn coats, the federal occupation would never end. The likes of Sergeant Yilda became cruelty personified. The little power some of the federal troops wielded was overtly abused to the detriment of the hapless civilians. The war created monsters like Yilda who slashed the throats of his Nkanu victims with relish. To many Nkanu Igbo the war stole the humanity of the Nigerian soldiers and set many families more than half a century back.

Acknowledgement

Profound gratitude goes to the IAFOR organizers for considering my paper worthy of Stuart D.B Picken Full Grant and Scholarship Award. I am eternally grateful.
References


Can Design Underpin a Strong Wellbeing?

Antonia Concha Philip Palmer, Queen Margaret University, United Kingdom

Abstract

Being creative is not only for artists. Many of the techniques associated with it could be successfully applied to other areas of life. To explain some of the background to this. At the moment I study research, before that careers guidance, and first design. I acquired a disability in 2006. In adapting to the changes in my own body and lifestyle I have come to understand that a lot of the things I learnt during my first degree could be applied to ‘re-designing a life’ if you like. So, I’ve set about doing that. What I discovered was more information, some that I was not initially aware of myself, about the different ways a person adapts their life to accommodate a health condition. Also, the different ways they could adapt. Being a research participant myself allowed me to better articulate some things that would be harder to explain to someone else. So, to conclude, can design underpin a strong wellbeing? I think it can. This involves uniting two world views, that of the artist and of the scientist. Two views that might seem too different. Straddling both is a person, that’s what I feel I do very often. What helps with this? To remain open minded. To understand that in adapting to a disability each day could be different.
Creativity, Wellbeing, Change

First, I want to say a bit more about creativity. This is something that’s unique to human beings. The first thing that could be asked is why any adult would want to be a creative person, as in some circles it’s not got such a great reputation after all. Despite that LinkedIn publish a list of the words people most commonly use to describe themselves in profiles and in 2012, top was creative. Being creative is not only about making great art, it is also about being successful in all aspects of life. Being creative is a skill that can be practised. It is not a gift only given to a chosen few. Creativity is like a muscle that needs exercising, and the more you do that the better it gets. Being creative involves living with an optimistic objectivity, thinking that something could work, treating something with optimism and hope. There is no creative value in being cynical.

If we were able to assess a person in the process of being creative we’d see they go through different stages. First comes preparation. This stage is all about absorbing knowledge and information about the creative challenge you’re facing. Then comes incubation. This is all about preparing your brain to take on new knowledge, making new connections and then stepping back and looking at what you’ve done. It’s in making new neural connections that result in a great idea creates that ‘ah-hah’ moment.

Regarding the design process and wellbeing, thinking about the process and how it maps onto wellness I’m going to split it into stages. First comes define. In design, this is where needs are interpreted and aligned to the objectives of a business. An example of how I applied this as a designer was by attending a design meeting with the business’ buyer where we’d discuss the needs of the business and what products they’d like to develop.

An example of how I apply this to develop a strong wellbeing is through daily living. In my case a need I’ve identified is my right hand isn’t as strong as my left because I use my walking stick in it.

Then comes the develop phase. As a designer, this is where I developed possible solutions after my meeting. I then took designs and samples along to a follow up where ideas were selected.

An example of how I apply this to continue to develop wellness is by purchasing hand strengtheners which I keep in my bag, I also try to use my left hand as much as my right and now use a walking stick with a softer handle.

And last comes the delivery. As a designer, I developed the ideas that had been chosen into sample garments. This was often together with a costing and a garment specification with measurements.

For wellbeing purposes, during the delivery phase I launch what would help into my life. I use my strengtheners as often as possible, for example when on a bus. Among other things I try to type with my left hand when I can, and use my soft handled walking stick when I’m out and about.
I have to tell you I’ve never regretted studying on my first course, I studied fashion design. My course was often talked of quite frivolously, but all I can say that it’s served me, and continues to serve me, really well in lots of ways. It could be said, if we want to future proof a child’s career and make sure their job isn’t automated they should study on a course like that. Send them to art school.

We live in a world of constant, often disruptive, change. Fashion thrives on change. I can’t think of another industry that does that. Not only does it thrive, it creates a desire for change. So, I think we could all fashion our futures in a way, and I want to tell you how that works in my own life.

As well as the concepts I mentioned before, one thing I try to do as often as possible is to use my imagination. Imagination is a limitless resource, and it is also free. A lot of people drink the same type of coffee, take the same route to work, eat the same type of foods, so by being creative and using imagination doesn’t mean only making nice things or painting nice pictures. It can mean doing things a little differently than usual.

Another thing that designers do that I think we could all take note of is to be curious. Designers are insanely curious, about people, and about things. That’s because they are always looking to be inspired. So, the next time you go to the cinema why not see a film you wouldn’t normally consider, or search the internet for a page you wouldn’t go to. While it’s never been easier to access information or to connect with people we tend to gravitate towards what we know.

Don’t be afraid to try new things or to make mistakes. Mistakes are something a person makes a few of, and in doing that at art college you realise that mistakes are part of life and more importantly you can learn so much from them. You realise that there are no mistakes so bad that they can’t be remedied. It is really hard to put yourself in a position where you feel vulnerable. Mistakes can do that, but in doing that you create resilience. Mistakes made by designers are often very public and can be humiliating.

It’s good to have lots of ideas, but don’t fall in love with all of them. Fashion designers generate lots, however only a small proportion will come to fruition. Think of presentations you’ve made, or reports you’ve written. A lot of care and consideration went into them and if someone said they weren’t right then you would quite rightly feel aggrieved. Designers learn to take this all on the chin. It might feel a bit strange and unpleasant the first time it happens but it’s something you get used to and learn from.

So just as the clothes we wear and other things we use can have an impact on the environment, so design can have an impact on our lives, on our wellbeing, which brings me back to the title of this talk. We can all create meaning in the world and make a difference. Michaelangelo said he saw a figure struggling to be free in each piece of marble so the arts and the human body have been linked for a long time. Mary Shelley said ‘we are un-fashioned creatures, but only half made up’, what if design provided that other half? Design is at its nature human-centred. It might make use of technology and fit a certain price point but it starts with what humans need or
might need. What would make life easier or more enjoyable. It is rooted in human empathy.

Creativity in all its forms improves my mental health, which in turn improves my physical health both of which make for a strong wellbeing. This all began for me in doing an embroidery in hospital. The positive reactions to it from my fellow patients, doctors and nurses made me think about how this could help me, how it could develop. And so, began a journey of self-discovery. So, we are slowly moving from a nature-inspired design to a design-inspired nature, and we have the power to use design to our best advantage.

Conclusion

Good mental health is one of the most important determinants of wellbeing. That was confirmed by my research. An implication of my study is that the determinants of wellbeing are more closely tracked to provide information on what is being done to improve wellbeing. A real benefit of using my own situation in this research is that one can better say what’s needed. This could also provide limitations to this research as it gives a very one-sided view. Going forward I plan to expand this study to include other participants.

1 – Michaelangelo – Italian Artist – 1475 - 1564
2 – Mary Wollstonecraft Shelley - author – 1797 - 1851

Acknowledgements

The healthcare professionals who care for me, the Confident & Informed research participants, my supervisor and my mother who proof-read this article.
References


ONARHEIM, B. 2012. 3 tools to become more creative (TED X presentation) TEDxCopenhagenSalon.


SINGULARITY UNIVERSITY. 2017. Be exponential - We empower a global community with the mindset, skillset, and network to create an abundant future. Join us on a transformative journey from inspiration to impact, and discover what being exponential means to you. (online). Available from: https://su.org/

Contact email: 16008615@qmu.ac.uk, tonipalmer71@outlook.com
Appendix

As part of this study, I am also conducting another project called Confident and Informed.

Confident and Informed researches the experiences of those who find themselves at a ‘cross-roads’ in their lives. For example, they could be looking for a new job or home. Those people in question also identify themselves as disabled or have a long-term health condition. Confident and Informed also researches the impact that creative thinking and/or doing has on their lives. Creativity can mean activities connected to Art & Design, but it can also mean approaching things a bit differently in different scenarios and aspects of life. Confident and Informed ultimately endeavours to create more confidence and improves life skills in others.

Confident and Informed will have a website in 2017, the blog for this project is now live and can be accessed here - https://v3.pebblepad.co.uk/spa/#/public/rMnyntMZZcb5hMwpp8pqkMxdh?historyId=gGZFVQ1LaD
Abstract
Racism is pervasive. Modernity shows that race broaches constant invocation, nearly becoming the standard for relations, internal and international. Moored in dominance and arrogance, the impact of race swelled uncontrollably during the imperial surge of the nineteenth century. Invasion, partition, and exploitation of Africa sowed its latent seeds and nurtured it into the irascible weed of today. During Queen Victoria’s reign, Britain expanded its colonial holdings to almost one-quarter of the earth. Nationalistic zealotry and desire to “civilize those less fortunate” fueled this expansion, and societal culture thrived on rigid principles of heroism, chivalry, and mettle. Contemporary writers such as H Rider Haggard, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, and Joseph Conrad relied on these and other Victorian values in their various Adventure Novels, wherein courageous characters presented as great men worthy of emulation. These authors and their peers incorporated and adapted white superiority over “natives,” rationalizing and propagating racial arrogance and the emergent racial paradigm. The sheer magnitude of their readership elucidates not only mass ingestion of their messages, but also a broad and unshakeable fastening of racism to human consciousness. Coupling history of Africa’s imperial fate with analysis of contemporary literature highlights the exacerbation of the racial paradigm. Though watersheds like imperial enterprise and common values leave the door far ajar when it comes to sufficient address of racism’s violent cornerstones, increased understanding of its conflagration through heroes and literature can foster more comprehensive discussion of its implications, misapplications, and volatile potential.

Keywords: Racism, Imperialism, Victorian Values, Literature, H. Rider Haggard, Africa
Introduction – Of Men and Might

Memorable characters and emotive attributes are not reserved exclusively for fiction. Historical eras also embody these aspects. The Ancient World is magical, mystical, and poignant; the Crusades are gallant and fiercely religious; the twentieth century is simultaneously pockmarked by war and adventure and is constantly shifting; and the list continues. While these epochs are each singular, there is perhaps no era more romanticized or celebrated than the period between Queen Victoria’s ascension to the British throne in 1837 and the early years of her successor King Edward (1910s) — considered emblematic of chivalry reborn.

Victoria is not only known for the morals of her times, but also for her colossal expansion of the British Empire, reaching almost one-quarter of the globe at her death. British imperialism was fueled by a sense of duty to spread British “civilization,” but this and other countries’ similar sentiments reignited and refashioned racism. Though famously difficult to define, here racism is understood as a social construct wherein one group exercises superiority and dominion over another due to various physical or cultural markers. This superiority manifests in action (violent or otherwise), opinion, and policy. Originating in human contact, these measures have governed that contact ever since, leading to violence and societal damage.

Most importantly, racism slowly joined the values championed by Victorian authors. Coupled with immense popularity of their and others’ works, racist literary themes helped perpetuate and fuel the concept, as well as imperialist ideas and policy. With racism on the rise, the masses continued to support the spread of civilization to those who were unfortunate and “knew no better.”¹ This vicious cycle allowed imperialism and racism to gain significant ground, and the latter continued to enjoy soci0-cultural application. Before these authors, however, existed perhaps the best agents of cultural spread — the explorers, missionaries, soldiers, and map-makers who sought to enlighten the darkened corners of the map.

Universal racial resurgence in the Imperial Century hinges on comprehensive analyses of Victorian society, literature, and imperialism, emphasizing African enterprise. This assessment presents over two parts. The first investigates the racial paradigm before shifting to the Victorian era. Also mentioned are the adventures and misadventures of the famous explorers who first charted the Dark Continent, as well as the Zulu Wars and their consequences for African nations and lands.

Part II analyzes the African imperial enterprise’s socio-cultural impact through the lens of the Sherlock Holmes stories and King Solomon’s Mines. Heroic themes and aspects of racial arrogance pulse throughout these narratives, providing insight into the strength of racist thought and imperialist ambitions in Victorian times while also acting as commentary. Exegesis illustrates the nexus between Victorian imperialism and the development of the modern racial paradigm. Understanding this origin point

¹ As a brief note, the term “native” is used throughout this project. Typical negative connotation is not intended, except where noted. It simply represents those peoples who originally populated colonial lands, embodying neutrality and the simple comparison of colonists against those that inhabited the areas they entered.
and its nuances offers more insight into how to approach and improve racially-themed relations.

**Part I: Savagery Silver-Gilt — Race, the Victorians, and Illuminating the Dark Continent**

Rulers have always sought ways to organize and control the populace, presenting state-controlled paradigms to subjects who adopted and absorbed them with little question. One such paradigm, perhaps the most insidious and dismally-forged, is race. Used by the state, race is a human construct, created by authority to precipitate human action toward collective sentiment (unity), which in turn fuels national pride and consequently economic prosperity. Propagation helps disseminate the concept as well, using media, literature, and popular culture.

Like ethnicity and nationalism, race is Janus-faced, entertaining countless definitions and explanations. Benedict Anderson, Anthony Marx, and many other scholars maintain that its origins lie in colonialism, an argument which this paper seeks to clarify and support. In *Imagined Communities*, Anderson explains racism as “the typical solidarity among whites, which linked colonial rulers from different national metropoles.”

Emphasis on solidarity or linkage across countries show racism as a commonality between competing nations, along with economic endeavors in colonial holdings. Anderson elaborates, stating that “[colonial racism generalized] a principle of innate, inherited superiority…conveying the idea that…Englishmen were…superior to the subjected natives.”

During their “imperial century,” Jeremy Paxman’s term in the BBC documentary *Empire*, Britain embodied this sentiment in a massive colonial surge, including the race with Scandinavia for the Arctic and Antarctic in the early twentieth century. By conveying the possession of distant lands and peoples in a superior or darkly paternal way, Britain imposed an identity and stratification structure onto its subjects, highlighting the state’s role in applying and perpetuating racism. Anthony Marx, in *Making Race and Nation*, claims blatantly that “states made race…[by] selling out blacks and reinforcing prior racial distinctions and ideology in order to unify whites [and maintain social order].”

Humans arrive at racial paradigms through an involuntary stratification of others upon first meeting, a process described by Max Weber as “ethnic honor.” Resultant constructed boundaries form the basis of nearly all human conflict, closing this vicious race cycle. Born out of the colonial mindset, which is inherently aggressive, race thrives on division and violence, only to culminate in more abusive forms of human action and surviving as a means to exploit and curtail others’ human rights. In

---


4 Britain controlled 13,700,000 sq mi by 1920. *Empire* (DVD), episode 1, “A Taste for Power.”

   Also, Antarctic exploration was a was only beginning at this point, and the Arctic was nearly charted. Norway’s Roald Amundsen and England’s Robert F. Scot and Ernest H. Shackleton fought over rights to the title of “first man to find the South Pole.” See Larson, Edward J. (2011) *An Empire of Ice*. New Haven: Yale University Press.


their work *Ethnicity and Race*, sociologists Stephen Cornell and Douglas Hartmann state that 19th-century imperialists “concluded [that] superficial differences surely indicated more fundamental differences as well…[which] helped them justify their efforts to colonize, enslave, and sometimes exterminate.” Simply, it was a means of identifying peoples encountered by colonial agents as inferior, biologically and civilly, and was heavily drawn upon to devise social and economic strata. Sir Henry Rider Haggard conveniently sums up imperial enterprise in *Allan Quatermain*, when he (through the titular, iconic character) says that “civilisation [sic] is only savagery silver-gilt.”

With Britain’s imperial expansion came the rapid influx of not only Britons themselves, but also their customs and set of morals. Britons harbored fervent national pride and clung to the belief that they knew how to care for foreign lands better than the natives. Thus, racial arrogance came rather naturally, spurred by Charles Darwin’s Social Theory in his 1874 work *The Descent of Man, and Selection in Relation to Sex*. A.N. Wilson summarizes and quotes Darwin’s findings that “the ‘savages’ who wasted away at the prospect of British colonization…have ‘low morality,’ insufficient powers of reasoning to recognize many virtues, and ‘weak power of self command.’”

Statements like this, embarrassing today, were freely accepted and viewed as truth by Victorians and Europeans at large. It was precisely this idea of superiority that encouraged “civilization” of foreign natives.

Moreover, the Victorian public’s desire for adventure and tales of heroic and chivalrous deeds swelled with surges in literacy and technology. The 1870 Education Act “permitted compulsory schooling for every child among Britain’s thirty-one million people.” The resultant Boarding Schools that popped up across cities were, as none other than Sherlock Holmes put it, “‘Beacons of the future! Capsules…out of which will spring [a] wiser, better England.’” Literacy increased rapidly, newspapers entered the public scene, and telegraph and railway lines connected people as nothing had before. For one of the first times in history, the government was directly accountable for its doings, especially in the imperial enterprise. W.J. Reader states that “[census] reports, returns and statistical tables, the Blue Books and White Papers…became a necessary part of the law-making process.”

Britons became more governmentally involved, and when their rights to see into the apparatus were challenged, uproar ensued.

Akin to the literacy boom was a cartographical renaissance, noted by Sally Bushell in her article “Mapping Victorian Adventure Fiction.” With the vast emptiness of Africa looming, Britons sought to illuminate the Dark Continent. Maps soon became a fixture not only in Victorian culture, but also in contemporary literature, and, as Bushell states, “[also functioned] not only to project the power of Englishmen to
penetrate and possess alien worlds and strip them of their wealth, but also to pose unsettling questions about the moral and ethical nature of such enterprises. 14 Concerned with morality as Victorians were, however, their belief in the civilizing power of their “superior” culture drove impassioned forays into the swaying dunes and breathing jungles of India, Africa, and beyond. As long as there was soil, capital, and souls to gain, imperial enterprise thrived, circulating and crystallizing ideologies like Kipling’s “White Man’s Burden” to reach out and civilize the less fortunate.

Britain’s most famous explorers played a pivotal role in fostering and supporting the newly-emergent racial paradigm. With Britain’s Egyptian ventures already fruitful, the riddle of the Nile’s origin, embedded in the uncharted bowels of Africa, gained ground once again. Africa did not give up the secret easily, however, as demonstrated by the intrepid efforts of what Tim Jeal calls “an idiosyncratic group of exceptionally brave British explorers.” 15 Sir Richard Burton, John Hanning Speke, Dr. David Livingstone, and Henry Morton Stanley would solve the mystery in piecemeal fashion through a series of haggard expeditions characterized by bouts of dangerous disease, incredibly rough conditions, and numerous setbacks due to the collision of British and African cultures.

Richard Burton’s Somaliland expedition, undertaken with John Hanning Speke, was stupendously catastrophic, culminating in a vicious confrontation with an African tribe and no proof of the Nile source. 16 Burton himself harbored fierce racial arrogance, viewing slaves at market in Zanzibar as “lines of negroes [that] stood like beasts…[and] appeared hardly human.” 17 Speke countered this view of Africans as chattel, empathizing for an African woman suffering under potential buyers’ scrutiny at the same market. This contrasting opinion, coupled with other partnership strains during expeditions, fueled these men’s emergent bitter rivalry pockmarked with insult, sabotage, and slander.

Dr. David Livingstone was famous for two aspects of his exploration: crossing the continent (1852-56) and disappearing between 1866-70 — the latter prompting the iconic catchphrase. A fervent missionary, abolitionist, and embodiment of the White Man’s Burden, he viewed his sanctioned 1866 search for the Nile source as “valuable only as a means of enabling me to open my mouth with power among men…to remedy [the] enormous evil [of the slave trade].” 18 Though adamant about expanding British trading opportunities in Africa, he passionately decried the racism and slave trading that came with that territory. His sentiments conveyed an understanding of racism’s imperial origins.

Henry Morton Stanley’s reports home about his adventures in search of Livingstone included violent encounters with Africans that excited the public to no end. His

quintessentially British “Dr. Livingstone, I presume?” has become a colloquialism affecting literature, film, and even exploration history, despite lacking formal proof that it was actually uttered. Britain’s famous explorers transcended mere popularity and entered the realm of myth once their adventures reached the public. However, their actual experiences served not only ideological transformations; they also exposed the once Dark Continent to exploitation.

As more agents arrived on native soil, the more organically the racial paradigm expanded in collective consciousness. In April 1877, Britain formally annexed the Transvaal region, inciting both support and protest. Staunch British shied away from broad imperial conquest, while enraged Dutch Afrikaners denigrated the loss of what they considered their land.

Africans also experienced a shock when they realized Europeans’ true intentions. Gone were the days of faithful porters, guides, and loyal expedition compatriots. Once tolerant and even somewhat welcoming to a point, some Africans now rose up to defend their claim to their homeland. The Zulu Wars from 1877 to 1879 are most indicative of imperial violence as a key underpinning to the racial paradigm raging through imperial powers’ veins.

Once conflict ignited between Africans and Europeans, it was not simply blacks against whites. In Zulu Warriors: The Battle for the South African Frontier, John Laband explains that rather than band together to keep their homeland, tribes maintained ancient rivalries — some even allied with the British hoping to gain favor in the long run. Britons obstructed solidarity by capitalizing on these feuds.

Though murky upon first glance, the impact of the racial paradigm in the Zulu Wars and beyond is massive. Yes, heavy artillery and the Maxim gun hurled the British standard through African hearts, but racism kept the fuses lit. British used their advanced technology and strategy against Africans, knowing that the conflict would be short because of Africans’ inferior tactics and weaponry. Nations like the Zulu clung fiercely to their culture constructs of fair fights on equal terms, an intense warrior ethic, and honor, while Britons quickly and brutally overpowered them. Once the conflicts ended, African combatants suffered the “overturning of [their] old order...[and] forced integration on the conqueror’s terms into a British-dominated sub-continent.” All the blood and deaths of brave warriors could not stay the white hand that snatched up Africans’ homeland.

Racism also manifested in Britain’s treatment of African allies. Laband addresses Britain’s betrayal of African loyalists and their condemnation to “increasingly

---

22 Pakenham and other scholars discuss the Maxim gun and superior technology and warfare tactics.
subservient station in the domineering colonial order.”24 African Inkosi (lord) Mqawe expressed his fury and indignation, crying, “Never more will I fight for the white man…. I have stood out in the fight with my men…and now I find we have been fighting for nothing…. My heart is angry.”25 His rage was but a matchstick in a torrent — Britain’s imperial tide would not be stemmed, and it joined in the other European powers’ colonial deluge.

The Zulu Wars wiped out African solidarity, and allowed coveting countries to further spread the contagions of “civilization” and imperialism. The 1884-5 Berlin Conference produced a “treaty that recognized [Belgian King] Leopold’s rights to operate in the Congo and also agreed to the future claims by [colonizing countries].”26 Africa was carved up without any consideration to its native people — racial arrogance personified. By 1890 Africa was a patchwork of imperial rulers, and the racial paradigm festered within each country’s sphere of influence.

Soon after these very real events, convictions of racial superiority spread like ignited gunpowder, and the emergent racial paradigm began to take on its modern characteristics. As long as this white superiority complex drove the wedge deeper between colonizer and colonized, its invocation in contemporary literature only reinforced differences created by the colonizers, and extensive readership expanded the concept’s reach. Further, since the Education Act was in full force and viable, its first beneficiary generation came of age to consume immensely popular adventure novels, which granted authors’ messages enough weight to influence — however subtly — collective consciousness.

Part II: Scarlet Threads in the Skein of Life — Moral “Canon” Fire of the Victorians

Affinity for their own literature tempered Victorians’ understanding of right and wrong, and they clung to their heroes with a vice-like grip. This section focuses on Victorian works and their commentary on colonialism and racism. Canonical tales like Robert Louis Stevenson’s The Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s Sherlock Holmes stories, and Sir H. Rider Haggard’s King Solomon’s Mines directly commented on imperial enterprise and on the importance of Victorian values to society.27 Shining light into the dismal alleys radiating from bloodied Whitechapel and into the far, dark corners of Britain’s imperial machine, these and other works provided commentary and escape to readers across the “civilized” world.

27 Robert Louis Stevenson, Joseph Conrad, Rudyard Kipling, and Charlotte Bronč are also important and pertinent novelists. Due to limitations of space, author relevance (Conrad has been analyzed extensively) and locale (Kipling writes about India), their works are omitted. Their imperial commentary is superb, however, and can be found in works like The Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde, Heart of Darkness, The Jungle Book(s), and Jane Eyre.
Robert Louis Stevenson’s *The Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde* strove to highlight the evil within all men, and succeeded wildly. Upon its publication in 1886, duplicity, *doppelgängers*, and natural selection were easily applied to character and physicality. Because of this, Victorian notice of this short story was meteoric. Stevenson’s story is first and foremost one of values and character, with Dr. Jekyll representing the pure Victorian man of honor, politeness, and respect. On the other hand, Hyde, “a sort of murderous mixture of timidity and boldness,” is a pure antithesis to Victorian-ness, and his existence within Jekyll shows that evil lives within all men.

Stevenson’s work can also have an imperial-racist spin. Heretofore unexplored, subtle racism appears a handful of times in the story. Recall that Darwin published *Descent of Man* in 1874, twelve years before Stevenson’s work. Darwin claimed that natives subjected to British colonialism (at this time a great portion of which were African) were inferior and incapable of higher thought or proper action. When Hyde’s murder of an MP is described by a witness, she says he used a club to bludgeon the man “with ape-like fury.” African natives were often considered simian, with physical attributes at the forefront of these depictions. Further, Hyde is known to the reader as uncivilized and wrathful. Not only is he the evil side of civilized humanity incapable of clear thinking, he also represents the “Other” — the savage who assaults and kills a white benefactor in cold blood. The subsequent energized hunt for the murderous Hyde echoes the vanquishing of native customs.

Arguably one of the most portrayed literary characters on television or film, Sherlock Holmes is adored the world over and has permeated vernacular culture as likely very few others. He became a beloved character, complete with earnest memorial service and public outcry when Doyle killed him, both of which eventually induced Doyle to contrive a brilliant resurrection.

Social Darwinism and fierce British patriotism often play a part in the Holmesian canon, and imperial mentality is also a recurring theme. In her essay “Anxieties of Empire in Doyle’s Tales of Sherlock Holmes,” scholar Lauren Raheja focuses on three imperial themes present in the Holmes chronicles, including that things or people originating from colonies appear in Britain as a threat. Though her article covers many stories, the most presently applicable are “The Adventure of the Devil’s Foot,” and *The Sign of the Four*.

In “The Adventure of the Devil’s Foot,” Holmes and Watson investigate two murders and two cases of acute insanity in Cornwall. They discover that “the great lion-hunter

28 *Jekyll and Hyde* is a purely masculine tale, implying that the “evil incarnate” is only in men. This is veiled commentary on femininity in Victorian times, echoing W.J. Reader’s statement that women’s “first business [is] to be happy — a sunbeam in the house.” (Reader, W.J. (1973). *Victorian England*. London: Book Club Associates, 14).

and explorer” Dr. Leon Sterndale had brought back a root powder from Africa. This powder had been stolen and used as the murder weapon, but Sterndale eventually found the thief/murderer and forced him to suffer the powder himself. The key is Sterndale’s mastery of *Radix pedis diaboli*, or the Devil’s Foot root — the powder “used as an ordeal poison by the medicine-men in…West Africa.” As an African item given demonic properties, the powder symbolizes the threat of African colonies lacking British influence. Sterndale’s mastery, illustrated by his familiarity with the substance’s properties and his righteous use, justifies Europeans being better-suited to implement African savagery.

The *Sign of the Four* offers one of the most clear examples of superficial and racial representations of blacks or foreigners in the Holmesian canon. In the novel, Bartholomew Sholto is murdered by a poisoned dart, fired by a transplanted Andaman Islander named Tonga. Tonga is described as “a little black man…[with] a great, misshapen head and a shock of tangled, dishevelled [sic] hair. …[T]his savage, distorted creature…[had] features so deeply marked with all bestiality and cruelty.” Tonga’s appearance and likeness to a beast emphasizes white superiority over natives, and puts into relief British ideals of increased civility and the need to “fix” or “deal with” these “savages.” Perpetual “defenders of the empire,” as Reheja calls them, Holmes and Watson expose the British public to the dangers of imperialism, laying bare authors’ warning of the lure of savagery awaiting any imperialist.

In his works, H. Rider Haggard consistently crafted themes of adventure, but is also known for romanticizing treasure and danger, and creating the image of the native worthy of sympathy. Yet, though the reader is faced with several instances of heroic Africans worthy of respect, undertones of white superiority abound. Readers’ ultimate takeaway is the idea of bringing “civilization” to otherwise “barbaric” natives, shoring up the ties between these themes and the burgeoning imperialism-racism paradigm.

In his article “Linguistic Crossings: African Essentialism in *King Solomon’s Mines*,” Matthew Nye shows how Quatermain or his compatriots Curtis and Good embody a space of “racial superiority” in moments of comic or emotional prevalence. Secreting commentary this way increases the subliminal nature of Haggard’s racial address.

During their trek towards King Solomon’s mines, Quatermain calls Umbopa (their Zulu companion) “…a cheerful savage…in a dignified sort of a way, when he had not

---

got one of his fits of brooding…. We all got very fond of him.”

Though there is some respect implied in the comment, language like “fits” and “very fond of him” indicate childlike qualities associated with Umbopa. Thus, even though Africans can be cheerful or brave, they are still considered children, feeding the superiority complex native to the white imperial mindset.

Also illustrative is Quatermain and the party’s continual capitalization on the natives’ superstition to obtain their goals or to protect themselves. When the party has to trust most of their gear, including firearms, to a local, Quatermain catches the man coveting the weapons and suspects that he will steal them, so he threatens to “kill him and all his people by witchcraft….and make the devils in the guns come out and talk to him.”

Quatermain tells the reader that Africans and particularly this “villain” are thoroughly superstitious, showing that these threats would inspire obedience. This usage of African innocence against them highlights Haggard’s veiled message of white arrogance. The Englishmen later abuse their supposed divinity to play to native superstition and ignorance, feigning power over a lunar eclipse to maintain their safety and to attain their goals. Counting on African innocence as given, Quatermain and his companions utilize their privileged knowledge to both navigate their surroundings and adapt to different encounters and interactions. As pioneers, they apply their white mindset to a black land- and people-scape. Though occasionally granted admirable traits like trustworthiness, bravery, and sacrifice, Africans are still considered ignorant and childlike, which invites whites to take advantage.

Readers may notice that Joseph Conrad is thus far absent from discussion, perhaps seeing it as a glaring omission. However, he is arguably the most analyzed imperial author, and so I have deigned to pass by his work, especially the default opus Heart of Darkness, in which Conrad’s protagonist Marlow relays a harrowing tale warning of the dangers of colonialism and “the horror” hiding within Africa. Conrad passes swift and harsh judgment on British imperialism, and remains one of the strongest commenters known today. H. Rider Haggard, an author that is often ignored in critic circles, also targets imperialism in his novels and stories, but through a far less direct approach. This is an important contrast: King Solomon’s Mines and Haggard’s other masterpieces appeared in the thick of imperial conquest (1886-1889), just after Britain jumped feet-first into the African fray and long after the Indian Mutiny. As a result, Haggard had to tread lightly when discussing the perils of imperialism. Conrad, on the other hand, was writing in the early twentieth century, thus granting him the heady tonic of hindsight and the ability to appeal to a more imperially-jaded public.

Haggard, Doyle, and other authors drove home the momentous duty charged to imperialists to civilize the foreign world with their particular brand of British sensibility and values network. Moreover, Doyle mastered the art of giving critique in a thoroughly domestic setting. Holmes and Watson operate predominantly on English soil, yet comment (subtly or bluntly) on England and Empire, effectively supporting opinions on imperial enterprise while remaining within England.

Conclusion

Moored in dominance and arrogance, the impact of race swelled uncontrollably during the imperial surge of the nineteenth century. Invasion, partition, and exploitation of Africa sowed its latent seeds and nurtured it into the irascible weed of today. Nineteenth-century Britain’s nationalistic zealotry and desire to “civilize those less fortunate” fueled imperial expansion, with icons like Burton and Livingstone entering and illuminating the Dark Continent. Reflecting their journals and published journeys, societal culture thrived on rigid principles of heroism and mettle. Contemporary writers such as Doyle, Conrad, and Haggard relied on these and other Victorian values in Adventure Novels, incorporating white superiority over “natives” to rationalize and propagate racial arrogance and the emergent racial paradigm. Snappy prose and exciting action drew in and engaged readers, focusing and refracting hidden commentary onto contemporary society and values. Characters also impacted reader mentality. Any fictional hero with an engaging and heroic personality can become fixed in readers’ minds, so that their values slowly inform the readers’. Or, at the very least, they can help confirm views on governmental practices. In this case, beloved Victorian personas’ indirect championing of the values of adventure, white superiority, and civilizing natives mirrored British imperialism, perpetuating the ideas that supported racism.

Fictional Africans came across as ignorant and inexperienced, traits expanded upon by virtue of their skin color. Victorian and other European colonists saw this widespread “savagery” as native to actual Africans, and therefore applied characteristics like lack of intellect, free will, or innovative ability to the race. Consequently, the notion of racism further developed, and via Victorian writers’ popularity germinated in the European psyche. The sheer magnitude of their readership elucidates not only mass ingestion of their messages, but racism’s broad and unshakeable crystallization into human consciousness.

Coupling history of Africa’s imperial fate with exegesis of contemporary literature highlights the exacerbation of the racial paradigm. Watersheds like imperial enterprise and common values leave the door far ajar when addressing racism’s violent cornerstones, but increased understanding of its conflagration through heroes and popular media fosters more comprehensive discussion of its implications, misapplications, and volatile potential.

Acknowledgements

This project would have never been this polished without continued encouragement from Chapman University’s Dr. William Cumiford. Many thanks are also due to my other readers Dr. Lynda Hall, Blake Meisenheimer, and Valle Cruz, whose appreciated recommendations helped flesh out the interdisciplinary nature of this undertaking. Last, and most assuredly not least, I thank Kathleen Owens for awakening my eternal love for literature and helping me find my passion for delving into its critical innards to divine deeper meaning.
References


Contact email: Laurencruz15@gmail.com
Teaching History or Retelling Ancient Stories with Pictures: 
William Blake and the School Version of Virgil

Mei-Ying Sung, FoGuang University, Taiwan

Abstract
History is not only told by words but also images and objects. This paper looks into the book illustrations of an early 19th-century British school book and their means and purposes for history education. The English poet and printmaker William Blake made a famous set of woodcuts for Dr. Robert Thornton’s *Pastorals of Virgil* (1821) which later became the inspiration for Romantic art. Scholars have observed that Blake’s unconventional engravings caused Thornton’s hesitation and cutting down the blocks to fit the book. The controversial style of Blake’s woodcuts was much discussed and justified by his followers ‘the Ancients’ and modern scholars. In my book *William Blake and the Art of Engraving* (Pickering & Chatto, 2009), I have also discussed an early imitator of Blake’s woodcut which reflects his contemporary aesthetic view. However, the context and motivation of Robert Thornton and his editions of *Virgil* have not been considered fully. This paper asks why Blake’s woodcuts were not considered to fit the book. By comparing the three editions of Thornton’s *Virgil*, I would argue that the 3rd edition was an ‘improved’ version from Thornton’s point of view for publishing and educational purposes. From the observation of the extant woodblocks engraved by Blake (in the British Museum) and other artists used in the Thornton edition (discovered by me in the Huntington Library), one may understand the contemporary contrast aesthetics and the early 19th-century norm for teaching young people history.

Keywords: Blake, Thornton, Virgil, school book, illustration
1. Introduction

History is not only told by words but also images and objects. This paper looks into the book illustrations of an early 19th-century British school book and their means and purposes in education.

Robert Thornton’s *School Virgil* is a school book unknown to most people today. Scholars believe that it is known for one reason alone: the seventeen wood engravings by William Blake that appear in the 1821 edition, *Pastorals of Virgil*.1 The English poet and printmaker William Blake (1757-1827) in his later life made a famous and his only set of woodcuts for Thornton’s *Pastorals of Virgil* (1821) which became the inspiration for artists from Samuel Palmer to Graham Sutherland. However, it is also well documented that Blake’s unconventional engravings caused Thornton’s hesitation about using and eventual cutting down the blocks to fit the book. The controversial style of Blake’s woodcuts was much discussed and justified by his followers ‘the Ancients’ and modern scholars. In my book *William Blake and the Art of Engraving* (Pickering & Chatto, 2009), I have also discussed an early imitator of Blake’s woodcut which reflects his contemporary aesthetic view.

Nevertheless, the context of Blake’s woodcuts and the motivation of Robert Thornton and his editions of *Virgil* have not been considered fully. This paper asks why Blake’s woodcuts were not considered appropriate to the book, what Blake and Thornton’s conflicting aims were. By comparing editions of Thornton’s *Virgil*, I would argue that the 1821 edition with Blake’s woodcuts was a compromised version for Thornton between his educational ideal or personal ambition and financial struggle. From the observation of the extant woodblocks engraved by Blake (in the British Museum) and another artist in the Thornton edition (which I discovered in the Huntington Library), one may understand the contemporary contrast aesthetics and the role of early 19th-century book illustrations in history or classics education.

---

2. Thornton, the publisher

Robert John Thornton was a medical doctor by profession with a passion for publishing botanical books. He was the family doctor of the artist John Linnell, who introduced William Blake to him.

Thornton was best known for his extravagant book the *New Illustration of the Sexual System of Linnaeus* (1799-1807, also known by its 1804 title of *The Temple of Flora*). The huge cost of illustration and printing seriously eroded Thornton’s personal fortune. To the end, he never recovered the losses from *The Temple of Flora* leaving his children on the edge of poverty.²

The *School Virgil* was published at the same time and after *The Temple of Flora*. The first edition published in 1812 has two versions, one with 3 illustrations and the other with 53 illustrations which cost 8 and 12 shillings respectively. In 1814, Thornton published a picture-only edition *The Illustrations of the School Virgil* taking out of the texts and adding the illustrations to 123. The 1821 edition consists of 2 volumes with 230 illustrations. In the last edition, Blake engraved 6 portraits on copper, designed 21 and engraved 17 woodcuts. While the copper engravings are neo-classical in style, Blake’s woodcuts are shockingly unconventional. To the contemporary conventional eye, the dark tone and rough lines look like works by someone with no experience in wood engraving.

3. The controversy of Blake’s woodcuts for Thornton

Under the first woodcut by Blake, Thornton wrote,

‘The Illustrations of this English Pastoral are by the famous Blake, the illustrator of Young’s Night Thoughts, and Blair’s Grave; who designed and engraved them himself. This is mentioned, as they display less of art than genius, and are much admired by some eminent painters.’³

What Thornton meant is that Blake was famous for his design but the cutting skill of this work is inferior.

According to the *Life of William Blake* by Alexander Gilchrist (1863), when Blake ‘sent in these seventeen the publishers, unused to so daring a style, were taken aback, and declared ‘this man must do no more;’ nay, were for having all he had done re-cut by one of their regular hands.…. Doctor Thornton had, …himself, no knowledge of art, and, despite kind intentions, was disposed to take his publishers’ view. However, it fortunately happened that meeting one day several artists at Mr. Aders’ table, -- Lawrence, James Ward, Linnell, and others, -- conversation fell on the Virgil. All present expressed warm admiration of Blake’s art, and of those designs and woodcuts in particular. By such competent authority reassured, if also puzzled, the good Doctor began to think there must be more in them than he and his publishers could discern. The contemplated

sacrifice of the blocks already cut was averted….’

According to the evidence of two surviving proofs now in the British Museum, Blake’s original woodcuts were trimmed on the four edges to reduce the size in order to fit in the book with extra texts underneath each picture.

4. Thornton’s idea of book illustration & education

For Thornton, the illustrations were meant to be educational aids as the subtitle of the book says, ‘in which all the proper facilities are given, enabling youtm[sic] to acquire the Latin language, in the shortest period of time, as words’.5

In the 1814 supplementary volume, Thornton took only the illustrations from the 1812 edition and added some more pictures. He wrote in the preface ‘Address to school-masters, parents, and others’ about the importance and benefits of pictures in children’s learning.

‘The impression made on the memory will also be such as never afterwards to be obliterated; for the new art of memory is by association, …here the words and the pictures correspond as much as possible. Every person must recollect, from his childhood, what an impression even the bad wood-cuts to the Fables in Dilworth’s Spelling-Book created,6 especially where the Huntsman is beating his old faithful Dog. Boys will likewise feel eager to know the meaning of the different cuts, and this will surely spur them on to the diligent reading of the original matter, to which these allude.’7

In the first glance, Thornton’s emphasis on picture is totally justifiable. However, a question about this statement arises: how do the boys associate the pictures with the

---

5 Subtitle for the 1821 edition.
7 ‘Address to School-Masters, Parents and others’, Illustrations to the School-Virgil (1814).
text in this 1814 publication, which has no text attached to the illustration? Was it only intended for purchasers of the original 1812 edition with only 3 illustrations? It is therefore questionable that Thornton’s motivation for publishing the book was really for the sake of education.

In the succeeding paragraph, Thornton mentions Benjamin West, the president of Royal Academy at the time, who believed book illustrations could also encourage children’s love for art.

‘Benjamin West, President of the Royal Academy, thinks such a plan will rouse the British youth to a love for painting; and we could have wished the designs had been more perfect, but the increased expense would then have defeated the intention, and this will apologize with the discerning, for our not making them of a more splendid nature. Even now it is to be feared, that the expense will deter several from the purchase of such a desirable adjunct to Virgil; …’

The reality is Thornton’s lack of finance, which limited his ambition.

5. Thornton’s financial problem & publishing strategy

Looking back at Thornton’s life, the Virgil publications were probably a compromise under his ambition in publishing career under the financial pressure. The first edition of 1812 was published with only a few illustrations probably because Thornton was short of money. Earlier from 1799 to 1807, Thornton spent a huge amount of fortune publishing The New Illustration of the sexual system of Linnaeus in large folios with fine engravings by famous artists and engravers of the time, especially its third part The Temple of Flora with colour plates. Although it was criticized that the book has little scientific value but perhaps showing some romantic aesthetics, the publication won him national and international fame. It was sent to Queen Charlotte and Prince Regent, and to the Emperor of Russia who returned a ring to acknowledge his achievement. Thornton’s ambition was to create a tradition of British botanical publication to parallel Boydell’s Shakespeare Gallery. However, worse than Boydell’s financial failure, Thornton almost drained his inheritance with little return. By 1812, Thornton was struggling with finance and trying to make up with minor publications. He held an exhibition of the botanical illustrations, but did not make enough money by selling the tickets. In 1812, Thornton issued a smaller edition of The Temple of Flora but this did not seem to have many subscribers.

The School Virgil was therefore perhaps Thornton’s venture of another subject on a smaller scale. After publishing the luxurious Temple of Flora, Thornton turned to small and easy reading for children. Juvenile Botany: Being an easy introduction to that delightful science, through the medium of familiar conversation (1818) was written in simple language with conversations between son and father.
Thornton was reusing the materials at hand and made simple versions out of them. Likewise, the publications of school book show a reduced ambition. The School Virgil is small in size, cheaply produced with wood engravings, but still includes works by famous artists and could possibly make a profit.

In the 1821 edition, Thornton in the Address named some designers and engravers of this edition.

‘In order to render this work worthy, as much as possible, of public patronage, and the distinguished honor conferred upon it, by the approbation of the learned, Messrs. Thurston, Craig, Cruikshanks, Blake and Varley, with others of great merit, have been selected for the designs; whilst the most eminent engravers on wood have been employed, as Nesbit, Clennell, Branston, Bewick, Thomson, Hughes, Byfield, Williams, Lee, Mackenzie, and Sears, for the Cuts, so that Boys will now learn Latin with greater facility and pleasure to themselves, deeper impressions be made, and ideas, as well as words, be acquired.’

Bewick was named as an engraver, but none of the illustrations were done by him but by his workshop. Similarly in Thornton’s New Family Herbal (1810), Bewick is advertised on the title page but all the engravings are by workshop. Blake was named as a designer but not engraver though he did engrave both on copper and wood.

The style overall is neo-classical in the earlier editions and became more ornamental in the 1821 edition. However, the mixture of fine and crude illustrations shows that Thornton seemed to have chosen whoever whose fame could help the sale, or whose work was cheaply available.

Blake was, in contrast to Thornton, sincerely opposed to formal and classical education. The reason why Blake participated the project was probably also financial in spite that he had John Linnell as a patron at this time.

6. The woodblock evidence

If we compare Blake’s woodblocks (British Museum) with the block engraved by another hand which was more to Thornton publishers’ taste (Huntington Library, one can detect from the surface that Blake’s cut lines are much more irregular and rough whereas the other hand shows regular and uniform dots and lines. Blake seems to treat the block as a canvas, filling in lines and ‘colours’ (so to speak), rather than cutting away the white areas. It is unique and revolutionary in style and in spirit.

The block used to illustrate page 8 of Volume 2 *School Virgil* (1821) typifies the standard printing block used in a mechanical printing process. The engraving on the recto shows clear contrast of relief and incised lines, the regular white lines popularized by the Bewick School. The top side of the block has stamped into the wood a mechanical number, which would have been done by the manufacturer.

In contrast, the woodblocks Blake used were not standard and he did not engrave on the end-grain as was the practice of Thomas Bewick and his pupils and followed throughout the 19th century. The two proofs of Blake’s *Virgil* before cut separately and cut down in size in the British Museum show that Blake originally engraved on a larger than usual piece of boxwood, simply cut from a tree trunk instead of a standard block from the regular block-makers. This means that the images were quite possibly engraved on the plank side rather than on the end-grain part. They are rightly called ‘woodcuts’ and not ‘wood engravings’ specifically in the 19th century printmaking terminology.
In this aspect, Blake was going back to the old tradition of woodcut instead of following contemporary fashion.

7. Conclusion: Blake & Thornton’s conflicting ideas of education

If both Blake and Thornton shared a financial rather than educational incentive, at least Blake spoke out a visual protest against the classical tradition, whereas Thornton was the embracer of an old world of classical culture. The supposed aim of the School Virgil book is to educate. Whether this is true for Thornton and Blake, the two obviously had very different ideas about it.

Thornton has experience as a lecturer on medical topics & has developed a theory of education centring on the use of visual images to aid learning. William Blake rejected all formal schooling.

‘Thank God, I never was sent to School
To be Flogg’d into following the Stile of a Fool.’\(^\text{15}\)

\(^{15}\) Blake, *Notebook*, p. 42.
References


*Thornton’s Temple of Flora*: with plates faithfully reproduced from the original engravings: and the work described by Geoffrey Grigson; with bibliographical notes by Handasy de Buchanan, London: Collins, 1972.


**Contact email:** maysung70@hotmail.com
The Medical Intelligentsia Life in the Post-revolutionary Russia  
(Doctors Letters Material to Nikolay Semashko)

Kira Bogatyreva, I.M. Sechenov First Moscow State Medical University,  
Russian Federation

Abstract
In the State Archive of the Russian Federation there are many documents, containing  
the doctors' letters arrested by Cheka in 1919-1922. The letters were addressed to N.A. Semashko, the People's Commissar of Health Care of the Soviet Russia. It is more than 200 stories of the doctors and medical workers life during the Civil War and the period of War Communism. In the stories of the events that preceded the arrest, the people, consciously or unconsciously, bring a lot of facts, indicating their life, the relationship with colleagues and with the local authorities. On the basis of this evidence, the professional relationship are analyzed, the response characteristics of ordinary physicians on the current events are given. The aim of this study is to reconstruct a picture of the ordinary doctor world of this time period. Practitioners have been very busy at work and, as a rule, are not interested in politics. Belonging to the doctor's estate was characterized by professionalism and high level of culture. This is often prevented from finding a common language with the new government. After all, they were the workers and peasants by origin and they saw in a doctor not sympathetic or neutral-minded intellectual, but rather a representative of the bourgeoisie. The professional and cultural differences were the reason of mistrustful attitude to physicians from the authorities and, at the same time, became a support, which helped to deal with disadvantaged circumstances.

Keywords: Soviet Russia, the medical intelligentsia, Nikolay Semashko, the Civil War

 iafor
The International Academic Forum
www.iafor.org

1 the All-Russian Extraordinary Commission for Combating Counter-Revolution and Sabotage at the Council of People's Commissars of the RSFSR.
Introduction

The end of the 10ths up to the beginning of the 20ths of the XX century was the time of severe trials for Russia: World War One, the revolution events of 1917, the Civil War entailed a series of social, political and economic problems. The population of the country was on the verge of survival because of hunger and epidemics. An important role in this period belonged to the doctors and medical personnel who resisted adversity.

During the Civil War the graduated doctors were a small section of society. So, before World War I in the country, with a population of about 1 hundred 75 million people, there were about thirty thousand doctors [7, p.624]. A few more specialists involved in medicine were medical assistants, midwives, women doctors, who were singled out for a special category [2]. With the finishing of World War I, and, especially after 1917, the shortage of physicians became particularly palpable. And in 1918-1919 years in the civil department of thirty nine provinces there were about eight thousand five hundred doctors and paramedics, and more than sixteen thousands were at the front.

Not only medical problems had to be dealt with by physicians. During the Civil War, almost any person could be arrested by the Cheka (the All-Russian Extraordinary Commission for Combating Counter-Revolution and Sabotage at the Council of People's Commissars of the RSFSR), headed by Felix Dzerzhinsky.. And belonging to the medical intelligentsia, which was mostly of a noble character, could not but affect the biased attention of the Bolshevik leadership of the Soviet State.

The documents, which led to this study, are related to the activities of the first People's Commissar of the Public Health of the Soviet Russia, Nikolai Semashko. The documents are represented in the State Archives of the Russian Federation (GARF).

N. Semashko's correspondents were arrested doctors, their relatives and members of the Cheka during the period of 1919 up to 1922. [1][2]. These are more than two hundred stories from the life of the people associated with medical activities.

What new can we learn from these letters?

1. The doctors sought to enlist the support of Nikolay Semashko as the head of the People's Commissariat of Public Health. Almost all requests for assistance were not left without N. Semashko’s attention. Most of the cases contain documentary evidence of the doctors’ release (at least from custody) and return to their official duties.

2. Why did N. Semashko help arrested people? This, above all, testifies to the desire of the head of Public Health to cope with the epidemiological catastrophe in which the Soviet Russia was at that time.

We do not know whether the doctors were guilty of these crimes, or not. The documents do not give full information about this. But N. Semashko was not

---

2 The documents are inaccurately dated - the first documents date back to December of 1919.
interested in the degree of their guilt. He was the head of the public health system, in which there were very few employees.

3. The doctors of the materials were quite apolitical. The characteristics that were given to untried physicians both by their defenders and accusers, very accurately characterize their attitude to political life in the country: "... not an active counter-revolutionary, but simply a non-partisan philistine" [1, 110], "... always was completely loyal political." [1, 277].

Doctors did not distinguish between working in a Soviet hospital or in the White Army. These people are so far from the political realities of their time (despite of the fact that they are in the thick of events!), that they did not even notice the facts, which in any such situation and at any time would be interpreted as involvement in treason [1, 244].

4. Doctors from the letters were lonely in their professional activities. Firstly, because they are sorely lacking, one doctor can manage two hospitals - and be the only qualified specialist in them. And there could be a similar situation when a large medical institution was headed by a non-professional. These people had a colossal responsibility, in conditions close to the military, they had to make decisions alone.

They were also lonely as the social elements of society. The most doctors during the revolution and the Civil War existed outside the professional associations. The "Society of Russian doctors in memory of Nikolay Pirogov", the most influential medical organization in Russia before the revolution, opposed the October Revolution at the end of 1917 and was dissolved by 1922. The most doctors were, in mainly, far from big cities, did not communicate with people from their professional environment, and, as a result, they had nowhere to get support. In Vitebsk, Gomel, Tyumen, Porkhov, Rezhitsy, doctors were left alone with their problems [1, 44, 58, 110, 277].

5. It is important to emphasize that the people with pre-revolutionary experience in the Bolshevik Party prevailed among the leadership of the Soviet power. But they were with a low level of education and experience in leadership work very often.

The revolution always contributes to the coming to power of people of dubious moral qualities. Some of them tend to make a career at any cost, others - to deal with their abusers. Such people were in local health authorities too. Apparently, they are connected with warnings of N. Semashko: "I have reason to assume a calumniation" [1, 20], "... intrigue is suspected. Be cautious "[1, 24], et cetera, which appear on the pages of archive documents many times.

Problems could also be connected with the incompetence of the leadership of the Soviets in health care matters. There are voices about the need to introduce experts in cases of specialists' trials, including doctors, because "... medicine and sanitation are just such areas in which everyone considers themselves fully competent, but in reality they understand nothing" 1, 111].
Conclusions

Letters themselves are an extremely subjective source of historical material, and the letters of the accused or arrested are all the more so. Materials of the letters to Nikolay Semashko does not always allow us to see the end of the case of arrested doctors. We can not establish the degree of their guilt or innocence in the offenses and crimes in which they are accused.

The letters reflect all the problems of life in the Soviet Russia at that time - disciplinary, labor, food, problems of interpersonal relations and relations with the organs of the Soviet power. We can see living people who just continued to fulfill their professional duty and which became the foundation of the Soviet health system.
References

1. GARF. F. 482. O.1. D.226 Correspondence with the Cheka about arrests, doctors’ release from the arrest. January 1920 - September 1922. 681 sheets.


3. Latsis, M.I. (1921) Chrezvychaynyye komissii po bor’be s kontrrevolyutsiyey. [Emergency commissions to combat counter-revolution]. Moscow, Gos. Izd-vo. [In Russian].


Contact email: kira-bogatyreva@yandex.ru
Tapoi Katha: A Reconstruction of History through an Odia Folk Travel Narrative

Supriya Subhadarsini Sahoo, Central University of Karnataka, India

Abstract

Considering the question of non-European travels and to rediscover a history on the least explored problematic of Intra-Asian travel by South Asian communities, it is important to both investigate this variety within their particular traditions and histories, and to work towards constructing larger theoretical paradigms that emerge out of the specificities of intra-Asian travel which will obviously provoke discussions on a wide variety of modalities of travel, i.e.: activities ranging from pilgrimages to travel songs to trader migrations within Asia. This paper aims to respond to questions regarding the studies on accounts of travel in primordial Odia folk narratives of origins and nomadic peregrinations which has its own cultural history and tries to explore the specific modes, motives, motifs and conditions that propel travel within an intra-Asian geography and to commemorate the then overseas glories, in an Odia folk tale, Tapoi Katha and the creation and continuation of many such folklores, traditions and rituals since the glorious maritime history and trading culture of Odisha portray the medieval Kalingans’ great expertise in sea voyage and trade links and commercial as well as cultural relationship across the south-east islands and the interrelation amongst Asian cultures and the continuation of customs based on the history of Odia culture.

Keywords: History, folk tradition, Intra-Asian travel narrative
The burgeoning field of travel writing as an academic enquiry and many societies around the world confronting complex issues of globalisation, cultural hybridisation and the large-scale flow of population both within and across national borders, it is impelling to historicize and theorise these and related phenomena that has directed attention to how knowledge of other regions and societies is acquired and circulated and the different forms of interaction and exchange that can exist between cultures (Thompson 2016: 28). A great majority and variety of Indian travel writing in its diverse forms published by the Indian language press, remains little known in terms of inaccessibility of material, linguistic diversity, boasting significant literary traditions (Bhattacharji 2016: 337). The long Indian tradition has encompassed many different itineraries and motives for travel. According to Sumerian sources the Indian subcontinent had trade links with Mesopotamia as early as the third century BCE when trade and diplomacy became linked, the Mauryan Emperor Ashoka despatched emissaries to parts of Asia and to the Eastern Mediterranean and around this period navigators also learned to harness the monsoon winds to sail which led to an extensive maritime trade between the Red Sea, southern Arabia and the coasts of peninsular India and thus the Indian traders also explored over land routes to Rome through Afghanistan, Persia, and Eastern Mediterranean and there were exchange of elephants and precious stones as gifts, spread of Buddhism, silk trade, Chola kings’s commercial link with southeast Asia (ibid 335-338). India’s great mythological epics also preserve traces of travel and of geographical knowledge. Unlike much modern travel writing, many poems of real or fictional travel during this period have mixed facts with fictions. Elements of travel writing also exist in fictional accounts that later inspired several folk songs with verbal maps and descriptions of seasons, places, people and patterns of life (ibid 342).

This paper will consider the nature of travel accounts and its importance as historical sources which is a recent scholarship on travel writing that was fuelled by post-colonial interventions in literary, anthropological and historical analyses. The aim, however, is not to touch upon the tired colonial/postcolonial studies but to begin an entirely new conversation on the unexplored problematic of intra-Asian travel by South Asian communities. With the region’s communal, religious, demographic, and linguistic varieties, travel pursuits and imaginaries are quite heterogeneous, and largely impervious to the Western model that has obscured travel studies so far (Modes, Motives, Motifs, and Conditions in Intra-Asian Travel). The scope of the paper is ambitious as it will provoke discussions on accounts of travel in primordial folk narratives of origins and trading peregrinations and a wide variety of modalities of travel: activities ranging from travel songs to trader migrations to folk narrative within Asia/in Odisha, India which unravels a whole new archive of Odia folk travel narrative. The paper investigates one of these varieties within its age old particular tradition and history and works towards constructing larger theoretical paradigm that emerges out of the specificities of Odia folk travel narrative which also opens fresh archival and theoretical resources for the study of travel and understand the modes, motives, motifs, and conditions that propel travel within an intra-Asian geography.

The idea of travel has always fascinated the Indian imagination which is evident from the various accounts of places and people in Indian folk narratives, epics, chronicles and plays (Satchidanandan 1). In ancient times people travelled for diverse reasons: war, pilgrimage, administration, which gave rise to many forms of travel related texts. Many medieval travel texts are a curious blend of the factual and the fabulous tracing
the beginning of the genre of travel writing in prehistory as there are vestiges of older oral tradition apparent in some of the earliest written treatments of the travel theme both in Western and Eastern literatures, such as the *Epic of Gilgamesh* (c. 1000 BCE), Homer’s *Odyssey* (c. 600 BCE), the *Mahabharata*, the *Ramayana*, the Upanishads and the Biblical books of Genesis and Exodus (Journey of Flowing Genres: Novels and Travelogue 34-35). Travel writing has flourished though the ages, and early travel accounts continue to be valued as a significant source of information about history of cultures, people and places (Joshi and Bhatt 2014: 60).

As the perspectives of travel narrative broadened the narratological practices of the discipline, its implicit literary form came into sharper focus where it has re-emerged with enduring relevance for the new possibilities within history. In *Rethinking History*, Keith Jenkins says that the logic of history writing in this era of rethinking is not of discovery, but one of construction (2003: 1). Travel writing is one of the genres that has endeavoured to utilise various narrative and academic principles and demonstrate a propensity to contribute a new and valuable form of history writing or a reconstruction of history. The travel accounts fictionalize, trivialize, and romanticize people, events, and movements through subjective interpretation and immersion to create a narrative for the reader that is intentionally directed (Stubbs 2014). As Robert F. Berkhofer says, any sort of history is a textual construction (1995) and this paves way for travel writing being a key genre in the rethinking of historical expression. Now that history writing faces its own period of rethinking, it prompts the question of whether travel writing through its dynamic and embedded nature can contribute in history writing.

Ancient Odisha’s most intensive periods of globalization between the sixteenth and twentieth centuries is a point of cultural contact zone between different South Asian countries and parts of the West. Mary Campbell suggests that “the travel book is a kind of witness: it is generically aimed at the truth” (1991: 2-3). Travel writings aimed to communicate “the truth” about Kalinga (Odisha) as it is related to the experiences of the people who travelled and the needs of the societies (and economies and polities). To write travel was to make use of a key cultural technology that helps enable more concrete forms of global connection between Odisha and the wider world. Whether enabling commerce, conquest, or conversion, travel writings laid the informational basis for subsequent interactions. Travel writing, then, both participated in and documented the larger transformations of historical geography, so connecting this paper’s culturalist approach to the “more familiar framing of the region through commerce and geopolitics” (Green 2013: 1-3), documenting a process in cultural history by which the then Kalinga was transformed into a textual space that was understood through the various discursive models.

The acceptance of the plurality of histories beyond simply a scientific rendering, allowed for alternative perspectives. Other developments include the recognition of the importance of oral history and also a form of cultural history which allowed the subjective and immersed perspectives of history to gain attraction. Besides the writings of Pliny and Ptolemy, the *Periplus of the Erythraean Sea*, Kautilya’s *Arthashastra*, the Jataka tales and other Buddhist texts make ample reference to the maritime trade and industry of ancient Odisha. Archaeological findings from the Sisupalgarh reveal that ancient Kalinga (Odisha) had trade relations with the Roman Empire in the ancient times and the Kalingan sailors were depicted as
Kalingosahasika (the brave Kalingans). Odisha established maritime relations with the far-off south-eastern lands of Java, Sumatra, Bali, Sumatra, Borneo, Malaya, Burma, Cambodia and Indo-China. In the Raghuvamsa, Kalidas has referred to the king of Kalinga as ‘Mahodadhipati’ (the king of ocean), Sarala Das in the Mahabharata, Narasimha Sena in his Parimala Kavya, Yosawant Das in Tika Govinda Chandra, Upendra Bhanja in Lavanyavati and Dinakrushna Das in Rasa Kollola have used the terms related to maritime terms like: ‘Boita’

‘Naha’, ‘Sadhaba’, ‘Sadhabani’, ‘Manga’, ‘Nabika’ etc. and islands like Sri Lanka, Java, Bali, Subarna Dwipa, Bramhadesh etc. The Araya Manjusri Mulakalpa, a Mahayana text refers to the Bay of Bengal as the Kalinga Sea. Many of the ancient texts mention ‘Kalinga Sahasika’ while referring to the brave sons of Kalinga. Odia literature was greatly influenced by its maritime activities as there are references of sea-voyages in Lavanyavati and Vaidehisa Vilasa of the celebrated Odia poet Upendra Bhanja; Dinakrushna Das in Rasakallola speaks about overseas trade and ship wreck by storm; Kavya Parimala by Narasimha Sen also refers to Odias’ trade and commerce with Ceylon. Archaeological findings, literary sources, epigraphic evidences, art and sculptural remains of Odisha emphasize on these ports, ship-building activities and their trading and cultural contacts with other countries. The port towns around Chilika lake (Odisha) had established their cultural and commercial contacts with Ceylon, Java, Sumatra, Borneo, China, Rome and African countries during the early centuries of the Christian era (Odisha Institute Of Maritime And South-East Asian Studies). Kalinga’s sea trade and cultural relations with Bali, Sumatra, Borneo and Indonesia has traces in the rock carvings at the Puri Jagannath temple. The famous ports of ancient Kalinga were: Tamralipti, Palur, Pithunda, Gopalpur, Chelitalo, Manikpatna etc.

Overseas trade is an important element of the history of Odisha. The vast literary texts of the early and medieval phase and Odia traditional customs and folk songs provide ample evidence on these spectacular maritime activities. The Odia Mahabharata by Sarala Das in the 15th century AD, Prastava Sindhu by Dinakrushna Das and many other Odia literary texts of the late medieval period provide unmistakable evidence on the maritime trade and the ship building activities in early and medieval era. Numerous references to sea voyages can be found in the stories, folk tales and songs; traditional festivities, religious activities which have contained through generations of Odia people are of a more substantial nature and afford more reliable proofs of sea voyages.

Among the several components that support and enrich the cultural heritage of a place, folklore is one such important parameter in which there are traces of our culture, tradition, and values and beliefs. It communicates the moral codes and ethics of a bygone society, and provides the present social order a window into the past (Nayak and Mohanty 2013: 1). According to Stuart Lackbur and Maria Leach, “Folklore is the generic term to designate the customs, beliefs, traditions, tales, magical practices, etc. (1984). Trilochan Pande explains folklore as one of the most important and effective instruments of social engineering (1971). Tapoi folk song-story that has formed a base for one of the popular religious festivals of the Odia community practiced by unmarried girls who keep a brata (fasting) on Sundays in the Bhadrav month for the well-being of their brothers and future husbands. The story is a fictional account on the socio-cultural and religious ethos of the Odia sadhaba community as it has multiple references to the ancient maritime activities that once
formed a crucial part of Kalinga’s history and culture. The Tapoi folk song is written in Odia language in the form of a text namely Bruhat Tapoi which has five adhyayas. In Odisha unmarried young girls of all castes, perform a brata (fast) called Khudurukuni Osa on every Sunday in the month of Bhadrav in honour of the sea goddess Mangala based on the folk tale of Tapoi, the daughter of an Odia sadhaba.

For example, 
In Odia:

> Aditya bara aji huye

> Hoyiba mangala osaye (Bruhat Tapoi 1).

English translation:

> Today is the auspicious day

> Mangala fast will be celebrated.

The prevalence of the folk story throughout Odisha and its incorporation in the Khudarkani Osa festival prove evidence of the then sea voyages. In the ancient times, all sailing ships used to leave the foreign ports the day after Diwali in the month of Kartika when the South Western monsoon waves cross the Bay of Bengal which is favourable for sea voyages towards the South East Asian countries. The Sadhaba wives used to do bandapana (worship) of the boyita before sailing by waving lights and blowing conch. To commemorate the old tradition the akasa dwipa (sky-lamp) is lit all throughout Kartika month which is an indication of good will for the sailing ships and these lamps were also termed as bidaya bati (farewell lamp). Till this date, on the occasion of Kartika Purnima, handmade colourful boats are floated in the local water reservoirs, recollecting the past maritime glory. Since the Christian era till the Somavansi period before 12th century AD, maritime activities by the Odia sadhabas, led to the inception of many trading centres and ports in the Far East and Malaysia. For example, Ptolemy’s Geographike Huphegesis (ca AD 150) refers to Palura. The adventurous mariners established commercial, socio-cultural and political connection with South East Asian countries, Sumatra, Java, Thaton and Pegu in Burma and arts of Malay Peninsula. The maritime traditions of the Odias have been preserved in the legends, folk songs and continued as part of a living tradition, cultural institution in the present day Odisha. Tapoi Katha, Khudarkani Osa, Bali Jatra and Boita Bandana, are commemorative traditions of ancient Kalingan maritime heritage. As a continuation of the old tradition and in reminiscence of the glorious sea-voyages in the past, an annual festival is observed on the Kartika Purnima when the people irrespective of caste and creed throng on river banks or on the edge of tanks to float tiny boats made of paper, banana peels with dwipa (lamp), pana (betel leaf), gua (betel nut) chanting joyously ‘A Ka Ma Boi’. Bali Yatra at Cuttack held on this occasion marks the hey-day of sea-voyage undertaken through the ports of Kalinga (Ghadai 62-64).

*Tapoi Katha*, a careful account of typical Odia landscape, habits, deities, manners, temples, belief system, is one of the most popular folktlores of eastern India, Odisha gives a broader picture of the past maritime activities and modes of travel and the creation and continuation of related cultural-religious practices in the region.
For example,

In Odia:

“Boite jauacchu ambhe gharasambhali thiba tumbhe
Dekha he daibarakrutya pita sangarare gale mata
Jemante jhia na jhuriba semante seba karuthiba
Bhojana karaiba ani kahi apurba rasa bani
Dolire doli panchaiba nimise helana kariba” (Bruhat Tapoi 3)

English translation:

We are going away sailing on the boat, take care of the household
See the Lord’s plans, our father along with mother died
Take care of the girl as she does not cherish us
Feed her by saying caring and assuring words
Make her swing and we will come back soon.

The folk song highlights the typical Odia sadhaba family and their trading activity and commercial success which is mentioned in Bruhat Tapoi as follows,

In Odia:

“Jaucha jebe banijyare anithibati alankare
Ke bole mora suna chudi anithibati ratna jhadi
Ke bole hirara basani mohara pain thiba ani
Ke bole subarna kankana aniba moh a nimantena
Ke bole astharatna tara ke bole khanja moti hira
Ke bole hira malli kadhi uttama rupe thiba ghadi
Bhainki bole Tapoyi Mo pain hirara kandhai” (Bruhat Tapoi 3)

In English translation:

When you are going for trade, bring us jewellery and ornaments
Someone says bring me gold bangles with jewels on it
Someone says bring me diamond nose ring
Someone says bring me eight precious stones and a pearl and diamond studded star
And Tapoi asks her brothers to bring her diamond dolls.

Mary Louis Pratt suggests that India has several ‘contact zones’ that is “social spaces where disparate cultures meet, clash and grapple with each other, often in highly asymmetrical relations of domination and subordination” (1995: 4-5). History is not a stable narrative of the past, but a fluid collection of competing narratives that continues to change and expand as it is revisited (Dean 2009: 2). Any attempt to deal with travel writing is inevitably related to the history and detailed consideration of the motives implied in travel as those are the accounts of cultural documentation. According to Roy Bridges, a sense of pressure grew due to discoveries and explorations of lands which tend to make travel writing more precise and scientific but also more obviously utilitarian, more explicitly concerned with issues of trade, diplomacy, and prestige (qtd. in Youngs 2013: 55). According to Jerry H. Bentley, in a way all historical thinking and writing deal with travel accounts as these are not just windows to foreign societies but also reflects back on the values of their own authors, literatures and cultures (Bentley 2004). Considering the importance of travel accounts as historical sources and the nature of travel accounts, their historical influence, their
meaning as expressions of their times, and the problems they raise as historical sources Bentley, takes a new approach, drawing on travel accounts to illuminate processes of cross-cultural communication and exchange in pre-modern times (ibid 1993). Such historical revision is a re-envisioning of the past and the present. History is not a linear sequence of events but a story whose truth depends on the expectations and assumptions of the discursive community in which it is created. Native voices are truer representations of their own past, present and future realities because they only best understand their own experiences by reimagining the past and reconstructing it (Dean 2009: 4-5). Odia oral travel folk song Tapoi Katha ‘reimagines’ and ‘reconfigures’ its historical past in order to envision ways for a reconstruction of history. Because stories create reality, stories of a people, by a people must be taken into account for an informed understanding of each community. The most reliable authority is that which represents itself (ibid 5) and the alternative strategies include counter-discourse and oral traditions as Lindeman Nelson writes, the stories found lying about in our culture that serve as summaries of socially shared understandings (Nelson 2001). The dominant narrative of history which reduces reality to a stable cultural frame, suggests that history and identity are always in flux. The natives see a place as it relates to local histories and personal stories and a place can have meaning and be known only by the claims to knowledge that people hold which influence their epistemologies and ontologies (Dean17).

Remembering the Odia maritime pride, famous Odia poet Gopabandhu Das writes, In Odia:

“Kahin gala purba Odia boyita?
Kahin se uddama sangita?
Jala pathe kahin bidesa gamana?
Kahin purba khyati kahin purba dhana?
Kathare rahichi sabu aji jaye
Sadhabani bohu boyita bandaye” (qtd. in Pradhan 147).

English translation:

Where is the ancient Odia boat?
Where are those exciting and energetic songs,
Travel to the foreign lands across the seas?
Where is the old pride and wealth?
All those are alive in our folk culture
Merchhant daughter-in-law worshipping the boat.

Like Tapoi’s story, the story of Odisha’s sea trade culture is also mentioned in various other Odia folk stories. On the occasion of Khudurukuni Osa festival, young village girls draw alpana₁⁵ of a sea sailing boat and worship goddess Mangala₁⁷ by placing Her on it for avoiding disturbance in family as per traditional belief system which has a reference to Odisha’s maritime tradition, during which there used to be long-time absence of the sea traders and to avoid mishap during their voyage (Mansingh 43).

The Tapoi folk song is written in standard Odia language which suggests that it was written during sixteenth or seventeenth century. The reference to the goddess Mangala in it suggests that worshipping the goddess started in the twelfth and fourteenth century in Odisha. This also has reference to the goddess Tara in the Buddhist religion, who is a sea goddess and there are many Tara temples found the port regions in Odisha. In the folk song there is a reference to Tapoi’s father Tanayabanta
mentioning about Jambudwipa (ancient name of India) who was a sadhaba (merchant).

In Odia:

Prathame Jambudwip e sara  
Bedhichi labana akara (Bruhat Tapoi 2).

English translation:

Firstly it is in Jambudwipa  
Surrounded by salt sea.

The prayer to goddess Mangala is also called as Bhalukuni Osa or Khudarkani Osa which explains the fact that in older times small ports were mentioned as ‘kona’ (corner) and the word ‘khudarakani’ is derived from the word ‘khudrakoni’ (small corner) through the evolution of language. English ethnographer James Hornell states, “When newly built boats are first launched, elaborate puja ceremonies are performed, that is connected with the worship of the Sea-goddess Kanniamma (sea Goddess)”. Thus the then local life was reflected in the ancient Odia folk culture. The maritime trade has been well documented in various other Odia folk stories, folk songs and local rural culture since generations together which is still part of its custom especially the coastal regions in Odisha. The tradition of lighting the Akasa Dwipa (sky lamp) in the evening and the drawing of alpana of a sailing boat on the front yard of every Odia household in the entire Kartika month and putting the household artefacts on it, pretending those as the sailing items and worshipping it in the morning are reminiscent of the glorious past when the wives of Odia Sadhabas use to pray before their husband’s safe sea voyage and trade. Another festival called Boyita Bhasana is also celebrated on the pious Kartika Purnima when the men and women sail handmade boats in local water reservoirs singing the song ‘Aa ka Ma Boi, Pana Gua Thoi Pana Gua Thori, Masaka Dharama Mora’ reminiscing the Sadhabas’ sail off to distant islands, starting their journey on Kartika Purnima to take advantage of favourable winds which start blowing around this time. The women of the community bid them farewell by singing ‘Aa Ka Ma Boi’ which symbolizes three months i.e. Aswina, Kartika and Margashira in Odia calender. Bali Jatra (journey to Bali), a fair is held on the banks of the river Mahanadi in Cuttack (eastern Odisha).

We get glimpses of the sea-faring merchants and their trading activities from diverse socio-historical sources in Odisha. The Odia literary and socio-cultural history and folk tradition also serves as a source material being embedded within its contemporary social systems, religious and cultural practices. Folklore provides unique and effective source of information for the better understanding of a specific socio-cultural history of a community. Thus, this particular folklore evidently represents the socio-cultural ethos of the then Odia merchant community. Odia maritime traditions have been preserved in the legends and continued to be remembered through its specific cultural institutions till date. Beautifully guarded within the native community through oral transmission, those traditions cover a wider area of practical historical reconstruction which includes an important part of Odia history, literature and culture. Thus it is evident that, overseas trade and commerce had a tremendous impact on the social, political, economic and cultural life of the Odias. Such folk travel narratives allow us to map the cultural dimensions of its earlier geopolitics and accounts of travel serves as a medium for cultural documentation. Travel writings served in this process as a cultural technology that
aided the incorporation of the region into larger global developments on politics and culture. Thus the paper shows in fine detail the role of travel writings in both recording and enabling ancient Odisha’s incorporation into global history as the region was tied not only politically but also culturally into a wider world. In creating these various representations, accounts of travel serve as discursive agents in helping shape strikingly variant images of ancient Odisha in its complex and connected history. Through such “new evaluations of artefacts and ruins, travel and writing provided the ideological resources for the construction of national identities and political claims” that linked then Kalinga to other South Asian countries and parts of the West (Green 25).

Notes

1. Kalingans are the people of Kalinga (ancient Odisha).

2. Boita in Odia means larger boat and ship, built in ancient Kalinga kingdom

3. Naha in Odia means small boat or ferry.

4. Sadhaba in Odia means merchant.

5. Sadhabani in Odia means wife of a merchant.


7. Nabika in Odia means sailor.

8. Ceylon King Tissa of Ceylon had sent four envoys to the court of emperor Ashoka who came and went through his port. Ashoka arrived at the island of Ceylon and converted Tissa into Buddhism. Sanghamitra, the daughter of Ashoka sailed from this port to Ceylon with the sacred ‘Bodhitree’.

9. Tamralipti (modern Tamluk in the Midnapore district of West Bengal) served as the main gateway for ancient Kalingan innumerable sea-going traders travellers and missionaries. Ptolemy in the second century AD called it as ‘Tainilotis’2. Tainilotis’. Tamralipi was counted to be Buddhist centre and an important sea port on the east coast of ancient India from which people travelled to China, Ceylon and South East Asia.

10. Palur which is identified with modern village of Palur on the coast of Bay of Bengal in Ganjam District. The Greek author Ptolemy in the middle of the 2nd century AD refers to Palur as a flourishing port of the Kalinga. Dantapura, mentioned in the Buddhist and Jaina text, is perhaps same as Palur since ‘Palla’ and ‘Ur’, the two terms in Tamil indicate the meaning tooth (Danta) and city (Pura).

11. Pithunda was another important port of Kalinga. The Jaina text Uttarakhyana Sutra mentions that being a famous centre during the time of Mahavir, merchants from Champa used to come to this place for trade. Kharavela’s Hatigumpha inscription mentions Pithunda as metropolis of Kalinga. Sylvain Levi located Pithunda to south of Pallur near Chicacola and Kalingapatanam. Che-li-ta-lo
(Chhatra) as described by famous Chinese pilgrim Hiuen Tsang, was another port situated on the sea coast of Odra desha (North Odisha). He states that this town was the resting place for the sea traders and it contained four Buddhist stupas in its neighbourhood.

12. Gerini, the researcher on Ptolemy’s geography further refers to a port, south from where ships sailed to Subarnabhumi (Burma) and Subernadipa. This port has been identified with Gopalpur, a sea coast in Ganjam district, Odisha.

13. Manikapatna, located close to the present Chilika lake (Odisha), is regarded as a sheltered port of ancient Odisha. Recent excavations brought to light rouletted ware, fragment of amphora etc. indicating contact with Roman Empire in the early centuries of the Christian era. The discovery of celadon ware and a coin of Sahasamalla, king of Srilanka shows trade relation with China and Srilanka in the early medieval period. Abul Fazal, the court historian of Akbar, mentions Manikapatna as a large port where salt dues were collected during his time.

Kalinga and Subarnadwipa: the islands of Bali, Java, Sumatra, Borneo and Malaya were collectively known as Subarnadwipa with which Kalinga had commercial, colonial and cultural relations. Legends and local traditions of Java mention that “20,000 families were sent to Java by the prince of Kling; these people prospered and multiplied”. The term ‘Kling’ is evidently derived from Kalinga. The three generations of Klings of Kalinga race ruled over Java for a period of four hundred years. In the 12th Century A.D., the king of Java named Jayabhaya or Jaya Baya has recorded the above legend. During the period from 2nd century A.D. to 7th century A.D. both Brahmanic Hinduism and Buddhism were two flourishing religions of Subarnadwipa. During that period, the literatures, architecture and social customs of India deeply influenced the people of this region. In the 6th century A.D. a Hindu king named Purna Varman ruled over Western Java and his inscriptions state that his father dug a long canal named as Chandrabhaga from his capital to the sea. It is possible that the canal was named after the river Chandrabhaga (near Konark) in coastal Odisha. Many such Hindu names were used in Java in those days. The Kalingan influence on Subarnadwipa reached its zenith in 8th century A.D. The Sailendra empire sprang up during this period which included Java, Sumatra, Malayan peninsula, Borneo and Bali. The contemporary Chinese and Arab historians are of opinion that the Sailendras of Subarnadwipa were the descendants of the Sailodbhaba dynasty that ruled over Odisha in the 7th century A.D. The rulers of the Sailendra dynasty were Buddhist. Under their influence Buddhism became the state religion of the entire Subarnadwipa. The contact between Kalinga and Simhala dates back to the 5th century B.C. According to the Buddhist chronicles of Ceylon Mahavamsa and Dipavamsa Prince Vijaya, son of king of Simhabahu of Simhapura (a famous city of Kalinga) had been to Ceylon and became the first king of the island. His grandmother was the daughter of the king of Kalinga. Sanghamitra, the daughter of Ashoka along with eight Buddhist families sailed from Tamralipti to Ceylon to preach Buddhism. Those Kalinga families settled there permanently and preached Buddhism. The Ceylonese chronicle Chulavamsa also states that king Vijayabahu (1054 A.D. to 1109 A.D.) married a Kalinga princess named Trilokasundari and made her his chief queen. The Chinese sources reveal that there existed close commercial and cultural relations between Kalinga and China. The sea-route from Kalinga to China passed through Simhala and Java. According to the Chinese sources a famous Kalingan scholar
named Subhakara visited the Court of the Chinese Emperor Husan-Tsung and translated the Buddhist text Mahavirochana Sutra into Chinese language. The discovery of celadon ware from the excavations of Manikpatna and Chinese coins along with China ware from Khalkpatna indicate the maritime contacts of Odia people with China. It is believed that the merchants of Odisha carried diamonds, costly stones, ivory, spices, medicines and fine cloth to China. The discovery of Roman coins at Bamanghaty in Mayurbhanj (Odisha) and Vizagapatnam (Andhra Pradesh) which were within the boundaries of ancient Odisha, prove that Kalinga exported goods to Rome and brought the Roman coin in return. On the rock sculpture of the Sun temple at Konark, there are giraffes on it which could be a proof of the export of these animals from Africa by the Odia merchants. Thus, Kalinga’s contribution to the other cultures, particularly to South East Asia is quite significant (See Ghadai 2009).

14. Bhadrav is the sixth month in a traditional Hindu lunar calendar that corresponds to August/September in the Gregorian calendar.

15. Kartika month holy month in Odia calendar. Kartika Purnima is the full moon day in the Kartika month.

16. Alpana is a colourful motif, sacred art or handmade drawing which is made with a paste of rice and flour on auspicious occasions in Odisha and other south eastern states of India.

17. Mangala is a local Goddess in Odisha who is believed to bring in wellbeing and peace.

Acknowledgements

I am immensely grateful to IAFOR and ECAH 2017 team for everything in this journey.
References


**Contact email:** sahoosupriya078@gmail.com
Abstract
Village life and community, the sense of belonging to the ‘place’ they live in, the events of history they observed as an individual and as a community, the thread of nostalgic moments interlace the several generations altogether. The past belongs not to Individuals but to the group who constantly redefined it as means to control the everyday present. Today it is almost impossible to read contents in the field of history that do not mention the phrase “collective memory” or its supplementary equivalent “narrative”. Indeed, the twofold manifestation of these phrases is in no way coincidental. The text chosen is Tarashankar Bandyopadhyay’s Hansuli Banker Upakatha, or The Tale of Hansuli Turn. Change of time is inevitable and so is the change in people and their way of life. The “Upokotha” (fables) of Hansuli Bak is a tussle between stagnation and mobility. The author portrays a complex transition in which a marginal caste fragments and mutates under the pressure of local and global forces maintaining a sympathetic outlook to the desires of both older and younger generations. The use of the ‘place’, community and the experience in relation to different generation’s shifts with the change of narrative point of view from the marginalized aboriginals to landowning caste and even a tree or a city space or a barren island becomes the markers of locality and memory. And nostalgia is the dominant principle that binds together the collective experience and memory of the group.

Keywords: Memory, Place, History, Community, Narrative
Introduction

Village is an umbrella term associated with a whole lot of other phrases like community, society and people with their uniqueness of culture and tradition. And with community come their tradition and rituals, their festivals and celebrations, language and other modes of expression, the economic and social condition, intricated with caste discrimination and how it controls their modes of expression and everyday life. Despite the volume and intricacy of the social group, the group needs to build and maintain an identity that unites its members. A social group’s identity is constructed with narratives and traditions that are fashioned to give its members a sense of community. Collective thought required individuals to physically and spiritually bond together to create a mutual experience which was shared within the community. As Durkheim claimed that the collective effervescence provided the transmission of the past to the present and the stress on shared thought was based upon individual memory and the celebrations triggered those memories. Memory has an operational role, in both the marketing of the development and in the creation of the place and all its associated values. A place where memories of a lifetime are made, it’s more than a home; it’s a group rich with traditional charm and an eye on the future. Thus ‘memory’ and ‘community’ are marked jointly. The rituals, incidents, festivals or celebration bridges the relationship of memory, particularly in its collective form and its ability to create a sense of ‘identity’ and ‘community’.

The text that is chosen for this particular study is The Tale of the Hansuli Turn (Bengali: Hansuli Baker Upokotha) by Tarashankar Bandopadhyay.

Theme of the Text in Reference

Hansuli Baker Upokotha is a novel by Tarashankar Bandopadhyay. Set in 1941, this novel explores the life in rural Bengal, the realities of the Zamindari system that was responsible for much of the social inequalities in Bengal, and as well as the changes in social perceptions with time. A terrifying sound disturbs the peace of Hansuli Turn, a forest village in Bengal, and the community gashes as to its meaning. Is it portent that the apocalyptic departure of the gods is near or is there a more rational explanation? The Kahars belong to an untouchable "criminal tribe", the inhabitants of Hansuli Turn soon to be epically transformed by the effects of World War II and India's independence movement. Their leading man, Bonwari, advocates the ethics of an older time, but his fragile philosophy proves no match for the overpowering machines of war. As younger villagers led by the rebel Karali look for other meanings and a different way of life, Bonwari and the village elders come to believe the gods have abandoned them.

While the two sections struggle, codes of authority, religion, sex, and society begin to break down, and amid deadly conflict and natural disaster, Karali seizes his chance to change his people's future. Sympathetic to the desires of both older and younger generations, Tarashankar Bandyopadhyay depicts a difficult transition in which a marginal caste fragments and mutates under the pressure of local and global forces. The novel's handling of the language of this rural society sets it apart from other works of its time, while the village's struggles anticipate the dilemmas of rural development, ecological and economic exploitation, and dalit militancy that would occupy the centre of India's post-Independence politics.
Negotiating the colonial depredations of the 1939--45 war and the oppressions of an agrarian caste system, the Kahars both fear and desire the consequences of a revolutionized society and the loss of their culture within it. Lyrically rendered by one of India's great novelists, this story of one people's plight dramatizes the anxieties of a nation and the resistance of some to further marginalization.

The Original Author and His Times

Tarashankar Bandyopadhyay (1898–1971) is one of the main figures in twentieth-century Bengali literature, the author of more than fifty novels and hundreds of short stories. Tarashankar was born into a prosperous Bengali Brahmin landowning family in the rural town of Labhpur, Birbhum, Bengal. For most people at Labhpur, life begins and ends with the magic of Tarashankar Bandyopadhyay. They nurture themselves under the nostalgia of a man whose humble being touched the endless chords of world literature and immortalized Bengali folk life and lifestyle.

Tarashankar Bandyopadhyay’s *Hansuli Banker Upakatha*, or *The Tale of Hansuli Turn*, tells the story of an India modernized by the forces of war in the mid-twentieth century. The novel was composed across the cusp of India’s official concurrence to independent nation-statehood and was in print in various versions between 1946 and 1951. It first appeared in a much shorter version in a special annual Durga festival issue of *Ananda Bazar Patrika* in 1946.

Deconstruction of the Novel and the Relevance of the Study

*Hansuli Turn* is unusual in at least two respects. First, it tries to represent sympathetically the frightening (and seductive) shapes of the new from within the imaginative universe and philosophy of the old. Second, it takes as central a set of subaltern protagonists, drawn from the very lowest and most marginalized strata of rural society. It names the shifting and heterogeneous positions that are cut off from the lines of intellectual and social mobility, and institutionalized agency, in colonial and postcolonial society. In *Hansuli Turn*, as in other places, the representation of subalternity turns on the philosophical paradox of its coming to a crisis and exceeding the codes by which it remains subaltern. Rural society in India is extremely differentiated and diverse, and it would be a mistake to assume that all novels about rustic protagonists, peasants and others, are dealing with common types of figures or even with subalterns at all. On the one hand, the spectacular and lengthy comparison between Eastern and Western regions of Bengal at the very opening of the novel appears to be redundant to the plot and constitutes a parenthesis that diverges conspicuously from the momentum of the opening’s urgent mystery (4–6). But it places the reader in relation to a sedimented coding of “Bengal” that is not just social, political, and historical but also cultural and literary. On the other hand, the novel is an account of a much more general problem of literary representation: it is an experiment in how to “do” novels in India, of how to make “tale” (*upakatha*) into “novel” (*upanyas*) across divisions not specifically defined by region.

The novel’s main protagonist and focalizer, meaning the character whose “vision” is given words by the narrator, is Bonwari Kahar. Much of the novel is vectored through his thought world, his imaginative universe and philosophy, which, along with the other village elders such as Suchand Kahar, exemplifies the values of the “old” world
for the novel. Bonwari is a subaltern figure, though drawn from the upper spaces of subalternity. He is the village headman and protector of its dharma (broadly speaking, ethical and religious principles), to whom responsibility means a complex relationship of loyalty and subordination to the quasi-feudal masters of village and town, and adherence to the prescriptions of gods and forefathers that comprehend any threat to these as a threat to the moral and existential order itself. *Hansuli Turn* represents a space in which pre-colonial temporalities, structures of myth, memory, and ritual, practical arrangements of everyday life, and imaginative patterns are powerfully residual.

However, I must immediately qualify the statement that emphasizes the contrast between new and old in *Hansuli Turn*. The old is not to be taken as referring to some kind of pristine, archaic tradition brought into contact with the novel’s key indices of modernity (the forces of war and capital as the machines of development in the twentieth century). The Kahars, the untouchable collective protagonist of the novel, are not traditional in any uncomplicated way. As they are depicted in *Hansuli Turn*, they too are the product of an earlier wave of transformation, the British colonization of India, displaced from an unknown elsewhere and brought to their present location and function by the vicissitudes of colonial capital and indigenous class/caste hierarchy.

As the novel’s narrator tells us:

The real meaning can be found in the old papers of the Chaudhury house. All those papers have now almost disappeared, devoured by termites. There are still a few whole bits and pieces in piles of termite-eaten paper. Among them the total statement of revenue accounts for the year 1818–19 can be found—the whole Bansbadi ward was wasteland—there was neither pond nor settlement there. There is mention of about ten huts situated in Jangol village, all were Sadgop farmers. In the papers of 1842–43 you see—a new land settlement, in the name of the illustrious Mister Jenkins saheb, indigo planter. Whatever wasteland there was at Jangol had almost all been incorporated into this new landholding, along with the entire Bansbadi ward. The place is overrun by brush now, and wild pigs have set up an outpost right there. Once they’ve taken a land settlement at Bansbadi ward, the sahebs dig a pond there and turn all Bansbadi’s wasteland to indigo cultivation. Some had found jobs at the indigo office, patrolling with fight-sticks and keeping watch at the sahebs’ gates when needed; for this they’d been given some land in lieu of salary and, in keeping with local custom, had received a title befitting their function as tenants of rent-free land on call twenty-four hours a day—Ostoprohori, or Atpoure.

These lines clearly tell us the change and transformation that this place and many villages like this have witnessed. With the usher of post colonialism rural societies and their people have gone through the rudest face of what has been termed as ‘development’ and ‘modernization’. This story is told and retold by the narrator and within the narratives of the Kahars themselves, and the permutations of these retellings are material for the novel’s elaboration of the relation between “tale” (*upakathā*) and “history” (*itihiās*). In the text under reference, The Kahars are thus the collective product of prior waves of internal migration and Diaspora—a class of armed guards and palanquin carriers created by the colonial planters, that is, then transformed into a class of landless sharecroppers for the needs of the indigenous landowners, and finally wage labourers in the small-town wartime industries. On the
way, the Kahars also become a “criminal tribe,” a colonial-era category for a large number of rustic groups outlawed by the British, an appellation they are portrayed as struggling to avoid in the novel. The Kahars are therefore thoroughly modern hybrids occupying the broad and shifting territory of untouchability between the autochthonous or aboriginal “tribal” groups of this western region of Bengal, and the caste Hindus and their erstwhile colonial rulers. Thus this novel also dramatizes the transforming experience and memory of the community and the way their identity shifts with the changing history. As the novel’s development makes clear, while the Kahars are both cut off and exploited in various ways, the isolation is a matter of social spaces and boundaries rather than of the figurative geographical circumscription that expresses it. *Hansuli Turn* vividly dramatizes this hybridism through the huge and general trope of reproductive heteronormativity, as the skin tone of the Kahars lightens while they work for the whites and some of their features come to resemble those of the Bengali landlords once the planters have departed. In spite of all the surrounding codes stipulating caste purity and avoidance of pollution, the Kahars appear as the exception that makes the rule of caste segregation possible. In many other ways, *Hansuli Turn* gives the lie to notions of the intact practices, values, and mind-sets of a fantastic “village India.”

*Hansuli Turn* dramatizes this stasis and isolation in its opening pages with the motif (to which it often returns) of the circular or oxbow river bend within which the Kahar hamlet sits, as if cut off from the wider world by a physical boundary. As the novel’s development makes clear, while the Kahars are both cut off and exploited in various ways, the isolation is a matter of social spaces and boundaries rather than of the figurative geographical circumscription that expresses it. The drama and tragedy of *Hansuli Turn* comes from one of the main protagonists, Karali, a youth whose crisis precisely involves a movement toward a social and intellectual mobility that clashes with the values of the village’s elders and the indigenous landlords. Yet as often as making such obviously historical statements, the novel’s narrator refers to the “ancient” or “primordial” (*ādim*) character of the Kahars, as if they represent some kind of anthropologically interesting survival of the primitive within the modern world: “In their eyes that primeval epoch’s stare lights up; that’s to say the darkness-piercing forest-animal stare of humans from the age before the discovery of fire!” (87). This conflict of different modes of imagining and representing India’s rural oppressed is one of the most powerful sites of aesthetic and rhetorical tension in *Hansuli Turn*, something that contains and determines the novel rather than being contained and resolved by it. One will recognize that it is a tension shared by much other so-called “primitivist” modernism.

Thus, if the novel exemplifies an attempt by an upper-middle class Brahmin author to represent social and epistemic change in a class and caste emphatically not his own, then it does so in ways that pose provocative questions and render the work difficult for recuperation within postcolonial studies as a novel of “resistance” by the colonized. Beside its modernist primitivism, there is no simple colonizer/colonized, East/ West contrast in this story. *Hansuli Turn* explores the fault lines within the colonized, and thus complicates the postcolonial paradigm. The ebbs and flows of collective and individual fortunes are not static in this world. Whites, Englishmen or “sahebs,” are a sinister offstage presence for most of *Hansuli Turn*. The Kahars live in the ruins of a former indigo plantation. A railway line (metonymic signifier of the imperial network) runs past the village, and the rhythmic to-and-fro of the train is
used as a timepiece by the Kahars to measure out the workday. The reader who has read Bibhutibhushan Bandopadhya's *Pather Panchali* (1929), later on adapted in a film by the same name by Satyajit Ray in 1955, will recall that its most famous scene involves the children Apu and Durga running through a field of kash reeds to watch a steam train passes by. This scene of confrontation between impoverished middle-class rustic Brahmin children and the ambiguous forces of imperial “modernity” is displaced in *Hansuli Turn*. Our protagonists are far lower on the social scale than Apu and Durga. Yet the train has been assimilated and in a sense normalized as timekeeper, and the rail line is now a different kind of narrative pointer to an “outside” (of the Kahars’ immediate world and of the text itself). Karali shuttles between village and town, and constantly tries to recruit the young men of his group to take up work in the factories. Yet *Karali’s temporary* and cyclic migration out of the village and back is set against the backdrop of the prior *permanent* migration women are obliged to enter if they take up the same kind of workshop or rail-line employment. These women, named only once in the novel, fleetingly appear and disappear from the narrative along this line:

“So many women left home to work construction on this line—Panchi, Khuki, Bele, Chitto, Nimmla. Khuki and Bele left the locality—with two Muslim stonecutters. Chitto and Panchi went off with a Hindusthani line mechanic. And Nimmla took off with another mechanic. Karali was that Nimmla’s son. The bitch even went off leaving little five-year-old Karali” (89-90).

The novel points to a story of a women’s Diaspora that it leaves untold as it focuses on change coded by male intergenerational struggle. (The predicaments of gendered subalternity are—more or less—occluded in *Hansuli Turn*).

The real equivalent of *Pather Panchali*’s fascinating, monstrous, and mysterious train, sign of some vast and as yet unknown alien structure, is *Hansuli Turn*’s squadrons of military aircraft that fly low over the Kahar hamlet as World War II unfolds. Indices of crisis in several ways, the aircraft subvert and overwrite the now-normalized (clichéd) motif of the steam train of empire. The airbase and airplanes becomes the sign of some offstage imperial and existential catastrophe, rather than of a systematic occupation of new territory; or, as they come insatiably to eat up irreplaceable resources and space toward the novel’s end, they become the signs of a late imperialism driven headlong by crisis.

The change is drawn beginning with Karali’s mode of investigation into the source of the terrifying forest whistling announced in the novel’s first lines. He uses a flashlight to search in the surrounding bamboo groves. The word “torch” (here meaning flashlight), lexicalized into Bengali from (British) English and metonymically associated with Karali, already announces a difference from the rest of the Kahars, as the use of electric light is associated with whites and with the police. At this inaugural point, Karali’s flashlight is “extremely weak”; the transformation is at an early stage. Karali is, in a metaphorical sense, reaching for certain “enlightenment,” linked by the rhetoric of the novel to the rational capabilities of the colonial apparatus, just as his rationalizing explanation of the mysterious forest whistle is at odds with the village elders’ metaphysical one. As the novel ends and the forest is cut down by wartime timber contractors, the intensity of the light penetrating the village’s former gloom
completes the illumination brought from the beginning by Karali’s “extremely weak” flashlight.

None of the foregoing argument is to claim that Hansuli Turn endorses the mission of colonialism as enlightenment (nor do I endorse the notion that colonialism and enlightenment are simply one and the same). The novel confronts us with a literary staging of the problem in the form of an unresolved double bind: being touched by the colonial apparatus as both a good and a bad thing for the subaltern. In doing so, it refuses the reader the false comforts of an easy nativism, a sense that the old, quasi-feudal values were better, just as it confronts us with a representation of colonization as the false herald of enlightenment and equality.

Change of time is inevitable and so is the change in people and their way of life. The “Upokotha” (fables) of Hansuli Bak is a tussle between stagnation and mobility. Though this battle have been going on for ages, what the play brought up on stage is the price you pay in the name of progression and the danger of blind faith. World War was a worldly affaire, but its micro and macro level effects differed in virtue. While some fell under the grinding taxes, others lost their morale. To be fair, maybe every war is personal, every war somehow effects the alignment at the dinner table and every war takes away a part of our soul. A war could boast of weaponries of different kind, ranging from bullets to broken twigs, but none of them ever fail to claim lives. Hansuli Baker Upokotha was such a story of content and desire, of eternity and infinity, of nature and mankind. Residents of Hansuli Turn, The Kahars are members of an untouchable "scandalous clan" shortly to be grandly converted by the consequences of India’s independence movement and World War II. Bonwari, their leader, endorses the principles of an older period, but his flimsy beliefs verifies to be no competition for the overshadowing machinery of warfare .Youthful villagers guided by the rebel Karali look for other meanings and a different way of life whereas Bonwari and the village elders come to consider the gods have deserted them. As the two divisions fight, codes of authority, society, religion, sex, culture start to shatter down, and in the middle of lethal clash and natural catastrophe, Karali grasps his prospect to transform his people's future. Tarashankar Bandyopadhyay portrays a complex transition in which a marginal caste fragments and mutates under the pressure of local and global forces maintaining a sympathetic outlook to the desires of both older and younger generations. This archiving of the experience of the lower caste tribe’s experience of the Partition can be contextualized by the silence of such voices in nationalist discourses of state formations. This novel then disrupts easily the past and present hegemonic definitions of national identity and creates a space for a more nuanced and contested terrain of agency that canonized narratives of partition do not allow. The novel that I have discussed use their settings as part of what they aim to say: therefore the politics of places is a good way to enter these narratives of the Partition. The place becomes the context in so far as the narrative seeks to be itself. The way the place , community and the experience in relation to different generations are used by the writer, this point becomes poignantly clear: a tree or a city space or a barren island becomes the markers of locality and memory. In the novel, the way the resistances have been shaped by a national liberation paradigm by foregrounding the impulses of the revolutionary movement. The use of the tropes of community and locality also shifts with the change of the narrative point of view from the low caste marginalised aboriginals to the landowning caste. As the vantage point shifts so does the experience and the memory. Nostalgia is the dominant principle that binds
together the collective experience and memory of the group. Two very extreme points of view have been represented through Bonwari and through Karali. One is their headman, Bonwari who upholds the ethics of an older time and then there is Karali, who is a rebel and a man of action who believes in seizing the chance to change the way and meaning of life. Thus, two people symbolize the two poles with the different experience and perspectives and also the dilemma and conflicts present as much as in an individual so also in the social group or in the community too. on the other hand, with its thick descriptions, the dialects, and the dream metaphor creates a different effect through another use of space: 'The duty of the book is to flesh out the life-world and the past of an expunged place, to construct a diverse thought of people and topography that drives against the impersonal account of nation and the intangible vicinity in our conception.' The realist mode of Bandopadhyay, with its locus on the individual, is also contrasted at times, with his mythical mode of storytelling based on community that absorbs within it the revolutionary praxis.

In this work I have tried to look at the Partition of Bengal not just as a set of historical events but have placed it as 'historical trauma within the problem of identity crisis. Unlike the partition narratives from Punjab where 'the author can find voice only through impersonal narrators, or teller-actors' (13) the stories of violence and trauma in Bengal are not silent about the horror of rioting in Calcutta or Noakhali, nor do they elide over what it means to survive a traumatic event. Rather, painful upon painful details of dead bodies lying through Calcutta's streets or through the bazaars of Noakhali are recollected in languages that are spare and filled with despair. Tarashankar's story, for example, is about survival, but it is also about questions regarding the status of fiction as it arises out of the problem of writing about violence in the first person voice. Bonwari’s experience of riot-tom Hansuli Turn is at once as a reality and, as a trauma. In thematic terms, I see the text as grouped around some broad parameters: witnessing an event, rehabilitation and resettlement, gender and livelihood. However the themes overlap in most cases and the novels particularly cannot be categorized as one and not the other. Each fictional work also points to the differences in recalling or representing that comes through in their dates of composition: a short story written immediately after an event is markedly different from a novel that recalls an event and written over a longer period of time. But there again, the relationship between memory and experience is richly problematic: the methods through which we gain access to our pasts are never simple and linear; all we can hope is to discover newer sources that will enable us to arrive at a nuanced account of the past.

To describe this fiction, Gayatri Spivak has called “transnational literacy” so that the reader can sense this novel’s insertion into a Bengali literary milieu. The novel’s main protagonist and focalizer, meaning the character whose “vision” is given words by the narrator, is Bonwari Kahar. Much of the novel is vectored through his thought world, his imaginative universe and philosophy, which, along with the other village elders such as Suchand Kahar, exemplifies the values of the “old” world for the novel. Bonwari is a subaltern figure, though drawn from the upper spaces of subalternity. He is the village headman and protector of its dharma (broadly speaking, ethical and religious principles), to whom responsibility means a complex relationship of loyalty and subordination to the quasi-feudal masters of village and town, and adherence to the prescriptions of gods and forefathers that comprehend any threat to these as a threat to the moral and existential order itself. Hansuli Turn represents a space in
which precolonial temporalities, structures of myth, memory, and ritual, practical arrangements of everyday life, and imaginative patterns are powerfully residual. The Kahars, the untouchable collective protagonist of the novel, are not traditional in any uncomplicated way. As they are depicted in *Hansuli Turn*, they too are the product of an earlier wave of transformation, the British colonization of India, displaced from an unknown elsewhere and brought to their present location and function by the vicissitudes of colonial capital and indigenous class/caste hierarchy. *Hansuli Turn* asks us to imagine a world of peasant farmers (Sadgops and Mondols), landlords, landowners, and rural gentry (Ghoshes, Chaudhurys, and unnamed Brahmin gentry) from the vantage point of the landless sharecropper eking out a living in village or country town. The ebbs and flows of collective and individual fortunes are not static in this world.

**Conclusion**

*Hansuli Turn* stages the agonizingly difficult way the forces of colonial modernity can in some sense be understood as emancipatory for India’s most marginal people. It is complicity with the very structural violations of war and “modernization” that paradoxically enables Karali to break with the feudal violence that prevails over the Kahars. The novel presents this dilemma as a double bind, particularly as its focalization is so powerfully vectored through the figure of Bonwari, unable to imagine an outside to feudal strictures except in terms of cosmic and moral-existential catastrophe. *Hansuli Turn* represents this process of change through Karali’s work and speeches, and also through the outward signs of the body as he undergoes a transvestite makeover from loincloth-clad village boy to uncanny uniform-clad proletarian. The novel depicts the horizons of rustic feudal hierarchy being ruptured by the world of wage labor and British military structure. As the war machine touches the subalternity of Karali, it causes that subalternity to exceed its own bounds, and this overflow can be given the name of “crisis” inasmuch as it enables the signs of a different order to begin to challenge and displace the signs of the prevailing one. This conflict of different modes of imagining and representing India’s rural oppressed is one of the most powerful sites of aesthetic and rhetorical tension in *Hansuli Turn*, something that contains and determines the novel rather than being contained and resolved by it.

Ultimately, this novel leaves the drama open-ended and seeks to suggest that the uncanny words, rhythms, and subnarratives of the rustic tale could be written into the future in a different way. This new story would, for better or worse, break with the dominant representation of the “we” of the public sphere and the “they” of the creolized subaltern. Hence, its closing moments stage the upwardly mobile militant Karali scratching or inscribing a link to “history,” but also include the transvestite dancer, Nasubala Kahar, and the crazy balladeer, Pagol Kahar, continuing the story in other forms.
References


Dasgupta, Biplab, “Urbanization and Rural Change in West Bengal.” February 14: *Economic and Political Weekly*,1987

Contact email: madhumitac59@gmail.com
Art from Tibetan Buddhist perspective
The First Anthropological Study of Jonang Sect

Mei Xue, Durham University, United Kingdom

Abstract
Art, divided into art works of fine art; and art objects of religion. Religion includes world religions like Christianity and Buddhism, it also includes folk religions, or local religions. Amongst religion, some objects are treated as persons, they certainly have agency, but the agency is given within a particular context. This paper is going to talk about how to understand Tibetan Buddhist art within its cultural context, setting the Jonang sect as an example. The Jonang sect is not well-known, this is the first anthological research about it. I am going to argue with Gell to clarify how he misleadingly understands non-western art in a western context. He ignores the diversity of forms of art, and simply treats all kinds of arts as secondary agent. Although some of Tibetan Buddhist images, icons, and the like have spiritual power, they are not merely treated as person, some of them are further treated as guidance, such as, a map, a communication or an outline to participants, not to the outsiders of this system, which are used as reminder to guide Tibetan Buddhists in their practice. In Tibetan Buddhism, teaching, practicing, philosophy, and doctrines are a coherent system, and art is a semiotic expression of this system.

Keywords: Tibetan Buddhist art, anthropology of art, Gell, agency, criticism, Jonang
Introduction

Among the lesser-known sects, Jonangpa occupies a very special place because, for hundreds of years; the Jonang tradition was thought to be extinct in Tibetan Buddhism history. Due to opposing political views and interests, and religious considerations, the Fifth Dalai Lama Ngawang Lozang Gyatso, who was from the Gelug tradition, did not approve the Jonangpa. The Jonang monasteries were, therefore, converted to the Gelug sect in the late 17th century. After the Fifth Dalai Lama annexed the Jonang sect, some of the Jonang monks travelled to remote villages in Amdo region, mainly in the Ngawa Tibetan and Qiang Autonomous Prefecture in Sichuan Province and Golog Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture in Qinghai Province; and east Tibet (Samuel 1993: 529), in these backwaters they guarded their practice and traditional culture. The Jonang sect continues on in an unbroken lineage and has been newly rediscovered and opened up to the world during the late 20th and early 21st centuries, the sect distinguishes itself with other Tibetan Buddhist sects with the emphasis of the practice of the Kalachakra Tantra, I will give more details about the Kalachakra Tantra in the following chapter.

In this paper, I am going to talk about Tibetan religious art as semiotic guidance to Tibetan Buddhist practitioners. Art as agency does not completely apply in Tibetan Buddhist art. For example, Tibetan Buddhists of Jonang tradition use the mandala to enhance their memory and visualization of the cosmology of tantric Buddhahood; it is a guidance to visualization.

“The basic thesis of this book, to recapitulate, is that works of art, images, icons, and the like have to be treated, in the context of an anthropological theory, as person-like; that is, sources of, and targets for, social agency”(Gell 1998: 96). However, without cultural conventions, the art’s agency cannot be understood properly, as Layton (2004) justifies “what Gell has identified as the distinctive features of art cannot be understood except by recognizing the status of art as a culturally constructed medium of visual expression”. Gell dismisses the context of various cultural conventions. Art works have power to influence their viewers, but the viewers’ cultural contexts mediate the interaction between works of art and its makers or viewers. We live in a world full of diversities nowadays so that a Thangka painting hanging in a British museum does not necessarily share the same interpretation as it does in a Tibetan Buddhist monastery. In a British museum, it may be a colourful exotic painting, which even has no artist is identified; while, in a Tibetan Buddhist monastery, it has multiple explications, such as guidance, a map of Buddhist universe, a communication or an outline, which, based on various occasions and different stage of practice, has different meanings. The interactions differ but the painting is the same, it is the agency of viewers’ cultural contexts’ rather than of the painting itself that differ. On the other hand, “the distributed person”(Gell 1998:96-154) from his formula of [[Prototype-A →[Artist-A]]→Index-P, does work, mostly in exoteric Buddhism, but not always in the tantric system1.

It is interaction with/within cultural conventions, which is behind the art works rather than the art works per se. It is like when we look at a white paper wearing glasses in different colours, the paper would show in red if the glasses were red; the paper shows blue if we wear blue glasses. It is not the paper changes colour; it is because of the coloured glasses one wears. The object is the paper, and the cultural context is

---

1 Tibetan Buddhism contains both exoteric and tantric systems.
coloured glass. We are not mediated by the paper but by the glasses. Gell rightly
notices that aesthetic is a Western idea, “consequently, it is only from a very parochial
(blinded) Western post-Enlightenment point of view that the separation between the
beautiful and the holy, between religious experience and aesthetic experience, arises.
Since this is so, the anthropologist writing about art inevitably contributes to the
anthropology of religion, because the religious is – in some contexts, though not all-
prior to the artistic.” (Gell 1998: 97). However, Gell sidesteps this crucial background
to his agency orientated theory. In fact, the term ‘art’ did not exist in some non-
Western cultures such as Japan and China before the end of 19th century.

Basic on my fieldwork and literature review I realized that the complexity of art and
religion in Chinese/Tibetan context, especially the terms of “art”, “religion” could not
match the ideas in practice, as these terms “philosophy”, “culture”, “democracy”, and
so forth, are neologisms that entered China through Japan in the early 20th century
(Chen 2002; Thoraval 1996) that there are no equivalent concepts in context of the
culture I do research with. Thus, any analyse without identify different contexts of
“art” falls into the danger of Western misconception.

The Kalachakra mandala and the cosmology of the Jonang tradition

I joined a ritual of Kalachakra initiation with about three hundred Buddhists at the
Chinese New Year’s Day in 2015. The Kalachakra is a tantric system brought to Tibet
from India. The guru gave us instructions at each steps of initiation.

Kalachakra is a term used in Vajrayana Buddhism; it literally means the
wheel of time or the cycle of time. Kala means time, and chakra means cycle.
The system contains three layers of Kalachakra, namely the external/outer
Kalachakra, internal Kalachakra, and other Kalachakra. The external
Kalachakra, takes in the physical world, time and the universe, it revolves
around the concept of the cycle of time. This can be considered as a part of
the basic sciences: astrology, astronomy, and mathematics. The inner
Kalachakra has to do with the human body; it is believed that the human
body is a small cosmos, which is related to the external cosmos. It concerns
processes of human gestation and birth, the classification of the functions
within the human body and experience; the expression of human physical
existence in terms of channels and Qi (wind or energy). The internal
Kalachakra refers to regularities of human body, which is corresponding to
the external Kalachakra. The ‘other Kalachakra’, describes the spiritual
method leading to enlightenment in the form of Kalachakra. It is the study
and practice of the Kalachakra, which leads from ordinary state to the state of
Buddhahood or enlightenment. The Kalachakra mandala also consists of
three mandalas corresponding to human body, which are the Body, Speech,
and Mind Mandala, and great bliss mandala that is the ultimate state of the
Buddha.
In Tibetan Buddhism, initiation or empowerment means giving permission, in other words to grant the disciples the right to practice the Tantra, it also means planting seeds and nurturing to cultivate to attain certain capacity and to grow the Buddha fruits. Kalachakra mandalas are regarded as the actual divine abode of a particular Kalachakra Buddha state. There are six hundred and thirty-six Buddhas in this mandala. At the second day of the initiation, after a series of complex rituals for preparing to enter the mandala in meditation, all the disciples were guided enter into the Kalachakra mandala by the guru. The disciples imagine they enter the mandala under the guru’s instruction and see all the Buddhas inside. According to the guru,

Imagine yourselves walking through the east, south, west, and north gates, and back to the east gate, bow to Buddhas in four directions, and the Buddhas in the centre respectively in sequence. Pray to all Buddhas in the mandala, dedicate to them all your resources to get blessing from all Buddhas, meanwhile, plant the seeds to attain the Buddhahood.

The ritual of the initiation is part of tantric teaching; here I am only talking about data related to the mandala. The Kalachakra mandala is one of the most complicated systems in Tibetan Buddhism. It is a huge palace, which represents physical body of the universe, the cosmology, and the philosophy of the tantric practice. Each of little dots in the painting represents a deity in the Buddha state according to the external Kalachakra; and each deity actually represents one constellation. It also represents the channel, wind, and drop2 of human body according to the internal Kalachakra.

In the Kalachakra tantra, there are many Buddhas in the mandala; for example, there are 620 Buddhas in 3 mandalas (the empowerment is conducted in 3 mandalas). They all correspond to constellations, seasons of the external wheel of time (Kalachakra) and the internal wheel of time (Kalachakra) in the human body. In the human body there are Yin and Yang

---

2 In Tantric Buddhism, drop (Tib: tigle) is subtle substance that permeates the body, caused by the coalescing of the mind and its accompanying wind at certain parts of the body. It is originated from the original white drop from the father and the red drop from the mother.
aspects corresponding to each other, the Buddha taking the appearance of Yab and Yum, the manifestation of the male and female Bodhisattvas, all of which represent corresponding law of Yin and Yang.

The doctrine of Kalachakra believes that the cosmos, human body and life should be studied from the perspective of time. For example, the four seasons of spring, summer, autumn and winter in a year is called external Kalachakra. The human body is a small cosmos, which is related to the external cosmos. For example, emotions change in spring and summer or are even different from morning to evening. In a word, life cannot be separated from the living environment; any minor changes will affect the body and life. Things in the cosmos reflect on the human body. The human body is made up of six aggregates, such as form, feeling, perceptions, mental formation, consciousness, and space, and in Kalachakra mandala there are six Buddhas representing the six aggregates. Six is a symbolic number in Kalachakra; for example, earth, water, fire, wind, space, and consciousness are six important constituents to make up human body. Only with the constituent of consciousness, can it form human body. In Kalachakra mandala, the six constituents are represented by six consorts of the tantric deities (yums).

In a word, all the different appearances of Buddha are the symbols of tantra, representing different theory and practice, in other words, they represent different philosophical views; they are not simply secondary agents standing in for the Buddha himself.

There are many guided visualizations at the ritual, to give you an idea of these, here are some data I recorded at the second day of the initiation.

First of all, we visualize the emptiness of all forms; visualize ourselves as Vajra Body of the Boundless Light Buddha. Led by guru, we walk to the north gate of the mandala, facing to Vajra Body of Kalachakra. In order to remove the obstacles of body, supplications are made to Vajra Body who are non-differentiable from guru to confer empowerments on us.

During the empowerment, disciples were guided by the guru went through all the four gates of the mandala in their visualization by visualizing themselves as different Buddhas to remove different type of obstacles (body obstacles, speech obstacles, mind obstacles, and so forth)3.

As aforementioned, the Kalachakra mandala contains three layers, which includes the external cosmology and astrology; internal system of human body; and the third level of the mental realm. They are all correspondence to each other; the essence of the Kalachakra doctrine is reflected in the mandala. Practitioners use the Mandala to visualize in meditation the steps along the Path to Enlightenment.

---

3 As the Kalachakra empowerment is a tantric ritual, there are many details I could not represent here.
Figure 2 is an image of four faced Kalachakra (image is taken from internal teaching material among the group of Tibetan Buddhists). The four faces are black/blackish blue face in the centre, red face to his right, white face to his left, and yellow face at the back. The four coloured faces represent four constituents. In the centre, black/blackish blue represents wind, in other words, vital energy; red represents fire; yellow represents earth; white represents water. The four constituents in external wheel of time represent the four seasons in a year. Spring, summer, autumn and winter correspond to earth, water, wind, and fire respectively. Kalachakra has 24 hands, which represent the 24 divisions of solar year, two legs represent two tropics, red leg represents the tropic of Cancer, and white leg represent the tropic of Capricorn. This is the corresponding law of Kalachakra between body and universe, in other words, the corresponding law between inner Kalachakra and external Kalachakra.

Figure 3 The guru explains the Kalachakra mandala to disciples
Figure 4 Main channels, wind, and drops of the human body

Figure 4 is a graphic guidance to practice Qi in the Jonang tradition (digital image, it is circulating for instruction among the group of Tibetan Buddhists on Wechat group) (n.d. Wechat, 15 Dec 2016), it shows there are three main channels and four main connections (the top of head, throat, heart, and intimate area). Once Qi could circulate through those channels and connections freely, the practitioner is most likely gain his/her enlightenment of Buddhahood. This image illustrates the location and colours of those channels and connections, also the posture of meditation.

Conclusion

In tantric Buddhism, art objects are made to represent theories, doctrines, philosophy, and so forth. They are visual code, rather than merely an index of a certain prototype, to assist the practitioners to visualize the concepts of doctrines in their practice. But if we were to follow Gell and merely regard the Kalachakra as a secondary agent of the Buddha, all of the rich and diverse meanings and cultural uses of the Kalachakra would be ignored.
References


Main Channels, wind, and drop of the human body. n.d. digital image. 15 Dec 2016. Wechat chating group.

Contact email: mei.xue@durham.ac.uk
Postmodern Simultaneity versus European History in Contemporary Travel-Writing: A Study of Jean Baudrillard, Pico Iyer, Umberto Eco

Ana Calvete, University of Helsinki, Finland

The European Conference of Arts & Humanities 2017
Official Conference Proceedings

Abstract
The 21st-century metropolis is dominated by quick changes and a distortion of traditional space and time. This paper studies how temporal distance is suppressed and how simultaneity overwrites history in The Global Soul by Pico Iyer, America by Jean Baudrillard and Umberto Eco's “Travels in Hyperreality”. History does not simply disappear: it is recycled. Torn between two versions, the traditional European history, and the rewritings of it by the United States, history appears a keenly contested field. This article investigates the fate of history when it is embroiled into hyperreal mechanisms. In the American landscape, the fast pace of the postmodern era is epitomized and created by cars. Movement and immediacy replace history. This forward movement flattens out and re-processes history in order to fuel an hyperreal reconstruction of it. On the one hand, by providing the raw material for this process, Europe, and above all the old English motherland, asserts its stranglehold over History and appears a stronghold of stability and fixity. On the other hand, the United States brings about a creative apocalypse: it both destroys history and preserves it in the form of simulacra.

Keywords: History, globalization, simultaneity, empire, hyperreality, instantaneity, simulacra, United States

iafor
The International Academic Forum
www.iafor.org
Introduction

Investigating the fate of history in a hyperreal setting

History can be seen as a backdrop of unchangeable events leading to the present in which we are born. Until the 19th century, these events required considerable time to unfold: it took up to three months to cross the Atlantic, and all letters depended on horses to reach their destinations. From the Industrial Revolution to the advent of the car, the plane, and the digital age, humankind has leaped into a swift-paced age: the postmodern era. The present in which we are born is now looking at the road ahead rather than at the road behind. The pair past/future finds its geographical twin image in the pair Europe/United States. Traditional European history competes with the rewritings of it by the United States. This article investigates the fate of History when it is embroiled into hyperreal mechanisms, and the consequences of temporal distance suppression in three texts: The Global Soul by Pico Iyer, America by Jean Baudrillard and Umberto Eco's “Travels in Hyperreality”. All three authors immersed themselves in big cities, centers of economic power and globalisation. All three traveled to locations that can be called hyperreal. The hyperreal is a frame wherein space and time are modified and replaced by simultaneity. According to Holland and Huggan (1998), Umberto Eco and Jean Baudrillard define the hyperreal as a simulated reality which tries to replace authentic reality (p. 24). I will add that hyperreality is a heightened version of reality: it exceeds reality, it has more colours, more dimensions, and what interests us the most in this study, increased speed. Hyperreality is a feature of postmodernity, an era also characterized by consumerism, television, capitalism and simulation. Within this temporal framework, the aesthetic movement of postmodernism took wing, advocating mobility and instability, re-reading history and hierarchies. Because it endorses a language of multiplicity, postmodernism conflicts with history understood as a set of unchangeable facts. Indeed, if we follow Zygmunt Bauman's words (1997), the existence of multiple viewpoints implies that “nothing can be known for sure and anything which is known can be known in a different way” (p. 6). If we look at how history is approached and understood in the postmodern era, we notice a shift of perspective. The emphasis shifts from the past immutability of events to the forward movement re-interpreting them.

This article investigates what happens to history when it is absorbed, devoured and preserved by hyperreal mechanisms that are mostly at play in the United States. For the most part, the history thusly absorbed is the imperialistic history of the old continent. As a consequence, I will examine whether Europe's long-lasting traditions still act as fixed anchors in an ever-changing world. First, we will see that the fast pace of the postmodern age is epitomized and created by cars. Then, I will study the process of “past-izing” (Eco, 1986, p. 10) and the accumulative digestion of European history, before discussing whether Europe still has a monopoly over history. Finally, I will investigate what may be considered a postmodern apocalypse: the destructive mechanism set in motion by preservation.

Eco, Baudrillard and Iyer: their intentions

Baudrillard was a French sociologist and philosopher who reflected on the way media communication influenced our system of signs. His travels in the United States are recorded in America. He specifically targeted vast, empty expanses, and chose them
as a lens through which he studied American hyperreality. He wrote that his “hunting
ground [was] composed of deserts, freeways, safeways, ghost towns or downtowns,
explains that he “was looking for […] the America of the vain and absolute freedom
of the freeways, never the America of the social and the cultural – the America of arid
speed, of motels and mineral surfaces” p. 10, my translation. The culture and
traditions which are a product of history are completely obliterated by the speed and
unfolding of vast stretches of land and roads. In 1986, the same year that saw the
publishing of Baudrillard's Amérique, “Travels in Hyperreality” by Umberto Eco was
translated from Italian to English. Umberto Eco (1986) undertakes his travels in the
United States in search of “The Absolute Fake” (p. 34). The readers explores
Disneyland, theme parks, collections of fake works and museums of wax statues
alongside Eco. Both Eco and Baudrillard are European professors and semiologists
addressing a well-read, initially European readership. Both admit being fascinated and
repulsed by the United States they explore. The third author brought into play is Pico
Iyer, a British citizen of Indian origin, a journalist and a writer. Pico Iyer does not
adopt the position of a postcolonial subject; he presents himself as Oxford educated
but working for America and living in Japan. The Global Soul is based on travels
which took place in the 1990s. It was published in 2001, before September 11th, and
focuses on the exploration of Western and Eastern economic centers: Japan, Hong
Kong, Atlanta.

1. Swallowing up the miles: postmodern immediacy

The citizens of developed nations experience movement in their everyday lives from
the driver or passenger seat. The United States are taken by Iyer, Eco and Baudrillard
as the perfect example of a nation and a landscape determined by the use of the car.
The car's movement and speed are inscribed on the bodies of the drivers. Driving on
Los Angeles' freeways, Baudrillard (2016) wrote that “[t]he machines themselves […]
have created an environment that resembles them […] [T]he system of freeways […]
creates a different state of mind” (p. 54). The cars are no longer subdued to their
human creators; they take over. In this sentence, the cars and the roads are the real
actors since they determine both the environment and the driver. Baudrillard (2016)
gave the car and its movement such importance that he decided to use them as a
cognitive tool, as a method to research the American society:

The point is not the sociology or psychology of the car. It is to drive in
order to know more about society than all the disciplines united could tell
us. […] Pulling yourself effortlessly, devouring the space without a
sound, sliding without a tremor […], braking softly albeit
instantaneously, progressing as if on an air cushion, having only the
obsession of what comes in front of you, and what overtakes you […] –
all this creates a new experience of space, and the entire societal system
in the same mouvement.

p. 55.

Seven-lines long catalogues and lists can be found in all three books studied. In this
excerpt, the list of present progressive “-ing” forms, which is, in fact, in French, a list
of infinitive verbs, imitates the rhythm and movement of driving, and gives the
impression of ease, comfort, and focus. The driver, barely visible, merges with the car
in the pronoun “you”. Both driver and car are outshone by the movement of the vehicle, which is at the centrestage. We notice that the driver is caught in an unfolding immediacy. He does pause to reflect upon America or anything else. His only obsession is that of the future: “what comes in front of you, and what overtakes you” (2016, p. 55). There is no past to behold through the windscreen; the present is hardly seized. Only the future is of importance.

In “Travels in Hyperreality”, Eco (1986) draws a portrait of Los Angeles in similar terms. The city is surrounded with highways, and the human body merges with the car:

And thus in the great expanses that were colonized late, where the posturban civilization represented by Los Angeles is being born, in a metropolis made up of seventy-six different cities where alleyways are ten-lane freeways and man considers his root foot a limb designed for pressing the accelerator, and the left an atrophied appendix, because cars no longer have a clutch – eyes are something to focus, at steady driving speed, on visual-mechanical wonders, signs, constructions that must impress the mind in the space of a few seconds.

No human limb shaped the car; the car shaped them. The feet and eyes are “designed” for the universe of speed, not for braking but for accelerating only. The thoughts do not focus long, but are swept by quick sights. The readers also notice that the environment is adapted to the speed of the car. The artificial cityscape and the conditions set by cars establish the use and shape of the human body, which loses control over both its environment and itself. Since it is limited to “the space of a few seconds”, the time frame is not on human scale either. Rather, it escapes the grasp and mastery of humankind. It is fleeting and subordinate to movement.

The template of the American car-city makes its appearance in Iyer's text under the traits of Atlanta:

Yet Atlanta at first sight looked like nowhere on earth: suburb led to interstate led to off-ramp led to suburb. I passed an Economy Inn, a Quality Inn, a Comfort Inn, a Days Inn; I passed a Holiday Inn Select, which gave way, soon enough, to a Holiday Inn Express. On every side of me were look-alike office blocks and landscaped driveways, mirror-glass buildings and office parks: all the interchangeable props of an International Style that could, in its latest incarnation, be called Silicon Neo-Colonial.

Atlanta “looked like nowhere on earth”, which almost renders it extraterrestrial. Because it is inhuman, the city offers a Science-Fiction scenery. The roads lead nowhere, and the readers are caught in a perpetual movement, in a loop, with no actual destination. Like in Eco's Los Angeles, the mind does not pause to behold the landscape, given that no feature in it has been made unique and worth seeing. The road is lined with generic hotels, temporary dwelling advertising their own characteristics: quality, economy, comfort, swiftness. The places passed by are not worth stopping by: they are generic copies belonging to hotel chains, and are denied
an individual name, a history and character. The peculiar purpose of this city – a corporate city – is best grasped from the car.

2. Devouring all pasts: reprocessing European History

The perpetual movement witnessed by the readers is a movement of retrieval. In its forward motion, postmodern instantaneity acts as a steamroller, flattening out history. Simultaneously, it re-processes it in order to fuel the construction of hyperreality. Just like the cars devour the roads, the United States devours the past. According to Eco (1986) and Baudrillard (2016), the United States is a country with no history. Baudrillard writes that “America […] has neither past nor founding truth” (p. 76). Rephrasing the words of J. Paul Getty, an American industrialist and founder of wealthy art institutions – in other words a tycoon anchored in mastering the present while revering the past – Eco (1986) wrote that the United States was “a country with much future but no historical depth”, and that “the Absolute Fake”, which can be summed up as a merging of hyperreality and simulacra, “[was] offspring of the unhappy awareness of a present without depth” (pp. 33, 31). For Eco (1986), the West Coast, which lacks history the most, is guilty of “the original sin of 'the leveling of the pasts', the fusion of copy and original” (p. 9). This means that the United States puts on the same level real and fake works of art, fictional and historical events, and antique objects from every eras. An example of this “leveling of the pasts” would be William Randolph Hearst's castle. This palace served as model for Citizen Kane's castle Xanadu. It is fraught with genuine art from all eras, kitsch copies and curiosities, with no overarching coherence:

The floor of the vestibule encloses a mosaic found in Pompeii, there are Gobelins on the walls, the door into the Meeting Hall is by Sansovino, the great hall is fake Renaissance presented as Italo-French. […] The striking aspect of the whole is not the quantity of antique pieces plundered from half of Europe […] but rather the sense of fullness […] that is here achieved.

Eco, 1986, p.22.

It is the European past that is consumed by this mansion, and even “plundered”, a rather negative term underlining that the past has been illegitimately displaced. In other parts of the text, Eco (1986) talks of “voracity”, of “gluttony”, of “ravenous consumption” (pp. 23, 31, 9). From this assembly of ill-matched pieces, the United States generates its own version of history. The accumulative process of Europe's millennial history is mimicked by the United States: in order to match the European quantity of memories, the United States turns a large number of contemporary items into past. Both objects still in use and people who are still alive are turned into past. This process comes under Eco's scrutiny:

[i]t is immediately worth noting that a private home seventy years old is already archeology; and this tells us a lot about the ravenous consumption of the present and about the constant 'past-izing' process carried out by American civilization in its alternate process of futuristic planning and nostalgic remorse.

Eco, 2016, p. 9-10.
The desire to have a past is expressed in Iyer's text by a reconstruction that is akin to Hearst's castle. In the United States, Iyer visits a mansion which luxury comes from the European traits it adopts. It has English fireguards, Italian marble, and overall, it is built to resemble England. However, the result is a rather humorous parody:

[...] in the place where ancestral portraits would be hung in the English country house it was designed to resemble, the 1928 confection had put up generic pictures of old people.

These pictures are a parody of the original portraits: a parody of the old, hereditary atmosphere of a country house. They imitate the look of the original portraits, but not their symbolic contents. They have no substance, albeit a substance that lies in England.

3. The contest of the old and the new continents over Europe's questioned landmarks

The readers may wonder what distinctive feature belongs to European history and renders it so desirable. In Iyer, Eco and Baudrillard's texts, the main characteristic the United Sates seeks to reproduce is authenticity. Originally, an authentic item was defined by a well-established origin which could not be questioned, whereas its opposite, the derivative or the copy, was suspicious. Akin to the theoretical Golden Age, the authentic item has become irretrievable, if it existed at all. Postmodernism introduces a reversal in suspicion: the authority and legitimacy of the authentic are more dubious than the copy. As a consequence, we witness two opposite pulls: the quest for and the undermining of the authentic. In other words, the texts exhibit a tendency to use European history to ground the present and give it legitimacy, but they also question the European model of history.

Europe is still a frame of reference. In *The Global Soul*, Iyer seems unable to find value in the places he visits: they appear anonymous, contrary to the England of his childhood. It is only when his destinations – Hong Kong, for instance – imitate the former “motherland” that they become valuable:

Taking a tram (with “Cathay Pacific” written all over its sides) down to the Bank of China, I got out and started climbing the steep concrete slope to the Citibank Plaza – Hong Kong's Central district was a web of such anonymities – when suddenly I saw the towers of an Anglican church down the street. I walked along its entrance, stepped inside, and instantly I was in England, on a grey November morning, being prepared for a war – or an Empire – that never came. [...] Standing in this mock thirteenth-century Gothic cathedral, I could have been my father, in Bombay in 1937, reciting a borrowed litany [...] 2001, p.90.

In Hong Kong, the remnants of colonial order trigger in Iyer a string of childhood memories. This act of remembering brings back the authentic, the original, the reference: England. As he walks in the mist of “anonymities”, an Anglican church stands out on the background of dull streets, and he writes “I was in England”. He
does not mirror England and Hong Kong with a comparison, he uses a metaphor to collapse the image of Hong Kong utterly and give way to the one true homeland: England. Hong Kong's locations, such as “Bank of China” and “Citibank Plaza”, belong to global trade. The presence of England suddenly reintroduces the notion of history with war and Empire, in a version of Hong Kong presented as a history-less trading place. England appears as a motherland from where inauthentic copies sprang. Thus, the cathedral is a “mock-thirteenth century cathedral” which means that it is inauthentic in relation to time and history, and the litany chanted within its walls is “borrowed”, it does not belong to the person who sings it, it belongs to the Empire.

Going back further in time to older Empires, Ancient Rome and Greece remain landmarks in terms of grandeur, which is why Iyer (2001) describes Toronto as a “New Athens” (p. 140) and why Baudrillard (2016) describes the Salt Institute as “modeled on the palace of Minos” – a mythical king of Crete – (p. 10) and New York as “the heir to everything at the same time, Athens, Alexandria, Persepolis” (p. 19). Postmodernity superimposed over antiquity creates a palimpsest. Baudrillard (2016) rewrites the antique battle of marathon in a Manhattan setting: “[t]here are 17 000 runners, and the real battle of Marathon comes to mind, where they were not even 17 000 fighting. […] ‘We won!’ whispers the Greek messenger of Marathon as he expires. ‘I did it!’ breathes the exhausted marathon runner while collapsing on the lawn of Central Park” (p. 25). Antiquity is born again as parody. Like the countryhouse portraits studied above, the resurrected elements of antiquity reappear under a degraded form.

The second pull is on the contrary a tendency to criticize Europe and to present America as superior and oriented towards the future. For Iyer (2001), Paris and London are “too old”, “too amorphous”, “too preoccupied”, while Toronto, on the new continent, appears as a more open city (p. 123). For Baudrillard (2016), European cities are “Middle Age cities”, and the streets are more alive in the United States than in France (pp. 23, 53). For our authors, Europe lives in the past. Traveling between his Californian home and his British boarding school as a child was like “traveling between 1441 and 1968” for Iyer (2001, p. 41) while for Baudrillard (2016), “[t]he first thing you notice in Paris is the 19th century. Coming from Los Angeles, you land in the 19th century” (p. 72). The United States is unburdened by traditions, it is free from the weight of time. Underneath the vast deserts explored by Baudrillard, we distinguish an America presented as a blank page. Baudrillard (2016) calls it “savage”, “naive and primitive” (p. 95). It is a blank page that encourages the creativity of the writer, while Europe is forever stuck in its past:

America exorcises the question of origins, it does not cultivate any origin or mythical authenticity, it has neither past nor founding truth. Because it has never known any primitive accumulation of time, it lives in a perpetual present. Because it has never known a slow and centennial accumulation of a truth principle, it lives in perpetual simulation, in the perpetual present of signs.
Baudrillard, 2016, p.76.

The time frame of the United States is presented as having two rather than three dimensions: the present is heightened, the future lies ahead, but the past is forgotten. Instead of being one point on a continuous line stretching from the past to the future,
the present is a point floating freely. It is furthermore hyperreal, since it is made up of artificial “signs”.

4. Preservation or destruction? How simulacra bring about the apocalypse

If we are to believe Baudrillard (2016), the past artificially generated by the United States is superior to the history of Europe because it is a simulacra: “[y]es, California (and America along with it) offers the image of our decline, but it is not declining at all, it has a hyperreal vitality, and all the energy of a simulacrum” (p. 101, emphasis in the text). The United States rises on the backdrop of a falling Europe; the satirical simulacra constructed on European landmarks are alive with “vitality” and “energy”.

Simulacra can be defined as the image of an image, a form of representation so distant from the original model that it constitutes an independent reality that can stand on its own. Simulacra are the third level of the representation system. In a museum, if visitors are faced with a statue and a painting of this statue, then the representation encompasses three levels: the living model, the statue (a representation or image), and the painting (a simulacrum). The simulacrum has little in common with the original model. It has also little in common with industrial copies, since contrary to them it introduces a variation from the original. The living model. Rather, it creates a new, independent reality, and seeks to bypass the original. In other words, it prompts the end of the traditional representation system, in which there was a model and an original artwork that could be designated as first and second, and told apart from the subsequent copies. The Venus is the most striking example of simulacrum in “Travels in Hyperreality”: in the Palace of Living Arts, a wax museum, the visitors are faced with a coloured wax statue of a Venus de Milo with arms (1986, p. 20). Insofar as it is an image of an image (freely drawing inspiration from the original Venus de Milo), and because it bears little resemblance to the original it imitates, this statue can be regarded as a simulacrum. The simulacra have more value to the Americans then the originals, because they correspond to an ideal, atemporal, hyperreal world. First, they have more colours and more dimensions, which makes them more than the original items. Second, they belong to an atemporal world because they are so far removed from their models that there is no origin to be traced back. In addition, they are made as immortal tokens, and, as such, they escape history. Conversely, the originals, often old and worn out, are said to be disappearing. For instance, at Santa Cruz Museum, where Eco (1986) beholds numerous versions of The Last Supper, an audio commentary warns that “the original fresco is by now ruined, almost invisible, unable to give you the emotion you have received from the three-dimensional copy” (p. 18).

The recorded voice serves a purpose: in a museum filled with simulacra, it is in its interest to have the visitors believe these simulacra are superior. As a consequence, this commentary's strategy is to speed up the disintegration of the original in the mind of the visitors. In all three texts preservation and destruction go hand in hand. First, the rise of the simulacra means the end of the traditional representation system, in which there was only the model and its aesthetical representation through art. Eco (1986) argues that the birth of simulacra originates in a desire to preserve the past:
[T]here is a constant in the average American imagination and taste, for which the past must be preserved and celebrated in full-scale authentic copy; a philosophy of immortality as duplication. [...] it dominates the relation with the self [...] with History and, even, with the European tradition.

p. 6.

Yet, In Eco's text, America is also seen as an all-devouring imperial power that causes the destruction of the former powers, called “primitive powers”. The simulacra appears as a tool of imperialism, selecting and modifying what deserves to be upkept. This rewriting of history can be seen as a form of apocalypse. The American museums embody:

[An] ideology of preservation, in the New World, of the treasures that the folly and negligence of the Old World are causing to disappear into the void. Naturally this ideology conceals something [...] the fact that it is the entrepreneurial colonization by the New World [...] that makes the Old World's condition critical. Just like the crocodile tears of the Roman patrician who reproduced the grandeurs of the very Greece that his country had humiliated and reduced to a colony. And so the Last Beach ideology develops its thirst for preservation of art from an imperialistic efficiency, but at the same time it is the bad conscience of the white man who thus pays his debt to the destroyed primitive cultures.


Baudrillard's text is also haunted by the idea of a disappearing world. Dozens of derivatives of the word “disparition” are sprinkled over the text and associated with the desert Baudrillard seeks. Once he has immersed himself into a hyperreality made of European-inspired simulacra, the old version of Europe has been definitely overshadowed: it disappears and cannot be retrieved: “[i]n Los Angeles, Europe has disappeared” (2016, p. 81). This reading of the catastrophe is backed-up by Jameson (1991):

[T]he catastrophe is the substitution of the real by the simulacrum, which entails a derealization of the whole surrounding world of everyday reality. [...] The world momentarily loses its depth and threatens to become a glossy skin, a stereoscopic illusion, a rush of filmic images without density. But is it now a terrifying or an exhilarating experience?

p. 34.

Baudrillard would likely have answered that the derealization is an exhilarating experience that ought to be sought. For him, the simulacra constitute a brand new reality which allows a fresh gaze to be cast on the world. A world “without depth” can be equated with the surface of a blank page, ready for the writing down of new perceptions and interpretations. However, this renewal calls for a destruction of the previous order. In Amérique, the simulacrum embodies an obsession with perfection so extreme that it justifies the extermination of the original model, the destruction of the reference:

[...] everything deserves to be protected, embalmed, restored. Everything is the object of a second birth, the eternal birth of the simulacrum. Not
only are the Americans missionaries, but they are Anabaptist: as they missed the first, original baptism, they dream of baptizing everything a second time, and only grant value to this ulterior sacrament, which is, as we know, the second edition of the first, only more real – which is the perfect definition of the simulacrum. […] To give things back in their exact shape, to present them to the Judgment Day, they are ready to destroy and exterminate […]. Baudrillard, 2016, p. 44.

Similarly, taking the example of Tibet, Iyer (2001) explains that genuine locations are reconstructed by Hollywood and preserved through these copies only, while they are in the process of being destroyed. There is no attempt to preserve the authentic: “Tibet is now on the world's screens, impeccably recreated in the mountains of Morocco and Argentina, while the country itself draws ever closer to extinction” (p. 36).

Conclusion

In the era of hyperreality and postmodernity, European writers outline an American concept of history based on perpetual movement. The machines – cars and planes – impel a rhythm on this movement, which remains out of humankind's control. The facticity of history is abandoned in favour of its forward movement, and since the slowness of human life is incompatible with the United States desire for a more eventful history, fictions are created as a replacement for historical events and traditions. The United States accumulate miscellaneous pieces of European history, which remains a landmarks and an inspiration, but these pieces are digested and transformed into simulacra. The disappearance of a former order and the reconstruction of the past is viewed by Iyer, Eco and Baudrillard as a creative process allowing a release from a burdening history. Yet in order to sow their own seeds in the land of history, the United States threaten to symbolically destroy past events and works of art. Both Eco and Baudrillard bear witness to this process, since the hyperreal simulacra retrospectively alter the image they have of the European referents; the return to the simple real is jeopardized, and the simulacra brings forth an end to the traditional understanding of history as irreversible.
References


Business Name Signboards in the Area of Bang Lamphu: Analysis of a Linguistic Landscape

Krittaphon Wangpusit, Phranakhon Rajabhat University, Thailand

Abstract
Business name signboards can shape the linguistic landscape of a business area and can create its identity. This study aims at analyzing distinctive features of the business name signboards in Bang Lamphu area by adopting Thom Huebner’s (2009) framework. It is found that, in terms of language, Thai business names outnumber others with the amount of 138 names in total. Others include Thai-China names (96 names) and mixed (74 names) respectively. In terms of the alphabets used on the signboards, the most used are Thai (147 signboards), Thai - China (102 signboards) and Thai (59 signboards) respectively. Based on the analysis of components of the signboards, the linguistic landscape of Bang Lamphu can be concluded as follows. First, Bang Lamphu can be construed of signboards demonstrating the preservation of Thai conventions. Next, Bang Lamphu is an area involved with globalization effects. Moreover, Bang Lamphu is an area for those belonging to different groups and income levels.

Keywords: Business Name Signboards, Bang Lamphu, Linguistic Landscape
Introduction

Signs have been around since the days of ancient Mesopotamia and Egypt's, 300 years BC, people started using signs to show the importance of places (J. Abbot 1994 cited in Supiti Janprasit 2000: 1) Suwrung Thongkum (2007: 105) says, "the label is very important because it shows the parties and the nature of the business", the signage that is intended to attract the attention of people passing by. So to write the name of the shops, type of business, product name or message relating to the things (Eng Arun University 1998: 3), also based on the landscape of Linguistics (Linguistic Landscape) (LL), a language which is displayed in signage is a key component of identity and meaning to different areas, the concept of landscape-oriented Linguistics (linguistic Landscape LL) is a linguistic concepts that focus the relationship between language and the various conditions, environmental, physical, linguistic landscapes that form the language or appear in different places. This plays a role in shaping the landscape or causing characteristics of the other, as Landry and Bourhis (cited in Florian Coulmas 2009: 15) states that "street signs, public billboards, street names, place names, sign shops, and public signs in government buildings, an element that is a form of landscape, the language clearly ", is important as showing the landscape and language of the community, the identity of each district trade shows the relationship with the environment.

The research suggests that the business names signboards in the area of Bang Lamphu looks interesting and indicative of the community that there are ways of living, social, contextual environment, therefore, worthy to be studied thoroughly and profound. Analysis suggests the following systems, using the concept of landscape-oriented language (linguistic Landscape LL), which an analysis of the language in the public areas as an indication or cultural characteristics of the communities in which it appears and is creating a hallmark of the community or local area.

In this study, the researchers introduced the concept of Thom Huebner 2009, which was revised application framework for the study of the ethnography of communication (Ethnography of Communication), Dell Hymes, 1974 was used to analyze the composition and characteristics of the signs.

The researchers chose to study in the area of Bang Lamphu, which is the commercial importance, which is the commercial hub former glory and is the oldest community one community in Bangkok, in the heart of Rattanakosin, a fascinating (Atthama Sokapanichwong 2001: 41-43; Wimonsiri Hemthanon 2003: 5) manner as described above, this area of Bang Lamphu area is attractive, the research aims to study business name signboards in the area Bang Lamphu, to answer the research question that features of business names signboards in the commercial district on the concept of linguistic landscape elements and how it affects the landscape of the Bang Lamphu area.

Researchers expect the business names signboards in this research will be useful to study the language and culture of Thailand and to study the language in the city (Metro Linguistics) and a new way of analyzing linguistic Thailand and linguistic concepts the landscape of Linguistics (linguistic Landscape) next.
The purpose of the research

Analyze the characteristics of business names signboards in the area of Bang Lamphu: along linguistic landscape (Linguistic Landscape LL).

Method

Details on how to do the research

1) Literature review, including the concept of linguistic landscape (Linguistic Landscape LL) and various related research.

2) Data collection

In this study, the researchers collected data both nonverbal name / text on business names signboards in the commercial district and is nonverbal, font color, highlighting, highlighting letters, symbols, pictures, posters and so on, the researchers will collect data, collect field data, note the name and photograph of the trades of the labels of commercial enterprises and interviews with business owners or those concerned about the source of the trades and the use of the label of the trades, to bring the analysis in the next step.

3) Data analysis

(1) Analyze business names signboards in the area of Bang Lamphu based linguistic landscape (Linguistic Landscape LL) of Thom Huebner, 2009.

(2) Proposed external expert review.

(3) A summary of the linguistic landscape in the area of Bang Lamphu based linguistic landscape (Linguistic Landscape LL) of Thom Huebner, 2009.

4) The results, compiled the findings.

Conceptual Framework

Theory of a landscape-oriented language that researchers use in this research, the concept of Thom Huebner, 2009, Huebner said in the past, the academic performance of a survey study on the landscape language of capital around the world many, but the main one is to opt for the classification and analysis of the language in the linguistic landscape is not (Thom Huebner, 2009: 70). For this reason, Huebner has tried to present an analytical framework to study the linguistic landscape with more, in this Huebner proposes that framework. "Ethnography of communication" (Ethnography of Communication) of Dell Hymes, 1974, then, is a framework that can be adapted for application to build the framework, the analysis for research in the linguistic landscape.

Huebner said the elements that should be considered in the study of the language of signage in public that there are eight elements, such as

S - Setting (scene) is the place or area where signage are placed in an analysis aimed at determining factors of physical, that label was set up anywhere, any area, nature shop buildings surrounding community and the environment.

P - Participants (event) is a receiver - a messenger, sometimes including other place in the event communications, in which case that person influences the communication that, for linguistic landscape, consider who is taking part in the preparation and
installation of signboards, signboards were prepared to communicate to anyone who wants to engage others associated with that signboards.

E - Ends (aim), the purpose of signboards, the signboards that are prepared for what purpose, for example, business names signboards aimed to convey the feelings and emotions, announcements will be made to provide advice and recommendation or solicitation, notice to explain, signboards warnings, restrictions, aim to define the relationship between a label reader signboards should behave.

A - Act sequence (the order), the order of the information and features on the label, which has two components, the characteristics of the layout of photos, text messages, and sort order for each section of the label.

K - Key (voice), is characterized by the use of distinctive signs.

I - Instrumentalities (Communication tool), is nonverbal and verbal language of the signs, which should be considered as a nonverbal language, the language and the characters used, the use of the dimensions, symbols, shapes, square, round, oval or independent, the appearance of the paint shop signs.

N - Norm of Interaction and Interpretation. (Norms of interaction and interpretation), the agreements are known and accepted on the conduct of the event between communication and agreement on the interpretation of the compounds media event destination, which in each culture, each instance of communication may vary, such as country A. has installed a sign in a shop in the language of their own country and so on.

G - Genre (category), such as the type of label, label, store, post, etc. The research suggests that the concept of landscape, linguistic, of Thom Huebner (2009) suited for landscape analysis of language to use as a study guide, business names signboards in the area of Bang Lamphu, each of the elements that affect the landscape in the area or not.

Research

1) Overview of the trades in the Bang Lamphu, the researchers will analyze the data business names signboards to the number of 308 businesses.

2) Features of business names signboards in Bang Lamphu area Landscape elements of the language of business names signboards in the Bang Lamphu, are as follows.

S – Setting community Banglumpu a dominant commercial center in the heart of Bangkok, the area of the border district community Banglumpu covered area below, north of the Samaeru Road, South of the Rambutre Road, east of the Bowonniwet Road and west of the Chakrabongse Road.

Most shops building retains its original features, observed with the use of trade names or decorative labels and popular tradition, while the modern style as well, a commercial district open, facing toward building a space between the traffic flow of vehicles.

Trades are located in commercial buildings and also have stalls, shops trolley along the road sub, these stores are located mingle together, not a separate area of business in any way, business names signboards will be displayed above the entrance of a trade or business may appear directly overhead pedestrian.
Scenes involving business names signboards in the commercial district of the country, society, Thailand, is a society that still preserve the traditional popularity of the original, which is in line with the country's policy is to encourage, promote and preserve the language, when taken into consideration, it can be said that the business names signboards in the area of Bang Lamphu, shows that this area is an area that has a single state language (monolingual policy) interesting.

**P - Participants** event communications with business names signboards in the Bang Lamphu, are as follows.

1) The sender, is the owner of the trade in the area, most of which are Thai-Chinese people.
2) The reciever, including customers, roaming in the Bang Lamphu area, which consists of Thailand, foreign students, students, workers, tourists, most customers are middle-aged 30-40 years.
3) Such other event, a group of people working around the commute, on the road that cuts through the neighborhood Banglumpu.
4) The government of Thailand has an important role to language in Thailand because of the policy language in Thailand, however, although the United States will continue to actively promote pragmatic language Thailand is the only language (Unilingual language policy), or even Thai language, standard will be honored as the national language, (the Lord blessed Chareonsak 2009: 21-23), but the commercial district, this is only their identity, is the use of language, but Thailand is a foreign language dividend increased.

**E - Ends** business names signboards, has been installed for the purpose to determine the most to say that the owner of the business, trade, who in the meantime has prepared banners, to commercial trade. is the identity of the trades that unlike other trades, however.

**A - Act sequence** the sequence of communication of a sign of things to consider two things: 1) the characteristics of the layout, text, images, and, 2) the sort order for each part the label, as follows:

1) The space of the sign
The researchers found that a label with the name trades as much as possible and to put the label of a commercial business is focused on providing a commercial presence, most prominently, the researcher, for example, business names signboards, has a label with the name of the commercial interest as well.

![Image 1 Label Store, Modern](image)
The first example, a business names signboards, business-related trade dress, signs show that the trade name will be featured in the label.

2) The order of the elements in the label
On this point, the researchers consider the sequence of letters, symbols in various business names signboards.

The results showed that, the labels have been used in Thailand or most other languages to be given, as the following example.

![Image 2 label shops, Kretiwat Nashoe](image)

For example, Figure 2, is a business names signboards related trades, the costumes, the label shows the name of the commercial use of the letter E Thailand most, also found that business names signboards most often. there will be other elements, in addition to the letter trades assembled, including text, picture, the media or related to the Company that, for example, a trade is usually the center of the label, as in this example.

![Image 3 label stores, pharmacies, Pharmacy win](image)

For example, Figure 3, the business names signboards related medical, the first element in a sign that there is a trade, and messages Metaphor (Pictorial Metaphor) is, image ads shown implications, implies, by. one is to use what means one thing, of relationships involving medical products and drugs, also can be seen that. Trade names are the dominant large letters.

**K - Key** (voice), the topic of this research is to study the nature of naming the business, the results showed that the appearance of the name to indicate the trades
directly (Hard-Sell), for example, Jeera, Yentafour, Khao geng banglamphu, Patongko, etc., found more than a name that does not convey the nature of Business direct (Soft-Sell), such as the use of synonyms to convey multiple meanings, wordplay, is taking place, words or phrases, can be linked to the two meanings are not related at the same time, or playing a significant overlap (double meaning), or ambiguous (ambiguity) (Sherzer, 2002: 2 cited. in Siriporn Pakdeeparsook, 2547), for example.

"Winner Medical", the title of "Winner Medical" in the name has two meanings, the first definition refers to the name of the owner and the second definition, means good fortune prevails trade.

I - Instrumentalities (communication tool), the research on this topic, consider the nature of the sign language used in that language, what is essentially, a character written language, this element that is very important, because it suggests that there may be people from different languages and cultures interacting together, the findings are as follows.

- The language used in business names signboards, unnamed in Thailand, most (138 names), followed by the names Thailand - Chinese (96 titles), name of languages like English, Language Thailand - English and so on. (74 titles), respectively, of the trades, Thailand is the most common in the apparel business. For example, Sengthong glasses, Siam, glasses, Sumalee, Ubonsangkatang.

- The letters used in business names signboards.
The analysis of the characters used in signage sorted by frequency, from most to least, as follows, 1) letter Thailand (147 titles), 2) letters, Thailand - Chinese (102 names), 3) letters. other languages, such as English characters. Thailand alphabet - English, etc. (59 titles), respectively, business names signboards used alphabet Thailand's most labels in the apparel business, such as the following picture.

Image 4, label stores, fabric stores Thai Namsin.

The picture shows the use of language and alphabet Thailand Thailand in purely commercial signage.

N - Norm of Interaction and Interpretation.

(Norms of interaction and interpretation) on this point, the researchers aim to analyze the agreement or the terms, rules about signage in the Bang Lamphu, the study found,
the laws and regulations that are relevant to business names signboards in the area of Bang Lamphu include

1) Tax Act 2510 and the 2534 Supplement. Label owner will have to pay tax at the rate specified in the Tax Act (No. 2) Act 2534, as amended by, Tax Act 2510, the Act contains significant details. tax rate, which is calculated from the size and character of the label, as follows. 
- Sign a letter to Thailand are charged 10 baht, five hundred per square centimeter. 
- Sign with alphabet letters with Thailand's foreign or mixed with visual or other charge 100 baht, five hundred per square centimeter. 
- Banners below, the rate of 200 baht, five hundred per square centimeter, is. 
  (A) that no signs or Thailand or whether they have any or not. 
  (B) signs with Thailand under partial or total foreign characters or less. 
It is seen that the taxation banners in support and give priority to the use of letters in Thailand label, can be seen as a sign that a letter Thailand, are taxed less than sign a letter languages. China, moreover, a sign with the letters Thailand appear next to their foreign language would taxpayers be a sign, a letter, a foreign language alone, shows that the United States focused on campaign spending in Thailand. the business names signboards, however, the Act also reflects that the government of Thailand does not restrict the use of the letters for foreign language in signs, too, study business names signboards showing that tax support using the letters in Thailand business names signboards, most. 

2) Regulation Office in partnership with the central company, registered partnership firms and 2554. Regulations such as the regulation of the Department of Commerce, Ministry of Commerce, which was defined as having no partnership or company name or any text, below. 
- The name of the king, queen or royal heir, support families, relatives of the royal family present, unless the minders. 
- Name ministries, bureaus, departments, government agencies, local government, state agencies or organizations, unless they have permission from the relevant minister, minister. 
- The name of the country, if the country is part of the name listed in parentheses after the name. 
- A name that is contrary to the policy of the State or contrary to public order. Or public morality 
  - Thailand language or foreign language meaning or understanding, whether a financial partnerships, such as securities, finance, banking, loan, credit, etc. INVESTMENT CREDIT MORTGAGE. 
  - A word or phrase that cannot be used, for example, borrow, honor Thailand, police, veterans, national, Buddhist, Central Market, Expressway, individualized, ASEAN, Chakri, Rama, prince, royal projects, and so on. 
The researchers found that the business does not have a business name or trade name that conflicts with the regulations of the Ministry of Commerce. 

3) The country's language policy 
The language policy of assimilation policies.(Assimilation policy) is, policies that promote a single language (monolingual policy), only one language, using austerity measures to accelerate the process of reducing the size of the group, who speak any one group of non-official languages of the smaller or the number less (Songporn Tarjaroenbsak 2552: 36).
However, although the United States has supported languages using Language Thailand, build the unity of the nation with the same language, commercial district Banglumpu the language in naming is over Thailand, the dominant feature of the landscape of the business district, this language, as language policy, which campaigned for the use of Thailand as standard or as the main language of communication.

G - Genre (of communication) is, types of signs, including labels, shops, banners, etc., types of signs that were found are both labeled as traditional popular created to preserve retain original as possible and creative to offer goods or services to attract, attention to customer or group found.

3) landscape-oriented Linguistics (Linguistic Landscape), reflecting the business names signboards. The study said that the linguistic landscape formed by business names signboards in Banglumpu below. 1) maintain the tradition popular, such is evident from the language in the name of maintaining a Thailand based, for example, Lotus clean Eala appearance, etc., and the signs and symbols of business names signboards like, appearance Anointed. He reflects Thailand to abide in Thailand or the trademark quality and delicious food, all the elements of section S - Setting (the) condition of business names signboards, building part, it retains the original, though. Before 2) Of (C) a popular tradition, such reflection is the name of the language that has been used in Chinese, English frequency increase, but less than in Thailand, in line with the aim to create a commercial identity of those trades. 3) There are many groups of different levels, which appear trades include a business with a booth and a wheelchair, also, the language of business names signboards, it is in Thailand, Chinese, English for example, shows that people living in diverse areas as well. 4) The influence of globalization, the elements of communication tools, which are used in the naming business, although Thailand have policies and laws, which encourage conservation and promote the campaign in Thailand and a sign with the letter Thailand. In this neighborhood, there are trades franchises from several international locations as well.

The study business names signboards can see that it is what creates business names signboards feature or linguistic landscape of the area is clearly visible.

Results and Discussion

The analysis of the elements in the communication business names signboards in the Siam Square and 8 composition according to the landscape of linguistics (Linguistic Landscape LL) of Thom Huebner, 2009, can be said that the eight elements within the "SPEAKING" effect, create a landscape in the Bang Lamphu, it is important, language, appears on the label that the trade is like.

It is seen that the commercial property, a society in which there is competition between cultural tradition popular at maintaining traditional trade in the popular culture that wants to create a universal, it is on the increase in the property this, compared to research Kittapon Wangphooosri (2555), "the name trades in the Siam Square area: a study based on a landscape-oriented language", to show that the Siam Square area opposite a district representative of the city or district. the trade reflects that the practice of naming and language signs in opposition to the policies of the
national language, a campaign to use Thailand as a priority but a commercial district of Siam Square has held that the use of English as the international language more.

Language is a reflection of the behavior and language used in the commercial district of Bangkok, then, that a group of people, is a residential area of the city that is open to foreign culture, a community that is not blocked in any way.

In this regard, the analysis in this research is to study the language in the Thailand business names signboards, suitable for applications in science teaching social studies in Thailand to ASEAN as well.

Researchers hope that this research will help readers see the role of language in a new dimension as the distinguished landscape of the neighborhood or area, as well as guidelines for language education in the urban context to the other side.
References


Contact email: krittaphon.wang@gmail.com
Abstract
The decolonisation movement that swept the British Caribbean and which saw all but five of the islands begin their move to self-government between 1962 and 1983, while heralding a significant change in the political relationships with the metropole, did little for the consciousness raising of the formerly colonial people to be independent. The significant icons of law and state still remained, largely, British. In order to address this situation the government of the newly recognised Republic of Trinidad and Tobago sought to foster a national consciousness through the establishment of a local television station. Against the backdrop of prevailing media theories of mass media’s role in national development and supported by the United General Assembly, the ultimate goal of TTT was to accelerate the development of a national identity, moving former colonials from British cultural imperialism to pride in self. It is here that this paper gains its relevance. By examining the role of the state television within government policy of the 1960s, within Wilbur Schramm’s media for third world development framework, the paper will analyse the extent to which TTT, during its existence as the sole television station between 1962 and 1976, created a counter hegemonic discourse within the nation’s movement from independence to republicanism.

Keywords: Caribbean Media Post-colonial Television Identity Nationalism
On August 31, 1962 Trinidad and Tobago Television (TTT) and Trinidad and Tobago came into being; TTT’s first broadcast was the flag raising independence ceremony. That iconic image has remained in the public imagination and continues to symbolize the birth of the nation. This image has persisted and continues to circulate in the national community even beyond TTT’s last broadcast on 15th January, 2005. Trinidad and Tobago lies off the North-east coast of Venezuela and is often considered to be one of the wealthiest countries in the Caribbean due to its oil and gas reserves. This twin-island nation, was formerly a British colony but after a failed attempt at a West Indian Federation among British colonies of the Caribbean, proceeded to independence in 1962, as part of the de-colonisation movement that swept the British Caribbean between 1962 and 1983. However, this change in political relationship would not in itself heighten national consciousness and create a national identity.

Within prevailing media theory of the era, mass communication was seen as a tool for developing countries to foster national development and change to society’s reliance on colonial imperialism to one of pride in self. For Trinidad and Tobago, the government attempted accelerate this process with the creation of a local television station – Trinidad and Tobago Television (TTT). TTT was the first television station in the Commonwealth Caribbean (Hosein, 1976) and had the explicit purpose of fostering a national consciousness in the people by emphasizing the values of Trinidad and Tobago (Trinidad and Tobago third Five Year Plan, 1970). This historical moment in the history of the Commonwealth Caribbean has been largely ignored in the history of the region. The continued privileging of the written text has perhaps unwittingly neglected visual text, specifically moving images, in Caribbean history. Consequently, the role of television in constructing the founding story of Trinidad and Tobago has received little prominence in the literature. Thus, this paper will analyse the extent to which TTT, during its existence as the sole television station in the first two decades of Trinidad and Tobago’s independence, created a counter hegemonic discourse that challenged the prevailing, colonial cultural imperialism within the national community. Firstly the theoretical underpinnings of the media in the developing world will be examined, then the paper will explore the policies and practices of TTT, within the social tensions of Trinidad society, and finally assess the extent to which it achieved its nationalistic goals.

The nationalist agenda of the anti-colonial period has influenced the use of television as public broadcasting in newly independent, former British colonies, particularly in the Caribbean (Lent, 1977, p. 58), in India (Sen Shitak, 2011; Butcher, 2003, p. 7), and in countries in Africa, such as Ghana, Nigeria and South Africa (Tayman, 2012, pp 249-251; Banda, 2010) The idea that electronic media could be an effective tool of social change gained popularity in the 1950s. The 1950s represented the last phase in the dominance of mass effects theories of mass media, such as the Hypodermic needle theory of mass media and the two-step flow theory. The Hypodermic Needle or “magic bullet” approach to media analysis held that audiences were passive recipients of highly influential media messages.
Katz and Lazarfeld in 1944 introduced the idea that the effect of media’s information flow is mediated by opinion leaders in society, hence the two-step flow theory of mass communication which ushered in the era of limited effects theories of mass media, underpinned by social psychology theories of social learning.

Media’s influence on audiences, largely reside in the way they shape perceptions of the world. All media are "the machinery of representation in modern societies". These representations inform our understanding of the world around us (Hall, 1986, p. 9), of our history, our relations with others and our position in the world and society. (Tayman, 2010, p. 249-251). In the context of newly independent developing countries in the 1960s, development communication theory - the idea of mass communication technologies could be used for national development was compelling. Wilbur Schramm, proposed that electronic media could facilitate national development by giving people a participatory role in deciding on the goals and pace of change. Specifically, Schramm stated, the use of mass communication offered citizens a participatory role in three key functions of developing a new nation – the watchman function, the policy function and the teaching function. The watchman function referred to the new nations' need to increase communication among its various segments within the national boundaries, as well as becoming concerned with surveillance of the international developments beyond their prior concerns with the colonizer. Additionally, the policy function refers to the use of media to gain the active participation of citizens in decision making, by fulfilling the need for information and persuasion inherent in the decision making process. Finally, the teaching function, he proposed, is fulfilled using mass media when, “the country uses information to increase the thirst for more information”, particularly with respect to the acquisition of new skills. (Schramm, 1964, p. 7)

Schramm’s theory was given impetus by the 1958 General Assembly of the United Nations’ call for a “program of concrete action” to build up mass communication facilities (press, radio broadcasting, film and television) in countries in the process of economic and social development. (Schramm, 1964, p. 5) In particular, the role of mass media in “third world” development was convincingly supported by the UNESCO publication, The role of Information in National Development1. This 1964 publication was an abridged version of Scramm’s influential book, Mass Media and National Development, where he discussed his development communication thesis. His is arguably an elitist, Eurocentric approach to development. However, his view was in congruence with the paradigm of nationalism to which many former British colonies, including Trinidad and Tobago aspired.

1 In 1962, Schramm, based on his prior work in theorizing the role of mass media in accelerating the development of newly independent nations, was commissioned by UNESCO to examine the role of the mass media in promoting economic and social progress. This followed the 1950s focus on developing the mass media of communication by the United Nations and included four years of work by the United Nations, from 1958-1962, working through UNESCO to develop mass media programme of development for each region of the world. According to the General assembly, “information media have an important part to play in education and in economic and social progress generally and that new techniques of communication offer special opportunities for acceleration of the education process.” See Foreword to: Schramm, W., The role of Information in National Development - Abridged Version of Mass Media and National Development, UNESCO, 1964, p. 14
Modern nationalism, for which there are numerous definitions, refers to a collective consciousness of allegiance to a politically sovereign community. This concept of nation states and nationalism has been influential in the aspirations of sections of the anti-colonial movement in the Caribbean. These aspirations have been largely spearheaded by European educated elites, such as Dr. Eric Williams. Therefore, although nationalism was promoted as an anti-colonial movement, it often adopted the state structure and ideology of the nation state introduced by the British colonizer, which was, essentially "the model of the bourgeois nation-state, the capitalist nation-state." (Basil, 1977, p. 39-46) For post-colonial, multicultural spaces like Trinidad, without a primordial basis for solidarity, nations are best conceptualized in Anderson’s terms as, imagined communities with four qualities. Firstly, they are “imagined because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow members, meet them of even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion.” Secondly, the nations are limited, “because even the largest of then has finite boundaries, which separates them from other nations. Thirdly, nations are also imagined as sovereign because the sovereign state is symbolic of freedom from the imposed, “legitimacy of the divinely-ordained, hierarchical dynastic realm” which preceded enlightenment. Finally, they are communities because nations are always conceived of as fraternities. (Anderson, 2006, p.7)

Brennan similarly argues, modern nations are “imaginary constructs that depend for their existence on an apparatus of cultural fictions.” Drawing on the work of scholars such as, Anderson (1983), Gellner, (1983) and Ranger, he, emphasized the creative work of inventing the nation, which suggests, “the cultural importance of what has often been treated as dry, rancorous political fact.” (Brennan, 1990, p. 130) Mass Media texts, in the form of the novel and newspaper, he notes, were instrumental in creating the literary myth which has allowed people to imagine themselves a part of, “a special community that was the nation” (Brennan, 1990, p. 131). Creating a national identity for former subject, went beyond political and economic considerations and involved complex social considerations. Thus, fostering national identity in post-colonial states like Trinidad and Tobago, as a form of social identity, required fundamental social change at the cultural level. The cultural change required in Trinidad resulted from historical antecedents of cultural erasure attendant to colonialism. In the context of post-colonial societies, the use media in the creation of national identity is founded on the concern with writing into history those subaltern histories omitted from dominant historical narratives. According to Brennan, in the west, this reclamation of histories, “has been a preliminary step in the construction of identity for marginalised groups” (Brennan, 1990, p. 131).

---

Trinidad is the meeting point of many cultures, diasporas and world views, which have collided, often violently, for centuries. It is the meeting point of explorers / colonisers from, Britain, France, Spain, Latvia, and labourer, some forced, some lured by or deceived into indentureship contracts, from Scotland, Ireland, India, Sierra Leone, St. Helena and West Africa, China, Portugal. Additionally, prior in the early twentieth century, people fleeing religious persecution and economic hardship came from Greater Syria (present day Iraq, Syria, Palestine and Lebanon). These migrants groups all added to the multiple nations of indigenous peoples already present in the Caribbean at the time of Christopher Columbus’s arrival in 1492 (Reid, 2009, pp. 11-48; Brereton 1981). Thus, the term “creolisation” has been introduced into academic discourse by Jamaican historian and poet, Kamau Brathwaite (1971) to bring a postcolonial analytical lens through which to view the Caribbean’s social history of hybridisation, of which Trinidad is a part. Creolization refers to the process of interaction which produces a new reality, which is neither one nor the other of the original elements, but which nevertheless share some features with the original elements (Bamikole, 2007, p. 76).

The creation of creole cultures of the Caribbean resulted from the traumatic encounters of genocide, colonisation and slavery. These traumatic encounters rendered each group incapable of fully retaining its “mother” culture, resulting a process of forced cultural hybridization. Yet, through the intangible heritages of these diasporas which make up the Caribbean, the distinctive Caribbean ethos was created. (Nettelford, 2007, para.16) Creolisation in this perspective was a process which continued into the post-emancipation period and became the basis upon which national and regional identities were developed. The concept of creolisation has undergone, “a massive blurring” (Palmie’, 2006, p. 44) which extended its meaning to describe contemporary processes of cultural hybridisations being brought about by globalization (Hall, 2003, p. 234). However, some Caribbean scholars (Mintz 1971; Khan, 2001) have been opposed to removing the term from its geo-historical realities in the Caribbean. In the Caribbean, creolisation has “involved the loss and refashioning of cultural materials”. (Mintz qtd in Stewart, 2007, p. 4) In this context it is considered subaltern agency - “a positive, resistive force to cultural hegemony” (Prabhu, 2007, p. 8).

The vision of national identity espoused by the premier and first Prime Minister of Trinidad and Tobago, Eric Williams was undoubtedly a creole nationality. Williams advocated for the acknowledgement of the ancestral cultures of the peoples of Trinidad and Tobago. However, these were to be subsumed within the emerging national culture of Trinidad and Tobago for a cohesive national identity. Colonialism relies on the destruction of national cultures, for culture is an integral part of selfhood. According to Fanon, “colonial domination, because it is total and tends to oversimplify, very soon disrupts in spectacular fashion, the cultural life of a conquered people. This cultural obliteration is made possible by the negation of national reality, by new legal relations introduced by the occupying power”. (Fanon, 1963) Thus, national culture is the highest expression of national liberation. The culture of Trinidad and Tobago was envisioned as a creole culture beholden to no mother country except Trinidad and Tobago, to be created and expressed by the people Trinidad and Tobago, starting with the excavation of those suppressed subaltern histories.
Therefore, construction of the nation’s history was an urgent and essential component of the independence project. Here the government’s use of mass media in this process is apparent. For instance, the week preceding the independence ceremony of August 31st, the nation was presented with a special publication; The Independence Supplement was published on August 26th 1962 in the daily. This publication focused on the histories of Trinidad and Tobago from 15th century European encounters with the indigenous peoples to the contemporary events of the era. This supplement included in depth articles on such topics as, History of the nation, History of Law and Order, History of the Sugar Industry, a book review of Philip Sherlock’s The Story of Trinidad, Revolt of Indigenous people, East Indian Indentureship, the History of the development of Steelband and the History of Folklore, amongst others. (Guardian Newspaper, August 26, 1962). This supplement was the culmination a series of newspaper publications and radio broadcasts, which the Williams government used to create the nation in the public imagination. These media texts taught colonial subjects, the rights and responsibilities of citizenship and independence, national symbols, national songs and protocols for their use. Symbolic of the central role of history in nationhood, Dr. Eric Williams, first premier and Prime Minister of Trinidad and Tobago, wrote, The History of the People of Trinidad and Tobago and called it, “a declaration of Independence of the united people of Trinidad and Tobago.” (Williams, 1964, p. ix) Having made this declaration of the country’s independence the electronic media in the form of television was introduced to further the project of nation-building.

Culture and technology are analytically distinct but dialectically related phenomena. Technology helps to shape and produce culture as culture creates and employs technology (Brwon, 1990). The media's main sphere of operations is the production and transformation of ideologies (Hall 1996, p. 160). The value of electronic media to the building of national consciousness lies in the ideological nature of their products (Thompson 1997, p. 34) and their influence on how people perceive their individual and group identities, (Hall 1996, p.161) including national identities. Broadcasting developed in accordance with two ideological, financial and regulatory models - one commercial and one public service. Broadcasting has been commercial almost from its inception in the United States. However, in European states, broadcasting was viewed as a public good. In the former, broadcasting was a free market activity; in the latter broadcasting was a government controlled and supported activity. (Brown, 1990) Caribbean broadcasting has historically followed the British public service model. However, following independence, broadcasting evolved into a hybrid to meet the economic and cultural needs of the region. Yet, the tradition of “public ownership and control was maintained even after independence, with the introduction of television in the decade of the 1960s (Brown, 1990). This reflected the practice in many post-colonial countries where national monopoly control was taken to be a technical necessity to protect the national interest” (Golding & Elliott 1979, p. 45). In other words, the potential of the new medium to influence opinion and culture was, considered to be too great to cede to popular control.
Schramm’s observations on the use of media for social change had great relevance for Trinidad’s society in 1962. The prevailing perspective that mass media were effective at creating solidarities was compelling. However, building solidarity through culture rather than conquest, is a gradual process (Schudson, 1977). According to Schramm, “when change is introduced in such a way to take advantage of, rather than tear, cultural links, then the results may be good and far-reaching.” However, he cautioned, “mass media risk being ineffective – indeed being counter-productive” if they were used without adequate knowledge of the local culture. (Schramm, 1964, p. 14) In Trinidad the very notion of “local culture” was problematic as communities identified with ancestral and diasporic cultural links as well as syncretic cultures. The emphasis on the local in the context of Trinidad and Tobago society on the surface precluded colonial loyalties. However, with the perpetuation of colonial institutions of socialisation, the determination of the “local” / “national” as the antithesis of the “foreign” / “colonial” was problematic, for the “local” / “national” was still in the process of creation.

The idea for a local television station to serve the islands of Trinidad and Tobago originated with Lord Roy Thompson, a Canadian businessman and media magnate, who had already set up local television stations in a number of former British colonies, as they gained their independence. (Muhammad, 2006) A consortium was formed to bring together technical and financial resources: The Thomson Organisation and British broadcasting company, Rediffusion each owned 40% of the shares in Trinidad and Tobago Television. The government of Trinidad and Tobago and the United States of America company, Columbia Broadcasting System each held 10% of the shares.

There was no regulatory governance to television broadcasting, TTT was allowed to operate by the government granting a license and assigning its administration to a Cabinet Minister. The business of TTT was under the direction of a Board of Directors which reflected the ownership, with the general manager of TTT also occupying a seat. The set-up management consisted of non-nationals who visited the country to build infrastructure, install equipment, recruit and train local staff. (Muhammad, 2006)

TTT was therefore technologically and logistically built by professionals from North America and Britain and then shaped by the local staff. However, the operations was guided by the Trinidad Third five-Year Plan 1969-1973, which emphasized local control, staff, advertising, and content. (Trinidad and Tobago third Five Year Plan, 1970). Programming decisions were left to the management of the station, which was largely Trinidad nationals who were charged with the development of a wide range of local programming for the station marketed to the populace with the tag line “It’s Yours!”. With this guiding policy, TTT impacted the cultural life of Trinidad and Tobago.

TTT brought new shared cultural practices and symbols, for with TTT came the ritual of public and private viewing of television. They rhythm of national life in many respects followed the TTT schedule and vice versa. For instance Sunday afternoon Indian movies followed Sunday lunch - a traditional, elaborate affair which involved the whole family. The viewing of the Indian movie with subtitles became an
extension of the family ritual. Television was relatively expensive and became a status symbol of sorts. Thus, in the first few years television, viewing was a community-based activity. Residents came together around the one or few televisions in the community and having neighbors visit to “watch TV” became a new social norm.

The government’s use of TTT to assist in Schramm’s watchman, policy and teaching functions is reflected in the range of programming on the station in its early years. In the 1970s programming totalled over 73 hours a week and included: feature films, programs for community groups designed to contribute to the government’s adult education campaign news and information, programs for special audiences, light entertainment and literature and the arts. During the same period 4 to 5 documentary and educational films were produced each year by the Public Relations Division film unit, under the Prime Minister’s Office. (Skinner, 1994, p. 48) The watchman function was executed through news and information-based, current affairs programmes such as, Time To Talk, Mainly For Women, At Home, It’s In The News, Community Dateline and Zingay. Local educational programming included College Quiz, Know Your country and the live in-studio children’s educational programme, The Rikki Tikki Show (Rampersad, 2012) in specific execution of its teaching function. By 1975 the percentage of local programmes transmitted by TTT peaked at just over 40% which was the highest ratio in the Caribbean at the time (Skinner, 1994, p. 48).

Production was supported by the policy directive to TTT to give, dignity to rural life, and provide opportunities for local talent. (Trinidad and Tobago third Five Year Plan, 1970) To fulfil this mandate, in 1963 TTT began live coverage of the main national festival - carnival and related in-studio programs. The station soon developed the iconic talent show, Scouting for Talent, which became the first stage for many local artists who went on to achieve national and international fame. These initiatives set the stage for broadcasting of other artistic programmes which showcased the cultural diversity of Trinidad and Tobago. Also building on Trinidad’s rich theatre and literary traditions, TTT provided the population with local soap operas, brought folk theatre to screen by and gave Trinidad and Tobago its first locally produced game show.

The range of programmes was also intended to mediate the social tensions in Trinidad society surrounding access to resources and opportunities for upward mobility. Those tensions were reproduced in the public contestations over representation on television. Members of the public complained of media’s urban bias, and called for greater representation of marginalized groups in the television portrayals. Simultaneously, the public complained of the poor technical quality of the locally produced programmes. The government through the Office of the Prime Minister sought to address the issues of representation with the implementation of a national community-based performing arts competition, Best Village, which would be broadcast on TTT. These programmes, produced in Trinidad and in large part, reflecting cultural practices in Trinidad cleared a space among imported media texts and colonial education, in the mindscape of citizens and in some important respects centred the lived experiences of Trinidadians in media representations - in narrative films, live broadcasts and in-studio productions.
TTT allowed opportunities for the cultural resistance and the formation of a counter-hegemonic identity. This is perhaps nowhere more evident than in the commercial success and public support of iconic local talent programmes on TTT in that era, exemplified by the show, *Scouting for Talent*, which began its broadcast on TT in 1963. This show allowed ordinary citizens to showcase their musical talent in a production with live studio audience. Talent shows of this type offered the country new cultural heroes. *Scouting for Talent*’s host, Holly Betaudier has become one of Trinidad and Tobago’s cultural legends. However, Betaudier’s lack of Eurocentric mannerisms in on-screen presentation was initially considered a grave problem to be fixed. Barry Gordon, as the head of TTT during *Scouting for Talent*’s first few years, recounted his attempts to “fix” the problem:

*Scouting for Talent* was probably the most successful local commercial show on television. While the talent that appeared on the programme deserves a lot of credit for this success I feel it was mainly due to Holly Betaudier the host. I had many sessions with Holly where I tried to correct his grammar and presentation. And then I realized that I was wrong. Holly was a son of the soil and represented the average local person . . . the clerk in the stores, the cutter in the cane fields, the cutlass-wielding vendor at the coconut carts. Holly was Holly and I was wrong to try to mould him into the likes of a sterile host as seen on North American television. (Gordon, 2006)

Programmes like Scouting for Talent and presenters like Betaudier, who routinely presented in both the English-based dialect and the lesser known French-based dialect called, *Patois*, were the exception rather than the rule in TTT’s broadcasting.

These opportunities, were insufficient to mediate the realities of Trinidad’s society in the 1960s and 1970s where race/class tensions were heightened by socio-economic disparities. The concept of Trinidad and Tobago’s creole identity as subaltern agency was limited by institutionalized practices which confirmed Trinidad’s occupation of a hybridized, hierarchical space located between two racial poles that, according to Hintzen, served as markers of civilization and savagery. He argued, “when applied to Europeans, creolisation implies the taint of savagery. When applied to Africans it implies a brush with civilization.” (Hintzen, 2002, p. 94) Additionally, Aisha Khan argues there existed a two-fold interpretation of creole in the Trinidad context.

In the context of slave-plantation and post-emancipation society—the colonial period, in other words—Trinidadian society was conventionally depicted as a three-tier pyramid: “white” at the top, “brown” in the middle, and “black” at the bottom. This pyramid represented the color-class hierarchy of the population, and referenced the African-European ancestral foundations of Trinidadian society. Secondly, she believes the independence movement brought the idea of “mixed”, the second dimension of “creolisation” into prominence. “Mixed as an index of the Trinidadian national character became symbolized as the rainbow, which superseded the pyramid. The rainbow metaphorically represents a united, independent nation of culturally and racially distinct groups who coexist together in harmonious cooperation (Khan, 20017, p. 55). The different connotations of “mixed”
and “creole” according to Khan reflected the perception of marginalization held by some groups of Trinidad’s post-independence society. “Ideologically, the allegedly “exotic” immigrants who came post-emancipation (East Indians, Chinese, Syrian-Lebanese) could not be mixed—as in absorbed—into the Afro-Euro foundation and were depicted (and treated) as foreign addenda that diversified Trinidadian society but did not alter its basic constitution” (Khan, 20017, p. 55).

Hintzen and Khan, articulated the ethnic tensions within the society, which presented challenges to the construction of the nation’s founding story, which had been perceived as “an Afro Creole master narrative” (Brereton, 2007, pp. 171 - 182). The ideology of creolization, has been criticized for construing “Trinidadian” and “national” as Afro-creole. The national symbols, some have argued were considered to be symbolic of African retentions – the calypso, steelband and Carnival (Ryan, 1994). Consequently, elements which East Indians brought to the cultural mix, were seen and stigmatized by some as being ‘oriental’ and not born of struggle in the Caribbean as were, carnival, steelband, bongo, limbo or the Spiritual Baptist religion. Aisha Khan elaborates (“Sacred Subversions”, 2004):

In hegemonic nationalist discourse, creolization moves toward national unity, but that nation has been defined according to a middle-class Afro-Trinidadian vision; in Indo-Trinidadian nationalist discourse, creolization spells subsumption within a vision not its own. (p. 174)

Ironically, the nation faced its first major threat from Black Power activists, who had rejected creole nationalism in favor of Pan-African nationalism. The serious social upheaval came to a climax with the 1970 revolt, as the working class clamoured for a more equitable position in the country’s socio-economic structure. The government’s policies, were criticised, by Caribbean intellectuals, representatives of the labour movement and proponents of black power as being neo-colonial. (Quinn, 2014; Taimoon & Stewart, 1995) Brereton argues, this Afro-creole narrative and the ethnic and regional counter-narratives which merged following the 1970s, “suppressed the earlier, class-based interpretation of the nation’s history” (Brereton, 2007, p. 171). TTT’s role in legitimizing suppressed cultures contributed to the writing of the history of the new nation, from below.

Nonetheless, at TTT, despite its commitment to diversity in local programming, what often resulted was the creation of local versions of colonial practices and media products. While there were elements of “shooting back” - the moving images counterpart to the post-colonial literary arts movement articulated in The Empire Writes Back (Ashcroft, Gareth & Tiffin, 2002) - often the programmes reproduced hegemonic representations. For instance to decision to name the flagship News programme Panorama, was no doubt influenced by its namesake from BBC and appropriated the British style of news presentation of the time. In an effort to localize TTT, the Trinidad and Tobago government assumed majority shareholding in the station in 1969 by purchasing the Thompson and Rediffusion shares, leaving CBS as the only minority shareholder with 10 per cent. Further the Third Five Year Plan for Trinidad and Tobago (1970) articulated the policy position that, there would be no new foreign television stations introduced in the country and no foreign enterprise
would be permitted to purchase any existing local television station. This economic intervention did little to address the organizational culture and journalistic practice of TTT. The journalistic values, programme formats and mannerisms of colonial broadcasting were retained.

The inclusion of programmes featuring creole language varieties and folk cultures, such as Scouting for Talent, Mastana Bahar, Best Village and Play of the Month delivered with a distinctive local accent, were attempts at inclusion and cultural resistance, following calls from the public for programmes which reflect local “grassroots” values and norms. However, the manner of their inclusion within the full range of programming served to reinforce the notion that the norm was still American and British. For instance the use of dialect was relegated to entertainment programme and/or programmes specifically highlighting, or exoticising African and East Indian cultural retentions. “Serious” issues and programmes, such as the flagship news broadcast, Panaroma and the current affairs discussion programme Time to Talk, required the closest approximation of British language and presentation codes. These practices in media were a reflection of the institutional practices of key state institutions in Trinidad, such as the, judiciary, primary and secondary educational institutions, which continued to privilege Eurocentric ontologies and epistemologies.

Technological and economic realities combined to erode the efforts of TTT in creating a hegemonic nationalist discourse, in its first decade of operations. The growth and popularisation of video technology, the compatibility of the North American broadcasting systems, the proximity of the Caribbean to North America and the rise of the Hollywood blockbuster, led to a significant increase in the imports of television programs from the US. (Brown) By the mid 1970s, it was now relatively cheaper to purchase the North American video programmes than produce locally. Thus, from the mid 1970s to the mid 1980s imported content in TTT had grown by a bewildering 89% (Mullerleile 1996). The pattern of North American media penetration was also evident throughout CARICOM, prompting a regional response to the emerging cultural dependency which accompanied the imported cultural ideologies of foreign media texts.

Thus by the end of the first decade of Trinidad and Tobago’s independence, the political and academic winds had shifted with respect to their optimistic projections for media’s role in the development of newly-independent nations. In the Caribbean, theories of development communication had given way to concerns about North American cultural penetration. As the 1960s drew to a close, Trinidad and Tobago and the wider CARICOM region governments entered the international debate on ICT, expressing concerns about the flow of information about the region, into and out of the region. At The fourth Conference of Heads of Government of Commonwealth Caribbean countries meeting in 1967 the countries agreed to “the establishment of a regional news agency; and the regular exchange of sound radio and television programme material including educational programmes by territorial broadcasting organisations”3 as a starting point in these new nations’ control of their information

and communication flows. Internationally, UNESCO became, “the site for the debate about the net flow and effects of the exchange of information between nations in the nineteen-seventies” (Pendakur 1983). Trinidad and Tobago, as part of the non-aligned movement joined in the articulation of arguments against the western developed nation’s dominance of mass communication flows, 1973 at the Fourth conference of Non-aligned countries in Algeria in 1973. In the Caribbean, the dominance of foreign media products and control of news flows resulted in:

- A veritable monopoly of news on the part of the developed countries
- A de facto hegemony founded on financial, industrial, cultural and technological power, which resulted in developing countries like Trinidad and Tobago being relegated in large part to the status of consumers of information.
- Cultural colonialism via the propaganda of advertising, content of television programmes, had become, “instruments of cultural domination and acculturation, transmitting to the developing countries messages which are harmful to their cultures, contrary to their values and detrimental to their development efforts.”

These concerns were not unique to Trinidad and Tobago and were raised in one of the reports of the United Nations’ International Commission for the study of Communications problems, *The New World Information Order*, presented by Mustapha Masoudi at the third session of the International Commission for the Study of communication Problems in 1978.

These concerns gave rise to the call for the creation of a New World Information and Communication order to redress these imbalances.

The experience of TTT is relevant to Masmoudi’s assessment of the communication problems facing developing countries. He stated, “the framework within which communication takes place is ultimately determined by the political and social struggles which have shaped the prevailing social consensus in a given society.” (UNESCO, 1980) The years 1962 to 1976 represented a period of transition for Trinidad and Tobago. However, despite valiant efforts to construct a national identity from its diversity, Trinidad and Tobago in retaining the inherently inequitable systems and institutions of colonialism, was unable to correct these legacies, or resist the communication dominance of North America. Thus, TTT, while creating significant spaces of cultural resistance and promoting a founding narrative of the independent creole nation where “every creed and race finds and equal place” ultimately reproduced the neo-colonial hegemony prevailing in the wider society.

**Acknowledgements**

I am grateful for the support for this conference paper and presentation provided to me by the School for Graduate Studies and Research, Campus Research and Publication Fund and the Faculty of Humanities and Education, of the University of the West Indies, at the St. Augustine Campus and the very helpful staff of the National Archives of Trinidad and Tobago.

---

4 A line from the National Anthem of Trinidad and Tobago
References


Davidson, Basil, (1977), Questions about Nationalism, African Affairs, 76 (302) Oxford University Press


Rampersad, Joan. First National Television Station. Trinidad and Tobago Newsday. August 30, 2012.


Williams, Eric, (1962) History of the People of Trinidad and Tobago (New York, NY: Frederick A. Prager Inc)


**Contact email:** lynette.sampson@gmail.com
Contesting History: Revisiting Native American Identity Through the Narratives of Momaday and Erdrich

Lalrinchhani Hmar, Mizoram University, India

The European Conference of Arts & Humanities 2017
Official Conference Proceedings
Native American Literature today has established a stable ground for itself in excavating and communicating those histories that were ignored, limited or utterly misrepresented by conventional histories. It has surpassed the boundaries set by conventional American History in that it tells the truths about the past that history cannot articulate and has been a strong force through time in asserting a different experience of American history and an altered perception of the past itself. Its strategic objective has been in considering how, “the past is conceptualized within Native cultures at the tribal and cross-tribal level and how this has informed the literary projects of specific Native writers.” (Allen, 122)

A variety of mainstream conceptualizations such as race, class, ethnicity, culture and postmodern approach have constantly been applied to explore and understand the Native American experience, which however seems to result in the noticeable intellectual marginalization of Native American Studies. Even though all these concepts are applicable in conceptualizing the Native American experience, they however are not sufficient in offering a holistic approach that centers on Native American communities and interpretations. Contemporary Native American writers have made an effort in popularizing their stories about how they were prejudicially subordinated or incorporated in alien states, which treat them as outsiders and usually as inferiors. They consequently strove to bring about a distinctive reading of their own writings by studying how as a “Nation”, they have endured innumerable battles against their marauders, by popularizing their own interpretations regarding the many treaties they signed with the US Government most of which were bigoted, by passionately retelling their stories and faithfully practicing their ceremonies for centuries and engaging in the on-going debates and controversies regarding Native American identity.

A deeper understanding of Native American tribal ways of life reveals that they have their own interpretation of individual and collective well-being. Rather than seeking emancipation from colonial oppression, Native American world view seeks spiritual and moral balance with all living forms of the world. Elizabeth Cooklyn exclaims in utter clarity why she writes in her Preface to *Anti-Indianism in Modern America*:

> I write because such days and places are unforgettable, and because the colonial dictatorship imposed on the very private lives of a very private people festers still and contaminates the life of a whole country (Cooklyn, Preface x).

Although many writings by Native Americans have been published before 1968, a drastic but much desirable change regarding the perception and reception of Native American writings materialized with the publication of *House Made of Dawn* in 1968 by N.Scott Momaday. Like any other tribal nations, Native Americans also have their earliest historical records about them written by the Europeans who immigrated to America. Social disruption followed along with extensive political tension and ethnic violence as a result of the differences in cultures between the established Native Americans and immigrant Europeans. Before Momaday’s ground-breaking novel, Native Americans were viewed as sources of unique national identity and literature discrete from European traditions. Thus, the trope of the “disappearing Indian” was employed in a number of texts written by non-
natives. These texts presented the death of the Native Americans as natural, rather than the result of political exclusion or social discrimination. This could be regarded as a denial of the Indian Removal Act passed by the US Congress in 1830 that forcibly removed Native Americans from their own homelands and relocate them in small reservations as a means to set them on the course to “civilization” that best ensured their survival.

Early Native American authors paved the way for Native American Literature to flourish today. They wrote within a hostile political climate, and in response to a dominant literary tradition that sentimentalized the death of Native Americans. But they found the means to engage with mainstream critics by authoring their own accounts of Native Americans that challenged stereotypical beliefs, demanded equal political rights and proved that Native Americans were neither disappearing nor silent. The period between late 1960s and 1970s was termed as “Native American Renaissance,” a period that saw the beginning of historical revisionism which attempted to document the history and colonization of the North American continent from a native perspective. A generation of Native Americans emerged who took up the task of writing about the issues of Native rights and the burdens of racial identities in their short stories and novels.

On a literary level, it is fair to say that Momaday's works brought about a reversal of roles: the Native American way of life was now recognized and given importance. Of Kiowa descent, Momaday has been a remarkable force in the preservation and flourishing of Native American culture. *House Made of Dawn* that depicts the agonizing search for identity was awarded the Pulitzer Prize in 1969. There is much resemblance between Momaday himself and Abel, the protagonist in the novel who is conflicted between the contending prerogatives of Native American tradition and modern American culture. The idea of emphasizing the importance of Native American identity was again seen in *The Way to Rainy Mountain* (1969) and *The Names* (1976) where this concept evolved in a more individual context. In an early essay, "The Morality of Indian Hating" (1964), Momaday had written that Native Americans have been for a long time generalized in the imagination of the white man. He had been denied the acknowledgment of individuality and change, and had been made to become in theory what he could not become in fact, a mixture of himself. The journey or the drive to recuperate wholeness and totality of self is thus the subject of much of Momaday's writing.

Native American texts like Momaday’s continue to revise how Native American history has often been interpreted and construed from the time of colonization. It transforms the history that has been narrated, interpreted and studied by the white man, which is often in juxtaposition to the Natives’ worldview and values. The White man’s interruption necessitates a negation of the rich history of the Native Americans, their religion, customs and identity, as well as an identification of the Native Americans as the “Other” who is uncivilized, and thus in need of the white man’s salvation.

Paula Gunn Allen points out that “the purpose of Native American Literature is never one of pure self-expression”. As a consequence, what we have in Native American writings is a quest for balance, prerequisite to seek individual, communal and environmental balance which includes a sense of interconnectedness and
relationship between all things, between animals, land, people and their language. Within Contemporary Native American Literature, the protagonists often undertakes this quest for balance.

Besides Momaday, Louis Erdrich have also written novels that depict characters seeking indigenous identity while in the meantime correcting history and established notions about Native Americans through this journey. Her novels explore some of the issues and conflicts faced by the Native American community in the twentieth century. Both Momaday and Erdrich have dealt on themes that depict reformation of their indigenous tribal identity making the novel a centrepiece for a program of both cultural transformation and continuity. They focus on the importance of community to individuals and their desire to maintain an indigenous focus based on their history which encompasses the themes of loss and tragedy. They challenge the dominant culture to suppress or overcome minority literature and culture.

Situating “tribal” identity has always been the dominant theme in Native American literature. Writers emphasized on the importance of community and shared ethnic identity through rituals and rhetoric of spirit and soul concentrating on ethnic identity as internal structure and as a self-contained source of individual and group identity. Native American writers therefore use literature as a source of formulating the concept of Nationhood which is affected by imagination in the way that citizens of tribal nations perceive their cultural and political identity.

From birth, the Native American oral tradition provides instruction in the culture and beliefs of the people by transmitting a sense of self, kinship, and tribal identity. Not only does it assist in establishing a close relationship with nature, it furthermore unifies tribal history and reveals ambiguities and natural phenomena. In the Native American culture, a good storyteller has the gift of moving its listeners into another world. Today, the task of the storyteller has been effectively transferred to good writers who are able to capture the oral world of Native Americans through their writings.

Many Native American tales explain that people and the universe at the same time moved from chaos and disorder to balance and harmony. These stories offer examples of archetypal relationships that show communal and cyclic evolution, an evolution tied to a very particular place. Louise Erdrich’s recurrent theme concerns the ties between people and geographical locations, the importance of community among all living beings, the complexities of individual and cultural identity and cultural survival. In her novel, *The Beet Queen* for example, Erdrich invites readers to see through the attitudes of characters exhibiting more “Native American” than Western consciousness, and to reason about Eurocentric welfares and ideals that forcefully control the lives of people who do not embrace them. Through an acquired knowledge of an Ojibwen perspective, readers are introduced to the regional history of the Turtle Mountain Ojibwe of North Dakota in *Love Medicine* and its sequels. We learn of a tribe who’s collective and individual identities have been affected drastically in their violent dealings with the Euro-Americans. The transformation of Native American culture and religion through the forceful introduction of Roman Catholicism is also dealt with by Erdrich and she does so presenting it from an indigenous perspective.
The structure of most Native American stories follows a pattern from disequilibrium to equilibrium. Often a situation occurs at the beginning of a story wherein the harmony and the equilibrium of things is destroyed or shaken and the rest of the story or myth narrates the efforts to restore this harmony. The plot of *House Made of Dawn* written by N. Scott Momaday similarly mimics Navajo chant ways or healing ceremonials undertaking a journey from conflict to harmony; from the destructive fragmentation of Abel’s sense of self to its positive reassemblage. Through Abel, Momaday recounted the experience of a number of men that he knew who had been disoriented in a way that Abel is. *House Made of Dawn* interestingly is Momaday’s attempt to not only delineate the causes of this behaviour but to envision what it would take to rebuild and heal from such estrangement. Through the character of Abel, he offers avenues for healing such suffering. Abel who after returning from World War II suffered a psychological inability to connect with his environment eventually achieves insight through the power of imagination and ritual language. Eventually Abel is able to locate himself once again at the center. He remembers, through his grandfather’s voice, that he knew/ knows “the long journey of the sun on the black mesa, how it rode in the season and the years, and they must live according to the sun appearing, for only then could they reckon where they were, in time.” (Momaday, 177) Thus, when Abel assumes his grandfather’s place as a dawn runner, he is able to run towards recreation.

Both Momaday’s and Erdrich’s texts clearly mirror the uniqueness of Native American spirituality and situate Native American identity in the interrelatedness of all things. Ines Hernandez-Avila, a Native American scholar and professor concerned with preserving the intellectual sovereignty of Native people wrote that “many Native American people who have been cut off from their traditions are hungry to recapture their ways, or at the very least, have a sense of what they have lost” (Hernández-Ávila, 334). In her essay, “Mediations of the Spirit: Native American Religious Traditions and the Ethics of Representation,” she quoted Grampa Raymond: "The ceremonies, the language, the songs, the dances are not lost. We are lost; they are where they have always been, just waiting to be (re)called." (334)

Native American religion that is grounded in specific languages, lands, rituals and myths and the community of tribes is exceedingly diverse and can consequently offer no easy summary nor can it be simplified into one text. Native American spirituality have persevered countless of religious and political suppression and has nevertheless preserved its unique ethnic history till today. It is this history that provides a boulevard to contemporary scholars and writers where they could pick up the pieces in framing Native American identity however clouded and muddled the path may be. Additionally, from the methodical reflection hitherto, it is evident that Native Americans do not consider their spirituality, ceremonies, and rituals as “religion.” Rather, their beliefs and practices form an essential and seamless part of their very being. From Momaday’s Abel, whose fragmented self is healed through Navajo chant ways and healing ceremonies to Louise Erdrich whose characters embody Native American consciousness in their search for the “whole”, we learn that the achievement of a “wholeness” of being in the Native American sense comes from an understanding and connection to their beliefs and practices. Healing chants
and ceremonies, songs and stories underline restoration of wholeness. And at the heart of it is the community of relationships that withstand and endure all its splintering, conflicts and denials. Through it all, it searches for a meaningful world of spirituality and innate commitment. The Native American tribes according to Paula Gunn Allen,

seek, through song, ceremony, legend, sacred stories (myths), and tales to embody, articulate, and share reality, to bring the isolated private self into harmony and balance with this reality, to verbalize the sense of the majesty and the reverent mystery of all things, and to actualize, in language, those truths of being and experience that give to humanity its greatest significance and dignity… (Allen, 8)

In her analysis of the multiple representations of Native American identity taken from colonial Euro-American narratives, Mary A. McCay declares the significant alterations and misinterpretations that govern these narratives thereby concluding that Euro-American cultural narratives are “hierarchical and monolithic” often excluding multicultural dimensions. She reveals that Erdrich’s patterns and narratives on the contrary look for the possibility of the acceptance of all cultures. In McCay’s view, Native American writers like Erdrich and N. Scott Momaday deploy Native American myths and points of view in order to re-constitute and revitalize Native American cultural traditions and identity-formations, suppressed by, or eliminated from, the Euro-American-centered narratives of North American history. (Balogh, 152-153)

The narrative technique or structure of Louise Erdrich for instance has generated the interest of non-Native American readers and critics and often trouble them because of the tribal influence upon her writings as well as her core themes. Through her narrative, she establishes the durable indigenous presence of a tribal culture that endures through “survivance”. Erdrich’s novels The Beet Queen, Tracks, The Bingo Place and Love Medicine all embrace the history of the same kinship. Erdrich in her novels successfully employs and recovers the narrative forms of the Native American oral tradition collectively with significant elements of Native American culture. Barbara L. Pittman and Catherine Rainwater who provided a critical study of Erdrich’s fiction discusses the difficulty of reading Native American literature like that of Erdrich denoting that it is, “challenge for Euro-American readers because it mediates between literary patterns familiar from the Euro-American literary tradition and unfamiliar structures characteristic of Native American narratives. The mixing of different traditions produces alternative cultural meanings.” (Rainwater, 405) In Pittman’s view, Erdrich in doing this, intends “to record the persistence of the Native American community and its resistance to appropriation by the monolithic discourses of the dominant culture” (Pittman, 777). Like Pittman, Rainwater accentuates Erdrich’s cultural hybridity and argues that “Erdrich’s concern with liminality and marginality pervades all levels of her texts”, (407) further arguing that the reader must respond to this conflict of cultural codes since it is a challenge to our efforts to establish an unambiguous interpretative framework.

Erdrich creates the native world inside of her stories in such a way as to invite any reader to understand the Ojibwe culture she is showing. Each chapter in Love
Medicine has a strong sense of closure and also maintains its own self-contained plot and each representing their own separate cosmos (Stookey, 19). Another distinctive narrative style that Erdrich employs is the subversion of the linear fashion in traditional fiction. She establishes her own system, destabilizing the already established one, interweaving diverse stories together for the plot and characters to progress, once again establishing the importance of communality where diversity contributes to wholeness of being. Within Elizabeth Gargano’s article, “Oral Narrative and Ojibwe Story Cycles in Louise Erdrich’s The Birchbark House and the Game of Silence,” she points out that Erdrich’s works serve to connect to an Ojibwe audience because the cultural relevance of her novels reflect the native experience back at them (Gargano, 27). As a mixed blood, this aspect of her identity is reflected through encounter of binaries in her novels. Erdrich’s heritage manifests in her works through the constant agitation of Ojibwe characters and the white characters and more importantly through the battle between Christianity and Ojibwe tradition and culture.

The superficiality of the general comprehension of the Native Americans shaped the ways Native Americans have been represented in movies and books. Hollywood movies till date have infamously popularized the image of a romanticized warrior chief, adorned in costumes and armed with weapons rather looking savage and brutal. Another popular image is the Native American as the orator and the treaty maker of history texts, the subject of the case study or documentary, the creator of pottery displayed in museums. These fabricated images are somewhat always exotic, sometimes fearsome and greatly fragmentary. They are misrepresentations that have severely distorted the formation of young Native Americans’ identity. Native American writers and film makers began to respond to these images by putting whites in their lenses, restructuring the established narratives and representing their own lives and images. Contemporary Native American writers therefore are left with the task of restructuring and correcting the false comprehensions of white ideals and stereotypes.

Reformulating indigenous cultures and languages alongside deconstructing the subject and the complexities of Contemporary Native identities, Erdrich and Momaday narrate histories and personal stories that have been suppressed, at the same time aiming to reveal key changes in practices of self-narration that reflect historical transitions. From dreams fashioned in pictographs, to performances, symbols, crafts and paintings, contemporary writers through their narrative interweave their personal stories with cultural myths and histories, emphasizing a specific subjectivity and the continuation of oral traditions. Bearing witness not only to a history of genocide, they write with the persistence of ensuring survival and the continuance of healing from the “wounds of history”.

Today many Native Americans write to uplift and educate Native American audiences, taking up the task of investigating Native American history, sociology, ethnography, culture, medicine, education, law, and literary criticism, among other fields. They have also expanded their purpose in writing, seeking to instruct not just themselves but the larger world about Native Americans. Thus, repatriation of tribal artefacts and human remains also becomes an important theme distinctive of Native American or Tribal literatures. In this way, a body of contemporary fiction speaks to the processes of "inter-cultural definition and negotiation" that are central to the
many issues currently being worked out among museums, university holdings, and tribal and federal governments. (Ira Jacknis, np).

Similarly, Louise Erdrich's 2005 novel The Painted Drum centers its plot structure in repatriation issues and the meanings of artefacts. The novel’s subject matter explores how repatriation of a tribe’s drum symbolic of the tribe’s culture and religion, resulted in restoring order within families and the Ojibwe community. In a letter, Bernard Shaawano, (who was later revealed as the grandson of the drum’s maker), wrote to Faye and Elsie, a daughter and mother descended from Ojibwe tribe, Erdrich clearly presents the significance and the sentiment that Native Americans have over artefacts that has tribal values. Faye who discovered a huge Native American drum in a client's attic was determined to return the drum to its creator sensing that a tragic story must have prompted its sale to a white trader. In The Painted Drum, Shaawano offers an explanation of the reverence the tribe has towards the drum that has been returned. Communicating through a letter in a few but meaningful words he wrote,

 Selling that drum was one of the things my father most regretted having done in his life. When he spoke about it, he would hang his head and stare at the floor for a long time…With the drum back, there is a good feeling here. People have come together around it. I am surprised. That young girl Shawnee has moved back with her mother to a house built on the site of the old one. (Erdrich, 269)

The Painted Drum is part of a body of current Native American fiction offering plot structures and oral histories relative to the context of the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA). Native American human remains or Native American cultural items which include funerary objects, sacred objects, and objects of cultural patrimony obtained without right of possession is in violation of the NAGPRA Act and is treated as a criminal offense. Thus, it is important to understand Native American fiction as participating in a major intercultural dialogue. Narratives with artefacts and bones in their plots show us how to revisit and reread Native American cultural and spiritual outlook and see human remains and cultural artefacts not as the end, the death, of tribal identities and ways of life, but as unending manifestations in a profoundly altered view of the relationship of past and present.

Tribal literatures (including oral traditions of stories, legends and myths) are unique and culturally specific. Although translation offers a possibility for the non-Natives to experience and share the Native consciousness, the affluence in meaning and the significance of these stories and legends will not be transferred through translation. Whether the stories are culturally corrective trickster tales or emergence or historical narratives, Native American genres show the people aspiring for harmonious interaction with the earth. Native American communities continually return in prayer and ritual, story and song, to the fundamental relationships, established as part of their tribal identity. At the same time, many Native American writers who have been separated from the life of a tribal community, have also discovered new strengths in the Native American oral tradition.
Craig S. Womack, a contemporary Native American critic who has attempted to formulate a tribal-centric reading of Native American literature has made an effort to construct a meaningful way of encouraging tribal people to talk about their own literature. Being fully aware of the wealth of Native wisdom, he wanted to incorporate Native perspectives in his approaches to Native literature. He genuinely coveted that tribes and tribal members should have an increasing role in evaluating tribal literatures. Through his criticism he ventures for a proof that there is such a thing as Native perspective and he wants to testify that a search for it will be a meaningful endeavour.

From the **Indian Removal Act** of 1830, to **The Trail of Tears** in 1838 and **The Wounded Knee Massacre** in 1890 to 1969, when all Native Americans were declared a citizen of the United States of America, the forces that triggered these events have not vanished till today. According to Daniel Heath Justice, these forces, still seek to uproot Indigenous peoples from traditional homelands; to contain, transform, displace or otherwise erase ceremonial traditions and languages; to replace the Native presence in the Americas with the ahistorical mythology of Euro-western cultural supremacy. (Justice, 9)

**Our Fire Survives the Storm** defines Indigenous nationhood as more of a response to the “assimilationist directive of imperialist nation states.” Justice in this book aims to differentiate between the nationhood that is linked to tribal nations to that which is linked to industrialized nation states. Other Native American writers and critics like Craig S. Womack, Robert Allen Warrior and Jace Weaver likewise agree on an understanding of Indigenous nationhood that is rooted in the Indigenous context; an understanding that arises from the intellectual traditions of indigenous communities or that draws inspiration from the ethic of ‘communitism’ - community and activism. They all agree on a shared sense of nationhood through the multilayered weave of experience, history and culture. Elizabeth Cooklyn, a contemporary Native American theorist, looks beyond the field of literature or texts and traces the origin of what can be termed as “anti-indianism” in the American imagination. It is rather daring and courageous of her to determine the terms’ origin in religiosity saying that anti-Indianism, “gained momentum as a fundamental element of American Christianity.” She identified what she saw as anti-indianism in the field of Literature and in the process of explaining what anti-indianism means, she establishes a very firm ground on the concept of nationhood that is constructed from the Native American perspective.

Revising a history and culture that has been misrepresented and subdued by the other powerful Nations, Native American writings emerge despite having to thrive in a hostile and challenging environment. Voices that have been suppressed and stifled for centuries took to writing and creating literature hoping to educate non-natives about Native American religions, culture, history and beliefs and most importantly to exercise their rights as self-governing human beings. Native American Literature that is rooted in the Native soil give birth to authentic Native American experiences further comprising of travel accounts, protest literature, autobiographies, sermons and tribal histories that help in a better communication of Native American experiences in the midst of dislocation, suppression, death, false treaties, alcoholism and rejection by the mainstream American society. As much as the dominant White culture attempted to erase all cultures that existed before
colonization even to the extent of a few writers pronouncing the end of Native Americans in America and reducing them to the term, “disappearing Indians.” Native cultures and literature continue to flourish among the bristly environment of contemporary cultures, ethics and literature.
References


Contact email: nanoihcu@gmail.com
The Possession of Narratives: Telling and Transmitting Caste in Indian Folktales

Siddharth N Kanoujia, University of Delhi, India

Abstract
This paper postulates that caste in India is not just a sociological category, or an existential reality, but has been historically constituted of narratives that shape both. It will elaborate this by offering a brief survey of the rich store of myths, fables and parables meant for the children that have emerged and been transmitted over a millenium in the subcontinent. These include the Jatakas, the Panchtantra, and the Hitopadesh – a few of its most famous examples. These stories are deployed today to instil in children the cultural values and a sense of history. Hence, the paper will also examine some of these narratives, to see how caste is represented in them, and to analyze the implications of such representations in their repeated retellings today. It will attempt to show that choice of subject, theme, mode and genre of Children’s Literature all substantially determine the meanings of ‘caste’ for the ‘impressionable minds’ they target. Through the detailed analysis, especially of highly popular stories in Baital Pachisi and Singhasan Battisi (both 11\textsuperscript{th} CE), this paper will attempt to reveal how children in India are introduced to the ideas of ‘caste’: how, when narrated by the paternal/maternal figure, the child imbibes the ideals of caste along with the other societal norms: how these ideas are juxtaposed by the child onto her social reality, leading to the verification and concretisation of caste ideologies. Towards this end, the author will also discuss, given the current political dispensation, how important it is to question this ideology and how it can be excoriated through the very process it seeks to be validated by.

Keywords: Children Literature, Indian Folktales, Caste System, Bedtime Stories, Short Stories.
Introduction

“Stories that are handed down from one generation to the next connect us to our past, to the roots of our specific cultures, national heritage, and general human condition. Stories are the repositories of culture. Knowing the tales, characters, expressions, and adages that are part of our cultural heritages makes us culturally literate.” — (Lynch-Brown & Tomlison, 1993)

It can be said that humans are the storytelling animals. We make sense of the world around us through the stories we choose to tell about it. The narratives of our origin, the origin of the universe, the Gods and the religion we believe in are all different stories we have told ourselves and chosen to believe in. These stories fashion our self and help us situate ourselves in our own culture and environment. In this context, I would like to stress the importance of the stories we tell our children, during their early stages of growth. These stories come in multifarious forms, be it bedtime stories drawn from the memory of the narrator or told with the help of books available in the market or the stories read from picture books or through many animated videos freely available for kids on YouTube and other video sites. These stories, according to Karen Coates:

“By offering substantive representations for words and things to the child, stories, especially those found in children’s literature, provide signifiers—conventional words and images—that attach themselves to unconscious processes and have material effects on the child’s developing subjectivity. Thus we could say that the stories we read or are told as children have as much to do with shaping our subjectivity as do our primary existential relationships. (Coats, 2004)

This paper would first map the field of Children’s Literature in India, then it will look at how this literature is intended to serve several purposes and, hence, it will emphasise on how sometimes this literature gives out more than what the adults prescribing it to a child, bargained for. For this purpose, using the Indian context, and through the examples of my own child’s encounter with this literature, I will highlight how the one size fits all approach is deficient in preparing the child for the future to come. I am going to use the immensely popular tales from Baital Pachisi and Singhasan Battisi as examples to highlight my thesis that Popular Indian Literature for children is casteist and dangerous. This literature, in the early childhood, creates such a jaundiced worldview that any dose of liberal education at the latter stage is unable to cure it. A tentative solution, however, would be proposed to counter the ill effects on children of such literature.

Children Literature in India

Children Literature as a distinct category is a recent phenomenon in India because although the child was an integral part of the family but it was never considered a separate entity. Hence, literature meant specifically for children was never produced. According to Manorama Jafa, in the article titled “The Indian Subcontinent” in The
International Companion Encyclopedia of Children’s Literature (2004), the first phase in the development of Children’s Literature in India was the oral tradition with its rich content of mythology, folktales and legends. The Jatakas, Hitopadesh, Panchatantra, Kathasaritsagar have always provided a rich source of stories for children in India. The second phase resulted due to the interaction with the British Children’s Literature and the third phase dawned when the Indian writers themselves started writing for children.

A visit to any bookstore in India will confirm that for the most part the tales from Ramayana, Mahabharata, Panchatantra, Jataka, Hitopadesh etc. form the core of what constitutes the indigenous Indian Children’s Literature. The stories contained therein and their many variations are continued to be read and told either as bedtime stories by parents or used in the textbooks of pre-school children. These tales and legends are presented to the children as Niti tales. Jafa (1982) quotes Arthur W. Ryder’s description of Niti as rules which ensure “the wise conduct of life”

Niti presupposes that one has considered and rejected the possibility of living as a saint. It can be practised by a social being, and represents an admirable attempt to answer the insistent questions how to win the utmost, possible joy of life from world of men. (Jafa, 1982)

They provide a child, like any other children’s literature, a better understanding of herself and her relationship with the world around her. The world with its socio-economic, cultural and religious structure is revealed to the child through this literature. A child develops the ideas of right and wrong, the permitted and the prohibited, culturally sanctioned rules of social engagement, customs, etiquettes etc. via these stories meant for her. Here I am not saying that these rules are explicitly stated or emphasised. They are revealed through the way the stories are structured, that is through its plot, characters and the way the central problem in the story is resolved in the end. Sometimes the story may not even serve its intended purpose at all: that is, when the stories explore in detail the exploits of the evil character then they may not have the intended effect on the reader or the listener.

Early childhood years are especially important for the emotional and intellectual growth of the child because it is the time when she is busy absorbing the experiences which will shape and define her relationship with the culture and the larger world she is placed in. It is the time when stories, help form in a child’s mind the notions of gender roles, religious norms, cultural practices and modes of social behaviour. A child who is not able to read and actively interpret data the world presents her with, trusts what parents and other adults tell her. It is through this belief in the testimony of the adults, Paul L. Harris (2012) claims:

They accept the extraordinary claims that are widespread in their community. They come to believe in the miraculous powers of God, in the efficacy of prayer, and in an after-life. Such beliefs can even infuse what children say they have seen and heard. When 5- and 6- year-old believers in the Tooth Fairy
were asked to describe her last visit as truthfully as they could, not only did they often weave in implausible details—“She flid in the window” or “My cat got her stinking fairy dust all over her fur”—they claimed to have personally witnessed her visit. (Harris, 2012)

As it is evident from the quote that a child does not only just believes in what she is told but also imaginatively creates the world according to what is contained in the stories that are told to her by the adults. To continue with Paul L. Harris, “Well before children go to school, they are capable of engaging in a sustained conversation. They can follow a story or an explanation, can reflect on what they are told, and can ask questions. Young children also have a powerful imagination.” (Harris, 2000) Besides the formation of the notions of gender roles, religious norms and patterns of social behaviour, caste structure is also emphasised in the stories in case of an Indian child. This paper will show how the narratives of Indian Folktales meant for children take possession of their worldview and instils in them the basic structure of the caste system as practiced in India along with the belief in the superiority of the higher castes and the inferiority of the lower castes. But before I move on to talk about the kind of stories that an Indian child is exposed to, and the contents of such stories, let me first talk about what triggered the idea for this paper.

A Personal Anecdote

I have a seven year old son, Kanishk who is growing up on a rich diet of bedtime stories ranging from Cinderella to Sleeping Beauty. He has been listening to stories since he was two and half and has been doing it regularly. I am the responsible for getting him to sleep. Hence, the task and responsibility of telling him stories every night rests with me. About a year ago, I found an illustrated copy of the Singhasan Battisi lying around the house, which I began reading to him from every night.

On the eighth night, my son nonchalantly closed the book and said, “Enough, I don’t want to listen to these stories anymore.” When asked why, he said that they are boring. He also said they were all similar. I was shocked, I understood that the narrative structure of the stories was repetitive, i.e. every morning King Bhoja would approach the Throne of King Vikramaditya to sit on and every time he would be stopped by a figurine studded on the throne, which would come alive and tell him a tale about the greatness of King Vikramaditya. The tale would end with the challenge that if King Bhoja thinks he is as great as Vikramaditya then he can sit on the throne otherwise he should leave. So King Bhoja would leave. Surprisingly my son didn’t find all that boring. What he found boring was the fact that in every story Vikramaditya would go on an exploit and would come back victorious with some invaluable gift or prize and in almost every story a poor Brahmin would appear in the end and would either demand that gift directly or talk about his problems which would prompt Vikramaditya to partake with his gift to solve that problem. My son also said that he hated the Brahmins in the story.

I was shocked at such decided views of Kanishk who was barely 6 at the time. When asked for the reasons, he volunteered that all the hard work is done by King Vikramaditya but prize is ultimately given to the Brahmins. This episode led me into
reading the Tales from *Panchatantra* and *Baital Pachhisi* also. In all of the above stories I found a pattern and structure which glorified the Brahmins, Kshatriyas and Vaishyas and also indicated a definite relationship between them. These stories also presented and glorified the caste stratification and in the process valorised the upper castes and presented the lower castes in villainous or demeaning roles. All this made me realise how the impressionable mind of a child can be a site for planting ideas which leads to the rich harvest of caste prejudice later in life.

**Caste System in India**

Before digging in deep into the stories in both *Simhasan Battisi* and *Baital Pachhisi*, let us pause here to talk briefly about the caste system ingrained in the Indian society. According to an article in BBC News, *Why are UK Hindus against a caste law?* dated 18/01/2017:

> The caste system is thought to be an ancient Indian social hierarchy and a defining feature of Hinduism. It is described as a hierarchy of four varnas or caste categories found in Hindu scriptures, with brahmins (priests and teachers) at the top, followed by kshatriyas (rulers and soldiers), vaishyas (merchants and traders) and the shudras (labourers and artisans). Beneath them all are the dalits—so-called "untouchables" —who are completely excluded from society. (Samani & Ahmad, 2017)

The most common features of the caste system in India are: segmental division of society on the basis of heredity and by birth, a system of hierarchy on the basis of purity and impurity, dietary and other restrictions on social interactions, endogamy and lack of choice of occupation, etc. Another BBC article *What is India's caste system?* dated 25/02/2016 makes it amply clear:

> For centuries, caste dictated almost every aspect of Hindu religious and social life, with each group occupying a specific place in this complex hierarchy. Rural communities were long arranged on the basis of castes—the upper and lower castes almost always lived in segregated colonies, the water wells were not shared, Brahmans would not accept food or drink from the Shudras, and one could marry only within one's caste. Traditionally, the system bestowed many privileges on the upper castes while sanctioning repression of the lower castes by privileged groups. (BBC News, 2016)

Although caste discrimination has been proscribed by the Indian Constitution and has been turned into a criminal offence through various acts regulating the caste discrimination and atrocities but we still find incidents of violence, rape and arson resulting in the deaths of the lower castes a routine matter in the daily life of India as a nation. Many crimes against dalits (untouchables) and shudras are reported while
countless go unreported as lower castes continue to live a life either under constant threat or fear of persecution on caste lines. The caste system finds its basis in the notion of purity and impurity which entails that upper castes are pure and the lower castes are polluted and polluting. It is with this view that we should understand a recent incident reported in BBC News:

The 42-year-old from Bedford identifies herself as Ravidassia—a group regarded by some as at the lower end of the caste system. She says she was in a supermarket when two women began verbally abusing her. "They started calling me a low caste chamar (a derogatory term used to describe an individual belonging to a low caste), a dirty bitch. "At that time, I got a bit frightened, I thought 'no, no this can't be happening.'" She said the women, who had seen her at a wedding previously, followed her and her nine-year-old son to her car. "There were two of them and one of them was going to hit me, I thought they were going to really rip me apart." My son kept asking 'mummy what is a dirty chamar? Is that a swear word?'" (Samani & Ahmad, 2017)

It is within this context one has to understand how deeply entrenched is the caste prejudice in the consciousness of the Indian mind that it refuses to loosen its grip in the liberal and educated social atmosphere of UK. This paper is part of an attempt to understand how this notion of caste takes hold of the mind of the child at an early age, an age when she is not ready to evaluate, test and verify the claims made in the stories being read out to her.

**Simhasan Battisi and Baital Pachhisi**

Considerable body of literature in Sanskrit contains numerous stories of Vikramaditya. Although the authorship and date of the Simhasan Battisi (Simhasan Dvatrimiska in Sanskrit) and Baital Pachhisi (Vetāla Pañcaviṃśati in Sanskrit) are unknown but it is agreed that both were written originally in Sanskrit. It is claimed that Simhasan Dvatrimiska must have been written in 11th century as King Bhoja mentioned in it died in 1055 AD. Similarly, the oldest recension of Baital Pachhisi is found in the 12th book of Kathasaritsagar, a Sanskrit work compiled in 11th century by Somadeva.

Both the collection of stories contain a frame narrative, within which the different stories are told. The frame narrative of Simhasan Battisi has already been mentioned in an anecdote about my son, the 25 stories in Betal Pachhisi are told by the eponymous Baital, the undead, to pass the time and to test the wisdom of Vikramaditya while he is being carried to a Yogi for sacrifice. So every tale told by Baital ends in a riddle for Vikramaditya to solve. These tales are also interspersed with various didactic and ethical exhortations drawn from such varied sources like Ramayana, Mahabharata, Garuda and Skand puranas, Kalidas'a works, Bhartrihari's Niti Shataka Traiye and from various verses on conduct and policy from Chanakya’s Arthashastra (Haksar,
It is through these tales, didactic verses and riddles that the social values, the morality and above all the caste structure is enunciated.

I must mention here that I have studied the standard English translations of both the works for reference while comparing it with the edited versions made available in the market to the kids as children’s literature. Most of these versions for kids do away with the references to sexual promiscuity, long didactic verses and the bristling misogyny that is at display. Most of these versions available for children are in Hindi and have some basic illustrations. Although the order of the stories might change, even the names of the characters change across editions and publications but in most cases the basic plot and the conclusion remains the same. These versions for kids the retain the elements of magic, adventure, horror, bravery and morality which the various editors deemed fit for the consumption of the child. Even in these bowdlerized versions the various aspects highlighted below shine through.

Here are the few facts which emerge on reading both the story collections:

1) Every story in Betal Pachisi starts with the mention of the city and its ruler; Even if the king may not have any role to play in the story but it as if mandatory to mention the king. Since, Sinhasan Battisi is about Vikramaditya himself so all 32 tales start with him and King Bhoja.

2) Every story has either a Brahmin or a Vaishya, either as a protagonist or as an important character. Betal Pachisi has 22 out of 25 tales with a Brahmin mentioned while in Sinhasan Battisi almost every tale has a mention of Brahmin.

3) In most of the stories a Brahmin might be poor, ugly or old but he is never evil. If he appears evil it will be revealed in the end that he was not so.

4) The King in the stories and even King Vikramaditya himself respects the Brahmins and the Vaishyas. There is no sin greater than angering or insulting the Brahmin as it is emphasized in several stories.

5) The King, a Kshatriyas by caste, is supposed to maintain the Dharma, which essentially get translated into observing and maintaining the rules of caste system.

6) Shudra (lower castes) are either conspicuous through their absence or are present as evil figures.

To illustrate these points, two examples, one from Baital Pachhisi and the other from Singhasan Battisi are given here. The VII story of Baital Pachhisi is a very common story found in almost all the editions available for children. This story like all stories in Baital Pachhisi ends with a riddle to be solved by King Vikrama. The story goes like this: In a city there was a king who had a very beautiful daughter. When she came of age king and the queen were anxious about her marriage. Many suits from different kingdoms came for her hand, but none of them suited her fancy. After some time four suitors from four directions arrived. When enquired by the king of their superior qualities, one of them said:
'I possess such knowledge that I can manufacture a cloth and sell it for five rubies. When I realize the price, I give one of the rubies to Brahmans, of another I make an offering to the gods, a third I wear on my own person, a fourth I reserve for my wife, the fifth I sell, and constantly support myself with the money so obtained.' (Platts, 2000, p. 75)

The second one said that he is ‘acquainted with the languages of both land and aquatic beasts and birds,’ similarly the third one said that he understands the shastras, the ‘learned writings that no equal of mine exists,’ and the last one claimed: ‘I stand alone in my knowledge of the use of weapons; there is no one like me; I can shoot an arrow which will strike an object which is heard, but not seen.’ After hearing all of them the king was confused and took the matter to his daughter and she also kept silent. Baital, the sprite, who has been telling this story to king Vikrama now asks him thus, “Now King Vikram! For which of them is this woman suited?” this is how King Vikram replies:

“He who makes cloth and sells it is a sudra by caste; and he who knows the languages is a bais by caste; he who has studied the learned writings is a Brahman; and he who hits with an arrow an object which is simply heard, and not seen, is of her caste: the woman is suitable for him” (Platts, 2000, pp. 76-77)

Another version, meant for kids, states the solution in following terms:

“A man’s identity is generally established through his profession. A princess is expected to marry a person of warrior caste….as the other remaining three princes were a Shudra, a Vaishya and a Brahmin.” (Kumar, Anil, 2015, p. 45)

Two more versions of the story, both in Hindi, which are more popular in terms of sales volumes, present a grimmer version of caste system. These version however replaces the suitor who had studied the learned writings, of the previous versions, with a Brahmin who can bring the dead back to life. (note: translation mine) Here again the solution is presented like this:

“Think about it yourself, how can a kshatriya girl be given to a shudras weaver? A kshatriya girl also cannot be given to a vaishya and then what is the point in giving her to the one who knows the languages of the animals and birds? Third one, a brahman, who left his own occupation and became a sorcerer, is also not suitable to be her husband, because that brahmin had become a degenerate when he quit his prescribed profession. Hence, that
kshatriya man is the most suitable for the Princess.”
(Bhatt, 2014, p. 58) (Gupta, 2013, p. 137)

As we can see in all the versions, that I have studied of the story, how: (a) caste heirarchy is maintained, (b) the caste of the person is determined on the basis of his profession, (c) endogamy is practiced when the a kshatriya man is found suitable to marry the Princess, and (d) a Brahmin is considered a degenerate/an apostate for giving up his prescribed profession.

After some brief examples from Singhasan Battisi, which are interspersed throughout the 32 tales, I would talk about how these stories shape the worldview of a small child. In one of the stories, this is how Vikramaditya’s rule over his kingdom is described: “The noble Vikrama was king in Avanti. Under his rule, the people eschewed the seven vices. Nor did they transgress the rules of their respective castes.” (Haksar, 1998, p. 68) Here is how Vikramaditya himself describes his rule over his kingdom to a visiting Brahmin: “…there is no transgression of proper governance in my kingdom. Nor is there any propagation of wrong policies…There is no animosity towards religion or interference in pious works;… Neither is there any destruction of sacred images, or affliction of sages, or departure from the rules of caste.” (Haksar, 1998, p. 147) Or as in another story wherein king Vikramaditya saves a drowning Brahmin and his wife and the Brahmin offers the king all his ‘merits acquired by the difficult lunar fast and other rights. King replied: “I am born in a kshatriya family, and cannot accept reciprocal favours. …For Kshatriya who follow the righteous path ordained for them, protecting people is there bounden duty.” (Haksar, 1998, p. 98). On hearing these words Brahmin realized that he is in the presence of Vikramaditya, and he goes on to say:

“What Your Majesty has said is both proper and true. Nevertheless pay attention to my words. In the beginning Brahma had created people from his head, arms, thighs, and feet, and ordained that they should all help each other. But only the brahmans and the kshatriyas were in particular called to help and protect one another as has been prescribed. Therefore it will be quite proper for you to accept my request on which I insist.” (Haksar, 1998, p. 98)

So King Vikramaditya accepts the boon from the Brahmin but as my son, Joy, would have already predicted if he had shown interest in these stories, an extremely hideous brahmin demon appears and asks the king for the same boon so that he can be relieved of the misery of ten thousand years because of his arrogance about his learning, conducting forbidden sacrifices, accepting tainted gifts and insulting the senior hermits. On hearing this the King gave him the store of merit immediately. “With it the brahmin demon was freed from his karmas and, assuming a divine form, he went to heaven, singing king’s praises” (Haksar, 1998, p. 99)

It is relevant here to ask how these stories influence the child growing up in India and how these stories create certain stereotypes in the mind of a child which are later transformed into a worldview which is blatantly casteist. The child may not understand the complexities of the varna-jati system, she may also not understand
what a Brahman, Kshatriya, Vaishya and Shudra means in the world outside but certain kind a perspective is formed wherein a Brahmin is a reverential figure, a kshatriya is someone tasked with protecting the society and hence to to looked up to. A vaishya is someone who is engaged in business and earns money through fair or foul means but as long as he is earning money it is fine. Shudras are rare in these stories but still when they are there they are presented as evil yogis or demonic figures as in the frame story of Vetal or shrewd and cunning as in the case of the weaver (Haksar, 1998, pp. 50-51) in Simhasan Battisi. Most of these tales in their resolution blatantly enunciate the glory of the Brahmins and Kshatriyas which go a long way in formation of the casteist mind-set in the children of India.

A lot of research is done in America to understand and reveal the biases and prejudices in their children’s literature. Works like, Clare Bradford’s *Unsettling Narratives: Postcolonial Readings of Children’s Literature* (2007), Gillian Klien’s *Reading into Racism: Bias in children’s literature and learning materials* (2002) and Donnarae MacCann’s *White Supremacy in Children’s Literature* (2001) are the few relevant examples in this regard. But in India much needs to be done. The so-called cultural organization, (which must not be named lest you desire to be beaten up by it supporters and members) realizes and understands the importance of possibilities that a young mind presents in inculcating their virulent agenda and hence they seek to catch’em young through their own established schools and early morning arms training sessions. We keep coming across several news reports about the changes in the school textbooks to further certain agenda. Much effort is spent by the academics in criticising these organizations and state governments for tinkering with liberal values that the education is supposed to promote. But we ignore that the real threat to these values is already present in the stories we tell or read to our kids during bedtime when we are so anxious to get them to sleep that we ignore the true import of what the child is actually learning through these stories. There is a compelling need to look at these stories which we, with all our best intentions, tell our kids to infuse them with moral values drawn from India’s purportedly glorious culture. But then, we may be unwittingly creating a patriarchal, casteist, regressive, superstitious individual who can be used as a readymade tool by certain organizations, leading to horrible consequences.

I can tentatively suggest that we should intervene creatively, firstly by carefully selecting the materials that we read out to our kids. Secondly, we should not shy away from making any changes deemed fit which make the story culturally and socially appropriate. Lastly, in the Indian scenario, we have to be more careful, and need to either purge the text of all the caste and patriarchal elements in the telling or use the tools like sarcasm and reading-against-the-grain to combat the subliminal and blatant indoctrination in kids. Coming back to my son Joy, you may ask what do I do now since he has already rejected Sinhasan Battisi. Well, in rejecting those tales he has already displayed the ability to think critically and against the grain, which has prompted me to push my own agenda by buying him the Amar Chitra Katha version of Babasaheb Ambedkar and reading from it. Although he doesn’t understand the concept of the lower castes and I too am replacing lower castes with “the poor” in these stories but all this is having the intended effect. He is now more sensitive towards the poor and has also started questioning the validity of the valorization of Gandhi in India politics and society. I haven’t stopped telling him the tales from
Sinhaan Battisi but now we both enjoy calling Vikramaditya ‘stupid’ when he is fooled into giving away his hard won gift or prize to the ‘wily’ Brahmin.
References


Contact email: kandidsid@gmail.com
Abstract

Medicine is an exquisitely sensitive indicator of the dominant cultural characteristics of any era. In the XIX-XX century, one of them was the possibility of organ and tissues transplantation. And it's one of the most interesting medical disciplines that was very active in imperial Russia and later in the USSR. The historical analysis of the development of experimental transplant in the USSR confirms that it was a result of high level of the Russian medical science. Nevertheless, since the start of clinical transplantation era, only three cardiac transplant operations were made in the USSR. Why did the clinical heart transplant virtually disappear from the practice of soviet surgeons? The system of Soviet healthcare was an organic part of the system of total state control over society. An Order of the Minister of the Healthcare of the USSR No. 600 of August 2, 1966, allowing the transplantation of organs and tissues only with a special permission from the Ministry of Health of the USSR actually imposed a ban on the clinical heart transplants in the USSR. Despite the attempts of renowned surgeons to cancel this order, the suspension lasted for 20 years and seriously impaired the medical activities in this area. All heart transplant activities had be taken away by the stroke of a pen of the government official. As well as alive people, which were deprived of the chance to live with a new alive heart in their chest.

Keywords: organ and tissues transplantation, heart transplant, soviet medicine
Introduction

The history of medicine is one of the few disciplines that allows you to accumulate the history of mankind from the moment of its inception, when the medicine was in close relationship to culture and philosophy to the abstract determinism of contemporary scientific medicine. As Jose Ortega y Gasset expressed "culture is a system of vital ideas, which each age possesses; better yet it is the system of ideas by which each age lives". Medicine is an exquisitely sensitive indicator of the dominant cultural characteristics of any era. Every culture it seems has developed a system of medicine which bears an indissoluble and reciprocal relationship to the prevailing views of the body and the world. It incorporates the main concepts of era: an utopia or myths, it is subjected to the influence of revolutionary ideology or ideological vacuum, it modifies the relationship of the state to man.

In the XIX-XX century, one of the revolutionary ideas was the possibility of organ transplantation. The historical analysis of the development of experimental transplant in the USSR confirms that it was a result of high level of the Russian medical science. Nevertheless, clinical heart transplantation in the USSR was almost not developed. Nevertheless, clinical heart transplantation in the USSR was almost not developed. I will argue that principal cause is not the lack of the necessary conditions for transplant operations but the disinclination of the government officials to create the conditions for heart transplant operations. More specifically, I want to show you how the state was limited the ability of the professional medical community to influence the development of medicine in the USSR.

Basic Views Concerning history of organ and tissue transplant in Russia

The history of the Russian transplantology has genesis in the name of the outstanding Russian surgeon Nikolay Ivanovich Pirogov (1810-1881). In 1835 he gave a lecture "On plastic surgery in general, about rhinoplasty in particular." N.Pirogov analyzed the problem of organs transplantation and tissues in detail, at that work and all his ideas were the result of thoughtful analysis and surgical practice. They were based on the doctrine of the movement or resettlement (transplantation) of animal parts, tissues and organs. He argued that it’s possible to move the part of the body separable from the body or associated with body from one place to another. «A material, from which nose is formed, is skin. According to the laws of transplantation the flap of skin for transplant purpose can belong body or be completely separate from him»1, he wrote. It became the scientific basis of a new area of a medicine - transplantology.

The pioneer of heart transplantology Alexey Alexandrovich Kulyabko (1866-1930) conducted his first experiments on revival of isolated heart of animal in 1901. In August 1902, he «recovered» heart of the 3-month-old child in 20 hours after death which came from pneumonia for the first time in the world. The heart movements resumed in 20 minutes after passing through the heart of a special solution enriched with oxygen. There was a first revitalization of the human heart in almost one day after heart beat stopped.

1 Spasskiy I.T. On plastic surgery in general, about rhinoplasty in particular. Lecture at the Imperial Saint Petersburg Academy of Science by N. Pirogov, PhD,MD, 9 December 1835. Voenno-Meditsinskiy Zhurnal 1836; 28: 3–36. [In Russian]
The further development of transplantation was aimed to resolve problem of the long-term storage and conservation of tissues and organs. This research was represented by the outstanding scientists Sergey Sergeevich Bryukhonenko (1890-1960) and Sergey Ionovich Chechulin (1894-1937). They have come up with an artificial circulation method with the help of a mechanical device - an auto-zhector, provides blood circulation both in an organism, and in the isolated body automatically supports blood pressure at the set level. The constant normo- and hypothermic perfusion became subsequently one of the basic and most physiological method of organs conservation.

The problem of same importance was the viability of tissues and organs after death. Will they be able to function in another organism? Vladimir Nikolaevich Shamov (1882-1962) was a scientist who resolved this problem by making the transfusion of cadaver blood. First-ever he in 1928 experimentally proved a possibility of transfusion of cadaveric blood. After the series of experiments he declared: “The blood, which was in cadaver for 11 hours can be used in another body and can functioned there, it's nontoxic and viable”. “The corpse in early after death represents a vast depot of viable tissues and organs, the hopes for widespread clinical use of which are quite real. The corpse should not be considered dead longer, it not only continues to live in its own parts, but it can also give gifts of extraordinary value to survivors - viable tissues and organs. Moreover, judging by our experiments, the corpse, paradoxically, can even sponge still other living beings from imminent death and death”2.

Vladimir Shamov's student - surgeon Yury Yurievich Voronoy (1895-1961) in April 3, 1933 made transplant of kidney to 26-year-old woman with acute poisoning with mercury. The kidney was taken after 6 hours after dead of 60-year-old man, who died due a fracture of the base of the skull. The patient lived with a transplanted kidney for two days. So Y. Voronoy owns a dual priority: the first clinical kidney transplantation and the first use for the transplantation of the cadaveric kidney.

In 1945-1948 the soviet scientist Nikolay Petrovich Sinitsin developed his own method of heart transplantation in frogs. The animals with graft lived for a long time and it was an unique model for proving the principle possibility of the existence of an animal with a transplanted heart.

Finally, a new stage in experimental transplantation was started by Vladimir Petrovich Demikhov (1916-1998), who in 1947, at the first time in the world, performed the operations of homoplastic transplantation of dog’s heart and lung. As a result, he developed several options for surgical techniques of an additional and isolated heart, lungs, kidneys, and liver. He made 250 heart transplants and he proved the possibility of multi-day (up to 143 days) parallel function of the transplanted heart in the chest without immunosuppressive therapy. It was outstanding achievements of experimental transplantation for 1956-1957. He developed and achieved significant successes in using the heart as a second intra-thoracic pump. The results of many years of experience were summarized in his study “Experimental transplantation of vital organs” which was published in 1960. Apparently, it was the first in the world book devoted to organ transplantation.

The first successful heart transplantation from human to human was done by South African surgeon Christian Barnard in December 1967. The patient lived for 18 days and died of pneumonia as a result of massive immunosuppressive therapy. Christian Barnard conducts a second heart transplantation operation in January 2, 1968. It was much more successful than his first one and the patient lived for 2 years and wrote his book.3

The operations conducted in Cape Town were the momentum for carrying out numerous cardiotransplantations in all cardiological centers of the world. By March 1, 1969, 122 heart transplant operations were made worldwide. On November 1, 1975, the number of operations increased to 293. There were made only two heart transplant in USSR by then. Neither one of them was successful. By 1987 only 3 operations were made. Why? Why did the clinical heart transplant virtually disappear from the practice of soviet surgeons?

The main document we have addressed to is an Order of the Minister of the Health Care of the USSR No. 600 of August 2, 1966 “About transplant of organs and tissues” , allowing the transplantation of organs and tissues only with a special permission from the Ministry of Health of the USSR4.

This Order has been referred to another Order 1607 of Council of People's Commissars of the USSR of September 15, 1937 "The modalities for conducting medical operations". Accordance with this document the People's Commissariat of Health was delegated the right to issue mandatory for all institutions, organizations and individuals orders for the implementation of medical, surgical operations, including transplantation operations from corpses, blood transfusion, transplantation of an organs, etc. This document, published to facilitate the practice of clinical transplant of corneal of the eye helped solve the problems of the Soviet transplantology at the time.

But if the transplantation rules have already defined, why did The Ministry of Health Care need to issue a new order? According to an Order 600, the reason of issue this document “because some transplantations had made at maladaptive conditions and often violated the established medical rules and legal norms”. To understand what legal norms this document is kept in mind we should answer the question: what a major development did take place in clinical transplantology in the USSR from 1937 to 1966? The professor Boris Vasilievich Petrovsky (1908-2004), the Minister of Health of the USSR from September, 1965, made the first successful kidney transplant in April 1965. That’s why in accordance with Clause 1 an Order there was the listing of several organs, the transplant should be to established to: "the transplantation of organs (kidney, liver, etc.) from human corpse or animals to humans, can be carried out only with the permission of the Ministry of health of the USSR by all Healthcare Institutions irrespective of their departmental subordination". Pursuant to Clause 4 this document:

“From 1 January 1967 to prohibit the transplant organs to person from other person, corpses or from animal by all health-care institutions, regardless of departmental subordination, without special permission of the Ministry of health of the USSR”.

Did this document have any relation to the regulation of heart transplant operations? This is the main question we need to clear up. First, it should be noted, there is no word “heart” at this document although the name of other organs (liver, kidney, etc.) are existed. Probably, there was no sense in the prohibition or resolution of heart transplantations, since no human heart transplant had ever been made to at that time. Secondly, first clinical heart transplant in the USSR was made in November 4th, 1968, in 2 years after this document has been issued. Accordance with common sense there had to make the additions to Order 600, but it hadn’t done.

The fact that this document was temporary in nature says paragraph 2 of this Order: “before November 1, apply with petition to the Ministry of Health of the USSR on granting the right to the relevant subordinate institutions to transplant organs (kidneys, liver, etc.) from a person, corpse or animals to humans”. That is, further elaboration of this order was implied, which was done in the next Order of 665 of September 12, 1969, where the institutions that are allowed to perform kidney transplant operations were identified. And again there were no mention of permission to change other organs at this Order 665.

And finally any accusing in infringement concerning inappropriate (including hygienic) conditions in Order 600 are impossible in case of heart transplant operations at that time. That time till today it is still very expensive operation impossible provided without of high class clinic. In the light of the foregoing, we can assert that it was impossible to manage the conduct of heart transplants by applying this Order, because it didn't he does not meet an elementary requirements.

Another reason offered to explain the forbid of heart transplant is the diagnosis of so-called brain death. In all known cases of successful transplant's attempts the surgeons used the functioning heart taken from donors with this diagnosis. The extensive discussion which arose on this matter not only among specialists but also with attraction of various sectors of society, created public opinion about non-compliance with moral, ethical and legal norms. This view was also shared by the Minister of Health of the USSR, Boris Petrovsky, who believed that an introduction of the "brain death" concept unreasonable, because it's immoral and an offense against the law to declare that a person is dead when his heart beats. Thus, in the USSR, the legislation has not recognized the diagnosis «brain death» granting performing right of a possibility of removal of organs after biological death of an organism. In the countries at the existing legislation it was really possible to carry out organ transplant at patients only after the termination of cordial reductions was registered.

But the Soviet surgeons used the technique of coronary perfusion of transplant, which ensured the functional activity of the donor heart during the 3-hour period of its being outside the body. And first heart transplant by professor Alexander Alexandrovich Vishnevsky (1906—1975) was made that way. Professor Vishnevsky made the first heart transplant in the USSR in November 4, 1968. The operation was carried out using the classical Lower-Shumway method. There was used the method of connecting the perfusion apparatuses of the transplant and the recipient (the so-called
switching principle). The muscle of the heart was supplied with blood from a special apparatus after removal. The operation to the recipient could began later, after a direct examination of the suitability of the heart for transplantation. The surgeon could transport the heart from donor to recipient quietly, without haste: three hours of normal life in a perfused condition was guaranteed.

In according with the Russian Medical Legislation the removal of organs and tissues for their transplantation was possible only with the onset of a true or biological death, i.e. after 10-minute resuscitative measures, which turned out to be unsuccessful. At Vishnevsky operation the donor had a heavy going transport trauma. After 2 hours resuscitation, there was diagnose “irreversible damage to the brain”. After another 2 hours, the diagnosis of the doctor's consilium was confirmed and donor was transfer to transplantation department. But the human heart is very sensitive and could not work after resuscitation. Therefore if an order 600 literally had been allow the transplant of organ actually it meanted your patient can be died because all donor's hearts were damaged by ischemia.

What are the objective reasons to not allow the transplant of heart in USSR that time? What did think about this problem not officials, but other specialists: the surgeons, medical examiners?

According to the report by Viktor Ilyich Prozorovsky, the chief forensic expert of the USSR Ministry of Health, the removal of organs from living and dying people affects moral, ethical and legal aspects and requires the issuance of special rules. He wrote :"The removal of such unpaired organs as the brain, heart, liver, etc., for the purpose of transplantation, can be tolerated only if three specialist doctors from among persons who do not engage in organ transplant sign an act about the imminent death of the donor".5

Being one of the leading experts in the world in heart transplant issues, Alexandr Vishnevsky was firmly convinced that "if transplantation, at least to some extent, guarantees the patient's relief from the painful manifestations of deep disability, she really deserves a completely special relationship"6

Here is a letter from Vladimir Burakovsky, Director of the The Bakulev Institute of Cardiovascular Surgery, the third surgeon, who made the heart transplant in the USSR in 1983:

"Currently, heart transplant surgery is the only possible surgical method for treating doomed patients with heart disease.

It is already generally accepted that the heart transplant operation makes it possible to prolong the life of patients sometimes for 2-3 years or more.

The Bakulev Institute of Cardiovascular Surgery The Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, being the lead institution in the field of cardiovascular diseases, serves patients coming from all over the Soviet Union. The Institute has a vast experience in

the surgical treatment of heart disease and blood vessels. The Institute has already
done about 2.5 thousand operations with artificial circulation only, i.e. on the open
heart operations.

At present, the whole volume of the most modern surgical interventions on the heart
and the main vessels is carried out at the institute. For many years the institute
conducts a comprehensive experimental study on the problem of "Heart
transplantation".

More than 300 heart transplant operations have been performed in the world.
Successful heart transplantations have been performed in the USA, France, South
African Union and in a number of other countries.

Already about 3 years ago we applied to the Academic Council of the Ministry of
Health of the USSR for issuing the appropriate permission to conduct such an
operation, naturally in strictly defined cases, if absolutely necessary and necessary
training was given.

I do not want to say that the implementation of several heart transplantations, even
successful ones, will to some extent solve the problem of treating patients with heart
and vascular diseases. However, the fact that this issue is not being resolved actively
in our country, certainly affects the entire research work in general. Preparing for a
heart transplant operation, its implementation without any doubt, should affect the
progress of the entire medical science in general, in particular, in such disciplines as
anesthesiology and reanimatology, as the doctrine of tissue immunity. In addition, a
number of questions on tissue immunity, anesthesia, and management of the
postoperative period can not be resolved in the experiment. It is necessary to conduct
clinical studies... "

But it also did not cancel the order of 600. Only showed the futility of attempts to
influence the solution of the problem of heart transplantation with the help of surgeon
alone.

Only 3 surgeons dared to break a ban: Alexander Alexandrovich Vishnevsky in 1968,
They believed that their duty was to help patients, even if it threatened their future.
They were outstanding surgeons and they were famous surgeons in USSR and all
around the world. There were sanctions for each of them after their heart transplant
operations, but even they could not to break the system.

Formally this Order did not prohibit organ transplantation, but the way it was
compiled led to impossibility of clinical heart transplant operation in the Soviet
Union. It took 20 years for the practicing surgeons to "pave the way for the heart" and
to change the transplantation law.

On February 17th, 1987 an Order № 236 called "Temporary instruction about
ascertaining of death on the basis of the brain death diagnosis" was adopted. On
March 12th, 1987 professor Valery Ivanovich Shumakov (1931-2008) the first in the

7 Burakovsky V.I. Notes of a cardiosurgeon: essays and reflections. Moscow: Knowledge, 1988; 239.
USSR performed the successful operation of heart transplantation to patient with dilated cardiomyopathy, who has lived after operation about more than 9 years.

But no one will ever know how many people were deprived of the chance to live with a new living heart in their chest to this date.
References


Kulyabko, A. (1902). *Experience the revitalization of the heart. Further experiments of recovery of the heart*. Proceedings of the St. Petersburg Academy of Sciences. [In Russian]

Petrovskiy, B. (1991).*Two people, one heart*. Moscow.[in Russian].

Shamov, V. (1958).The emergence of the idea of blood transfusion from a corpse and the further prospects of using fibrinolated blood. Eksperimental'naya khirurgiya 1958; 5-1 [In Russian]


Voronoy, Y. (1934). *On the blockade of the reticuloendothelial apparatus in humans with certain forms of poisoning with mercuric chloride and the free transplantation of an entire kidney taken from a corpse*. Proceedings of All-Ukrainian. Trudy Vseukrainsk. in-ta neotlozhnoy khir. i pereliv. krovi, Dnepropetrovsk, 1: 221. [In Russian]
Untouched Voices: Dalit Women’s Autobiographies in Dalit History

Payal Madhia Sahay, University of Delhi, India

Abstract
This paper will engage with the idea of the self as a narrated, social identity, as this is explored and articulated in Dalit women’s autobiographical writing. The category ‘Dalit’ came into use sometime in the nineteenth century to denote the oppressed and exploited ‘untouchable’ communities of India, traditionally considered so ‘impure’ that they were ‘out-castes’; and yet, simultaneously, integral to defining the system, in being its ‘lowest’ component. However, this liminal position and status predates the emergence of the appellation ‘Dalit’ by millennia, is as old as the caste-system itself. ‘Dalit’ is a construction of singular political identity, out of large variety of ‘outcaste’ communities, based on the commonality of their oppression. This paper will examine Dalit women’s autobiographies as the multi-layered articulations of their engagements with
(a) oppressions effected by the commonality of being Dalit;
(b) oppressions effected by the fact of being women in a profoundly patriarchal order;
(c) the tensions generated in the intersections of these two.
Analyzing the writings of Baby Kamble, Sumitra Bhave and Kaushalya Basantra, this paper will explore how, by virtue of these intersections, the routine narrative imperatives of the autobiographical confessional mode – e.g., emphasizing first-person perceptions and experiences – morph from individual stories of pain, into gendered narratives of oppression, and thereby into ineradicable archives of the suffering and injustice that constitute the histories of the community. The paper will thus reflect on the dynamics between gender, caste and class identities on the one hand, and on their narrativizations into histories of community.

Keywords: Dalit, caste, narrative, identity, autobiography,
Introduction

Dalit as a term denotes broken or shattered, a community which has been socially segregated across the Indian society according to the caste system, the composition of four castes in the Varna system came into being as per different body parts of Brahma, the Brahmins evolving from the mouth, Kshatriyas from the arms, Vaishyas (peasants and traders) from the thighs. Dalits being the neglected and suppressed caste is assumed to have evolved from the feet of Brahma and therefore, occupy the lowest position in the society. ‘Caste’ was basically meant to serve the so called ‘upper’ castes.

The origin of caste has been described by different scholars and the most common and well accepted theory is by Ambedkar. Ambedkar’s theory is based on the Varna system mentioned in the Manusmriti. According to the Varna system people are divided on the basis of occupation into Brahmins, Kshatriyas, Vaishyas, and Shudras. Though there is no mention of the fifth Varna (outcastes) in Manusmriti but it clearly explains the concept of mixed castes. According to Manu, the offspring of inter-caste marriages are to be considered the most degraded in the society and are forced to live on the outskirts of a civilization. Varna system showcases a rigid hierarchy which places Brahmins at the top and hence provides them a privileged position. Caste is determined on the basis of occupation. Certain groups are considered suitable for particular occupations, such as the Brahmins who have always enjoyed the right to study the spiritual texts and sanskrit at the same time, denying the right to attain education to other lower castes. The Shudras have always been considered fit to perform only menial jobs, related to cleaning the ‘filth’ of the society.

The racial theory traces the origin of the caste system to the invasion of the Aryans in India around 1500 B.C. The Aryans thought of themselves as a superior race and were in constant conflict with the indigenous tribe of Dasus. But later intermarriages took place between the two races, giving rise to different identity groups and dividing the society further based on color and occupation.

The ritual theory describes a theosophical, moralist, ritualistic society in which people derive their identity in the performance of different rituals for distinctive purposes e.g., Kshatriyas perform rituals at the warfront. People belonging to the ‘upper’ caste status e.g. Brahmins perform rituals for the common welfare of people. There are various theories on which caste is understood. Caste is also understood and generally connoted equivalent to ‘jati’, which is often used in Indian society and often confused with the term ‘Varna’. From Varnas, various jatis, castes and even sub-castes have emerged and each ‘Jati’ is different from other Jatis. Basically ‘Jati’ is an Indian word used for caste.

It was only in the last phase of twentieth century that Dalits were seen representing them with Dalit writings reflected in Dalit Literature. Dalit Autobiographies is an important genre of Dalit Literature, but recently lots of Dalit writings also include fiction.

The plight of Dalit women is even more deplorable who have been oppressed on the basis of caste, by both upper caste men and women, on the basis of class, Including both social and economic and gender by both Savarnas and Dalit men. The
representation of Dalit women began with Ambedkar’s efforts, his major concern being the right of self-representation, not only for Dalits but more for Dalit women, because of his staunch belief that only educated women can contribute to a progressive and prosperous society.

With the emergence of Feminism as a social movement showcasing the cause of women, there was hope for amelioration of Dalit women. But unfortunately, since most of the women in the women’s movement were upper caste educated women, they generalized the concerns of women neglecting the difference in class and caste. These upper caste feminists failed to either understand or represent the experiences of Dalit women. This resulted in either marginal or no representation of Dalit women. Sharmila Rege correctly points out in her book Writing Caste/Writing Gender about the partial representation of Dalit women along with the concerns of upper caste women, she asserts “In the women’s movement too, caste was rarely discussed as it was assumed that caste identities could be transcended by the larger identity of sisterhood among all women”1 Similarly, in case of Dalit men voicing the problems of Dalit women they talked about the universal atrocities on Dalits, thus making it a generalized victimization of women. Because a Dalit woman has been suppressed a lot more than a woman of an upper caste, there was a compelling need to voice the concerns of Dalit women by none other than Dalit women herself who have agonized the pain of being triply marginalized.

As a result of this resentment and dissatisfaction, it was during the 1990s that there was an upsurge in Dalit women’s autobiographies in various languages like Marathi, Tamil, and Hindi. Now even English translations of these autobiographies are readily available. Dalit Women’s Autobiography is used as a form of personal testimony by Dalit women in order to share their personal experiences; which are experiences of public humiliation and sexual exploitation in various forms.

My paper aims at analyzing autobiographies by Dalit women. One of these autobiographies Dohra Abhishap by Kaushaliya Basantrai explains the plight of Dalit women focusing on the dual subordination of women by men on personal level and by upper castes on social level. It will chart out the personal instances that liberate women and works as a stepping stone towards their enlightenment and representation in the society. The paper focuses mainly on Baby Kamble’s Prison We Broke, Sumitra Bhave’s Pan on Fire and Kaushalya Basantrai’s Dohra Abhishap.

Baby Kamble’s autobiography Jina Amucha originally written in Marathi narrates the tale of Dalit patriarchy, the plight of women and horrific conditions and day to day challenges that the community and especially women have to undergo in the class biased society. Kamble in her interview asserts that it is not her personal life that she intends to narrate in her autobiography. She transcends the boundaries of personal narrative and instead showcases the social conditions of the community. Kamble says that she finds it difficult to think of herself outside her community and exposes the real conditions of the Mahars of Maharashtra, dwelling in Maharwada. Kamble begins by talking about the month of ‘Ashadh’ which is the most treasured month for Mahars. This month involves cleaning of the houses, polishing of the walls, bathing

---

of the entire family along with washing of the rags. Kamble explains the elaborate ritual of cleaning and bathing that begins early in the morning and goes on till late afternoon. The woman of the house literally pushes the boys and girls to take a bath. Harsh reality of poverty and lack of hygienic conditions in Mahar community is discussed at length in the autobiography.

_The Prison We Broke_ is a feminist critique of patriarchy, the text narrates how Dalit women are the ‘other’ for Dalit men, in the same manner in which Dalits are the ‘other’ to the Brahmins. How caste and patriarchy coincide and hence support in sustaining further violence and injustice for women. Kamble asserts that the poverty stricken conditions of the family are so bad that they do not use any soap for cleaning themselves, instead what the women do is to buy dried coconut and shilkakai worth one paisa. Since, the ritual of bathing comes after a long time; it exposes the fixation with the idea of cleanliness, which they avail only once a year.

Kamble while mentioning the exploitative set up of the society explains how women become enemies of their own gender. The mother-in-laws are the perpetrators of maximum domestic violence. In order to secure their own position of superiority they make the poor daughter-in-law thrashed by her son. The bitterness and violence take violent form by chopping off the nose of the daughter-in-law. Later she is thrown out of the house of her in-laws on the grounds of bad moral character.

Kamble devotes a large section of her autobiography of how Dalits even after being oppressed for centuries by other castes still cling to Hindu rituals, although they have no money to carry forward the over expensive rituals. The obsession of Dalit women with ‘haldi’, ‘kumkum’ is an example which establishes the fact that Dalits try their best to preserve whatever bit of Hindu culture they can. Irrespective of the fact that Hindu culture itself has discarded the Dalits completely and Brahmins used Dalits in order to maintain their own superiority. Kamble states that it was by worshipping the Hindu gods that Dalits found some solace and aspiring better future for them. Kamble lashes out at Hinduism stating that it perpetuates religion which is not meant for humans but animals. “What a beastly thing Hinduism is! Let me tell you, it’s not prosperity and wealth that you enjoy – it is the very life blood of the Mahars!” (56)

Kamble narrates the rituals of Maharwada that went on for four weeks, the superstitions and the elaborate ceremonies that Dalits enjoyed. This further emphasizes the undying faith and the orthodoxy of the down trodden. The ritual of offering the eldest son as ‘vaghya’ or ‘potraja’ was considered very prestigious for the family. Especially fathers took great pride in looking at the son dressed in feminine attire with his forehead smeared with ‘haldi’ and ‘kumkum’. Fathers praised boy’s singing and dancing ability, stating that the boy looks good as a ‘nachaya’. Another instance that Kamble refers at length is the instance of women being possessed with goddesses at prayer meetings with loud music and people approaching her to worship her and fulfill the demands of the goddess so that she blesses the entire household and does not curse them instead.

The vivid description about the condition of women during the course of child birth really shakes our souls. Lack of any experienced doctor and hygienic conditions pose a dangerous threat to the lives of the young girls married at an early age and middle aged women. Since there are no doctors, women delivering the kids rely on ignorant
midwives, who trust their hands and therefore keep inserting their hands into the poor women’s vagina, in order to figure out the position of the unborn child. This continuous infusion results in the swelling of the vagina and hence obstructing the path for the child. The life of the delivering mother depends only on her luck. Her mother is requested to rush to the temple of lakhamai and pray for her child. The girl after enduring the pain of the delivery has to bear the pain of the swollen and wounded vagina.

Kamble mentions a practice under which parents are forced to feed their children cactus pods, removing the thorns and eating the fleshy part. The plant satisfies the hunger for a fortnight but next day cactus seeds become slabs of cement, one is unable to attend nature’s call, no matter how hard one tries but this refuses to be pushed out. Poor Mahar families eat this deadly cactus pods themselves and offer it to their children, such is the picture of real poverty stricken condition which cannot go unnoticed.

The later part of Kamble’s text narrates how Ambedkar illuminates the Mahars, how he added life to the lifeless status of the downtrodden. It was Ambedkar asserts Kamble, who gave the untouchables a human form instead of the god, the creator of humans. Who turned a blind eye towards the suffering of the Mahars. Kamble questions why is it that Brahmns still preserve and propagate their religious texts like Ramayana and Mahabharata? Whereas it has been just thirty years since Baba passed away but we have already wiped away his teachings.

Baba Saheb Ambedkar brought about a revolution for the Depressed Classes. Maharwada was elated to see acquaintances and were influenced among the lot, like many other folks of the community see a Mahar man’s acceptance into the upper caste society. Baby Kamble and Dr. Ambedkar professed with the intent of promoting the spread of education amongst the Depressed Classes by opening hostels, libraries and by advancing the economic conditions of such down trodden castes by setting up schools. He was against the unquestionable acceptance of the caste system which emphasized on suppressing the suppressed, a practice which is both, morally and legally wrong. Babasaheb’s main concern was that the untouchables should cease to be agricultural laborers and escape from their landlessness. They should either get industrial or white collar jobs or they should get land for cultivation. He criticized the Indian village system where the lives of the untouchables were dictated by the dominant ‘touchable’ community. Ambedkar stated, “I hold that these village republics have been the ruination of India. What is a village but a sink of localism, a den of ignorance, narrow mindedness and communalism?” In Baby Kamble’s The Prisons We Broke, there are innumerable references which showcase that the action of a single individual or a group of Dalits, only if they stand up and question the traditionally accepted notions of morality and social behavior; the Caste Hindus not only get offended but take it as a grave violation of its ethics and also punish the offenders severely. And the punishment can go to any extend, be it naked parading of Dalits in the village or just setting fire to the household of poor Dalits and thus rendering them homeless. Hence, both the authority and the rule book stays only with the upper caste. Furthermore, any challenge to the caste hegemony is looked after by the caste makers.
It is worth noticing how the notions of two great leaders, Dr. Ambedkar and Mahatma Gandhi, differed on the debatable issue of caste. Gandhi, a baniya by caste (a vaishya) imagined a utopian life for the Indians. The Prisons we broke portrays a very anti-Gandhian picture of the entire Dalit Movement. We learn that during her school days, Baby and her friends, used to torment and insult other upper caste girls at the slightest possible chance. This was a method to let the “upper” caste people know that the Mahars can no longer be suppressed. Innumerable instances can be picked up which clearly portray the retaliation and the process of annihilation among the Dalits. For instance, Baby and her mates deliberately “polluted” the drinking water of the school, and they intentionally entered the temples of the upper caste people. Baby Kamble describes the insults each caste group threw at each other’s leaders (Ambedkar and Gandhi) very effectively through songs. To quote a Mahar’s song:

“Our Ambedkar looks like a sahib. You know why your Gandhi is toothless? Because our Ambedkar kicked him in his teeth! Ha ha...That’s why your Gandhi has no teeth! And you know why Gandhi has no hair? Because our Ambedkar shaved it off! That’s the kind of man our Ambedkar is!”

Maharwada is known for domestic violence where husbands beat up their wives and it is even more tragic if the girl is eight to nine years old newly married girl. Kamble explains the situation of Dalit women being beaten up by their male counterparts by quoting one of her personal experiences.

“Once we went to Mumbai to attend a meeting, we travelled in a general compartment that was very crowded and some young men happened to stare at me. My husband immediately suspected me and hit me so hard that my nose started bleeding profusely…The same evening we returned and he was so angry that he kept hitting me in the train”

Another very interesting book is Pan on Fire by Sumitra Bhave. She has enlisted eight Dalit women testimonies. The Dalit feminist movement she stresses should begin with embracing ‘shame’ in order to put ‘honor’ of shameful caste into question. The most important aspect of the book is the idea of getting over with shame; by talking about issues which have always been a taboo, be it sex or menstruation but above all it how women feel about their lives and experiences. Certain sections in the book ridicule the practice of polygamy by men, stressing the fact if ‘purity of vagina’ is stressed, it should also demand ‘purity of penis’. In the book eight different Dalit women are portrayed as strong women who endure the sufferings of caste and patriarchy. But still rise above the hardships of their life and are able to make their families rise above and stay together. The book is in a form of collective interviews, more like informal ‘chat sessions’ where women and young girls open about their personal life and their future aspirations.

The book is one of its kinds addressing the life of Dalit women under different circumstances and how they deal or prepare themselves to deal with their present situation. Extremely important observations like the importance of women help groups come across. Women share, exchange and console each other which gives

them confidence and support, whereas men lack such support groups, says Rukmini (one of the interviewee) in the book. The book discusses ‘fire’ in the literal sense of the term, in the sense that it openly talks about issues that were never discussed till date. Women are taught to stay repressed and not talk openly about their feelings. Rukmani mentioned in the book, whatever you say, a woman’s life is pretty bad you were asking me why wear all these ornaments and kumkum. But if a woman does not people say look at that witch or if the sari slips from one’s head they say here is a prostitute. Women are clearly looked upon as objects, who glorify the cultural traditions of the caste Hindus. Those who don’t follow the customs are termed as sluts. Men in a patriarchal society have conveniently dumped to onus of tradition, entirely on the shoulders of women. Do we ever see men wearing a ‘mangalsutra’ or vermillion denoting that they are married? Certainly not!

Here issues like menstruation and the treatment young girls and women get when they are menstruating are discussed at length. They are ordered to ‘stay away’ and not mingle with others during their period due to the superstitious idea of ‘impurity’, instead of explaining it to the young ones about onset of puberty and hormonal changes, people start discussing about their marriage and their getting mature. Women are slowly progressing, they understand and acknowledge the value of education and are staunch followers of Dr. Ambedkar and his teachings. Therefore, they contribute to whatever little they could at both personal and social level.

One of the testimonies is by Chhaya, a Mahar girl who is just eighteen years old, stays with her grandmother and her maternal-uncle, who is a patriarch and Chhaya feels very uncomfortable when he asserts his authority. This girl exhibits an example of a free spirit who wants to take her own decisions in life, decisions related to marriage or career. She does not wish to get married at an early age instead she wants to continue school. She wishes to be independent by working on her own but somewhere the orthodox set up of the family and rumors about her being involved with guys really make her depressed. Chhaya has her own inhibitions about marriage. The domestic violence that she has witnessed and the taboo of inter caste marriages. Chhaya has to stand the suspicious nature of her family. Her autobiography ends with a bright hope for her future, she is shown to be working and the biggest achievement is that she takes a loan and renovates her house, which makes her grandmother very happy. She succeeds in implementing her belief of not getting married early but instead being independent is what counts more and adds meaning to a woman’s life.

Dalit women are often considered ‘thrice Dalits’ as they are exploited by the forces of caste, class and gender. Kaushalya Basantri’s Dohra Abhishap narrates the tale of Mahar women in Maharashtra. Various factors that subdue women are addressed here by Basantrai, she narrates her autobiography by charting the condition of women which she witnessed around her, Although her parents who worked as mill workers worked very hard all their life just to make sure that their children are educated and well placed in life. In spite of having such an assertive and independent mother; Basantrai as a child witnessed her mother cursing her for bearing so many daughters and no son. The fixation with the idea of male child is quite prevalent in Indian society, a male heir to the family, somebody who will carry on the family name and virtue forward. Wondering why can’t women take family name forward? Also, our fixation with the male child comes from our religion and the shastras that have been ruling our minds. The very fact that the funeral pyre can be given light only by the
son and not a daughter I feel somewhere plays a crucial role. Religious sentiments reign supreme in Hindu religion. On top of that Dalits in order to look for someone to be the breadwinner emphasizes the value of a son.

Basantrai talks about an important aspect of widow remarriage, and brings in important aspects of gender bias in the concept of remarriage. Young widows were allowed to remarry but the marriage ceremony was different for both divorced females and widows. A stark difference between the rituals which even pricks the readers more is that after the second marriage of a widow she was send away only at night and not during the day contrary to the newly wedded bride. Also, after second marriage widows were not allowed to participate in auspicious ceremonies like wedding or any ceremony related to god. Widowers or divorced males on the contrary were allowed to marry again with pomp and show, there were no such restrictions for them. The rituals of our society are the very basis of discrimination of gender, makes a woman feel small and downcast. Another prevalent practice which Basantrai mentions is that second marriage was common amongst men, even when the first wife was present in the house. In case of objection from the first wife for second marriage for her husband she was given good thrashing by the husband and kept quiet, her opinion never really mattered in the family.

The idea of educating women has been given due importance in Basantrai’s narrative but women have to struggle more than men to continue their studies and have a good career. Even Basantrai’s parents thought of halting the education of their daughter considering that they will not be able to find suitable educated match for their daughter if she is highly qualified. Education runs parallel with the idea of keeping matrimony at the center, Education for men is considered normative whereas highly educated wife of a man is still considered as an aberration. Basantrai showcases very common picture of abusive language and social boycott that a woman has to go through if she chooses to marry at a later age.

Basantrai internalized the essential educational superiority of males and married the most educated known Dalit, she became a victim of sexist ideology. All her hopes are shattered when she discovers that Devendra Kumar (her husband) is a self-centered and a cold human being. The kind of treatment that Basantrai gets from his end is extremely painful, Devendra leaves her when she is about to deliver their baby. She had to be accompanied by the maid to the hospital and even when Devendra came to visit her in the hospital, he comes to show off his status and post of an officer by shifting Basantrai to the private ward. His conscious does not even remind him to inquire about the health of his wife. He decides to leave for another tour by giving calculated amount of mere thirty rupees for the hospital. Basantrai couldn’t continue to stay with her husband in the later years of her life and therefore, stays with her younger son.

Basantrai exposes a very relevant aspect in her life when she narrates her struggle to acquire a water tap for her family inside the house, as the atmosphere near the tap and the conversations followed by it were turning abusive and ugly day by day. She along with her dad had to bear the cultural bias of the employees and an officer, but on top of that she was also a victim of sexual harassment. Such examples reflect vulnerable condition of women and explore the hypocrisy of men at the official level. Even the
workers and other women from lower strata are taken for granted by men and hence ill-treated.

Basantrai in later period of her life keeps her occupied with the upliftment and betterment of women by organizing mahila sangs, but even after her constant requests, the husbands of the women of the sang; would do not allow their wives to be a part of such a propaganda. Basantrai like her own mother followed the teachings of Dr. Ambedkar and promoted the idea of uniting and educating women.

The autobiographies discussed in this paper portray the lives of Mahar community focusing on the marginalization of women in the society both at the social and personal level. Women narrators are mainly believers of Dr Ambedkar and follow his ideology of gaining education and that is the only tool through which the down trodden can represent themselves in a caste biased society and break the shackles of slavery. The above narratives end on a promising note where women have struggled to acquire knowledge and are involved with larger development of Dalits and women in particular. But even in the conclusion of their autobiographies, on professional front they seem happy and involved, but they share unhappy state in their personal lives. All these women at some or the other point have been a victim of severe male domination. They accepted their husbands as they are, they thrash them up, distrust them and even accuse them of their moral character, but there is nothing much that these women can do about it. Basantrai choose not to stay with her husband, Baby Kamble herself accepts in her interview that her husband used to distrust her and beat her up. Hence, we see a streak of unhappiness towards the not so co-operative male partners. It is only on the social front that these women became a part of progressive and supportive women communities. This comparative aloofness of women from the community is primarily due to ideological and structural nature of the society, which is mainly patriarchal.
References


